

Representations of Gharb Al-Andalus in Selected Travel Writing, Historical Fiction and Journalism (1787-1989)

Juliet Rose Gryspeerdt
University of Nottingham

Abstract

This study investigates how Gharb (Western) Al-Andalus is represented in a selection of texts written in Portuguese, English, French and Spanish, dating from the Romantic period, beginning in the late 1780s, up until the late twentieth century. The first chapter examines British and French travel writing up until the late nineteenth century, while the second investigates nineteenth-century historical fiction which draws on travel writing. The third chapter focuses on the early twentieth century as an age of politicisation, looking at Portuguese journalism and British travel writing, whereas the fourth moves to the late twentieth century to examine José Saramago's travel writing and historiographical metafiction.

Whereas nineteenth-century travel writing on Spain contributed to the construction of a Spanish Orient in the European consciousness, this study finds that a Portuguese Orient was only fleetingly perceived in comparative travel writing on Portugal. It was not until the 1930s that travel writing 'caught up' and fully embraced Portugal's Islamic traces. In addition, this study finds that Oliveira Parreira's *Os Luso-Árabes* (1898) is not only the most detailed representation of Gharb Al-Andalus in nineteenth-century historical fiction, but is also a work that draws directly on the author's own travel writing. In different ways, José Saramago's *História do Cerco do Lisboa* (1989) also draws on his earlier *Viagem a Portugal* (1981). Finally, the study demonstrates how the Algarvian intellectual community kept Oliveira Parreira's legacy alive in their journalism and defended their tradition of celebrating the region's Islamic heritage in the first half of the twentieth century.

Contents

Acknowledgements.....	3
Introduction	4
Historical Context: Al-Andalus and Gharb Al-Andalus	7
The Problem of Terminology	9
Historical Context: Romanticism and Beyond.....	11
Theoretical Framework.....	13
Chapter 1: Travel Writing on Portugal (1787-1891): A Comparative Perspective.....	35
Romanticism and Al-Andalus	37
Educated Travellers.....	40
British and French Attitudes	42
Battles and Sieges	45
Decorative Architecture and its Symbolism.....	62
Gardens of Paradise	77
Customs, Echoes and Traces	89
Conclusion.....	92
Chapter 2: From Travel Writing to Historical Fiction. António Maria de Oliveira Parreira's <i>Os Luso-Árabes</i> (1898)	95
<i>The Talba, or Moor of Portugal</i> (1830)	100
Romanticism in Portugal: Almeida Garrett.....	111
<i>Os Luso-Árabes</i> (1898)	113
'O Phantasista'	121
The Author as Traveller.....	122
Reveries.....	126
The Traveller's Eye	130
Oriental Themes.....	132
Conclusion.....	136
Chapter 3: Representing Gharb Al-Andalus in the Early Twentieth Century: Portuguese Journalism and British Travel Writing.....	139
Part 1: Memory and the Internal Orient in <i>Alma Algarvia</i>	141
Legends, Voices, Ghosts.....	154
Part 2: The Silves Controversy	159
Part 3: The Forgotten 'Orient' in the Writing of Travellers to Portugal in the 1930s	185
A Portuguese Orient.....	204
Chapter 4: José Saramago's <i>Viagem a Portugal</i> (1981) and <i>História do Cerco de Lisboa</i> (1989)	215
<i>Viagem a Portugal</i> (1981)	220

Responses to Mudéjar Architecture	226
Memory and Historical Bias	231
Indirect References to the Memory of Al-Andalus and the Reconquest.....	235
<i>História do Cerco de Lisboa</i> (1989)	239
Itineraries	242
Criticism of the Traditional Historical Novel	252
Irony and Comedy	255
Destabilising the Christian Hero.....	260
Representation of the Moors: Partiality and Intrusion.....	263
Conclusion.....	269
Conclusion.....	272
Bibliography	281

Acknowledgements

I would like to express my deepest thanks to my Supervisors, Dr Jean Andrews and Dr Rui Miranda from the University of Nottingham and Professor Tim Youngs from Nottingham Trent University, for their excellent guidance, feedback and encouragement with this project. The AHRC (Midlands3Cities DTP) also deserves my thanks, for funding this doctoral research. I am very appreciative of the help offered by Arquivo Municipal de Silves in providing copies of various newspaper articles and archival records relating to the Silves controversy of 1928. In addition, I would particularly like to thank Dr João Paulo Pereira da Silva and Dr Maria Zulmira Castanheira from the Universidade Nova de Lisboa, both members of CETAPS (Centre for English, Translation and Anglo-Portuguese Studies), for their advice and recommendations on travel writing on Portugal, and also Dr Everton Machado from the *Orientalismo Português* research group, for inviting me to come and speak on Oliveira Parreira. I am indebted to AbdoolKarim Vakil from King's College London for first introducing me to *Os Luso-Árabes* and to Professor Julian Weiss for sparking my interest in Al-Andalus. My heartfelt thanks also to Peter Haysom for his inspired suggestions for my Bibliography. I am very grateful to my family for the encouragement they have given me to pursue an academic career and would also finally like to thank to my fiancé Simon for all his much-appreciated support of various kinds, especially during the final months of this process.

Introduction

The aim of this study is to investigate how Gharb (Western) Al-Andalus is represented in a selection of texts dating from the Romantic period, beginning in the late 1780s, up until the late twentieth century. It is by no means intended to be an exhaustive study but rather aims to provide insights both by investigating material which has not been the subject of published scholarly work, and by examining previously studied material under a new thematic lens. The study is comparative in that looks at texts written in Portuguese, English, French and Spanish, whilst acknowledging even with this multilingual approach there is still much scope for further comparative work to be done, for example by incorporating the analysis of material written in German, Arabic and other languages. All primary texts have been examined in their original language, to avoid questions of translation adding further complexity to the close textual analysis undertaken.¹ The primary texts examined fall into distinct generic categories, but the study also aims to draw connections between those genres, namely travel writing, historical fiction and journalism. All chapters will examine representations of Gharb Al-Andalus, but each chapter will look at a particular corpus. The first chapter will examine travel writing from the late eighteenth to late nineteenth centuries, whilst the second will examine the links between nineteenth-century travel writing and historical fiction. The third chapter will focus on the early twentieth century as an age of politicisation, looking at Portuguese journalism and British travel writing, whereas the fourth chapter will move to the late twentieth century to examine José Saramago's travel writing and historiographical metafiction.

¹ I have maintained the original (old) Portuguese spellings in quotations and names of newspapers cited in this study.

I have chosen the term 'Gharb Al-Andalus' to highlight the focus of this study on the Western region of Al-Andalus, which broadly corresponds to modern-day Portugal (although northern cities such as Porto and Braga were only under Muslim rule for around 150 years). It is important to note, however, that Gharb Al-Andalus also encompassed territories situated in Spain near the border with Portugal, such as Badajoz in Extremadura. I have not focused particularly on the Spanish regions of Gharb Al-Andalus, precisely because, as I shall elaborate on below, Al-Andalus is already predominantly associated with Spain.

Travel writing here refers to accounts of real journeys undertaken by the authors, and all travel writing examined refers to journeys undertaken on the Iberian Peninsula.² Travel writing was chosen as a genre for discussion because, as Lou Charnon-Deutsch and others have argued, and as I will expand on in this introductory chapter, Romantic travel writing was of central importance to the construction of an Orient in Spain in the European consciousness.³ The term 'Orient' itself is far from having a stable meaning, having designated historically Egypt, the Levant, Western parts of North Africa and large parts of Asia, either selectively or in their totality. The Spanish Orient was seen to have come into being with the historic presence of Islamic culture on the Peninsula in the Middle Ages. However, despite Portugal sharing this history of Islamic presence, the country is not associated so deeply with the Orient as is Spain. As such, a starting point for this study was the hypothesis that a study of Romantic and post-Romantic travel writing on Portugal would yield insights into why such an association between Portugal and Al-Andalus is so much weaker in the European consciousness.

² Some critics include fictional journeys in their definition of travel writing, but others (Tim Youngs and Peter Hulme, for example) do not.

³ Lou Charnon-Deutsch, *The Spanish Gypsy: The History of a European Obsession* (Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2004).

Although travel writing frequently offers imaginative insights into a country's history, it presents itself as an account of a contemporary journey. Since historical fiction, on the other hand, presents itself primarily as a narrative set in a historical period, it is an ideal complement to the study of how Gharb Al-Andalus has been represented. In addition, all historical fiction included in this study draws in some way on travel accounts. The third category of primary text, that of journalism, is included in order to provide a fuller examination of representations of Gharb Al-Andalus by intellectuals in the Algarve in the early twentieth century. This journalism is connected to the aforementioned travel writing and historical fiction genres in that the articles examined are concerned with the representation of place (the Algarve) and with history (Gharb Al-Andalus).

A study of the representation of Gharb Al-Andalus in these related genres has not been undertaken in such depth to date, though, as I shall outline in this introduction, complementary studies exist in a number of different disciplinary areas, including Hispanic studies, cultural history, travel writing studies and architecture. The originality of the study also derives from the fact that it brings archival material to light in order to offer new perspectives, in particular by expanding the work of AbdoolKarim Vakil who has identified the 'minor boom in mostly Algarve-centred Islamic-themed writings from the 1890s into the early twentieth century'.⁴ As well as examining in detail the work of António Maria de Oliveira Parreira (1836-1918), one of the main proponents of such writings, the study will expose how this movement acquired its own tradition and positioned itself within an ideologically-driven debate in that period on how Islam should be remembered in the Algarve. A further innovative aspect of the thesis is the

⁴ AbdoolKarim Vakil, 'The Crusader Heritage: Portugal and Islam from Colonial to Postcolonial Identities' in *Rethinking Heritage: Cultures and Politics in Europe* ed. by R. Peckham (London: I.B. Tauris, 2003) pp. 29-44 (p. 35).

drawing of comparisons between canonical and little-known authors, in particular by including a study of two works by José Saramago in the final chapter, which looks back to and complements the discussion of the work of Oliveira Parreira in the second chapter. The study therefore contributes to several wider discussions: that of the history of Islam (and its representation) on the Iberian Peninsula, that of generic links between travel writing, historical fiction and journalism, and more specifically to their joint contribution to that history.

Historical Context: Al-Andalus and Gharb Al-Andalus

In this study the term Al-Andalus (a transliteration from Arabic) refers to both the territory and the cultural domain in the Iberian Peninsula controlled by Muslims between 711 and 1492 CE. To understand how this came about it is necessary to go back to 638 and the death of Mohammed in Medina (present-day Saudi Arabia), after which there was a rapid expansion of Islam into Persia, the Levant, Egypt and North Africa. A series of Caliphates controlled the region, the second being the Umayyad dynasty. In 711, an Umayyad-led force made up of a minority of Arabs and a majority of Berbers who had converted to Islam defeated Roderic, the Visigothic ruler of Hispania, and proceeded to establish control over the Iberian Peninsula, calling the conquered territory Al-Andalus.⁵

The subsequent period of Muslim rule can be split into various historical phases during which the boundaries of Al-Andalus shifted considerably. The consolidation of power in the region lasted from 711-756, with the Umayyad Emirate of Cordoba lasting

⁵ For further reading, see Joseph O'Callaghan, *A History of Medieval Spain* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press 1983); *História de Portugal, Vol. I: Antes de Portugal* ed. by Raquel Soeiro de Brito and others and *Vol. II: A monarquia feudal* ed. by José Mattoso and Armindo de Sousa (Lisbon: Estampa, D.L., 1993-4).

from 756-929. This then became an independent Umayyad Caliphate (929-1031), during which time Cordoba was reported to have around 70 libraries. From 1009 onwards civil wars broke out and the territory was split up into smaller kingdoms known as *taifas* (1009 to 1089). The next phase involved the Almoravids and Almohads, Berber dynasties from Morocco. Al-Andalus was incorporated into first the Almoravid and then the Almohad empires (from c. 1090-1238). The famous Jewish philosopher Maimonides as well as the Muslim philosopher Ibn Rushd or Averroes also lived during this time, in Almoravid Cordoba. In the final phase, from 1238 to 1492, only the Nasrid Emirate of Granada in the East remained. Of course, many Muslims stayed on in the reconquered territories, though the Christian kingdoms did not remain tolerant of their presence in the long term. Manuel I of Portugal ordered the kingdom's Muslims subjects to leave in 1496, and in Spain, the descendants of Muslims who had converted to Christianity, known as moriscos, were subject to an expulsion decree in 1609.

In the region known as Gharb Al-Andalus ('Gharb' being a transliteration of an Arabic word meaning 'West'), the last Muslim territory to fall during the period of the reconquest was Faro in the Algarve, in 1249. The more marginal territory of Gharb Al-Andalus had less concentration of wealth and power than centres further East such as Cordoba and Granada, and the surviving Islamic architecture in Gharb Al-Andalus, though impressive in its own right, is not generally seen to rival that of sites such as the Great Mosque of Cordoba or the Alhambra Palace of Granada. Many medieval mosques in Portugal have been converted into churches, and little can be seen today of the region's most important Islamic palace, Qasr Al-Sharajib (Palace of the Balconies), located in Silves, in the Algarve (though following recent excavations visitors can now see the vaulted Moorish windows). The bare walls of Moorish castles, and the odd surviving Moorish arch, are mostly what remain today, but traces of the historic Islamic

presence can also be found in the Portuguese language, Portuguese place names, and local legends.

The Problem of Terminology

In her article 'Why Iberia?' the medieval historian María Rosa Menocal highlights the difficulty of finding 'worthy names', in other words terminology, to denote peoples or objects within Al-Andalus.⁶ Having first wanted to entitle her article 'Why Medieval Spain', it was her editors who suggested changing it to the geographic term 'Iberia' rather than the national term 'Spain'. The proliferation of histories of Al-Andalus that call themselves histories of Medieval Spain is a further example of this issue, which helps to perpetuate the notion that Al-Andalus can be associated exclusively with Spain. The tendency to refer to the Muslims of Iberia as 'Moors' or 'Arabs', whilst referring to the Christians as 'Spanish' (or 'Portuguese'), is another terminological problem highlighted by Menocal. This also is problematic in that we end up 'grossly confusing religion and ethnicity and suggesting, every time we do, that to be a Muslim was always not to be a Spaniard, in the way that being a Christian was, or that confession is equivalent to ethnicity?'. One way past this problem is to ensure that we always refer to 'Christians' and 'Muslims'. As mentioned, the Muslims who came to Al-Andalus included both Berbers and Arabs. Though 'Moor' would originally have designated those from North Africa only, it is now understood that in the context of the Iberian Peninsula 'Moor' or 'Moorish' refers to the mixture of Arab and Berber peoples and cultures that took root there. 'Muslim' therefore solves the problem of including other peoples on the Peninsula who converted to Islam but excludes the Jews and Mozarabs (Christians who

⁶ María Rosa Menocal, 'Why Iberia?' in *diacritics* 36:3-4 (Fall-Winter 2006) 7-11 (p. 7).

adopted Arabic language and Islamic culture in Al-Andalus). There is therefore no perfect term to use, but an awareness of the issues involved can at least direct us to use the most appropriate term in a particular context.

When studying modern representations of Al-Andalus the issue of terminology becomes even more complex: in analysing a modern text, should the scholar use the same terminology employed by the author, which could well produce problematic juxtapositions (such as 'Christians' juxtaposed with 'Moors', or 'Portuguese' juxtaposed with 'Muslims'), or should they alter these in their analysis to, for example, 'Christians' and 'Muslims'? The latter option is attractive in that it counters such problematic juxtapositions by using fairer ones that avoid confusing religion with ethnicity or nationality. However, it can encourage a different type of confusion, as the scholar is thus describing an author's use of language using terms the author does not himself employ, and which denote different ideas from those suggested by the author. Where possible in this study I have avoided problematic juxtapositions, but in some cases, for the reason I have just cited, it is unavoidable. In such cases, I have been careful to highlight the issues that the use of such terms creates.

In addition, since the primary texts studied are late-modern, they do often view the region within the parameters of modern national borders and national and regional identities. The question of memory also makes such parameters relevant, due to its focus on the moment and context of remembrance, as well as the historical context. A representation might therefore be thought of as a representation of 'Islamic Portugal' rather than of Gharb Al-Andalus, despite this containing an anachronism – the Kingdom of Portugal did not come into being until 1139, and, even then, did not yet include the Algarve. Although the thesis is titled 'Representations of Gharb Al-Andalus' rather than 'Representations of Islamic Portugal', when discussing authors who were looking at

Gharb Al-Andalus through the lens of national boundaries, or when considering the question of the memory of the Islamic presence within Portugal, I have on occasion referred to 'Islamic Portugal'.

Historical Context: Romanticism and Beyond

The Romantic travel writing which celebrated an Oriental Spain came about as a result of the Romantics' fascination with the surviving Islamic and Mudejar architecture in Toledo and in Granada, Cordoba and Seville in Andalusia. The fact that the Orient could be found in Europe, and therefore in their own backyard, must have made it particularly tantalising, and ripe for discovery, since such architecture had by the eighteenth century been left to fall into ruin by the Spanish themselves. As Lou Charnon-Deutsch writes:

Most eighteenth-century travelers regarded Andalusia as a quasi-Moorish region where it was possible to view the vestiges, now sadly in ruins, of a great premodern culture. Interpreting Moorish inscriptions and architecture was of far more interest to these early travelers than were the current residents whose customs and occupations they often despised.⁷

Over time this changed, and those travellers began to interest themselves far more in the people they saw in Andalusia, particularly the gypsies, whom they saw as modern incarnations or inheritors of this Islamic Orient in Spain. Such interest led one travel writer, Prosper Mérimée, to pen the novel *Carmen* (1845), which was then transformed into an even more famous opera by Georges Bizet (first performed in 1875). Mérimée created an image of a fiery, fatalistic heroine who was an Andalusian gypsy woman, but also a representative, for many who saw Bizet's opera, of Spanish culture as a whole.⁸

⁷ Charnon-Deutsch, p. 48.

⁸ José F. Colmeiro has written on the creation of the myth of Carmen in 'Exorcising Exoticism: "Carmen" and the Construction of Oriental Spain', *Comparative Literature*, 54: 2 (Spring 2002), 127-144.

There are further reasons why Romantic travel writers were so fascinated with Islamic and Mudejar architecture to begin with. The architectural historian Adrian Forty traces how the association between a region's language and its *Volksgeist*, first traced by Johann Gottfried Herder in his *Treatise on the Origin of Language* (1770), was then applied to architecture, so that architecture itself was seen by travel writers as encapsulating the spirit of the people. Interpreting architecture was therefore seen as a way of interpreting a culture.⁹ As discussed in more detail in Chapter 1, medievalism was also dominant in the Romantic period, prompting travellers to focus particularly on medieval architecture and history. However, this did not necessarily mean that interest waned in the post-Romantic periods. Romanticism cast a long shadow and its concerns continued to manifest themselves in travel writing into the twentieth century. Paul Fussell's study, *Abroad*, supports this view in relation to British travel writing in the interwar years, writing that: 'literary travel between the wars constitutes an implicit rejection of industrialism and everything implied by the concept "modern northern Europe," [...]. One travels to experience the past, and travel is thus an adventure in time as well as distance'.¹⁰ As such, the travel writing of the 1930s is a fertile ground to look for late manifestations of a Romantic tradition, ones which may themselves differ in important ways from travel writing on Portugal written during the Romantic period itself.

⁹ Adrian Forty, 'Foreword', in Ricardo Agarez, *Algarve Building: Modernism, Regionalism and Architecture in the South of Portugal, 1925-65* (New York and London: Routledge, 2016), pp. xxvi-xxvii.

¹⁰ Paul Fussell, *Abroad: British Literary Travel Writing between the Wars* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1980), p. 242.

Theoretical Framework

This study is primarily concerned with investigating how Gharb Al-Andalus has been represented, however, as mentioned previously, tied in with this is the question of how the Islamic presence on the Iberian Peninsula is remembered. Here memory studies can provide useful insights particularly in relation to symbolic meanings. Pierre Nora's concept of the *lieu de mémoire*, or site of memory, is not only intended to be applicable to physical sites and can therefore be applied to space-time configurations such as Al-Andalus as a whole, or more specific examples such as 'Islamic Silves'. This theory argues that such sites acquire a symbolic meaning for a particular community.¹¹ The concept of *lieu de mémoire* as conceived by Nora has been criticised for being too static and nation-focused, and not accounting for travelling or transcultural memories.¹² Nonetheless, Nora's assertion that '*lieux de mémoire* only exist because of their capacity for metamorphosis, an endless recycling of their meaning and an unpredictable proliferation of their ramifications' is helpful for our understanding of how Al-Andalus functions as a shifting symbol.¹³ Of course, such symbolic meanings necessarily oversimplify the complexity of the period of Islamic presence and rule on the Peninsula, and what they leave out is often as significant as what they include.

One of the most significant theoretical works for the framework of this study is Edward Said's highly influential but also polemical study *Orientalism* (1978), a work which is fundamentally concerned with representation, specifically representation of the Orient.¹⁴ Before discussing the particulars of Said's argument in *Orientalism*, it is

¹¹ Pierre Nora, 'Between Memory and History: Les Lieux de Mémoire' in *Representations. Special Issue: Memory and Counter-Memory*, 26 (1989) 7-24 (p. 7).

¹² Astrid Erll, 'Travelling Memory' in *Parallax*, 17:4 (October 2011), 4-18 <<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/13534645.2011.605570>> [accessed 14 August 2019] (p. 7).

¹³ Nora, p. 19.

¹⁴ Edward Said, *Orientalism* (London: Penguin Books, 2003).

important to highlight Said's own indebtedness to Michel Foucault, in particular Foucault's so-called genealogical work from the 1970s, including *Surveiller et punir* (1975) and the first volume of his *Histoire de la sexualité*, entitled *La volonté de savoir* (1976).¹⁵ Foucault's work foregrounded the relationship between knowledge (its production and dissemination) and power structures, arguing that knowledge operates as part of a system propped up by social and political power structures. According to this logic, knowledge is at the service of power. Crucially for Said, Foucault maintained that such power relations could be seen through an analysis of the particular discourses produced in different fields, discourses which were in turn used to govern social groups. Although Foucault did not look at what Hiddleston terms the 'mechanics of colonialism', Said was able to use such insights to examine the academic study of and cultural representations of the Orient, and how these could often be complicit with a colonial mission.¹⁷

Said's approach is, however, more humanist than that of Foucault, who saw discourse as a historically contingent social system which produced knowledge and meaning. Said himself writes that 'unlike Michel Foucault, to whose work I am greatly indebted, I do believe in the determining imprint of individual writers upon the otherwise anonymous collective body of texts constituting a discursive formation like Orientalism'.¹⁸ This is an important distinction for the present study, which will look not only at patterns of discourse across related texts but also at the contribution of particular authors in shaping or challenging a particular discourse. A further distinction between the two thinkers is highlighted by Gauri Viswanathan, who writes that: 'far

¹⁵ Michel Foucault, *Surveiller et punir* (Paris: Gallimard, 1975) and *Histoire de la sexualité*, 3 vols, (Paris: Gallimard, 1976-84).

¹⁷ Jane Hiddleston, 'Foucault and Said: Colonial discourse and Orientalism' In *Understanding Postcolonialism* (Stockfield: Acumen Publishing, 2009) pp. 76-97 (pp. 76-77).

¹⁸ Said, *Orientalism*, p. 23.

from attributing total coercive power to discourse, Said refers on more than one occasion to Orientalism as a “meaningful” rather than a meaningless system of discursive rule. In a move that puts distance between himself and Foucault, Said instead prefers to view Orientalist representations for what they enable through the mechanisms of power’.¹⁹

Said’s thesis in *Orientalism* begins with the idea that the historic relationship and geographical proximity between Christianity and Islam led to Christian kingdoms perceiving Islam and Islamic culture as a persistent threat. For Christians, Islam was also historically a ‘real provocation’ due to its drawing on Judeo-Hellenic traditions, its creative borrowings from Christianity, its ‘unrivaled military and political successes’ and its position ‘adjacent to and even on top of the Biblical lands’.²⁰ The success of the Ottoman Empire meant that the threat lingered until the end of the seventeenth century. Even afterwards, however, Christian kingdoms were not easily able to excise the association between Islam and danger. In Said’s words, ‘for Europe, Islam was a lasting trauma’.²¹ Continuing with this psychological analysis, he later adds that ‘Orientalism is a form of paranoia, knowledge of another kind say, from ordinary historical knowledge’.²² This reading is helpful to bear in mind given how Orientalist discourse can be seen to reflect particular Western anxieties.

For Said, Napoleon’s invasion of Egypt in 1798 was a pivotal moment in which colonial ambitions came into play, and he proceeds to present Orientalism as a ‘British and French cultural enterprise’ in which particular ideas about the Orient (‘Oriental despotism, Oriental splendour, cruelty, sensuality’) were then put at the service of

¹⁹ Gauri Viswanathan, ‘Introduction’ in Gauri Viswanathan ed., *Power, Politics and Culture: Interviews with Edward W. Said* (New York: Vintage Books, 2002), pp. xiv-xv.

²⁰ Said, *Orientalism*, p. 74.

²¹ Said, *Orientalism*, p. 59.

²² Said, *Orientalism*, p. 72.

legitimising colonial domination of the Orient.²³ Said thereby suggests that quite a few Orientalists (by trade) were complicit in the production of a discourse that justified the domination of Oriental peoples.²⁴ Said himself acknowledges that his study fails to look in detail at 'the important contributions to Orientalism of Germany, Italy, Russia, Spain, and Portugal'.²⁵ Rather, he says, he has described 'parts of that fabric [of the discourse of Orientalism] at certain moments, and merely to suggest the existence of a larger whole'.²⁶

A comparative literature scholar by training, Said then proceeds to analyse a number of nineteenth and twentieth-century texts about the Orient, setting out his approach as follows:

The things to look for are style, figures of speech, setting, narrative devices, historical and social circumstances, *not* the correctness of the representation nor its fidelity to some great original. The value, efficacy, strength, apparent veracity of a written statement about the Orient therefore relies very little, and cannot instrumentally depend, on the Orient as such.²⁷

This approach to the analysis of discourse uses the instruments of literary analysis, under the assumption that the producers of Orientalist discourse use such narrative devices to produce said discourse. Nonetheless, as mentioned already, Said's approach is not intended to be prescriptive and can be adapted to the material studied and to its context.

There has been much useful and constructive critique of Said, including that of Lisa Lowe, who argues that 'orientalism is not a single developmental tradition but is profoundly heterogeneous'²⁸ as well as 'contradictory'.²⁹ Such insights invite a

²³ Said, *Orientalism*, p. 4.

²⁴ Said, *Orientalism*, p. 150.

²⁵ Said, *Orientalism*, p. 17.

²⁶ Said, *Orientalism*, p. 24.

²⁷ Said, *Orientalism*, p. 21.

²⁸ Lisa Lowe, *Critical Terrains: French and British Orientalisms* (Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press, 1991), p. ix.

²⁹ Lowe, p. 5.

discussion of the particularity as well as the possible contradictions of Orientalist discourse about one particular Orient, that of Gharb Al-Andalus. Diego Saglia, looking at Romantic Orientalism in a European context, has also critiqued Said by arguing that 'fascination with Oriental cultures was often unrelated to any direct control of colonial territories in the East'.³⁰ Contrasting the approaches of Lord Byron and Thomas Moore, Saglia considers that they reveal:

the perpetual oscillation of Romantic Orientalism between accuracy, factuality, and scholarly reliability, on the one hand, and the decorative fantasies of a clichéd East of harems, sultans, crescents, and palm-trees, on the other. Both dimensions had eighteenth-century precedents – the Enlightenment's interest in non-European civilizations and the hedonistic East of the *Arabian Nights*.³¹

Orientalism can therefore have different modes. The importance of *The Thousand and One Nights* in conjuring up images of the Orient in the European popular imagination it was undeniable and shall be discussed in more detail in Chapter 1.

One of the issues with applying Said's theory to the Iberian context is that the Orient described by Said is not situated in Europe. The Iberian Orient is both internal and historic, as Diego Saglia acknowledges in relation to Spain. Saglia describes how: 'through the resurgence of the exotic, Spanish culture in the Romantic period also rediscovered its Oriental roots and revalued the presence of an internal Orient in its own history'.³² Though scholarship has yet to do so, this idea of an 'internal Orient' can usefully applied to Portugal when discussing writers who represent Gharb Al-Andalus. José Colmeiro had also used the terms 'internalized orientalism' and 'internalized exoticism' three years earlier, to describe how fin-de-siècle Spanish artists were influenced by the Orientalist trend and drew on the image of the Gypsy as a symbol of

³⁰ Diego Saglia, 'Orientalism', in *A Companion to European Romanticism* ed. by Michael Ferber (Malden, Massachusetts: Blackwell, 2005), pp. 467-485 (p. 469).

³¹ Saglia, 'Orientalism', p. 474.

³² Saglia, 'Orientalism', p. 481.

oriental Spain when producing work which had a nationalist sentiment.³³ This takes the analytical framework one stage further in suggesting that certain Spanish artists orientalised their own historic internal Orient, a possibility that can also be brought to bear in the Portuguese context.

Said argues that: 'Orientalist notions influenced the people who were called Orientals as well as those called Occidental, European or Western' but this is far too simplistic to suffice in relation to the Iberian context.³⁴ As Saglia explains in relation to Spain, one thing that Said neglects to address is:

the particular double bind of Spanish culture due to its experience of orientalism from both sides: as a European Christian culture that had repressed a constitutive element of its historical identity and sees the oriental as its cultural and political other, and as a mirror of oriental culture constructed by other Europeans (emphasizing the historical imprints left by several centuries of close contact with Arabic and Jewish culture and highlighting the Gypsies as a symbolic representation of Spanish orientalism).³⁵

When transposing this idea to the Portuguese context, it is important to bear in mind that the Portuguese context is similar, though far from identical. It differs in the sense that Portugal is not associated with the Gypsies and is not identified with the Orient in such a systematic way as Spain is. Nonetheless, the potential to find itself in such a double bind remains and can be seen in certain texts in the corpus.

As Julian Weiss explains, Said attempted to remedy his lack of attention to Al-Andalus by publishing in 2002, not long before his death, a preface to the Spanish edition of *Orientalism*, as well as an article outside of the academic sphere entitled 'Andalusia's Journey'.³⁶ Here Said focused on the model of coexistence and dialogue between

³³ José Colmeiro, 'Exorcising Exoticism: "Carmen" and the Construction of Oriental Spain', in *Comparative Literature*, 54: 2 (Spring, 2002), 127-144 (p. 142).

³⁴ Said, *Orientalism*, p. 41.

³⁵ Colmeiro, pp. 129-30.

³⁶ Julian Weiss, 'El postcolonialismo medieval: líneas y pautas en la investigación de un problema histórico', in Natalia Fernández Rodríguez and María Fernández Ferreiro eds., *Literatura Medieval y Renacentista en España: Líneas y Pautas* (Salamanca: Universidad de Salamanca, Sociedad de Estudios Medievales y Renacentistas (SEMYR), 2012), pp. 177-200 (p. 178). Edward Said, *Orientalismo*, trans. by

cultures that existed in Al-Andalus, which he argues is particularly relevant for today's hybrid but conflict-ridden world.³⁷ This focus on tolerance was emblematic of scholarship at the time, with María Rosa Menocal's volume *The Ornament of the World* being published in the same year.³⁸ For Weiss, however, Said missed an opportunity to: 'analizar cómo la historia y las culturas ibéricas contribuyen a, y problematizan, la construcción no solo del Oriente sino de la Europa misma'. The Iberian medieval context itself therefore problematises the dichotomy of East and West that is present in Said's *Orientalism*.

A further complication of applying Said's *Orientalism* to the corpus of this study is that Said identifies the Arabist Reinhart Dozy's (1820-1833) work *Histoire des musulmans d'Espagne*, as being notable for its 'impressive antipathy [...] to the Orient, Islam, and the Arabs'.³⁹ This is significant because certain writers in the corpus who celebrate the contribution of medieval Islamic culture to Iberian culture draw heavily on Dozy, begging the question as to whether such authors manage to use Dozy selectively and to what extent they manage to banish such prejudices from their own work.

Although Said does not discuss Al-Andalus in *Orientalism*, he does include an analysis of French travel writing about the Orient, including Chateaubriand's *L'Itinéraire de Paris à Jérusalem* (1811), Lamartine's *Voyage en Orient* (1835), Nerval's *Voyage en Orient* (1851) and Flaubert's notebook and letters from his own trip to Egypt in 1849-

María Luisa Fuentes (Madrid: Debate, 2002); 'Andalusia's Journey', *Travel and Leisure* (December 2002), 178-94, <<http://www.travelandleisure.com/articles/andalusias-journey/1>> [accessed 30 August 2019].

³⁷ Of Al-Andalus, Said writes: 'its periods of fruitful cultural diversity may provide a model for the co-existence of peoples, a model quite different from the ideological battles, local chauvinism, and ethnic conflict that finally brought it down – and which ironically enough threaten to engulf our own 21st-century world'. Said, 'Andalusia's Journey', p. 178.

³⁸ María Rosa Menocal, *The Ornament of the World: How Muslims, Jews and Christians Created a Culture of Tolerance in Medieval Spain* (New York: Little, Brown, 2002).

³⁹ Said, *Orientalism*, p. 150. Reinhart Dozy, *Histoire des Musulmans d'Espagne, jusqu'à la conquête de l'Andalousie par les Almoravides, 711-1110*, 4 vols (Leiden: Imprimeur de l'Université, 1861).

50.⁴⁰ Said argues that these travellers, or 'literary pilgrims', 'found in the Orient a locale sympathetic to their myths, obsessions, and requirements'.⁴¹ Of Chateaubriand, Said writes that he 'attempts to *consume* the Orient. He not only appropriates it, he represents and speaks for it, not in history but beyond history'.⁴² He describes Lamartine as a 'bundle of predispositions, sympathies, biases' and identifies in him a 'transcendent quasi-national egoism'.⁴³ On Nerval and Flaubert, he writes that these authors' work 'quite consciously plays with the limitations and challenges presented to them by the Orient and by knowledge about it'. Furthermore, both writers 'were thoroughly steeped in aspects of European culture that encouraged a sympathetic, if perverse, vision of the Orient'.⁴⁴ This idea he develops by expanding on the 'almost uniform association between the Orient and sex' that had developed by this point. The Orient, he writes suggested 'not only fecundity but sexual promise (and threat), untiring sensuality, unlimited desire, deep generative energies'.⁴⁵ Said then focuses on the importance of female figures in the work of these writers on the Orient, including a discussion of Flaubert's writings on his encounters with the prostitute Kuchuk Hanon.⁴⁶

Such insights are useful as the attitude of such writers is likely to have common threads with those of French travellers to the Iberian Orient. Nonetheless, Said's analysis of French travel writing has been criticised by Robert Irwin for containing factual inaccuracies and misinterpretations, which Irwin attributes to: 'the extraordinary haste and consequent carelessness with which Orientalism was written', suggesting that Said's

⁴⁰ Gustave Flaubert, *Voyage en Orient* (Paris: Gallimard, 2006); 'Correspondance' ed. by Yvan Leclerc et Danielle Girard <<https://flaubert.univ-rouen.fr/correspondance/edition/>> [accessed 24 August 2019].

⁴¹ Said, *Orientalism*, p. 170.

⁴² Said, *Orientalism*, p. 174.

⁴³ Said, *Orientalism*, pp. 177, 179.

⁴⁴ Said, *Orientalism*, pp. 180-181.

⁴⁵ Said, *Orientalism*, p. 188.

⁴⁶ Said, *Orientalism*, pp. 180, 187.

'need to make all his material conform to a predetermined thesis' could have been a further factor.⁴⁷ Focusing on Flaubert, Irwin suggests that he was 'tacitly satirizing precisely the sort of Orientalism that Said so disliked'. He also questions Said's interpretation of Flaubert's development of a female Oriental type inspired by his encounters with Kuchuk Hanon, and encourages scholars to consider the question of the social class of the travel writers (likely to be upper class) and the implications this has for their view of the world, as well as their age.⁴⁸ Here the overlap with travel writing on Iberia is only partial, since though many authors of travel accounts on Iberia from the late eighteenth to the twentieth century were upper class, they were certainly not all. As for age, Irwin argues that travellers to the Orient tended to be young, whereas there is more diversity in the ages of travellers studied here, including quite a few middle-aged writers.

Continuing with studies of French travel writing about the (non-Iberian) Orient, Ali Behdad's theory of belated travellers can usefully be applied to certain travellers, as I have done in Chapter 1. Behdad argues that the experiences of traveller-writers who went to the Orient in the mid- and late nineteenth century were marked by an 'anxiety of coming after what had come before'. They were conscious of 'Europe's appropriation and penetration of the Orient' which prompted an 'obsessive urge to discover an "authentic" Other', accompanied by a sense of loss.⁴⁹ Using as an example Nerval's disappointment about the appearance of Cairo, Behdad adds:

the orientalist subject's encounter with the 'real' can only be an experience of discontentment because his vision is mediated by the symbolic field of cultural 'baggage' that has given him the illusion of a phantasmagoric city. The fantastic tales of *The Thousand and One Nights*, which the

⁴⁷ Robert Irwin, 'Flaubert's Camel: Said's Animus' in *Debating Orientalism*, ed. by Ziad Elmarsafy, Anna Bernard and David Attwell (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013), pp. 38-54 (p. 47).

⁴⁸ Irwin, pp. 48-50.

⁴⁹ Ali Behdad, *Belated Travelers: Orientalism in the Age of Colonial Dissolution* (Durham and London: Duke University Press, 1994), p. 13.

orientalist has been made to see as a 'true representation' of Oriental reality, comes between the narrator and the immediate reality, exposing the mimetic nature of his desire.⁵⁰

Some travellers to Iberia did experience feelings of belatedness, though not necessarily in relation to Al-Andalus. Their expectations would have been different, for example that of finding traces of an Orient rather than a whole scale living Orient, given that Al-Andalus is safely distanced by time. This temporal distancing means that writers may not have needed to come to terms with the mimetic nature of their desire in Iberia, nor deny themselves the possibility that the phantasmagoric city such as that found in *The Thousand and One Nights* once existed there.

As we have seen already with the work of Lou-Channon Deutsch (working within Hispanic Studies), studies of travel writing on Iberia which touch on representations of Moorish architecture or other traces of Islamic culture may be found outside of travel writing studies itself. Another such example, this time within studies of Architecture, is the work of Ricardo Agarez, who in *Algarve Building, a study of Modernism, Regionalism and Architecture in the South of Portugal*, includes a study of travel writing about the Algarve and a discussion on Algarve identity, of which the Moorish past is a decisive element.⁵¹

Within travel writing studies, C.W. Thompson's volume *French Romantic Travel Writing* is particularly helpful due to its inclusion, within the section on travel writing on the Orient, of a detailed chapter on 'The "Orient" and Spain'.⁵² The study itself is not exhaustive, and Portugal itself is not discussed due to its relative lack of prominence as a tourist destination in the late eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. Neither Spain nor

⁵⁰ Behdad, p. 26.

⁵¹ Ricardo Agarez, *Algarve Building: Modernism, Regionalism and Architecture in the South of Portugal, 1925-65* (New York and London: Routledge, 2016).

⁵² C.W. Thompson, *French Romantic Travel Writing, Chateaubriand to Nerval* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012).

Portugal was included in the early days of the Grand Tour, in which wealthy young European men (and some women) travelled to Paris, Switzerland, Italy, Germany and Holland from the late seventeenth century onwards, as a rite of passage. By the second half of the eighteenth century the standard Grand Tour itinerary no longer held great novelty, and travellers started to include other Southern European countries including Spain and Portugal in their itinerary, in the search for exoticism.⁵³ British travellers did not travel in large numbers to Portugal, though prominent Romantics such as William Beckford, Robert Southey, Lord Byron and Dora Wordsworth (daughter of William Wordsworth) did visit in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries.⁵⁴ Portugal's smaller size and geographical position may have contributed to it being virtually ignored by French Romantic writers, who 'distinguished themselves from the Scandinavians, Germans and English' by publishing more than fifty travelogues on a variety of countries by 1855.⁵⁵ In examining travel writing on Portugal, scholarship within Anglo-Portuguese or Franco-Portuguese studies includes useful and highly specific studies on particular writers or groups of writers, though here the nature of representations of Al-Andalus may only be touched upon briefly, if at all.

Scholarship which discusses the particularity of the Portuguese context is of course crucial to this study. Patricia Hertel's *The Crescent Remembered: Islam and Nationalism on the Iberian Peninsula* is notable for its approach of comparing and contrasting the ways in which Islam is remembered in Spain and Portugal, and linking

⁵³ Ana Calado, *O Portugal de Salazar visto de uma varanda transmontana* (Lisbon: Centro de Estudos Anglo-Portugueses, 2005), p. 15.

⁵⁴ Lord Byron did not produce a travel account on Portugal but his narrative poem *Childe Harold's Pilgrimage* (1812-18) refers to Sintra as a 'glorious Eden'.

⁵⁵ C.W. Thompson, 'The Romantic Literary Travel Book', in *The Routledge Companion to Travel Writing* ed. by Carl Thompson, 1st edn (Abingdon: Routledge, 2016), pp. 269-277 (p. 269). Álvaro Manuel Machado and Daniel-Henri Pageaux, *Da Literatura Comparada à Teoria da Literatura*, 2nd edn (Lisbon: Ed. Presença, 2001), p. 37.

this to nationalist agendas in the two nation states.⁵⁶ Hertel's wide-ranging study includes an examination of historiography, scholarship on architecture, periodicals, history textbooks and popular festivals. Specialised historical context is also provided by Eva Maria von Kemnitz's study *Portugal e o Magrebe*, which examines attitudes in Portugal towards the Maghreb, the development of Arab studies in Portugal, and diplomatic relations between Portugal and Morocco from the eighteenth to twentieth centuries.⁵⁷

A further key influence on this study is AbdoolKarim Vakil's 2003 article 'The Crusader Heritage: Portugal and Islam from Colonial to Postcolonial Identities'. Amongst others, Vakil discusses two Portuguese writers who have a prominent position in this study: José Saramago, whose work is discussed in Chapter 4, and António Maria de Oliveira Parreira (1837), the virtually unknown author of *Os Luso-Árabes*, a two-volume historical novel published in 1898. Vakil's identification of the boom in 'Algarve-centred Islamic-themed writings from the 1890s into the early twentieth century' also prompted my own further investigation into this boom and interest in the intellectuals who contributed to it.⁵⁸

It is also important to highlight the existence of studies on Portuguese Orientalism, for example the research outputs of the Lisbon-based research group *ORION - Orientalismo Português* led by Everton Machado and formerly by Ana Paula Laborinho.⁵⁹ However, in Portugal the term 'Orientalismo Português' is generally applied to writings on other countries where Portugal had a presence, whether colonial or more

⁵⁶ Patricia Hertel, *The Crescent Remembered: Islam and Nationalism on the Iberian Peninsula* trans. by Ellen Yutzy Glebe (Brighton: Sussex Academic Press, 2015).

⁵⁷ Eva Maria von Kemnitz, *Portugal e o Magrebe (séculos XVIII/XIX): Pragmatismo, inovação e conhecimento nas relações diplomáticas* (Lisbon: MNE e Instituto Diplomático, 2010).

⁵⁸ Vakil, p. 35.

⁵⁹ See <<http://cec.letras.ulisboa.pt/en/research-groups/locus/orion-portuguese-orientalism/>> [accessed 27 September 2019].

informal, rather than to examples of internal Orientalism. Internal Orientalism would be more likely to be classified in Portuguese academia as a late manifestation of Romanticism. As Fernando Catroga explains in 'A história começou a oriente', Portuguese Romanticism developed in a different manner from British Romanticism:

o nosso primeiro romantismo não terá mostrado uma grande atracção pelo Oriente. O romance histórico referenciou, sobretudo, o Norte de África e a invasão e domínio sarracenos num relevo que tem ainda muito que ver com o anelo historicista e romântico de reconstrução da identidade através da busca e comunhão com as origens políticas da Nação. Daí, ao contrário do que aconteceu com alguns dos modelos, no romance (Walter Scott) e na poesia (Byron), a quase ausência do Oriente em escritores como Alexandre Herculano e Almeida Garrett [...] Será necessário esperar pelas décadas seguintes para que se encontrem sinais mais directos da valorização romântica (estética, epistemológica e política) do Oriente.⁶⁰

According to Catroga, therefore, Portuguese Romanticism developed first in the historical novel – the historian and novelist Alexandre Herculano (1810-1877)'s *Eurico, o Presbítero* from 1844, tells the story of a Visigoth, Eurico, fighting against the invading Moors in the eighth century, and two of his historical tales from 1851, 'O Alcaide de Santarém (950–961)' and 'A Morte do Lidador (1170)', the latter featuring the knight Gonfalon Mendes da Maia, are also set in the time of Al-Andalus.⁶¹ Although the search for a *volksgeist* is clearly in evidence here through the search for the origins of the nation, other aspects of the Romantic sensibility, including the aesthetic use of an external Orient, did not develop until later in the nineteenth century in Portuguese literature.

Portugal had of course been a key player in the European expansion of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, but by the nineteenth century, the Portuguese colonial presence in India had long since entered into decline, with the gradual loss of control over its coastal enclaves. The independence of Brazil in 1822 had also led to

⁶⁰ Fernando Catroga, 'A história começou a oriente' in *O orientalismo em Portugal: séculos XVI-XX*, (Lisbon: Comissão Nacional para as Comemorações dos Descobrimentos Portugueses, 1999), pp. 197-239 (p. 213).

⁶¹ These tales appear in Alexandre Herculano, *Lendas e narrativas*, 2 vols (Lisbon: Livraria Bertrand, 1970).

Portugal refocusing its colonial ambitions on Africa.⁶² A document named the *Mapa cor-de-rosa* (Rose-coloured map) was famously produced in 1885 which outlined a land corridor connecting Angola and Mozambique, over which the Portuguese claimed sovereignty. However, in 1890 the British issued an ultimatum forcing the Portuguese to retreat. It is in this competitive context, with Portugal keen to reform itself, catch up and be taken seriously as a modern European nation by other colonial powers, that Portuguese external Orientalism develops. Catroga lists well-known examples, such as Eça de Queirós' *O Egipto, notas de viagem* (from a trip undertaken in 1869, but published posthumously in 1926), which he describes as being '[n]a linha dos precursores franceses e ingleses', and the decadent and symbolist poetry of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries.⁶³ Eça's novel *A Relíquia* (1887) is another pertinent example as it features a highly satirical depiction of a Portuguese traveller to the Holy Land.⁶⁴ This study contributes to the understanding of Portuguese Orientalism by highlighting, in addition to such examples of external Orientalism, the existence of late nineteenth-century Portuguese representations of an internal Orient which employ a late Romantic-Orientalist aesthetic.

Boaventura de Sousa Santos' well-known article 'Between Prospero and Caliban' is helpful in theorising Portugal's complex position as a semi-periphery – a nation with a colonial history but with a history of economic dependence on Britain. Sousa Santos describes Portugal's complex constellation of identities, which combines traces of

⁶² Catroga, p. 211.

⁶³ Catroga, p. 223. Eça de Queirós, *O Egipto, notas de viagem* (Porto: Livr. Chardron, 1926).

⁶⁴ See Carlos Reis, 'Eça de Queirós e o Oriente', in *Portugal-China: 500 anos* (Lisbon: BNP/Babel, 2014), pp. 221-225 (p. 223) for a discussion of Eça's satirical portrayal of the (French) Romantic imagination shaping Portuguese ideas of the Orient.

coloniser and colonised, as an 'inter-identity'.⁶⁵ Applying this argument to the question of the representation of Portugal's Islamic past in discussions of national identity, Ana Rita Moreira argues that semi-periphery countries such as Portugal suffer from a problem of self-representation in a similar way to colonised countries, in that: 'confrontam-se com a dificuldade em representar-se fora dos termos da representação colonial que lhes atribui uma posição subalterna'.⁶⁶ Moreira compares the situation in Portugal to that of Spain, Italy and Greece, writing that when the elites of Southern Europe were confronted with: 'a ideia de decadência e inferioridade cultural sentenciada ao Oriente', they tried to negotiate, 'na formulação do passado e do destino nacional, um lugar na Europa do progresso'. Such negotiation consisted of trying to: 'desambiguar a situação liminar que lhes coube no quadro geopolítico traçado pelas grandes potências europeias'.⁶⁷ As such, despite Alexandre Herculano's inclusion of medieval Iberian Muslims in the history of the nation for the first time, nineteenth-century historians and politicians sought overall to underplay the impact of Islamic culture on the defining traits of the Portuguese nation.⁶⁸

A later example of this tendency would be the Portuguese writer and politician (later President of the Republic) Teófilo Braga. As Sérgio Campos Matos explains, in 1870 Teófilo Braga had chosen to argue that the Mozarabs were the essence of the Portuguese nation.⁶⁹ Though Braga's theories concerning Portuguese nationality changed over the years, he continued to argue that the Mozarabs were the

⁶⁵ Boaventura de Sousa Santos, 'Between Prospero and Caliban: Colonialism, Postcolonialism, and Inter-identity', *Luso-Brazilian Review*, 39: 2 (Winter, 2002), 9-43.

⁶⁶ Ana Rita Moreira, 'Árabes e Nação na periferia da Europa', *Intersecções Ibéricas: Margens, Passagens, Fronteiras*, IV Encontro Ibérico de Antropólogos, Ponte de Lima, 4-8 September 2007, pp. 97-112 (p. 101).

⁶⁷ Moreira, p. 100.

⁶⁸ Moreira, p. 103. Alexandre Herculano, *História de Portugal*, 4 vols (Lisbon: Viúva Bertrand e Filhos, 1846-1853).

⁶⁹ Teófilo Braga, 'Introdução' in *História da Literatura Portuguesa* (Porto: Nova Livraria Internacional, 1870), p. 2. Cited in Sérgio Campos Matos, 'Portugal: The nineteenth century debate on the formation of the nation', *Portuguese Studies* 13 (1997), 66-94 (p. 77).

anthropological core of the Hispanic race, and, as Campos Matos explains, that they were 'a core left unchanged by both German invasion and Arab conquest'.⁷⁰ Braga also later sought to portray the Berber majority who came to the Peninsula as being 'arabizados e islamizados' rather than 'árabes ou muçulmanos autênticos', resulting in a minimal cultural and religious influence, since the Arab aristocracy maintained their distance from the Mozarab population.⁷¹ A further tendency in Portuguese historiography was to foreground regional identities, reinforcing the sense of a north-south divide. This entailed arguing that only in the very south of the country (Alentejo and the Algarve) was there any lasting legacy of the Islamic presence, an idea that Moreira describes in terms of the placing of a 'fronteira higiénica' in which the south of the nation is sacrificed.⁷² Such a division mirrored other perceived north-south divisions within Spain and also, ironically, within Europe as a whole, in which the north was associated positively with industriousness, and the south negatively with decadence. In the European scenario, of course, all of Portugal was associated with southern decadence, despite the country's own internal drive to differentiate between its northerly and southerly regions.

Moreira sees Herculano, whose *História de Portugal* was published from 1846-53, as the first in the series of liberal and republican intellectuals who spearheaded an incorporation of the Islamic past into national history as part of their efforts to reform the nation. These include the politician and historian Oliveira Martins (1845-1894), the (literary) historian and politician Teófilo Braga (1843-1924) and ended with the renowned Arabist David de Melo Lopes (1867-1942) in the early twentieth century.

⁷⁰ Campos Matos, pp. 78-79.

⁷¹ Teófilo Braga, *A Pátria Portuguesa: o território e a Raça* (Porto: Chardron, 1894), pp. 96; 281. Cited in Moreira, p. 106.

⁷² Moreira, p. 105.

Though such writers were constrained by the need to situate themselves favourably within the Orientalist discourse generated by the UK, France, and later Germany, Moreira also considers that Portugal's condition as a semi-periphery gave them room for manoeuvre, and the potential to subvert Orientalist discourse. Even so, such subversion was not always successful due to the prevalence of the idea that Portugal was in cultural decline, or decadence. What is clear is that Portuguese authors made use of the internal contradictions found in European external Orientalism. As such, in their work we can see: 'a oscilação entre visões positivas, exotizantes ou reconhecedoras do legado cultural (ainda que espúrio), e negativas, ou decadentes, da civilização Islâmica'. Moreira provides examples of such 'useful' contradictions in Oliveira Martins' account of the origins of the nation in his volume *História da Civilização Ibérica*.⁷³ Such contradictions may also be present, therefore, in the work of Portuguese writers aiming to celebrate their country's Islamic cultural heritage in the corpus of the present study.

Portugal after April 1974

Whereas, as Patricia Hertel writes, '[n]either the monarchy, the republic nor the dictatorship had reason to promote the concept of a Portuguese Islam',⁷⁴ after the revolution of April 1974 there was 'a greater emphasis on Portugal's Islamic heritage. The fledgling democracy reacted to the one-dimensional national identity propagated under the Estado Novo by seeking to recognize the cultural and religious diversity of the architectural landscape'.⁷⁵ The archaeologist and historian Cláudio Torres (1939-) is an important figure in the post-1974 re-evaluation of Portuguese Islamic archaeological

⁷³ Moreira, p. 102-5.

⁷⁴ Hertel, p. 69.

⁷⁵ Hertel, p. 67.

heritage. Returning from political exile, Torres undertook an excavation and museum project in Mértola, Alentejo which is still running today. As Hertel reminds us, 'Mértola was certainly not the only town in Portugal with Islamic archaeological heritage, nor was the legacy here necessarily richer than in other locations'. Rather, it was its suitability for excavation and the support of the local municipal administration that rendered it the right choice for Torres' project, which has also worked to achieve sustainable tourism in Mértola which both benefits the local community and recovers traditional artisanal techniques such as weaving.⁷⁶ Torres has also contributed revisionist interpretations of history in published interviews, arguing that the arrival of Muslims in the Peninsula should not be viewed as an invasion, citing a lack of archaeological evidence. He instead considers it more likely that Islam and Islamic culture were brought over by merchants.⁷⁷ Both Torres and Santiago Macías have championed a new conceptualisation of Gharb Al-Andalus, which recontextualises it as an extension of North Africa, with Torres also emphasising Berber cultural heritage rather than privileging that of the Arabs.⁷⁸ In 1988, for example, he organised an exhibition on Almoravid and Almohad Mértola in Rabat, Morocco.⁷⁹

A further important figure in the post-1974 landscape is Adalberto Alves (1939-). Alves was particularly interested in the figure of Al-Mutamid, and, as Vakil notes, was 'responsible for the commemorations of Al-Mutamid organised by the Municipality of Beja in 1985'.⁸⁰ This involvement led to the publication of a Portuguese translation of

⁷⁶ Vakil, p. 42, Hertel, p. 67. For more information about the archaeological site, see *Campo Arqueológico de Mértola* <<http://www.camertola.pt>> [accessed 21 August 2019].

⁷⁷ Carlos Dias, 'Papa Francisco premeia 40 anos de trabalho do Campo Arqueológico de Mértola', *Público*, 13 November 2015 <<https://www.publico.pt/local/noticia/papa-francisco-enalteceu-e-premiou-40-anos-de-trabalho-do-campo-arqueologico-de-mertola-1714232>> [accessed 21 August 2019].

⁷⁸ Vakil, p. 43.

⁷⁹ See 'Biografia do Autor: Cláudio Torres, Diretor do Campo Arqueológico de Mértola', *Campo Arqueológico de Mértola* <<http://www.camertola.pt/author/cl%C3%A1udio-torres-0>> [accessed 26 August 2019].

⁸⁰ Vakil, p. 36.

Al-Mutamid's poetry, and later a volume of translated Luso-Arab poetry containing not only the work of Al-Mutamid but also other important poets of Gharb Al-Andalus.⁸¹ Thus, as Vakil writes, Alves has contributed to 'the fundamental redefinition of the Portuguese literary canon'.⁸² More broadly, Alves has sought, through his work, to ensure that the important cultural legacy of Al-Andalus is recognised in Portugal.

Today, there is no shortage of enthusiasts of Portugal's Arab-Islamic history. We can see this in the existence of blogs on the subject, and also in the medieval festivals held in Mértola and Silves.⁸³ The tourist industry has also come to recognise this Arab-Islamic history as a draw for visitors, with Mértola castle including a wall exhibit of Al-Mutamid's poetry, and Sintra tourist office opening a *Mitos e Lendas* tourist attraction in 2015, including local legends featuring Muslims, and making use of set design, multimedia technology and sensory experiences.⁸⁴ There is an Al-Mutamid tourist route from Seville to Lisbon, as well as an Umayyad route incorporating parts of Spain and Portugal as well as Italy, Tunisia, Egypt, Jordan and Lebanon.⁸⁵ The website for the Umayyad route was produced with the financial assistance from the European Union under the ENPI CBC Mediterranean Sea Basin Programme, which aims to foster 'fair, equitable development on both sides of the Mediterranean'.⁸⁶ Despite these positive

⁸¹ Adalberto Alves, *Al-Mutamid de Beja* (Beja: Câmara Municipal de Beja, 1985); *O meu coração é árabe* (Lisbon: Assírio & Alvim, 1987).

⁸² Vakil, p. 36.

⁸³ See *Al-Gharb-Al-Andaluz: Celebrating 1300 years of Islamic Heritage in Portugal* <<http://algharb-alandaluz.blogspot.com>>; *Festival Islâmico de Mértola* <<https://www.festivalislamicodemertola.com>>; 'XVI Feira Medieval de Silves', *Câmara Municipal Silves* <<https://www.cm-silves.pt/pt/menu/1080/xvi-feira-medieval-de-silves.aspx>> [all accessed 26 August 2019].

⁸⁴ See 'Sintra Myths and Legends', *Sintra Capital do Romantismo* <<http://www.sintraromantica.net/en/museums/623-sintra-myths-and-legends>> [accessed 26 August 2019].

⁸⁵ 'La Ruta de al-Mutamid, de Sevilla a Lisboa', *El legado andalusí: Revista digital de la Fundación Pública Andaluza* <http://revista.legadoandalusi.es/n47_revista_el_legado_andalusi/las_artes_y_los_dias/la_ruta_de_al_mutamid_de_sevilla_a_lisboa>; *Umayyad Route* <<http://umayyad.eu/?q=umayyad-route>> [both accessed 26 August 2019].

⁸⁶ *ENI CBCMED* (2018) <<http://www.enicbcmec.eu/home>> [accessed 26 August 2019].

changes, there remains much to be done if the predominant image of the Algarve, in particular, is to change from one of sun, sea, sand to one of history and culture.

This introduction would not be complete without a consideration of this study's contemporary significance in a world where instances of Islamophobia make headlines almost daily. In this context, the study contributes to a greater understanding of how Islam forms a part of European and therefore Western history and cultural heritage. Recent political developments in Spain are also a reminder of how history can seem to repeat itself, for example in Chapter 3 I examine a controversy surrounding a proposal for a homage and plaque to the eleventh-century ruler and poet Al-Mutamid in Silves, Algarve, in the 1920s. In June 2019 it was reported that in Cadrete, a small town in north-east Spain, a bust of Abd al-Rahman III, the tenth-century Caliph of Cordoba, was removed by the new Town council. The far-right party Vox had previously initiated a petition to remove the bust, which had been donated in 2016. Vox councillor Jesús García Royo, who ordered the bust's removal, had stated that it did not represent today's society, however the removal of the bust was branded an intolerant and racist act by critics.⁸⁷

In terms of considerations of the question of Islamophobia in the Portuguese context, a recent article on Portugal by the British journalist Robert Fisk is of significance for this study. Fisk is familiar with both Portugal and the Arab world, having been posted to Portugal after the Carnation Revolution in 1974, and having subsequently been a Middle East correspondent for over 40 years. Here he argues that anti-Muslim ideology may be less prevalent in Portugal today for reasons relating to the country's history. Pointing out that Portugal's colonial past, including racism and slavery, did not involve

⁸⁷ Mario Sasot, 'Un concejal de Vox retira un busto de Abderramán III en un pueblo de Zaragoza', *La Vanguardia*, 19 June 2019 <<https://www.lavanguardia.com/politica/20190619/462969369062/busto-abderraman-iii-zaragoza-retirado-cadrete-vox.html>> [accessed 21 August 2019].

the Middle East, he argues that Portugal in fact had a particular respect for the Arabs as 'exotic and educated peoples whose own culture was never erased from the streets of Portugal's cities'.⁸⁸ As recent evidence of Portugal's more sympathetic attitude towards the Arabs, he cites Prime Minister Antonio Costa's statement that his country would receive 10,000 Syrian refugees. Admittedly, in reality far fewer have arrived, and Costa's statement might have as much to do with the ideological position of his centre-left government as with his country's historic links with Middle East. A further recent example is that of the Global Platform for Syrian Students, an initiative founded in 2013 by the former President of the Portuguese Republic and member of the Partido Socialista Jorge Sampaio, a man with strong humanitarian values. The platform has enabled Syrian students to study at universities both in Portugal and other participating countries with full and partial tuition fee waivers.⁸⁹

The contrast detected by Fisk between Portugal's attitude towards individuals from its former colonies and its more recent openness to celebrating its Arab-Islamic legacy has also been explored in detail by AbdoolKarim Vakil. Vakil has noted, in particular, the irony of Portugal continuing to ignore the needs of its Muslims today, whilst celebrating the memory of high-profile Muslims from Al-Andalus. An example he gives is the 1996 exhibition *Pelas Ruas e Lugares de Loures*, which aimed to reflect the changing identity of the community of the city of Loures in the outskirts of Lisbon, where many post-colonial immigrants had settled after 1974. In the exhibition, the Muslim community was represented by texts in Arabic, despite local Muslims being 'Indians

⁸⁸ Robert Fisk, 'There's a good reason why anti-Muslim ideology hasn't found a home in Portugal', *The Independent*, 23 February 2018.

<<https://edition.independent.co.uk/editions/uk.co.independent.issue.230218/data/8223506/index.html>> [accessed 22 August 2019].

⁸⁹ *Global Platform for Syrian Students* <<http://www.globalplatformforsyrianstudents.org>> [accessed 2 September 2019].

from Mozambique, for the greater part Gujarati-speaking, and Africans from Guinea'. Vakil notes that these individuals would have had Portuguese, Creole and Gujarati as their 'community' languages, and would only have been likely to have had a reading knowledge of Qur'anic Arabic, which would not have helped them to read modern Arabic.⁹⁰

There is of course a distinction to be made between beginning to recognise a centuries-old cultural legacy and facing up to the reality of contemporary economic migration from former colonies in Africa. The enthusiasm that has developed over recent decades for celebrating Portugal's Arab-Islamic legacy may suggest that the former is easier for some Portuguese than the latter. This is perhaps because it is easier for some to engage with a medieval Muslim, who is safely distanced from them in time by many hundred years, than with a Muslim they may meet in day-to-day life, or indeed because these different Muslims from different historical and cultural contexts are not perceived to have equal status. There is likely to be a further distinction still to be made between Muslims from former colonies, who speak Portuguese and are likely to integrate more easily, even if they are still the victims of discrimination, and other Muslims who do not come from the Portuguese ex-colonies and therefore do not speak Portuguese and might find it harder to integrate. Acknowledging the complexity of the current picture, the recognition of the legacy of Gharb Al-Andalus remains a useful pathway towards a greater understanding of a shared history that is Portuguese, Iberian, European but also Islamic. This study's examination of the efforts of travellers, novelists and journalists to represent Gharb Al-Andalus and its medieval Iberian Muslims is part of that story.

⁹⁰ Vakil, p. 41.

Chapter 1: Travel Writing on Portugal (1787-1891): A Comparative Perspective

This first chapter will examine representations of Al-Andalus in a corpus of British and French travel writing on Iberia from the period 1787-1891. Whilst the majority of authors in the corpus are selected because their travel writing on Portugal includes observations and reflections on Portugal's Islamic architecture, history and heritage, the remainder are chosen because they provide salient corresponding examples of travel writing on Spain. This comparative approach was adopted in order to investigate to what extent British and French travel writers from this period engaged with the idea of a Portuguese Orient, as occurred in travel writing on Spain with the construction of a Spanish Orient. If the engagement is lesser in travel writing on Portugal, it is also important to examine the reasons why this is the case.

The corpus I will be examining in this chapter consists of the following works: William Beckford's *Italy; with Sketches of Spain and Portugal, Vol. II* (1834) and *Recollections of an Excursion to the Monasteries of Alcobaça and Batalha* (London: Richard Bentley, 1835); Charles Davillier and Gustave Doré's *L'Espagne* (1874); Théophile Gautier's *Voyage en Espagne* (1843); Washington Irving's *Tales of the Alhambra* (1832); Catherine Jackson's *Fair Lusitania* (1874); Olivier Merson's *Guide du voyageur à Lisbonne* (1857); John Mason Neale's *Murray's Handbook for Travellers in Portugal* (1855); Edgar Quinet's *Mes vacances en Espagne* (1846); Marie Rattazzi's *Le Portugal à vol d'oiseau* (1879); Gabriel de Saint Victor's *Portugal: Souvenirs et Impressions de Voyage* (1891); Robert Southey's *Letters Written during a Short Residence in Spain and Portugal, with Some Account of Spanish and Portuguese Poetry* (1797) and *Journals of Residence in Portugal 1800-1801* (not published until 1960); and

Dorothy (Quillinan) Wordsworth's *Journey of a Few Months' Residence in Portugal and Glimpses of the South of Spain* (1847).

Taking as its starting point the important role of the French Romantics in disseminating the idea of an Oriental Spain, this chapter draws on the work of C.W. Thompson, whose volume *French Romantic Travel Writing* includes an important chapter on 'The "Orient" and Spain'.

¹ Thompson describes the aims of the French Romantic travel writers as being 'to wander freely and gratuitously, expanding and enriching their imaginative resources while exploring and testing their identities in encounters with others'.² He sees the best Romantic travel writing as being protean in nature, characterised by 'freedom, tensions, and variety of approaches'.³ And in terms of evocation of place, he considers that Romantic travel writers possessed 'a growing awareness of what would be required of the imagination of travellers if they were to do justice to the lands visited'.⁴ Although Thompson is writing specifically about the French context and about the travel writing authored between 1827 and 1850, the features he emphasises are useful in providing overall points of focus for this study. Since British Romantic travel writing developed earlier than French, the corpus includes earlier texts by the novelist William Beckford and the poet and literary scholar Robert Southey, who travelled at the close of the eighteenth century. It also extends to the work of later nineteenth-century British and French travel writers, whose work often attests to the pervasiveness of Romanticism (both style and concerns) in travel writing – if not throughout their work then certainly at specific moments and locations.

¹ C.W. Thompson, *French Romantic Travel Writing*, pp. 161-202.

² C.W. Thompson, p. 9.

³ C.W. Thompson, p. 192.

⁴ C.W. Thompson, p. 11.

As we shall see, the particular approach of the French Romantics was one that was dependent on an imaginative engagement with medieval history as well as place. The territory that was once Gharb Al-Andalus may not have had such impressive Islamic architectural remains as could be found in Andalusia, but there was still scope for travellers to engage with historical narratives, local legends or with other traces of Islamic culture. After providing literary context, the discussion will be structured thematically, considering first how authors wrote about battles and sieges, secondly their engagement with decorative architecture, thirdly the associations they make with gardens of paradise, and finally their thoughts on customs, echoes and traces of Islamic culture.

Romanticism and Al-Andalus

As discussed in the introduction to this thesis, Al-Andalus tends to be associated exclusively with Spain in the international consciousness, and this vision has been shaped to a large degree by travel writing. The widespread fascination with the narratives and monuments of medieval Iberia, including the presence of Islamic culture, can be explained when we consider the interests and concerns of the Romantics, one of which being, of course, an interest in medievalism, including medieval chivalry. In the European context, Al-Andalus had long been associated with warfare (and 'reconquest') through medieval literature such as the *romances fronterizos*, the *Cantar de mio Cid*, and the medieval chronicles. Patricia Hertel points out that: 'Though Islam hardly represented a territorial threat to Europe in the nineteenth century, it retained a

prominent and important role in the repertoire of European myths.⁵ The *romances fronterizos*, Spanish popular ballads about Moors and Christians, were frequently translated from the mid-eighteenth century onwards, and, as Diego Saglia notes: 'among antiquarians it was customary to consider Spanish *romances* about Moors and Christians as originally composed in Arabic and only later turned into Castilian poems'.⁶

The Romantic discourse on Spain converged in the works of Madame de Staël, brothers Friedrich and August Schlegel, and Swiss historian Simone de Sismondi at the beginning of the nineteenth century.⁷ Madame de Staël and her circle at Coppet on Lake Geneva turned their attention to Spain, rediscovering a culture which they saw as having developed on the margins of 'the European social, economic and philosophical frameworks that dominated the rest of Europe'.⁸ They were most fascinated by the Arabic and Moorish elements in Spanish history and culture, seeing them as outstanding markers of Iberian cultural difference. One of the apparent contradictions within Romantic theories of medieval Spain is that it seems predicated both on the idea of harmonious cultural fusion and that of fierce and lengthy resistance and warfare. There was also, of course, a more recent, nationalist factor at play here. The Peninsular War had begun in 1807 when Portugal was invaded by the French armies and their then allies, the Spanish. However, the Napoleonic army soon turned on Spain, and insurrections against the Napoleonic occupation in Spain in 1808 signalled the start of what the Spanish call the *Guerra de la independencia española* (1808-1814). Of these events, it

⁵ Hertel, pp 1-2.

⁶ Diego Saglia, "'The true essence of romanticism': Romantic theories of Spain and the question of Spanish romanticism', *Journal of Iberian and Latin American Studies*, 3:2 (1997) 127-145 <<https://doi.org/10.1080/13507499708569457>> p. 129.

⁷ According to Saglia, Friedrich Schlegel, the author of *Geschichte der alten und neuen Literatur* (1815), 'posited Spanish national identity as among the first to originate in Europe because the long fights against the Moors ensured that, at least until the decadence of the seventeenth-century, the whole literature was an unbroken sequence of monuments to the nation' (Saglia, p. 130).

⁸ Saglia, p. 129.

appears that the narrative of the heroic resistance of the Spanish was what most impacted the Romantics. Friedrich Schlegel's *Geschichte der alten und neuen Literatur*, published in 1815, was 'animated by the energy of the Spanish patriotic rising' and so emphasised 'the weight of the Spanish Romantic *Volksgeist* throughout the development of its literature', 'canonizing Spain as a Romantic symbol'.⁹

Simonde de Sismondi's *De la littérature du Midi de l'Europe* (1813) also marked a high point of this reformulation of Spain as the land of Romanticism. It devoted thirteen chapters to Spain's literary evolution, reflecting contemporary assumptions that the interpretation of a national literature could then lead to a wider and connected reflection on a country's history and character. Sismondi highlights the prolonged period of cultural contact between Christians and Moors, coupled with the presence of a culture of gallantry and chivalry in the Middle Ages,¹⁰ and the survival of certain national attitude of dignity among the Spanish up until the time that he was writing.¹¹ He also includes five chapters on Portuguese literature, in which he reflects on the Portuguese national character, at one point suggesting that there was an even greater influence of Moorish culture on the Portuguese than on the Spanish. On the fall of Islamic Portugal, he writes:

un plus grand nombre de Moçarabes se trouvant tout à coup incorporés à la nation, l'influence orientale se fit sentir sur eux plus vivement encore que sur les Castillans. L'amour occupa une partie plus grande encore de leur vie; il fut plus passionné, plus tendre, plus rêveur; et leur poésie est devenue un culte de leurs belles plus enthousiaste que celui d'aucun peuple de l'Europe.¹²

I would argue, however, that this isolated evaluation of the Portuguese character was not in itself sufficient to promote in a pervasive manner the idea of a Romantic Portugal,

⁹ Saglia, p. 130.

¹⁰ J.C.L. Simonde de Sismondi, *De la littérature du midi de l'Europe*, 4 vols (Paris: Treuttel et Würtz: 1829), I, p. 96.

¹¹ Sismondi, III, p. 110.

¹² Sismondi, IV, pp. 269-270.

and certainly not one which could match the image which had been created of a Romantic Spain. This is partly because Sismondi provides so much more detail in relation to Islamic Spain, and partly because, in a Foucaultian sense, the discourse on Portugal was easily submerged under the growing number of statements in other literature affirming the Romantic nature of Spain.

It is also important to note that in his study of the history of European literature Sismondi dwells on the literary heritage of Al-Andalus (and its influence on European poetry) but only in his chapters on Spain: he does not include or mention any poetry written in Arabic from Gharb Al-Andalus in his chapters on Portugal. We might conclude, therefore, that Sismondi's work privileges a view of Spanish history as being inherently Romantic far more than it does Portuguese history. Although he briefly emphasises Portugal's Islamic heritage, it is dealt with superficially, without providing the corresponding level of detail that he offers with regard to Spain.

Educated Travellers

Although travellers to Portugal between 1787 and 1891 varied in how much knowledge they had of Portuguese history, culture and literature, some would have been aware of key events from the early medieval period in the Portuguese national narrative, such as the Battle of Ourique (1139), and the sieges of Lisbon (1147), Santarém (1184), and Silves (1189). The Battle of Ourique is of particular importance because of its associated *lenda do milagre*, a foundation myth created in the sixteenth century.¹³ The legend tells

¹³ Alan Freeland, 'The People and the Poet: Portuguese National Identity and the Camões Tercentenary (1880)' in *Nationalism and the Nation in the Iberian Peninsula, Competing and Conflicting Identities*, ed. by Clare Mar-Molinero and Angel Smith (Oxford & Washington D.C.: Berg, 1996) pp. 53-67 (p. 63).

of the appearance of Saint James to Prince Afonso Henriques (and in later versions of the legend, Saint George, and finally Jesus Christ), promising not only victory for the Christian side but also an independent kingdom. This legend elevated the battle to a demonstration of divine will whereby a small Christian army were able to defeat a much larger one made up of the combined forces of five Muslim leaders.

Alexandre Herculano famously re-examined the Battle of Ourique in the first volume of his *História de Portugal* (1846), where he rejected the possibility of such divine intervention as a 'pious fraud', as well as reducing the size and importance of the battle to a mere skirmish. This ignited a polemic between Herculano and a number of historians who defended the legend as truth, among them António Caetano Pereira, who held the Chair of Arabic in Lisbon at the time and published a pamphlet criticising Herculano's version of events.¹⁴ According to Teófilo Braga, the Spanish Arabist Pascual de Gayangos examined Pereira's pamphlet and in 1852 wrote a long letter to Herculano, providing evidence of Pereira's ignorance of Arabic and his clumsy use of the Arabic texts to serve his intuition. This resulted in an intellectual victory for Herculano, with António Caetano losing his Chair of Arabic to Augusto Soromenho.¹⁵ Arabic studies in Portugal then entered into decline in the second half of the nineteenth century –there was no Chair in Arabic Studies in Portugal between 1869 and 1914.¹⁶ This of course would have limited the historical information on Portuguese Al-Andalus that was available both to the Portuguese people and to foreign visitors and writers.

Although some travellers would have had knowledge of some of the most important battles and sieges of the reconquest, they would not have been familiar with

¹⁴ António Caetano Pereira, *Commentário crítico sobre a advertência do 4º volume de A.Herculano* (Lisboa: Imprensa Nacional, 1853).

¹⁵ As narrated by Teófilo Braga in *História do Romantismo em Portugal - II* (Minho: Edições Vercial, 2014), p. 73. According to Braga, Gayangos' letter is dated 2 January 1852.

¹⁶ Von Kemnitz, p. 505.

any important Muslim figures from Portuguese Al-Andalus. The only exception might be that of Aben Afan, the hero of Almeida Garrett's poem *Dona Branca, ou a conquista dos Algarves* (1826), although no writer in the corpus mentions the poem or its hero.

British and French Attitudes

The different political relationship and history that Britain and France each had with Portugal has implications for the attitudes that British and French travellers each had towards the country. Pierre Rivas argues that French travellers historically had a greater interest in visiting Spain than Portugal, because compared to France's history of conflict with Spain, there had been almost no diplomatic conflicts between France and Portugal.¹⁷ Rivas writes: 'L'image de l'Autre est souvent médiatisée par les conflits: on cherche à connaître ou exorciser l'ennemi [...] Absence de frontières communes, donc de relations, d'intérêt pour la langue et la culture.'¹⁸ The exception, of course, is the Peninsular war (1807-1814), which saw Napoleon's forces invade and occupy Portugal, and also turn on and invade Spain, its former ally. For the French, therefore, both Spain and Portugal were territories that they had invaded and come close to possessing, and we would perhaps expect the Peninsular War to generate interest from French writers in Portugal. C.W. Thompson has noted in his study of French Romantic travel writers that:

¹⁷ Susana Margarida Carvalheiro Cabete, *A narrativa de viagem em Portugal no século XIX: alteridade e identidade nacional* (unpublished doctoral thesis, Université de la Sorbonne nouvelle - Paris III, 2010) <<https://tel.archives-ouvertes.fr/tel-00868637>> [accessed 1 September 2019], p. 251.

¹⁸ Pierre Rivas, 'Le Portugal dans les Lettres Françaises: permanence et mutation' in *Actes du Colloque: Images Réciproques France-Portugal (21-23 May 1992)* ed. by Francis Balle (Paris: Association pour le Développement des Études Portugaises, Brésiliennes, d'Afrique et d'Asie lusophones, 1994) pp. 161-162. Cited in Cabete, p. 251.

To the extent that the Romantics did indeed treat the world as a spectacle, it is not surprising then that almost all of them, of whatever political persuasion, showed themselves nostalgic for the prestige of Napoleon's Empire [...] we shall find them all seizing every opportunity to recall Napoleon and his battles, and doing so with a jealous eye on the rivalry with Britain.¹⁹

Nonetheless, it is widely accepted that during the Romantic period Portugal was largely forgotten by France and its travellers.²⁰ For Álvaro Manuel Machado and Daniel-Henri Pageaux, one of the reasons for this is simply the geographical position of the three countries, which means that Spain has historically functioned as a kind of screen between Portugal and France.²¹ C.W. Thompson has also noted, however, that the Romantics had a sensitivity to 'the porosity of frontiers'.²² If this is true, one would perhaps expect Romantic travellers to see past the frontiers of the two nation states, Spain and Portugal, and have a sense of the shape of the older early-medieval territories. Even if they did, this was not sufficient in most cases to encourage them to visit Portugal. Many avoided the country because earlier literature had denigrated it; it was viewed as a sort of accessory on the fringes of the main event, Spain, lacking in sufficient interest to warrant a visit. As Susana Cabete notes, there were comparatively few French travel writers writing on Portugal until the 1890s.²³

Britain, on the other hand, had enjoyed an alliance with Portugal since 1373 (the oldest alliance in the world still in force) and was finding new opportunities for trade with Brazil, Portugal's colony. The British, as well as securing Portugal, had joined the Spanish forces against Napoleon, with Spanish, Portuguese and British forces driving Napoleon's forces out of Spain in 1813. For Britain, an alliance with Portugal had

¹⁹ C.W. Thompson, *French Romantic Travel Writing*, p. 173. Edward Said also identifies the tendency in the writings of Edward Lane, Richard Burton, and Gérard de Nerval to offer a 'vision of Orient as spectacle, or *tableau vivant*' (Said 2003, p. 158).

²⁰ Cabete, p. 232.

²¹ Machado and Pageaux, p. 37.

²² C.W. Thompson, p. 164.

²³ Cabete, pp. 255-256.

historically been a way of hindering the development of a large European state on the Peninsula.²⁴ Over time, the development of trade relations and other economic ties had made Portugal practically economically dependent on Britain, which led to resentment amongst the Portuguese population through the nineteenth century. As Livermore notes, ‘the very word “inglês” was a synonym for “creditor”.’ It was popularly believed in Portugal that the English manipulated the Portuguese economy –and it was of course true that the English had lent considerable sums to the Portuguese state and these sums had been heavily discounted’.²⁵ For the British, then, interest in Portugal was primarily related to the two countries’ strategic alliance or to business. It is due to this history that British travellers in particular tended to visit Porto (English companies had produced Port wine there since the eighteenth century).

Nonetheless, one aspect which British and French travellers shared was their sense of cultural superiority over the Iberian Peninsula in general. Both British and French travellers had the self-assurance and sense of authority to feel able to critique the way of life that they observed. The intellectual discourse that these writers were exposed to assigned particular virtues to the Portuguese, sometimes in an apparently sympathetic manner, and justified them with reference to history. Sismondi, for example, includes the following description of the Portuguese:

La nation, partagée entre de hardis navigateurs, des soldats et des bergers, se montra plus propre à un grand développement d’énergie et de courage qu’à l’activité persistante de l’industrie. [...] il s’était accoutumé à tout, comme matelot et comme berger; mais dès qu’il ne sentait plus l’aiguillon des passions, il retombait dans son indolence rêveuse.²⁶

²⁴ Carlos Taibo, *Comprender Portugal* (Madrid: Los libros de la Catarata, 2015), p. 47.

²⁵ H.V. Livermore, *Portugal: A Short History* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1973), p. 171.

²⁶ Sismondi, IV, pp. 270-271.

The writings of Sismondi and others reveal how, before journeying, these travellers would have been exposed to and influenced by particular negative stereotypes being applied to Portugal.

This chapter will now proceed with a thematic analysis of the travel accounts in its corpus.

Battles and Sieges

This first thematic section concerns travellers' representations of Gharb Al-Andalus that deal primarily with warfare: fortifications, battles and sieges. Given the Romantic interest in medieval chivalry, a focus on these aspects is not surprising, however writers often tend to emphasise Christian valour in their accounts, rather than engaging with the Muslim experience of loss in the way that travel accounts about Granada, Spain, for example, had done. A focus on the key conflicts of the Christian reconquest also meant less emphasis on non-bellic aspects of Muslim culture (literature, family life, etc.). As previously discussed, the Battle of Ourique and its associated foundational myth was one of the key events of medieval Portuguese history concerning Muslims which would have been known to some travellers. However, apart from a stream of travellers visiting Évora, few travellers visited the Alentejo region where the battle took place, due to problems with accessibility, comfort and safety.

One of the earliest writers in the corpus, Robert Southey, visited the (alleged) site of the Battle of Ourique on his second visit to Portugal in 1800.²⁷ Southey writes in his journal:

²⁷ A commemorative pillory of the battle of Ourique was erected along the northern side of the Chapel of São Pedro das Cabeças in 1785.

I crossed the rivers Terres and Corbi which ran three days with blood. [...] I know not why the Teles which flows within 100 yards and the Ribeira dos Enamorados have been omitted in the fable. [...] The battle field itself is broken and not uninteresting – the fiction that as far as could be seen all was Moorish soldiers absurd – we saw Beja.²⁸

Written in the form of notes, Southey's journal entry deconstructs the legend, attempting to compare its claims to the visual evidence that he is presented with. Southey does not, however, attempt to put himself in the position of either of the two sides. At the time, he was carrying out the research for a planned *History of Portugal*, which he never completed.²⁹ The battles between Christians and Muslims clearly captured Southey's imagination prior to his trip to the Alentejo and Algarve, since back in Lisbon, he writes on 26 November 1800: 'I am up to my ears in chronicles – a pleasant day's amusement: but battles and folios, and Moors and monarchs, teaze me terribly in my dreams.'³⁰

Despite his lifelong interest in Portugal, Southey did not produce any detailed literary representations of Gharb Al-Andalus. His later poem, *Roderick last of the Goths* (1814), does contain references to particular places in Portugal, including the ruins of 'Conimbrica' (the Roman settlement of Conimbriga), the river Mondego, and the city of Coimbra, despite the poem being framed by scholars as a representation of Spanish history, rather than Iberian history as a whole.³¹ Southey's representation of Muslims in *Roderick* was profoundly influenced by his horror at the French invasion of Portugal and

²⁸ Robert Southey, *Journals of Residence in Portugal 1800-1801*, ed. by Adolfo Cabral (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1960), p. 40. Beja, a city in the Alentejo, was close to the battlefield.

²⁹ See Maria Zulmira Castanheira, 'Robert Southey, o primeiro lusófilo inglês', *Revista de Estudos Anglo-Portugueses*, 5 (1996) 59-120.

³⁰ Southey, *Journals of Residence in Portugal 1800-1801*, p. 139.

³¹ Southey, *Roderick last of the Goths*, 4th edn (London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, Orme and Brown, 1816). This is despite the fact that Southey connects the history of Spanish and Portuguese al-Andalus, as he himself remarks in his next letter dated Dec. 16, 1800: 'You know that, till Count Henrique's time, all that regards Spain equally regards Portugal; and indeed, a description of one people now needs little alteration to resemble the other.' Southey, *Journals of Residence in Portugal 1800-1801*, Letter to John May from Lisbon, dated Dec. 16, 1800, pp. 144-5.

Spain in the Peninsular War (1807-1814), despite the very different historical contexts.³²

The second page of the poem animalises the Muslim invaders by describing them as 'a cloud of locusts, whom the South | Wafts from the plains of wasted Africa'. It also emphasises the idea that Islam is morally inferior, by referring to the arriving Muslims as 'a dreadful brotherhood | In whom all turbulent vices were let loose'.³³ Muslims are also portrayed by Southey as oppressors of the inhabitants of the Peninsula, for example he writes that '[t]he daughters of the land' are '[n]ow masked in Moorish mufflers' when they go to the mosque.³⁴

Returning to our discussion of the representation of the Battle of Ourique, other references tend to reinforce the myth championing the valour of the Portuguese Christian army. An example is French writer Gabriel de Saint-Victor's account from 1891, which simply retells the myth without questioning it:

Nous traversons ensuite les champs d'Ourique. [...] La bataille dura depuis le matin jusqu'à midi et cinq chefs musulmans succombèrent dans ce combat avant lequel le roi avait prié pour avoir le courage qui lui fit remporter la victoire. C'est ainsi que l'on faisait les rois en 1138!³⁵

Accounts such as this reinforce a discourse which suggests that the point of interest of Portugal's medieval history is Christian valour in defeating the Moors, meaning that the presence of Islamic culture itself is not explored. Even the French writer Olivier Merson, who elsewhere celebrates the presence of the Orient in Lisbon, retells the myth unquestioningly. Merson, whose account *Guide du voyageur à Lisbonne* was published in 1857, does not visit the site of the battle but retells the story as part of the historical detail provided with the account of his visit to the Castello de São Jorge. Merson

³² The period 1808-1814 is known as the *Guerra de la Independencia española* in the Spanish-speaking world.

³³ *Roderick last of the Goths*, p. 2.

³⁴ *Roderick last of the Goths*, p. 34.

³⁵ Gabriel de Saint-Victor, *Portugal: Souvenirs et Impressions de Voyage* (Paris: Henri Gautier, 1891), pp. 219-220.

describes the Battle of Ourique as ‘terrible et décisive’ and recounts for the reader Afonso’s vision of the cross from the myth.³⁷ Elsewhere, however, he does acknowledge the element of luck that aided the Christian forces when Lisbon was besieged in 1147, writing:

Le *Conquistador* arrive enfin devant Lisbonne; il se dispose à chasser de cette grande cité jusqu’au dernier des Almoravides, et le hasard sert merveilleusement ce courageux dessein, en amenant dans les eaux du Tage une flotte de Croisés français et allemands.³⁸

Despite this, Merson’s account here nevertheless contributes to a discourse which, in its celebration of medieval chivalry and Christian victories, fails to engage meaningfully and imaginatively with the human experience of living in the medieval period, a period marked not only by conflict but also by cultural contact.

Returning to Robert Southey’s journal and letters from his visit to Portugal in 1800, these are notable in that he is one of the first travel writers of the modern period to travel to the Algarve, and specifically to Silves, one of the most important towns of Gharb Al-Andalus. Unfortunately, Southey is denied the opportunity to see the large Moorish cistern lying within the walls of the red castle, writing: ‘In vain we tried to see the cistern – the military Governor had the key – money or persuasions were useless.’³⁹ Neither does Southey reflect in his journal or letters on the symbolic or historic

³⁷ Olivier Merson, *Guide du voyageur à Lisbonne – histoire – monuments – mœurs* (Paris: Imprimeur du Sénat et de la Cour de Cassation, 1857), p. 86. Merson indicates that he left France to embark on a first trip to Portugal in July, and we can assume this was July 1956 as in an account of a second trip in April-May 1957 published in *Le Tour du Monde* he writes that he recognises a house he had visited the previous year. See Olivier Merson, ‘Voyage dans les provinces du nord du Portugal’ in *Le Tour du Monde : Nouveau Journal des Voyages*, ed. by M. Édouard Charton (Paris: Hachette, 1861), pp. 273-320 (p. 273). The account in *Le Tour du Monde* includes illustrations based on early photographs by Eugène Lefèvre: for more on this photographer see Nuno Borges de Araújo, ‘Portugal’, in *Encyclopedia of Nineteenth-Century Photography* ed. by John Hannavy (New York: Routledge Reference, 2008) pp. 1151-1154 (p. 1152). Merson’s second account does not add in any detailed way to his discussion of the Portuguese Orient, though it does show a desire to flesh out his version with an insider’s knowledge of the country. As Merson acknowledges (p. 320), prior to publication he supplemented the account with information taken from Portuguese sources, including statistics from António Augusto Teixeira de Vasconcelos’ *Les Contemporains Portugais, Espagnols et Brésiliens. Le Portugal et La Maison de Bragança* (Paris: Typ. Guirard, 1859).

³⁸ Merson, p. 88.

³⁹ Southey, *Letters Written during a Short Residence in Spain and Portugal*, p. 51.

importance of Silves, subjects which would be picked up a century later by Portuguese Algarve-centred writing. The siege of Silves is mentioned briefly by Olivier Merson, but solely as part of a list of King Sancho I's exploits. Merson limits himself to commenting in general on the horror of sieges, rather than focusing on a specific siege: 'Dans ce temps-là, les luttes étaient terribles; lorsqu'une cité céda sous les efforts d'un dernier assaut, le carnage était aussi grand que la colère des vainqueurs, affreux et prolongé autant que le désespoir des vaincus.'⁴⁰ Merson is better in general at invoking states of emotional experience than honing in on particular events and individuals.

Murray's *Handbook for Travellers in Portugal*, first published in 1855, and with a number of subsequent editions through into the 1880s, is attributed to the Anglican priest, scholar and hymn-writer John Mason Neale (1818-1866), and does include a visit to Silves, which is rare for the period.⁴¹ The *Handbook* is a detailed guidebook for the traveller, and Neale's style of writing tends to be factual and non-literary. Neale finds, initially, that in the Algarve there is 'little to engage the attention of the antiquary' given that the region has been exposed to 'the ravages of enemies and to the desolations of earthquakes'.⁴² However, Neale is careful to research Portuguese history, and discusses the siege of Silves in detail, including the presence of English crusaders. He writes: 'Herculano gives an interesting account of its capture by D. Sancho I. in 1189, though with that singular bias in favour of the Moors which he always displays.'⁴³

⁴⁰ Merson, p. 171.

⁴¹ See also Maria Zulmira Castanheira, 'Portugal: uma barbárie de pitorescas paisagens (Joseph Oldknow e John Mason Neale, dois ingleses entre nós em meados do século XIX)', *Revista de Estudos Anglo-Portugueses*, 3 (1994) 31-73. Castanheira mentions that Neale was accompanied by another Anglican priest, Joseph Oldknow: 'Uma barbárie de belas e pitorescas paisagens, eis, em resumo, a visão que formaram de Portugal os sacerdotes John Mason Neale e Joseph Oldknow. Trata-se, no fundo, de manter a imagem de um país retrógrado e paralisado por uma política e uma religião avessas à ideia de progresso' (pp. 68-69).

⁴² John Mason Neale, *Murray's Handbook for Travellers in Portugal. With a Travelling Map*, 2nd edn (London: John Murray, 1856), p. 54.

⁴³ Neale, p. 65.

Neale's position as an Anglican priest means that perhaps it is unsurprising that he resists any attempt to undermine a Christian-centred account. Nonetheless, he frequently taps into the local folklore at a time when Portugal's Islamic heritage was marginalised, and this folklore was the principal container and preserver of this heritage. For example, Neale refers to a visit to a cavern somewhere between Loulé and Faro, where legend has it Moors hid during the reconquest:

Hence by a wild track, known to but few, to the cavern called the Poço or Burraco dos Mouros, from a tradition that a large number of Moors took refuge here during the conquest of the country by D. Sancho II. It is of course necessary to come provided with torches; and the traveller will probably have to explore the cave by himself, as it is considered extremely unlucky to go into it.⁴⁴

Reading Neale's account, we get the sense of a Moorish heritage that is ever-present, even if the text does not employ the techniques of literary fiction. We get a sense of Neale being struck by the effects of time on particular places, with Silves in particular standing out. Neale writes: 'Chelb or Silves was the capital of Algarve under its Moorish sovereigns. It is now one of the most desolate and deserted places in Portugal, though still enjoying the title of a city.' This image of abandonment echoes Robert Southey's impressions of the Algarve but with added historical perspective. Whereas Southey was denied the opportunity, Neale is able to visit the 'magnificent' Moorish cistern, and finds that:

it has been restored and is now perfect. [...] The Moorish fortifications are in some places tolerably perfect: the detached towers, with their bridges of communication to the wall, are very curious, and command a good view of the adjacent country.⁴⁵

⁴⁴ Neale, p. 56. James Cavanagh Murphy also mentions a local legend when he writes about visiting a ruined Moorish bath at Sintra, but is disparaging about belief in the legend: 'There is a tradition among the common people, that treasures are hidden beneath the above ruins; and that under this bath are interred a Morisque King, with his treasures, in a tomb of brass, guarded by evil spirits. And not only the common people, but also those who, from their situation in life, ought to know better, give credit to these ridiculous tales.' *Travels in Portugal; through the provinces of Entre Douro e Minho, Estremadura and Alem-Tejo, in the years 1789 and 1790. Consisting of Observations on the Manners, Customs, Trade, Public Buildings, Arts, Antiquities, &c. of that Kingdom* (London: Printed for A. Strahan and T. Cadell Jun and W. Davies, 1795), p. 246.

⁴⁵ Neale, p. 65.

In summary, Neale's account presents Silves as a curiosity, providing the reader with some historical background, but again failing to account for Silves' symbolic status in the memory of Gharb Al-Andalus.

Although not concerned with Portugal, it is worth at this point turning briefly to Washington Irving's introduction to his work *Chronicle of the Conquest of Granada* (1829). Irving's interest in the drawn-out campaign to retake Granada, the final important stronghold of Muslim Al-Andalus, reveals the characteristic Romantic fascination with cultural contrasts and medieval chivalry:

It [the war of Granada] possessed sufficient interest in the striking contrast presented by the combatants of Oriental and European creeds, costumes, and manners, and in the hardy and hare-brained enterprises [...] when the old Moorish towers and castles, that for ages had frowned defiance to the battering rams and catapults of classic tactics, were toppled down by the *lombards* of the Spanish engineers. It was one of those cases in which history rises superior to fiction.⁴⁶

Despite the author's preoccupation here with the detail of warfare, it is the work's portrayal, elsewhere, of a weak and naive Boabdil which is arguably of more lasting import. Although less influential culturally than Irving's *Tales from the Alhambra* (1832), the very existence of *Chronicle of the Conquest of Granada* prompts the question as to why there is no Romantic narrative written about the battles and sieges of the fall of Portuguese Al-Andalus.

Boabdil is a prominent example of an emotive historical figure who travel writers were able to engage with in their reflections concerning Iberian Al-Andalus. One such writer is the French Romantic historian Edgar Quinet (1803-1875), who, as Edward Said notes, coined the term Oriental renaissance ('renaissance orientale' in the original French) to describe the 'new awareness of the Orient' experienced by 'a wide variety of

⁴⁶ Washington Irving, *Chronicle of the Conquest of Granada: The Final War to Expel Muslim Rule During the 15th Century* (United Kingdom: Leonaur, 2011).

thinkers, politicians and artists' in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries.⁴⁷

Quinet published a travel account, *Mes vacances en Espagne*, in 1846, which also includes a brief account of a visit to Lisbon at the end of the narrative. When Quinet leaves Granada earlier in his trip, he remembers Boabdil as he approaches a particular feature of the landscape and puts himself in his shoes:

A l'extrémité de la plaine, nous commençâmes à gravir une montagne abrupte dans le lit rocailleux d'un torrent. En grimpant cette rampe, je me souvins du roi Boabdil; je me retournai comme lui, et j'entendis à loisir dans les fentes des rochers le *soupir du dernier des rois maures*.⁴⁸

Quinet's identification with Boabdil leads to a reflection on loss, both Boabdil's loss of the city of Granada and a personal loss in the author's life:

O bon roi Boabdil, que tu as raison de pleurer! Où retrouveras-tu jamais en Orient une autre Grenade? Arrête-toi ici, au détour de ce ravin, et contemple une dernière fois ce que tu as perdu pour toujours. Vois la montagne d'Elvire qui dresse sa tente bleue, au bord de l'oasis! vois *le cyprès de la sultane* dans le Généralife abandonné. Écoute ce cri de joie parti de ton Alhambra, et répété au loin par sous les objets. Tu ne l'entendras plus. Si tu le veux, je pleurerai en secret avec toi; car j'avais aussi un royaume enchanté. Il renfermait, comme le tien, un palais tout rempli de promesses et de paroles magiques; et je suis arrivé à ce sombre seuil de la vie, d'où il faut que je dise adieu aux Tours Vermeilles qui m'ont abrité jusqu'ici.⁴⁹

Boabdil's imagined pain at looking upon Granada for the last time, and of being able to still witness its perfection even when it has already fallen out of his possession, makes the scene all the more compelling. The extent of Quinet's identification with Boabdil shows the potential for travel writers to identify with historical figures distanced from them by centuries, thanks to the presence of narratives and the role of the landscape in facilitating this process of identification.⁵⁰ Of course, the Boabdil legend was very much present in the European imaginary, not only through narrative but also painting. Oscar E. Vázquez's study has highlighted that it was 'through prints and salon paintings that

⁴⁷ Said, *Orientalism*, p. 42. Edgar Quinet, 'De la renaissance orientale', *Revue des Deux Mondes*, 28 (1841) 112-130.

⁴⁸ Edgar Quinet, *Mes vacances en Espagne* (Paris: Comptoir des imprimeurs-unis, 1846), p. 284.

⁴⁹ Quinet, pp. 285-286.

⁵⁰ The drama of this loss is also narrated by Charles Davillier, who writes: 'On assure qu'en regardant pour la dernière fois le paradis terrestre qu'il allait quitter pour une terre ingrate et sauvage, il s'écria –*Allah akhbar!*' Davillier, Charles and Doré, Gustave, *L'Espagne* (Paris: Hachette, 1874), p. 228.

the Boabdil legend –the one which most frequently represented the act of looking at the lost object, the Alhambra– was popularized and disseminated’.⁵¹ The absence not only of literary narratives but also of corresponding images must surely be a factor in preventing the identification of travellers with important Muslim figures from Gharb Al-Andalus.

A further useful comparative example is that of French writer Charles Davillier’s *L’Espagne* (1874), a partial version of which was published as ‘Voyage en Espagne’ in *Le Tour du Monde* (1864).⁵² Davillier was accompanied on his trip to Spain by Gustave Doré, who produced illustrations of scenes from the trip. A hispanophile, Davillier’s knowledge of Spanish history and literature sets him apart from other travel writers of his day to the Iberian Peninsula. Davillier’s account is also notable for his balanced treatment of the question of wartime atrocities committed by both sides during the reconquest. When writing of his visit to the Valle de Lecrín south of Granada, Davillier describes the sixteenth-century Morisco revolts that occurred there: ‘Les atrocités les plus révoltantes furent commises des deux côtés; on était arrivé à ne plus faire ni trêve ni quartier: à Guecija, les Mores s’emparièrent des moines du couvent des Augustins et les firent bouillir dans l’huile’.⁵³ Davillier’s approach to travel writing includes extensive research and a somewhat detached style, but we also see a more human side, as can be seen both in his playful interactions with local people and in the empathy that he feels for both Christians and Muslims caught up in conflicts and suffering.

⁵¹ In fact, while the images would have influenced travellers prior to their journeys, they were themselves constructed using the image or experience of travellers. Vázquez writes: ‘Tales of travellers, or of those earlier expelled from the Alhambra, looking at the site were key in the translation of narratives of nostalgia and lost empires into text and image’. Oscar E. Vazquez, ‘Vision, Lamentation and Nineteenth-century Representations of the End of al-Andalus’, *Art in Translation*, 9:1 (2017), 71-91, <<https://doi.org/10.1080/17561310.2017.1303994>> pp. 73-74.

⁵² ‘Voyage en Espagne’ in *Le Tour du Monde* ed. by Édouard Charton (Paris: Hachette, 1864) pp. 1-32; 353-416.

⁵³ Davillier, *L’Espagne*, p. 231.

Davillier's style contrasts with that of earlier Romantic travel writers such as Théophile Gautier, Prosper Mérimée and Edgar Quinet, who engage with what they see in a particularly imaginative way. According to C.W. Thompson, for these earlier writers the 'illumination of spectacles by historical awareness mostly takes the form of a sudden opening out from the present onto the past in more or less well-informed reverie', rather than 'an attempt at some integral resuscitation of history'.⁵⁴ We can see this, for example, when Edgar Quinet climbs to the top of the Alcázar in Toledo, and puts himself in the shoes of a Moorish king:

Quand le roi maure, assis au haut de l'Alcazar, voyait autour de lui ces montagnes pelées, ces gorges tortueuses, ce fleuve changé en torrent, la ville serrée dans une ceinture de granit, qui se dénoue sur une oasis, il devait se dire : ce mélange d'Arabie Pétrée et d'Arabie Heureuse est à moi par le droit d'héritage. La terre et le ciel le confirmaient dans son autorité. De Damas arrivé à Tolède, il retrouvait en toute chose le sceau d'Allah sur une nature pierreuse; point d'ombre, l'air transparent de l'Yémen, une montagne qui se courbe sous les mosquées, comme un chameau chargé au bord d'une fleuve.⁵⁵

Quinet's reflection here focuses on the experience of possession of and authority over a territory and particular landscape. It is a reflection that has both performative and poetic elements, for example the simile comparing the mountain to a laden camel. It should be noted that Quinet's writing also reflects an essentialist view of Islamic religious culture. Quinet's earlier work, *Du Génie des religions* (1842) is often cited as having a strong influence on Orientalist discourse, due to its essentialist portrayals of different (world) religions.

Olivier Merson's travel account (from 1857) is often reminiscent of Quinet's travel writing, with its characteristic reveries. Though, as we shall see, Merson is alert to any traces of the Orient in Portugal, he is more likely to look at history with a broad sweep than to put himself in the shoes of a specific historical figure. An example is the

⁵⁴ C.W. Thompson, *French Romantic Travel Writing*, p. 174.

⁵⁵ Quinet, pp. 212-213.

following extract in which Merson discusses the lasting impact of Islamic culture in Portugal:

Chassés par un aventurier heureux, les soldats du Prophète ont laissé, derrière eux, comme une traînée de leurs mœurs. Ils sont partis, violemment rejetés loin de ces rives qu'ils avaient eux-mêmes conquises, et que, depuis des siècles, ils considéraient comme leur propriété; mais c'est en vain qu'ils ont emmené avec eux leurs artistes et leurs poètes, leur Croissant et leurs harems: dans ces contrées leur long séjour reste gravé en caractères ineffaçables, sur les monuments, dans le langage, dans les habitudes, dans les traditions.

Without providing specific historical details, Merson here emphasises both the idea of a violent expulsion and of indelible traces of culture left behind, traces which are present not only physically, for example on historical buildings, but also in what we would call nowadays intangible heritage, that is to say, in traditions and customs. His account stands out amongst the travel accounts on Portugal from this chapter's corpus because of his enthusiastic embrace of the idea of an Islamic cultural heritage which still permeates Portuguese society. Merson is also the most successful at transposing Romantic visions of an Oriental Spain onto Lisbon. We can see this, for example, in the emphasis he places on the idea of there being a continuity of a particular physiognomy: 'les soldats des califes ont, du reste, été pareils à tous ces peuples autrefois puissants, aujourd'hui disparus sans retour, mais dont la physionomie et le type se retrouveront éternellement dans les régions qu'ils dominèrent jadis'.⁵⁶ We can also perhaps sense in Merson's account an admiration for the enduring traces that empire leaves on the cultures that it dominates, an admiration that can also be found in other French Romantic travel writing.

Amongst the British travel writers in my corpus the earliest traveller was William Beckford, who first visited Portugal in 1787 and again in 1793-6 and 1798-9, although his two travel accounts were not published until 1834 and 1835 respectively.⁵⁷ Miguel

⁵⁶ Merson, pp. 74-75.

⁵⁷ Pietro Deandrea, 'The hegemonic outsider: William Beckford's Lisbon journal', *Studies in Travel Writing*, 14:3 (2010), 225-239

Rogério Puga has examined the presence of the medieval imaginary in Beckford's work, mainly Beckford's interest in the architecture of the Alcobaça and Batalha monasteries, which Beckford visited in 1794, although he also briefly examines Beckford's few statements on Moorish fortified architecture.⁵⁸ Beckford's first travel account had been disparaging about the Moorish remains he saw at Sintra, remarking that they were 'scarcely worth notice, and indeed seem never to have made part of any considerable edifice'.⁵⁹ However, in his later account, *Recollections of an Excursion to the Monasteries of Alcobaça and Batalha*, looking back at his trip to the two monasteries in 1794, Beckford is more impressed by Alcobaça castle, describing it as 'invitingly picturesque, with its varied outline of wall and tower'.⁶⁰ The concept of the picturesque was itself developed by William Gilpin (1724-1804) who defined a set of principles of picturesque beauty based on those of landscape painting. For Gilpin, the picturesque needed to combine both the idea of beauty, associated with regularity, and the sublime, which was associated with magnitude and power. A product of his influence was what Charles Batten calls the 'picturesque tourist', who would often 'criticiz[e] the landscape as an art critic would', and it is this tendency that we see here in Beckford's appreciation of Alcobaça castle.⁶¹

(233) <<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/13645145.2010.500098>> [accessed 29 July 2019]. William Beckford, *Italy; with Sketches of Spain and Portugal*, 2 vols (London: Richard Bentley, 1834), II. *Recollections of an Excursion to the Monasteries of Alcobaça and Batalha* (London: Richard Bentley, 1835).

⁵⁸ Rogério Miguel Puga, 'Through the Stained Glass Window: O Imaginário Medieval(izante) na obra lusitanista de William Beckford', *Revista de Estudos Anglo-Portugueses*, 12 (2003) 61-84 (pp. 71-75).

⁵⁹ Beckford, *Italy; with Sketches of Spain and Portugal*, II, p. 180.

⁶⁰ In fact, the 'Moorish' castle was ruined several times during the reconquest and was rebuilt by the Christians.

⁶¹ Batten also quotes Gilpin on Tintern Abbey as an example of such criticism of architectural landscape, and underlines the part played by picturesque descriptions in travel literature in the development of the Romantic sensibility. Batten writes: 'Much romantic poetry, for example, attempts to convey the impression of having been composed on the spot at a particular time.' Charles Batten, *Pleasurable Instruction: Form and Convention in Eighteenth-Century Travel Literature* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1978), p. 114.

Beckford also describes how, on his way back to Lisbon, he catches sight of Alfeizerão castle (as identified by Puga).⁶² He writes: 'At some distance we saw a Moorish castle, standing proudly on an insulated eminence, presenting a grand mass: it bears also a grand name: Alafagirão.' Beckford's response to the particular sound of the Arabic name reveals the powerful and emotive impact that such Arabic place names had on travellers, in conjuring up the past. Here, the name contributes to the 'proud' character that Beckford perceives the 'grand mass' of the castle to possess.⁶³

British travellers to Portugal in the nineteenth century were more likely than the French to visit the north of the country, due to Britain's trade links with Porto. They also favoured Sintra, where, within the period in question and into the 1900s, a number of pleasure palaces were built. However, Sintra also boasts a Moorish castle as well as a National Palace with sixteenth-century Islamic revival tiles (*azulejos*). For the purposes of this study, it is therefore important to look at travellers' evaluations of the relative merits of the medieval remains and surviving architecture in comparison to the recently-built Orientalist pleasure palaces in Sintra, and this part of the analysis shall begin by looking at the travel account of Dora Wordsworth.

Written in 1845-46, Dora Wordsworth's *Journal of a Residence in Portugal and Glimpses of the South of Spain* (first published in 1847 under the name Dora Quillinan) is written under the influence of Romanticism (she was, after all, the daughter of William Wordsworth). It is, however, tinged with disappointment. From Dora Wordsworth onwards, as we shall see, literary-minded travel writers expressed their sadness that Portugal, and particularly Sintra, did not turn out to be the paradise evoked by William Beckford's lyrical prose. Like many other travel writers, Wordsworth does little more

⁶² Puga, p. 75.

⁶³ Beckford, *Recollections of an Excursion*, p. 170.

than mention the fortified Castelo dos Mouros in Sintra (which was being restored at the time of her visit).⁶⁴ In contrast, later on her trip, she visits Andalusia, and shows greater interest in the fortifications near Seville, writing: 'The hill behind those copses is encircled by the Moorish wall and crowned by a Moorish castle, peculiarly interesting as the spot where the Moors made their last stand, after they had lost Seville.'⁶⁵ Her account suggests that information about the fall of Seville had been made available to her, and that it was likely to have been presented in a compelling way.

In Lisbon, on the other hand, Wordsworth writes: 'The History of Portugal – the most romantic of histories – is still unwritten; so we must console ourselves with such a one as we may get from Senhor Herculano, librarian to the king-consort.'⁶⁶ In this sense Wordsworth's view of Portugal echoes Romantic theories of Spain: Diego Saglia has traced the (often contradictory) evolution of the view that Spanish history, with its clashes and fusions of different cultures, was essentially Romantic, as part of his study of the evolution of the discourse of Romanticism.⁶⁷ Wordsworth's use of the word 'console' in the above quotation may refer to the fact that only the first part of Herculano's *História de Portugal* had been published by this point. Nonetheless, the absence of a similar resource in English to Herculano's *História de Portugal* reveals the difficulty for British writers of this period to obtain detailed knowledge of the Islamic presence in Gharb Al-Andalus. In this sense Wordsworth was in a fortunate position, as

⁶⁴ Dorothy (Quillinan) Wordsworth, *Journey of a Few Months' Residence in Portugal and Glimpses of the South of Spain* (London and New York: Longmans, Green & Co, 1895), p. 162.

⁶⁵ Wordsworth, p. 197.

⁶⁶ Wordsworth, p. 186. Alexandre Herculano, *História de Portugal: 1.ª época, desde a origem da monarquia até D. Afonso III*, 4 vols (Lisbon: Viúva Bertrand e Filhos, 1846-1853). Wordsworth would only have had access to the first part, published in 1846, in which Herculano famously rewrote the mythic version of the battle of Ourique.

⁶⁷ Diego Saglia, "'The true essence of romanticism': Romantic theories of Spain and the question of Spanish romanticism", *Journal of Iberian and Latin American Studies*, 3:2 (1997), 127-145, <<https://doi.org/10.1080/13507499708569457>>.

her husband, Edward Quillinan was a Portuguese speaker, and as Katie Waldegrave writes, it was Quillinan who added historical material to his wife's journal.⁶⁸

A later account, Lady Catherine Jackson's illustrated *Fair Lusitania* (1874), sets out to both celebrate and defend Portugal as an attractive and culturally rich destination at a time when it did not enjoy a favourable reputation in these regards among the British. When visiting the site of the former *San Bento* convent in Lisbon, Jackson comes across the royal archives housed there. Jackson remarks: 'What a world of romance and sensational incident must be contained in these historical records! For the history of Portugal is certainly the most romantic of histories'.⁶⁹ Jackson here echoes Dora Wordsworth in defining Portuguese history as inherently Romantic, suggesting a certain ideological continuity between the two writers. However, Jackson's additional emphasis on 'sensational incident' is more suggestive of the search for real-life melodrama that can be seen in travel writing on Iberia from the mid nineteenth century onwards, reflecting a change in aesthetic values and the growing popularity of melodramatic forms in the nineteenth century.

In her account, Jackson mentions that she is disappointed not to be able to visit Santarém, both on account of its medieval history (she mentions the date it was taken from the Moors by Afonso Henriques, 1147) and also because it is the location of the story of Joaninha from Almeida Garrett's *Viagens na minha terra*.⁷⁰ Later, when visiting the Alcobaça monastery, Jackson gives the following account of the siege of Santarém:

Dom Affonso, when about to attack the Moors, who held Santarem with a garrison of 4,000 men –his own troops amounting only to two hundred and fifty– before setting out on his enterprise, vowed to God, if He gave him the victory, to devote as much land in the direction of the sea as was visible to the naked eye in the erection and support of an abbey. [...] Santarem was entered

⁶⁸ Waldegrave does however consider these additions to be 'heavy, dull and poorly integrated'. Katie Waldegrave, *The Poets' Daughters: Dora Wordsworth and Sara Coleridge* (London: Windmill Books, 2014), p. 291.

⁶⁹ Catherine Jackson, *Fair Lusitania* (London: Bentley & Son, 1874), p. 110.

⁷⁰ Jackson, p. 248.

by stratagem, and the Moors routed out. Affonso then founded his abbey on the site where now stands the present grand edifice, which dates from the early part of the thirteenth century. The whole history of the foundation of the convent is quaintly depicted on the *azulejos* that line the walls of the Hall of the Kings.⁷¹

Jackson does not comment on the irony of using *azulejos* (a word of Arabic origin, to describe tilework with unmistakeable Arab influences) to depict such scenes. Her account focuses on the bellic-heroic aspects of the siege from the Christian perspective and fails to challenge the authority of this Christian-centred account. Neither does it draw on the emotive aspects which tend to be present when writers of the period discuss the fall of Muslim Granada. Nonetheless, the undermining of the male Christian conqueror can be seen elsewhere in Jackson's travel account, for example when she is visiting a museum in Porto and writes:

we did our best to go into ecstasies over the plumed cocked-hat and the field-glass of Dom Pedro IV., and the rusty sword-blade said to have belonged to that redoubtable slayer of the Moors, Dom Affonso Henriques –for these seemed to be held in greater veneration than any other of the treasures belonging to the institution.⁷²

For Jackson, while the male Christian narrative is fair game to be undermined with use of humour, her aim is not to provide an alternative perspective on Portuguese Al-Andalus.

Jackson's travelogue was warmly received in Portugal, to the extent that it was translated by one of the most important novelists of the day, Camilo Castello Branco (published as *A formosa Lusitania*, 1877).⁷³ Camilo was, however, less impressed by another travel account from the period, Marie Rattazzi's *Le portugal à vol d'oiseau* from 1879 (translated into Portuguese as *Portugal de Relance* in 1882).⁷⁴ Born in Ireland and

⁷¹ Jackson, p. 377.

⁷² Jackson, p. 307.

⁷³ See Maria Zulmira Castanheira, 'O "aborrecido lavor de traduzir": Camilo Castello Branco, tradutor de Lady Jackson', *Revista de Estudos Anglo-Portugueses*, 16 (2007), 119-134.

⁷⁴ Marie Rattazzi, *Le Portugal à vol d'oiseau* (Paris, A. Degorce-Cadot, 1879). Translated as *Portugal de relance* (Lisbon: Henrique Zeferino, 1882).

a descendant of Napoleon, Rattazzi was a literary hostess, writer, and a controversial figure in French society, often rebelling against social norms in a manner that scandalised conservative French society of the time. Camilo disliked Rattazzi's criticism of Portugal and the inaccuracies that he perceived to lie in her work, and published a critical pamphlet concerning her travel account in 1880.⁷⁵ Rattazzi's writing, even more so than Jackson's, shows characteristics of the Orientalist concerns of the period, in which an appreciation of eclecticism and fantasy are more evident than the appreciation of a building's authenticity based on its age or historical function. When visiting Sintra, Rattazzi notes that '[l]e château de la Penha domine les ruines du château des Maures auxquelles le panorama qui déroule à ses pieds n'emprunte pas peu de son aspect grandiose'.⁷⁶ As such, the Moorish castle is somewhat diminished by the new construction of Pena Palace, in Rattazzi's eyes.

Even Olivier Merson, who is generally enthusiastic about traces of Islamic culture in Portugal, is less positive about the Castle of the Moors in Sintra. He writes:

Le sinistre château des Maures s'enroule autour d'une aiguille désolée et c'est au mieux; – se dressant radieux en plein milieu d'un pyramidal bouquet de verdure et de fleurs, le palais de la Pena se présente aux regards dans toute l'harmonie d'une toilette éclatante de jeunesse et de sourires.⁷⁷

For Merson, therefore, the Pena Palace represents the joyful innocence of youth, whereas the much older Moorish castle, by contrast, is perceived as sinister. For Merson, such a perception is linked to his imagining the castle walls as painful witnesses of past crimes and human suffering: 'Si elles pouvaient parler, les pierres de cette muraille arabe, quels crimes ne diraient-elles pas? qu'elles [*sic*] horreurs n'ont-elles pas abritées? quels coupables n'ont-elles pas défendus? Eh, mon Dieu!'⁷⁸ Here Merson's

⁷⁵ Camilo Castelo Branco, *A Senhora Rattazzi* (Porto: Livraria Internacional de Ernesto Chardron, 1880).

⁷⁶ Marie Rattazzi, *Le Portugal à vol d'oiseau* (Paris, A. Degorce-Cadot, 1879) p. 242.

⁷⁷ Merson, pp. 208-209.

⁷⁸ Merson, p. 204.

account again draws on the writing of Quinet, who, as Thompson analyses and as I shall explore further below, has a 'predilection for rhetorically asking the ghosts of history and monuments to speak'.⁷⁹ Merson's gothic description of Sintra's 'sinister' Moorish walls, in contrast to his more positive writing on the Portuguese Orient in his account as a whole, further demonstrates the vague and unstable significance of the Moorish castle to travel writers of the period.

As we have seen in this section, travellers in this period struggled to engage emotively with the Moorish castles and with the battles and sieges of Portuguese Al-Andalus, limiting themselves to short remarks on the presence of castles and detached discussions of battles and sieges. This is in contrast to comparative travel writing in Spain which engaged more meaningfully with the human experience of warfare in Spanish Al-Andalus. Nonetheless, travellers to Portugal during this period also express a desire to be better acquainted with the knowledge that would perhaps have enabled a more profound engagement with such events.

Decorative Architecture and its Symbolism

Late eighteenth- and nineteenth-century travellers to Portugal were not only interested in fortified architecture, with its reminiscences of an age of medieval warfare and chivalry. They also looked for Oriental palaces, and although some were inspired by the architecture of Al-Andalus, they were all of later construction. For the travellers in this chapter's corpus, the question of the historical authenticity of these monuments was often less important than the feelings and sensations that they incited. In this sense, the

⁷⁹ C.W. Thompson, p. 197. In Quinet's account he does this in Burgos (p. 15), Toledo (pp. 209-11), and in Cordoba (p. 319-320).

focus of travel writing on Portugal shows a departure from travel writing on Moorish architecture of Spain. As Lou Charnon-Deutsch has described, travellers had, since the eighteenth century, come to Spain to admire both 'Arab architecture and ancient wisdom'.⁸⁰ They were inspired by works such as James Cavanagh Murphy's *Arabian Antiquities of Spain* (1813), with its 'intricate engravings of Moorish architecture and art,' which 'fed Europe's taste for the visual vestiges of ancient empires'. Charnon-Deutsch adds that this 'love of things Moorish, or "maurophilia" as it has been called, would continue well into the second half of the [nineteenth] century'.⁸¹ However, the attraction to Moorish architecture was not merely about difference. As Thompson has noted in relation to the French Romantic travel writers, travellers were 'impelled by a sharp impatience with the growing uniformity of life in Northern Europe and its constraints on their spirits and bodies'. The Moorish architecture in Spain, on the other hand, seemed to suggest 'cultural energies [...] that might be capable of producing changes'.⁸² However, Thompson also notes the naivety of these quests, which 'were also coloured by the sheer pleasure of adventure, temporary disorientation, and curiosity'.⁸³ Interpretations of architecture in Spain were also influenced by the travellers' prior reading, which would have been likely to contain essentialist views of Arabic-Islamic culture and Islam.

This section will first examine examples of travellers' reactions to and interpretations of Moorish architecture in Spain, and then show how travellers' descriptions of Moorish and Orientalist architecture (of later construction) in Portugal were both influenced by and departed from travel writing on Spain.

⁸⁰ Charnon-Deutsch, p. 51.

⁸¹ Charnon-Deutsch, p. 180.

⁸² C.W. Thompson, pp. 161-162.

⁸³ C.W. Thompson, p. 168.

Our discussion on Spain begins with Washington Irving, who in *Tales of the Alhambra* describes how the 'light, elegant and voluptuous character' of the Moorish architecture of the Alhambra invited a contrast with the 'gloomy solemnity of the Gothic edifices'. The use of the adjective 'voluptuous' here is an example of a feminised description of Moorish architecture. For Irving, the Alhambra palace is the site of creative energy precisely because it triggers the traveller's imagination, even if he concedes that the images conjured up are illusions:

The peculiar charm of this dreamy palace is its power of calling up vague reveries and picturings of the past, and thus clothing naked realities with the illusions of the memory and the imagination. I am prone to seek those parts of the Alhambra which are most favourable to this phantasmagoria of the mind.⁸⁴

Edgar Quinet, on the other hand, identifies the fact that the Alhambra palace exists in the traveller's mind prior to his or her arrival in Granada, and also expects his reader to have the same experience:

Qui ne s'est bâti, une fois, en imagination, son palais des rois maures! [...] Alhambra! Avec cette parole mystérieuse, vous avez traversé impatiemment le grand désert d'Espagne; vous arrivez rempli d'une soif ardente de joie, de paix, d'amour, de délices, comme si ce nom magique, entr'ouvrant des trésors enfouis, allait payer, en un moment, des années d'attente.⁸⁵

Quinet captures here the huge symbolic weight that the word 'Alhambra' carries for the Northern European Romantic traveller, as well as the huge expectations that this traveller would have.

Olivier Merson, whose account draws on Edgar Quinet, but who was unable to visit Granada due to travel restrictions imposed after a cholera outbreak, writes:

mais nous avions tant rêvé de Séville et de son Alcazar, de Cordoue, la cité des califes, de l'Alhambra, de Grenade [...] qu'en vérité nous ne pouvions, sans pousser un cri de douleur, assister à l'écroulement subit de tout cet échafaudage élevé par une curiosité ardente et par une imagination enthousiaste. Que de songes, grand Dieu! Évanouis en un instant! Nous avions espéré surprendre des sérénades galantes sous les balcons obscurs, ou des œillades de hardies senoras [sic] au travers d'une jalousie entre-baillée; nous voulions aussi toucher à ces magiques murailles

⁸⁴ Washington Irving, *Tales of the Alhambra* (Granada: Ediciones Miguel Sánchez, 2002), p. 77. The work was first published as *The Alhambra: a series of tales and sketches of the Moors and Spaniards* in 1832. Irving revised the work and it was republished in 1851 as *Tales of the Alhambra*.

⁸⁵ Quinet, p. 247.

ciselées au gré des plus merveilleux caprices par les Maures, ces colosses de l'Orient, vaincus par cinq siècles d'incomparables plaisirs.⁸⁶

Merson's description of his disappointment also reveals his awareness that his imagined idea of the Alhambra is a scaffold which can be toppled in an instant –a lofty but fragile construction. Oscar E. Vázquez has described how in European romanticism:

the Alhambra becomes the very object of the irreconcilable or unattainable ideal. [...] not only is vision and the act of looking at the Alhambra central to this mythologized, albeit European romantic, identity, but one is burdened with the signs of history, decay as a metaphor for loss, and connotations of nostalgia.⁸⁷

The Alhambra therefore carries a heavy symbolic burden for the Romantics and is associated both with desire and with loss. Later in the nineteenth century, Alhambrism would also become increasingly popular in European decorative arts.

Although Prosper Mérimée and Théophile Gautier's travel accounts are better known today, Edgar Quinet's account is of particular importance for this study. Quinet brings a particular vision to his travel writing, as a Romantic historian influenced by his German contemporaries and their views on historical development. He was also guided by his own belief that historical development had a specific religious significance.⁸⁸ C.W. Thompson's perceptive analysis identifies many important aspects of Quinet's interpretation of Andalusian Moorish architecture. In Cordoba and Granada, Thompson writes:

with a better command of existing translations of the Koran than Gautier or Custine, Quinet highlighted the analogy between the two faces of Islam, militant as well as edenic, and the architectural dualities of the mosque complex in Cordoba and the fortified palace of the Alhambra.

⁸⁶ Merson, pp. 50-51.

⁸⁷ Vázquez, pp. 74-75. See also Hoffmeister, for whom the Alhambra is the 'incarnation of a [unattainable] poetic ideal'. Gerhart Hoffmeister, 'Exoticism: Granada's Alhambra in European Romanticism', in *European Romanticism: Literary Cross-currents, Modes and Models* ed. by G. Hoffmeister (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 1990), p. 121.

⁸⁸ See C.W. Thompson, pp. 192-198.

This chapter will later discuss references to Eden, paradise and gardens, but it is useful already to note Quinet's attentiveness to such architectural duality. Thompson also sees Quinet's commentary on the Cordoba mosque as being more insightful than other commentaries of the time, in particular: 'his comparison of the essentially earthy rationalism behind the suggestion of organic growth in soaring Gothic cathedrals, and the blend in Cordoba's mosque of a sublimely floating effect with another of infinite horizontal extension'.⁸⁹ Quinet's essentialist discourse links interpretations of Islamic architecture with qualities that he saw in the religion of Islam itself. Though often associated with reinforcing Orientalist discourse, Quinet is arguably more sympathetic to the qualities he attributes to the Orient than other writers later on in the nineteenth century, who would be more likely to draw out what they saw as the negative qualities of the Orient.

Quinet's writings on Spain's Moorish architecture combine considerable knowledge with powerful imaginative work. In particular, as Thompson remarks, 'Quinet's imagination has a far better grasp of how the Arabic script, Koranic quotations, and poems were an integral part of this architecture'.⁹⁰ Recounting his visit to the Alhambra palace, Quinet discusses the interlacing of poems and other texts on the walls, writing that '*les murs parlent*' and appreciating the appropriateness of '*cette expression orientale: la parole édifiée*'.⁹¹ Thompson thus commends Quinet's 'attention to the voices of Spain' and his 'taste for listening' which is 'not so common' in the French Romantic travelogues that he examines. Though he considers Quinet's travelogue to be

⁸⁹ C.W. Thompson, p. 195. Quinet writes that the arches of Cordoba's Mosque: '*paraissent n'avoir aucun fondement sur terre*' (Quinet, p. 315) and that: '*Le sublime de la mosquée, c'est de n'avoir pas de limites à l'horizon. Elle s'étend, en un moment, comme le royaume de l'Islam, sur une surface sans bornes*' (p. 317).

⁹⁰ C.W. Thompson, p. 195.

⁹¹ Quinet, p. 253.

at times 'clumsily ambitious', he nonetheless considers that 'he tries harder than Gautier to convey the rich and contradictory interlacing of different ethnic, cultural, and historical strands evident in the Spain of his day'. Moreover, in Quinet's reflections on the Casa de Pilatos in Seville, Thompson considers that he is 'subtler and more generous about the implications of the enduring internalization of the spirit of Islam' which can be seen in such a building.⁹² On the architecture of the Casa de Pilatos, Quinet writes: 'Cette grave et correcte antiquité, entrevue à travers les caprices de l'art arabe, ce mélange d'Athènes et de la Mecque, marquent mieux que tous les commentaires le chaos de l'imagination espagnole en sortant du moyen âge.'⁹³ Though Quinet's choice of the word 'chaos' adds a negative connotation here, his interest in this mixing of styles perfectly encapsulates the Romantic fascination with the energy and dynamism of cultural hybridity.

Finally, Charles Davillier, who writes a more detailed and less dreamy account in the 1860s, after the high point of Romantic travel writing, is also, nevertheless, carried away by the Alhambra, writing of 'ces salles féeriques, ces patios si élégants et si voluptueux, milles images délicieuses, mais confuses, se présentent à l'esprit: il semble qu'on vient de faire un rêve'.⁹⁴ He also laments the destruction, at the hands of the Christian conquerors, of 'les chefs-d'œuvre accumulés pendant près de trois siècles par la patience et le génie des Mores, dans le plus merveilleux séjour que l'imagination puisse rêver'.⁹⁵ In this way Davillier continues the Romantic tradition, even invoking lines from Victor Hugo's poem 'Grenade' from his collection *Les Orientales* (1829).⁹⁶ In

⁹² C.W. Thompson, pp. 196-198.

⁹³ Quinet, p. 339.

⁹⁴ Davillier, *L'Espagne*, p. 190.

⁹⁵ Davillier, *L'Espagne*, p. 161.

⁹⁶ Davillier, *L'Espagne*, p. 190. 'L'Alhambra! l'Alhambra! Palais que les Génies | Ont doré comme un rêve et rempli d'harmonies; | Forteresse aux créneaux festonnés et croulants, | Où l'on entend la nuit de

Cordoba he cites Hugo's lines on the city from the same poem,⁹⁷ and in fact finds himself unable to provide a description to do the Cordoba Mosque justice: 'car la plume est impuissante à en rendre les aspects variés et la poésie étrange'.⁹⁸ This deferment to the Romantics is a sign of their enduring authority and legacy in terms of the interpretation of the monuments of Al-Andalus.

The Moorish architecture of Spain, as we have seen, aroused not only intense appreciation of the delicate beauty of the Islamic architecture and decorative art, but also feelings of euphoria and, particularly in Edgar Quinet's writing, essentialist reflections on Islamic and Islamic culture (in contrast to Christianity and Gothic architecture). We shall now move to consider travel writing on Portugal, in order to assess which of these elements are also present. As detailed in the introduction to this thesis, very little decorative Islamic architecture dating from the time of Gharb Al-Andalus has survived. The region's most important Islamic palace, Sharajib (also known as Palace of the Balconies), is located in Silves, beneath the castle, but my research to date has yet to find any reference suggesting that nineteenth-century travellers from France and the British isles were aware of the existence this palace. I have therefore chosen to focus on Sintra for this part of the study, partly because of its prominent place in the travel narratives in my corpus from this period, but also because of the variety of Oriental architecture there. This ranges from the Moorish elements of Sintra's National Palace, most of which dates from the fifteenth and early sixteenth centuries and combines Gothic, Manueline, Moorish and Mudéjar styles, to the Orientalist pleasure palaces of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries and the Romantic Palácio da Pena

magiques syllabes, | Quand la lune, à travers les mille arceaux arabes, | Sème les murs de trèfles blancs!' Victor Hugo, *Les Orientales* (Paris: J. Hetzel, 1829), p. 187.

⁹⁷ 'Cordoue aux maisons vieilles | A sa mosquée, où l'œil se perd dans les merveilles;' Hugo, p. 186.

⁹⁸ Davillier, *L'Espagne*, p. 450.

(Pena Palace), with its intentionally eclectic mix of neo-Gothic, neo-Manueline, Neo-Islamic and Neo-Renaissance styles.

The oldest of these buildings, the National Palace, tends to elicit criticism from nineteenth-century travel writers for lacking architectural coherence. William Beckford writes:

The Alhambra itself is scarcely more morisco in point of architecture than this confused pile, which seems to grow out of the summit of a rocky eminence, and is broken into a variety of picturesque recesses and projections. [...] From the windows, which are all in a fantastic oriental style, crinkled and crinkled, and supported by twisted pillars of smooth marble, striking, romantic views of the cliff and village of Cintra are commanded.⁹⁹

For Beckford, the palace's appeal is based purely on its (Oriental) appearance, its 'picturesque' recesses and 'romantic' views. His letter does not include any reflection about the people who lived in the building. Nowadays, of course, we might also reflect on the possible background and perspective of the craftsmen who worked on the Mudéjar tiles during the time of Manuel I (he sponsored work on the palace in the early sixteenth century). Beckford is bold in his comparison of the Palace to the Alhambra, although his choice of the term 'morisco' (usually referring to baptised Moors, or their culture) is problematic since the Alhambra was constructed before the reconquest.

Robert Southey, writing in 1800, calls the palace 'remarkably irregular –a large, rambling, shapeless pile, not unlike the prints I have seen in old romances of a castle'.¹⁰⁰ Like Beckford's assessment, Southey's is ambivalent: the castle's irregularity is disordered but also attractive to him because of its similarity to the illustrations in old romances. These ambiguous responses are characteristic both of the Romantics' openness to difference and of their nostalgia for an idealised medieval past. In a much later travel account, that of Marie Rattazzi from 1879, the response is similar in some

⁹⁹ Beckford, *Italy; with Sketches of Spain and Portugal*, II, p. 110.

¹⁰⁰ Southey, *Journals of Residence in Portugal 1800-1801*, p. 122.

ways and yet reveals a shift in perspective. Rattazzi describes the National Palace as follows:

–C'est un amas assez confus de constructions sans grand style. Le style mauresque y domine, cependant. Il présente des traces fort belles de sculptures sarrasines. Comme dans les palais royaux, tout ce qui tient à l'ornementation extérieure est d'une grande richesse, tandis que l'aménagement intérieur est d'une simplicité relativement pauvre. Aucune fille de bourgeois, un peu coquette, ne se contenterait d'un lit aussi dur et de deux chaises de paille aussi simples que celles qui se trouvent dans la chambre royale.¹⁰¹

Rattazzi therefore echoes Beckford and Southey by describing the palace as an 'amas assez confus de constructions sans grand style' but praises the beauty of the Moorish and 'Saracen' elements, highlighting the contrast between the ornamental exterior and the perceived simplicity of the interior, which does not appeal to her. As with previous writers, Rattazzi shows contrasting responses, but her perspective appears more rigid and self-assured in its conception of good style and values luxury –the almost rustic simplicity of the furnishings fails to charm her.

Several writers tend to compare Sintra's National Palace with the Alhambra in Granada. Beckford writes of a water reservoir running the length of the great hall:

There is a solemnity in the deep colour, approaching to blackness, of the water in that part of the reservoir which is overshadowed by lofty buildings, I cannot help thinking superior to all the flutter and glitter of the famous Moorish edifices at Granada or Seville.¹⁰²

Beckford here suggests that there is something frivolous about the ostentatious Moorish architecture found in Granada and Seville, with the starker contrasts of Portuguese palace lending it a greater appeal. Interestingly, in later writers this idea of 'solemnity' is often projected onto the Portuguese character in comparison to the perceived liveliness of the Andalusian Spaniards.

J.M. Neale, whose guide to Portugal was first published in 1855, writes that Sintra's National Palace 'was the Alhambra of the Moorish kings [...] a singular mixture

¹⁰¹ Rattazzi, p. 244.

¹⁰² Beckford, *Italy; with Sketches of Spain and Portugal*, II, pp. 112-113.

of Moorish and Christian architecture'.¹⁰³ Catherine Jackson, writing in 1873, may have read Neale, since she too refers to the Palace as 'the Alhambra of the Moorish kings of Portugal',¹⁰⁴ though she may have also been encouraged in making the comparison by her reading of William Beckford's letters (as I shall return to later in the chapter). Jackson goes on to provide the following description of Sintra's National Palace:

the mysterious ins and outs, labyrinths, and vaulted passages, the stories, the legends, &c., of this Portuguese Alhambra –the subdued splendour of whose richly variegated marbles has been by some persons more admired than the golden grandeur of the Moorish buildings of Granada—we should have seen more, and have known more concerning it when we left, had we been allowed to walk through it alone.¹⁰⁵

Here even the suggestion that some commentators might have preferred this palace to the Alhambra is enough to constitute a recommendation, though the constraints of the guided visit act as a barrier to Jackson being able to fully satisfy her curiosity.

Dora Wordsworth is the only writer in this chapter's corpus to reject the notion that the two sets of buildings should be compared. Describing the view, she approached Sintra, Wordsworth writes:

yonder famous 'Moorish' palace, which now, as we wind round the north-east shoulder of the mountain, comes in sight, with the little town nestling close under the huge rocks, at the instep of the Serra-Mafra, in the northern distance, breaking the outline of the horizon. The Portuguese, ever jealous, or perhaps nobly emulous of the Spaniards, boast of their Alhambra in that Moorish palace, and of their Escorial in yon majestic Mafra [...] But such parallels are hardly judicious, for they cannot be well sustained; and we may be content to admire the desolate grandeur of Mafra, and the hale old age of the quasi-arabesque pile at Cintra, without disturbing our admiration by invidious comparisons.¹⁰⁶

Wordsworth positions the Portuguese in a position of self-acknowledged inferiority in relation to the Spanish, however her point that a comparison of Sintra National Palace and the Alhambra complex does not stand up to scrutiny is well-made, and attests to the originality of Wordsworth's reflections. Whereas the Alhambra could be said to

¹⁰³ Neale is also struck by the fact that the resident Superintendent in Sintra still has a title from the Arabic, 'Almocharife' (p. 68).

¹⁰⁴ Jackson, p. 171.

¹⁰⁵ Jackson, p. 219.

¹⁰⁶ Wordsworth, p. 159.

represent the final flourishing of the culture of Al-Andalus, Sintra National Palace stands on the site where a Moorish Palace once stood, of which nothing has survived. Wordsworth's description of the palace as 'quasi-arabesque' therefore also successfully conveys its intermediary identity.

Pena Palace, a much later construction, was built on the site of a ruined monastery under King consort Ferdinand II in the 1840s. Beckford and Southey's accounts were therefore written prior to the construction of Pena Palace, whereas Dora Wordsworth's account, from her visit in 1845-46, was written during the latter part of its construction (she comments that at the time of her visit Ferdinand the king consort is 'adding square tower to the west' and that it is being restored 'with such additions and approaches that give it the air of a Gothic castle').¹⁰⁷ Later nineteenth-century travellers in the corpus tend to be enthusiastic about Pena, for example Marie Rattazzi writes that that is 'une œuvre essentiellement originale, capricieuse, fantastique comme un rêve'.¹⁰⁸ Olivier Merson is stunned by 'l'éblouissant château de la Pena [...] Nous sommes au pays des chimères, des fantaisies et des rêves'.¹⁰⁹ He describes seeing :

des aiguilles fines, délicates, élancées comme des minarets; [...] des galeries taillées à jour à la façon orientale et suspendues au-dessus des nuages; [...] on laisse à gauche des écuries et des remises dignes de figurer dans les Mille et une Nuits.¹¹⁰

That this building, a fantastical embodiment of architectural eclecticism, should so appeal to the writers who visited it after its completion, is suggestive of the extent to which Islamic culture was associated at the time with the magical elements of *The Thousand and One Nights*, and with the idea of retreating into an escapist fantasy.

¹⁰⁷ Wordsworth, p. 161.

¹⁰⁸ Rattazzi, p. 241.

¹⁰⁹ Merson, p. 201.

¹¹⁰ Merson, pp. 205-6.

The first European translation of *The Thousand and One Nights* was Antoine Galland's French translation which appeared in 1704, and the success and popularity of such translations meant that they spread across the continent during the eighteenth century, and had a profound influence both on literature and on European imaginings of Oriental, Islamic and Middle Eastern cultures. Of course, even in Arabic the tales were only a representation of the various cultures that spawned them (combining Middle Eastern, Persian and Indian elements) and the translation process then added a second level of representation, in other words, a European filter. Some stories, such as those featuring Aladdin, Ali Baba and Sinbad the Sailor, were also not in the original Arabic versions. However, for our travel writers and for many Europeans who had been exposed to these tales since childhood, they existed as a narrative vision of the Orient.

The tendency to describe medieval Moorish architecture as resembling scenes from *The Thousand and One Nights*, or the experience of being there as being akin to being transported into that world, is one that is already common amongst travel writing on Spain, as can be seen within this chapter's corpus. Théophile Gautier compares the sunset in Granada to: 'la joaillerie féerique des *Mille et une Nuits*',¹¹¹ and when Dora Wordsworth visits the Alcázar, 'or Moorish Palace' in Seville, she writes the following:

when I entered the 'Hall of the Ambassador,' and yet more when I looked down from one of the balconied windows upon the garden, I literally trembled in a sort of transport of delighted surprise, and for an instant thought Aladdin must be our guide, for here was one of those fair gardens that I imagined could only be heard of in the 'Arabian Nights.' But what pen could describe the witchery of that glorious sun and deep blue sky, and of those orange groves and cypress-trees, and rich flowers and flowering shrubs [...] and the historical interest attached to all this, with the thought that you are treading the marble floors that the Moor and the Christian trod so many centuries ago, and for the possession of which they struggled so bravely.¹¹²

Here Wordsworth combines familiar tropes: the identification with *The Thousand and One Nights*, the idea that the experience of being in the Alcázar cannot be captured in

¹¹¹ Gautier, pp. 265-266.

¹¹² Wordsworth, p. 199-200.

words – that only being in the place itself can provide the experience, and thirdly, the question of a historical interest which centres on notions of bravery in war. The medieval conflict between Christians and Moors is presented here as one in which both sides acted nobly in the long struggle for territory on the Peninsula. The question to consider, therefore, is whether the Portuguese monuments could supply a similarly powerful cocktail of impressions to travellers.

A further example of such emphasis on magic in responses to Islamic architecture can be seen in the following extract from Edgard Quinet's account of his visit to the Alhambra Palace:

Dans ce moment rapide comme l'éclair, je vis, je sentis ce que toutes les bibliothèques des Orientalistes ne m'auraient jamais enseigné. J'étais dans la cour des *Arroyalès*, au milieu de la féerie du palais des rois maures. A ce changement instantané, je reconnus la main des Négromants orientaux qui d'un coup de baguette, dans les Mille et une Nuits, transforment une cabane en un château de lumière.¹¹³

Quinet's account here emphasises the idea of a transformative experience. The traveller's curiosity and imagination has been kindled and shaped by prior reading, and Quinet contributes further to the Alhambra's reputation of providing an incomparable mystical experience. Charles Davillier, writing in the 1860s, also draws a comparison between Al-Andalus and *The Thousand and One Nights* when discussing Madinat al-Zahra near Cordoba, the location of which was unknown at this time (it was rediscovered in 1911). Davillier writes: 'Les récits que font les historiens arabes du luxe et des merveilles de ce palais rappellent les contes des *Mille et une Nuits*.'¹¹⁴ In doing so, he suggests that Al-Andalus was a place where the magic of *The Thousand and One Nights* was in fact a reality.

¹¹³ Quinet, pp. 249-250.

¹¹⁴ Davillier, p. 456.

In travel accounts about Sintra, on the other hand, evocations of *The Thousand and One Nights* are used to describe more recent constructions, such as Montserrate, originally built in 1789 by the English Merchant Gerard to Visme. Combining Indian, Mudéjar Moorish Revival and Neo Gothic architectural styles, Montserrate is a fanciful architectural creation, and one which responded to visitors' desires at the time for luxurious Oriental fantasy. When Marie Rattazzi visits Montserrate, originally built in 1789 by the English Merchant Gerard to Visme, she writes: 'Tout ce qui peut captiver, séduire, charmer, est réuni dans cet Eden qui ne manque de visiter aucun voyageur, curieux de voir l'illustration des contes merveilleux des *Mille et une Nuits*'.¹¹⁵ Here, Rattazzi combines references to Christian and Islamic culture in her response, and also references Byron's description of Sintra as 'glorious Eden', which will be discussed further later in the chapter.

Olivier Merson also draws on the tradition of comparison to the *One Thousand and One Nights*. Again, it is not Sintra's National Palace that inspires the comparison, but in this case Pena Palace, finished only a few years before his visit. Merson writes:

L'on traverse un merveilleux parc qu'animent des autruches, des paons, des cerfs, des biches, des gazelles et des cygnes, et nous atteignons le pied de ce bijou de marbre. Entrons vite, car c'est pour sûr un palais magique, et, d'un coup de sa baguette, Mélusine ou Morgane pourrait bien le faire disparaître à nos yeux.

[...] Lorsque les couvents furent fermés, le monastère de la sierra de Cintra subit la loi commune. Ses bâtiments tombaient en ruines, et, dans un avenir prochain, ce chef-d'oeuvre d'architecture gothico-mauresque allait disparaître, lorsque le roi dom Fernando, dont le goût pour les arts est aussi vif qu'éclairé, s'en empara. Il en fit sortir ce château devant lequel pâlissent les descriptions des palais enchantés d'Aladin ou de Sinbad-le-Marin.¹¹⁶

¹¹⁵ Rattazzi, p. 241. William Beckford added features to Montserrate such as a diversion of the stream to create the Cascade, and Vathek's Arch, in 1793-4. He gave up the lease in 1808, by which time the house and garden had already fallen into an overgrown ruin, as described by Byron, who visited in 1809, in his *Childe Harold's Pilgrimage* (1812-1818). Francis Cook eventually purchased Montserrate in 1863 and developed it further.

¹¹⁶ Merson, pp. 204-205.

The fact that Merson invokes Aladdin and Sinbad the Sailor to talk about a recent construction (Pena Palace) suggests that Sintra's Oriental appearance, though enchanting, is not rooted in a specific historical and literary tradition, at least not one that was known by the travellers. It is also worth noting that Merson draws on European folklore and Arthurian legend – traditions which were of course very attractive to the Romantics – with the references to Melusine and Morgan le Fay. He thus adds a further magical (but non-Oriental) frame of reference. This of course has antecedents in travel writing on Iberia: Washington Irving frequently mentions fairies in *Tales from the Alhambra*. In Portugal, William Beckford recounts an anecdote from an old Italian priest about an apartment he once stayed in 'bedecked with mirrors and curtains, in a sort of fairy palace communicating with the Nunnery of Odivellas',¹¹⁷ and Catherine Jackson mentions that the *quinta* of the Marquez de Vianna in Sintra 'has been compared to the antechamber of a romantic fairy palace'.¹¹⁸

There therefore seems to be a certain degree of continuity between travel writing on Spain and Portugal in this period, with the important difference that in Spain it is medieval Islamic architecture that prompts a magical, transformative experience, whereas in Portugal, it is the more recent and eclectic Orientalist palaces that have this effect. In Portugal, the fact that such palaces are unconnected to Portugal's own history of Islamic presence, and thus from important historical moments, means that the architecture does not elicit quite such a powerful response in the traveller. As we have seen, travellers in the corpus who visited Cordoba, Granada and Seville were often able to relate their appreciation of Moorish decorative architecture to important moments in Spanish medieval history associated with the buildings they were visiting. In addition

¹¹⁷ Beckford, *Italy; with Sketches of Spain and Portugal*, II, p. 148. Odivelas is situated north-west of Lisbon.

¹¹⁸ Jackson, p. 194.

to this, Edgar Quinet in particular includes imaginative (if at times melodramatic) episodes invoking the ghosts of history, as well as essentialist interpretations of Islam in his accounts of visits to these cities.

Although the writers in the corpus who travelled to Portugal use many of the same images and references to *The Thousand and One Nights* to evoke the more recently constructed Oriental palaces they found in Sintra, they found it harder to engage imaginatively with Sintra's National Palace, aside perhaps from Beckford's more reflective piece. The overall effect of the travel writing on Sintra's decorative architecture is therefore one of vague and rather ephemeral impressions, lacking the depth afforded by the evocations of Al-Andalus found in the travel writing on Spain. Although the contrast is of course partly due to the difference in the quality and nature of the Islamic or Islamic-influenced decorative architecture in Spain and Portugal, I would argue that travellers' lack of historical knowledge of Islamic figures and culture in medieval Portugal also had a significant limiting effect on the imaginative elements of the work that they produced.

Gardens of Paradise

The prevalence of allusions to Christian and Muslim paradises in descriptions found in nineteenth-century travel writing on both Spain and Portugal is significant and suggests a long-lasting association between the lands which were formerly part of Islamic Al-Andalus and the idea of paradise as a garden. Before looking at examples of these allusions, it is important first to separate out the different ideas at work here, even if ultimately these ideas are conflated by some writers. Before we consider the idea of a

landscape as a garden, we must first consider the symbolism of the gardens that were built alongside the palaces of Islamic Spain. D. Fairchild Ruggles has explored the function and significance of these gardens in medieval Al-Andalus, and writes that she sees the palace garden as ‘a set of visual relationships that includes the architecture and the landscape both within and around it’.¹¹⁹ In particular, Ruggles highlights the evolving significance of the palace garden during the medieval period. In tenth-century Cordoba, when Al-Andalus was at its height both politically and culturally, Ruggles has:

found no explicit conceptual link between the gardens of the *mynyas* of Cordoba and the Quranic concept of paradise as a garden of shade-giving trees and flowing rivers. Rather, palace gardens were sensual places of worldly pleasure and areas for political ceremonial.¹²⁰

Ruggles goes on to explain that the later evolution and ‘proliferation of tombs, tomb gardens and their paradisiac symbolism’ meant that ‘all gardens, whether in cemeteries or palaces eventually acquired the potential meaning of “paradise on earth”’.¹²¹

Ruggles also rightly notes that ‘the very image of paradise as a garden owes much to pre-existing Jewish and Christian conceptions of Eden and heaven’. This more spiritual take on the garden can be seen in the Alhambra, as Ruggles explains: ‘The miradors and gardens of the Alhambra exemplify the shift from a symbolism derived from the agricultural landscape to the symbolism of the Quranic paradise, and from the worldly to the spiritual.’ Ruggles however considers that:

the Alhambra [...] pays homage in almost every aspect to its ancestor, Madinat al-Zahra. [...] the palaces of Al-Andalus [...] shared a mythic concept of the sovereign as creator and steward of the land, expressed in the visual continuities that united architecture with garden.¹²²

This concept of the sovereign as creator and steward of the land is a useful one in understanding modern writers’ interpretations of whole landscapes of Southern Iberia

¹¹⁹ D. Fairchild Ruggles, *Gardens, Landscape & Vision in the Palaces of Islamic Spain* (University Park, Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania University Press, 2000), p. xvi.

¹²⁰ Ruggles, p. 215.

¹²¹ Ruggles, p. 220.

¹²² Ruggles, pp. 219-222.

as a garden, particularly since the Muslims of Al-Andalus had changed the physical appearance of the landscape by introducing new agricultural methods to Iberia. In the Arab imaginary, Al-Andalus is envisaged as God's paradise on Earth, and this idea has survived up until the present day.¹²³ As such, some of our travel writers' impressions are likely to be Western interpretations or reflections of the Arab imaginary.

Thompson has noted that the French Romantic travel writers who travelled to Spain, Africa and the Levant were seeking:

anti-modern paradises which, if not always rich and sumptuous, seemed to them at least more coherent and harmonious than the increasingly fragmented and fractious life of modern cities. [...] their expression of the sublime also reveals indirectly their hope of a calmer plenitude.¹²⁴

As such, it is useful to see travel writers' visions of landscapes as gardens in terms of a rejection of certain aspects of the modern city. In drawing on the idea of paradise as a garden, though, writers are also drawing on a long tradition, which, as described by Ruggles, sought to 'present nature not in its coarse reality but as an ideal in which plants are always growing or at their peak, and in which life triumphs over death'.¹²⁵ In the case of some writers, therefore, there may be a search for a particular kind of idealised nature which could transcend the ugliness of decay and death.

Before considering allusions to the Quranic paradise, it is first worth briefly examining Biblical references in the texts in the corpus. Rather than seeing these as competing with allusions to Islam and the Quranic paradise in their texts, it is more fruitful to see the co-existence of Christian and Islamic references as evidence of the potential for imaginative fluidity and ambiguity that these landscapes offered our travellers. Thus, when William Beckford is in Sintra, he describes an evening scene with:

¹²³ See Atef Laouyene, 'Pathologies of Moorishness: Al-Andalus, Narrative, and 'Worldly Humanism' in *Journal of East-West Thought*, 3:1 (2013) pp. 31-44, <<http://www.cpp.edu/~jet/Documents/JET/Jet6/Louayene31-44.pdf>> [accessed 21 September 2019].

¹²⁴ C.W. Thompson, p. 169.

¹²⁵ Ruggles, p. 215.

drizzling mist overspreading the crags of Cintra [...] just as we emerged from the shady avenue, appeared the turret of the convent of the Penha, faintly tinted by the last rays of the sun, and looking down, like the ark on Mount Ararat, on a sea of undulating clouds.¹²⁶

Robert Southey also includes Biblical references in his account. Writing to his wife Edith from Faro, he recounts his journey through the 'wilds' of the Alentejo to the Algarve:

we crossed the mountains to Tavira [...]. This day's journey, however, was quite new; wherever we looked was mountain, – waving, swelling, breasting, exactly like the sea-like prints of the Holy Land which you see in old Travels. At last the sea appeared, and the Guadiana, and the frontier towns Azamonte [Ayamonte] and Castro Marini [Castro Marim]; we descended, and entered the garden, the Paradise of Algarve. Here our troubles and labour were to end; we were out of the wilderness. Milk and honey, indeed, we did not expect in this land of promise, but we expected everything else.¹²⁷

The above extract is a first example of the whole of the Algarve being described as a garden, which becomes a recurring image. Southey sees the Algarve as a tamed landscape, a land of plenty, and he is also struck by how much the landscape he sees resembles images he has seen of the Holy Land.

This uncanny sensation of life resembling art is shared by more than one traveller to Iberia. When Charles Davillier visits Elche in the province of Alicante in Spain, he describes the palm trees that surround the city:

autour d'Elche ils forment une vaste ceinture qui entoure la ville comme une véritable forêt: on se croirait transporté tout d'un coup, par la baguette d'un enchanteur, dans quelque ville de l'intérieur de l'Afrique, ou bien encore dans un de ces sites où l'imagination se plaît à placer les scènes grandioses de la Bible.¹²⁸

Here Davillier includes different frames of reference, combining wizardry, the African interior, and epic scenes from the Bible.¹²⁹ This confusion of references supports the vision of Spain's richness and its ability to satisfy a variety of different expectations and tastes. However, as we have seen, such an impression is reflected in Rattazzi's later

¹²⁶ Beckford, *Italy; with Sketches of Spain and Portugal*, II, p. 160.

¹²⁷ Southey, *Journals of Residence in Portugal 1800-1801*, p. 165. Letter dated April 17, 1801.

¹²⁸ Davillier, *L'Espagne*, p. 111.

¹²⁹ It is difficult to speculate as to which African town Davillier was thinking of here, given that at the time of writing the interior of Africa was only just beginning to be explored by Europeans.

account on Sintra, where she combines references to Eden and to *The Thousand and One Nights* in a single sentence.¹³⁰

When Davillier approaches Valencia, he writes: 'C'est par la huerta de Gandia [Gandía] que nous commençâmes notre excursion dans cet Eden des poètes [*sic.*] espagnols, dans ce paradis terrestre des Arabes d'Occident.'¹³¹ Here Davillier suggests that the Eden-like quality of the area is something inherent, and that Christians and Muslims alternatively saw it as an Eden or Earthly paradise depending on their religion, implying a shared experience of a place by different cultures. This idea remains consistent in Davillier's writing. Concerning Granada, he writes the following:

Rien ne saurait rendre l'impression qu'éprouve celui qui traverse pour la première fois la 'porte des Grenades': on se croit transporté dans un pays enchanté, [...] on pense à la description du poète arabe, qui les comparait à des voûtes d'émeraude. C'est la plus majestueuse décoration qu'il soit possible de rêver, et si les yeux sont émerveillés, l'oreille n'est pas moins charmée par le chant des oiseaux, et par le bruit des cascades et des fontaines; l'eau limpide des ruisseaux entretient une fraîcheur continuelle dans cet Éden où le printemps dure toujours, et auquel les Grenadins ont donné le nom beaucoup trop modeste de *Bosque de la Alhambra*.¹³²

Davillier here stresses a continuity of experience between the Arab poets and modern-day travellers and combines a reference to an Arab poet with his own reference to a Biblical Eden 'where Spring lasts forever', an idealised, otherworldly place of endless fertility where decay and death are not present. In this instance, he almost perfectly reproduces Gautier's impression of Granada: Gautier had admired the Moorish irrigation techniques and commented that: 'c'est à eux que Grenade doit d'être le paradis de l'Espagne, et de jouir d'un printemps éternel sous une température africaine'.¹³³ As such, we can see how Davillier's travel writing replicates or rewrites Gautier's Romantic writing at key moments, contributing to the persistence of Gautier's vision of Spain. There is also a certain degree of continuity in that both Davillier on Spain

¹³⁰ Rattazzi, p. 241.

¹³¹ Davillier, *L'Espagne*, p. 88.

¹³² Davillier, *L'Espagne*, p. 149.

¹³³ Gautier, p. 293.

and Rattazzi on Portugal combine references to Christian and Islamic culture, to the religious and the magical, in their descriptions.

References to gardens of paradise in travel writing on Portugal are concentrated around Sintra, which was of course immortalised in Lord Byron's poem *Childe Harold's Pilgrimage* (1812-1818) as 'glorious Eden'.¹³⁴ Marie Rattazzi quotes the phrase in her account, stating that the poet had not exaggerated.¹³⁵ When Catherine Jackson comes to Sintra she experiences a sense of belatedness (the term is coined by Ali Behdad to describe travellers who experience the sense of having arrived at a place too late).¹³⁶ Specifically, she suspects that the Sintra of 1870s is not that of the late eighteenth century, when William Beckford visited. Jackson writes:

I can imagine that Cintra was even more lovely then than now – at least it was more out of reach of pleasure-seeking invaders. There were neither races nor bullfights, but probably there were fairies and wood-nymphs, or you might fancy so; for it is just that sort of enchanted or enchanting region where, if anywhere, the existence of such beings may be believed in. The glowworms and fireflies that perhaps lighted the fairy revels still linger here. [...] you may fancy, as you breathe this balmy atmosphere, that seems too pure, too ethereal for earth, that you have at least reached the threshold of Paradise.¹³⁷

Jackson's account describes a lush, magical and otherworldly Sintra, but not one that references either the Bible or the Quran.

It is significant that three of the earlier writers in my corpus make specific references to 'Mohammed's paradise'. The first, William Beckford, describes his visit to 'a convent of Savoyard nuns' in the Belém district of Lisbon, where he was admitted to a parlour filled with Brazilian doves, parakeets and canary birds:

¹³⁴ 'Lo! Cintra's glorious Eden intervenes | In variegated maze of mount and glen. | Ah me! what hand can pencil guide, or pen, | To follow half on which the eye dilates | Through views more dazzling unto mortal ken | Than those whereof such things the bard relates, | Who to the awe-struck world unlocked Elysium's gates?', George Gordon Byron, 'Childe Harold's Pilgrimage', in *The Works of Lord Byron*, 13 vols, ed. by E. Coleridge & R. Protero (London: John Murray, 1898-1904), II, Canto I, Stanza XVIII, p. 34.

¹³⁵ Rattazzi, p. 236.

¹³⁶ Behdad, *Belated Travelers*.

¹³⁷ Jackson, p. 180-81. Prior to this extract, she writes: 'Many pens have attempted to describe Cintra – I know of none but Beckford's that has succeeded in making its beauty *felt*; and he does not so much attempt to describe the place, as the effect of its spell-like loveliness on his sensitive and poetic temperament' (p. 180).

Such a cooing and chirping was never heard in greater perfection, except in Mahomet's Paradise; nor were the houries wanting, for in a deep recess, behind a tolerably wide lattice, sat a row of the loveliest young creatures I ever behold.¹³⁸

Beckford thus moves seamlessly from discussing the cooing birds to discussing the young nuns. By alluding to the Quranic paradise, Beckford is able to compare the women he sees to the virgin companions of the Muslim faithful. Beckford's decision to describe a Christian convent in this way is of course irreverent. It is also a particularly male-centric (and Protestant) perspective, and one that we can also glimpse in Robert Southey's journal. As Southey travels through the Algarve towards Faro, and reaches Olhão on the coast, he writes: 'The occasional odour of orange gardens was like Mohammed's paradise.'¹³⁹ It may or may not be a coincidence that in Southey's letter to his wife, written during the same trip, he refers, as we saw earlier, to the 'Paradise of Algarve' and to 'Milk and honey', as discussed already, but makes no reference to Islam.

William Beckford's vision of the Belém convent is also remarkably similar to Washington Irving's description of his experience of walking through the halls of the Alhambra palace, which is as follows:

As I loiter through these Oriental chambers and hear the murmur of fountains and the song of the nightingale, as I inhale the odour of the rose and feel the influence of the balmy climate, I am almost tempted to fancy myself in the paradise of Mahomet and that the plump little Dolores is one of the bright-eyed houris, destined to administer to the happiness of true believers.¹⁴⁰

Both Irving and Beckford cast the Spanish and Portuguese women that they encounter (presumably nuns, in Beckford's case) as the houris. The implication is that the women, through their physical appearance, enable the writer's imagination to conjure up an Islamic paradise, however this imagined physical resemblance also casts the women in a sexually submissive role.

¹³⁸ Beckford, *Italy; with Sketches of Spain and Portugal*, II p. 84.

¹³⁹ Southey, *Journals of Residence in Portugal 1800-1801*, p. 45.

¹⁴⁰ Irving, p. 59.

In travel writing on both Spain and Portugal there are particular places, or points of focus, which are perceived to be earthly paradises by travellers. In Spain, this tends to be Granada, and in Portugal, as we have seen, it is Sintra. When Quinet describes the Granada of the European imagination, he asks the reader:

Qui n'a élevé, dans une heure de ravissement, ce ciel terrestre, à mi-côté d'une colline d'orangers, où toute chose sourit d'une promesse de bonheur? [...] vous cherchez avidement des yeux, en approchant de Grenade, cette oasis attendue, ce seuil de félicité qui s'abreuve des eaux du Coran.¹⁴¹

Granada is more automatically associated with the Quranic paradise than Sintra, as we have seen, but both share a particular status as points of focus. Granada has the added emotive facet of being a paradise lost by the Moors, centred around the figure of Boabdil. Sintra's focality, on the other hand, is mostly apparent by the dominant position it holds in nineteenth-century travel accounts of Portugal, however we can also see it in the remarks Southey makes when he visits Monchique on his first and only trip to the Algarve in 1801. He writes in his journal that 'the town Monchique' is 'the lovely Cintra of Algarve [...] Our window looks upon a lemon garden with chestnuts on the near hill that bounds the view – and the sound of water. It has the sight and sound of dear Cintra.'¹⁴² Southey's emotive description emphasises the association between Sintra, which conjures up the idea of a nature that is plentiful but not out of control, and Spring – he visits Monchique in late April.

Not all references to the Orient focus on the idea of the Quranic paradise. When Southey visits Extremadura he writes: 'When the Moors possessed Extremadura this whole province was like a well-cultivated garden'. At this point Southey references the Spanish painter Antonio Ponz, who published travel writing on his own country between

¹⁴¹ Quinet, p. 247.

¹⁴² Southey, *Journals of Residence in Portugal 1800-1801*, p. 51. Maria Zulmira Castanheira has discussed how Southey had a preference for natural spectacles over castles, churches or indeed cities. See 'Robert Southey, o primeiro lusófilo inglês', *Revista de Estudos Anglo-Portugueses*, 5 (1996) 59-120 (pp. 84; 104).

1772 and 1794.¹⁴³ Southey writes that according to Ponz: ‘the pestilence of 1348 destroyed two-thirds of the people of Spain, in consequence vast tracks of lands were left uncultivated, and thus a slovenly and Tartar-like system of pasturage was introduced’.¹⁴⁴ Thus Southey projects an image of Estremadura under the Moors as ordered nature: cultivated and controlled.

The South of both Spain and Portugal is described as resembling a variety of different regions situated further to the South (or South East). The obvious implication is that these Iberian spaces do not look European, but there is remarkable diversity in the places that are chosen as points of comparison. In the section on the ‘Kingdom of Algarve’ in J.M. Neale’s guidebook, the author describes how the climate of the Algarve is different to the remainder of Portugal, writing: ‘If it has been said that Africa commences at the Pyrenees, it may with a great deal more truth be asserted that it extends to Monchique’.¹⁴⁵ Thus the Algarve is the true ‘Africa in Europe’, according to Neale. If we leave aside the special case of Sintra, there seems to be continuity between writers’ attitudes to Southern Spain and Portugal, since a number of writers make a comparison to a contemporary Oriental landscape. Dora Wordsworth describes the landscape around Loja, in the province of Granada, as “‘Arabia Petraea” – that grand, stony, rocky wild on the very top of the pass’ (Arabia Petraea was a frontier province of the Roman Empire whose capital was Petra, Jordan).¹⁴⁶ Marie Rattazzi distinguishes between a ‘productive’ northern region of Portugal, and: ‘la seconde, celle du midi, a quelque analogie avec le désert du Sahara, sous le nom d’*Alemtejo* [...] Dans ces régions

¹⁴³ Antonio Ponz, *Viage de España*, 18 vols (Madrid: D. Joachim Ibarra, 1776).

¹⁴⁴ Southey, *Letters Written during a Short Residence in Spain and Portugal*, p. 232.

¹⁴⁵ Neale, p. 53.

¹⁴⁶ Wordsworth, p. 256.

on rencontre le caroubier, le palmier nain, originaires d'Afrique'.¹⁴⁷ Gabriel de Saint-Victor, on reaching Quarteira in the Algarve, writes:

'Comme en Algérie', ai-je dit tout à l'heure. C'est que rien ne ressemble à notre colonie comme cette province que j'ai traversée d'un bout à l'autre. Climat plus chaud, plus d'eau, moins d'entraves administratives mais, dans les terrains non défrichés, les palmiers nains, les scilles, les asphodèles, les terres rouges et fortes avec les ravines creusées par les pluies diluviennes.¹⁴⁸

When Saint Victor reaches Silves, on the other hand, before noting the presence of its Moorish castle he first remarks that: 'Le lit de cette petite rivière est encombré de lauriers-roses, on se croirait en Asie Mineure [Anatolia, Turkey]!'¹⁴⁹

The choice to reference a variety of different Oriental and African landscapes suggests the writers' continuing need to underscore the idea of difference and non-Europeanness when visiting Andalusia, the Alentejo and the Algarve. However, by continually offering the landscape they see to the reader as a version of an Oriental landscape, or an assemblage of such landscapes, the writers also seem to deny the landscapes they describe a uniquely Iberian identity.

Certain writers also make comparisons to imagined Oriental landscapes. When Charles Davillier visits Jaen in Andalusia, he describes it as follows:

Jaen est située au pied des hauteurs couronnées de vieilles murailles moresques, aussi rousses et aussi lézardées que celles de l'Alhambra; nous avons rarement vu des ruines surchargées d'une végétation aussi touffue: on croirait voir les fameux jardins suspendus de Babylone.¹⁵⁰

The choice of Babylon, a romantic ideal of an eastern Garden with a mythical status, confers a similarly mythical aura onto Spain. When Olivier Merson is describing how the Orient reveals itself in the physiognomy of Lisbon, he also describes it partly through references to nature, as follows:

L'Orient, ai-je dit; mais l'Orient n'apparaît-il pas dans toute la physionomie de la ville dont je viens de tracer ce tableau? [...] Et surtout ce ciel, voûte, unie et bleue; [...] cette brise doucement attiédie par la chaleur du jour; ces fleurs qui réjouissent la vue; ces arbres – palmiers, platanes ou

¹⁴⁷ Rattazzi, p. 184.

¹⁴⁸ Saint-Victor, p. 231.

¹⁴⁹ Saint-Victor, p. 256.

¹⁵⁰ Davillier, *L'Espagne*, p. 224.

citronniers – qui donnent de l'ombre du haut des terrasses; ce fleuve transparent et limpide; [...] n'est-ce pas toujours l'Orient qui s'épanouit, et n'y reconnaît-on pas profondément écrit le souvenir des Maures, maîtres autrefois de ce pays?¹⁵¹

Crucially, though, rather than connecting it to a modern-day colony, as Saint-Victor had done with part of the Algarve and Algeria, Merson directly refers to Portugal's Moorish heritage, and to the Moors as 'maîtres'. The question of the representation of the Oriental presence as subjugator in the Iberian context is one that deserves more attention by scholarship. Nature is also represented here not only as plentiful and gentle ('attiédie') but also as having pure qualities ('unie' and 'transparent'): it therefore connects to the idealised portrayals of the garden that we have seen already.

Despite its unique discourse centred around an edenic Sintra, travel writing on Portugal does not contain numerous examples of creative reflection expanding out from the object viewed, of the type that can be found in French Romantic travel writing, for example in both Quinet and Gautier's travel writing on Spain. When Quinet visits the Alhambra palace, he follows a loose ram which leads him to the Mihrab in the form of a booth overlooking a valley, where the imam would have conducted the call to prayer. Using the tendency that we have already seen in Quinet to survey his surroundings from the imagined perspective of a medieval Muslim, he writes: 'Priez! ô croyants! voici l'heure, tout prie.'¹⁵² He then proceeds to describe the lush vegetation that he sees below him:

Où reverrez-vous ailleurs un fleuve d'orangers qui se répande, à son embouchure, dans une mer de verdure? de cette hauteur, les tours sombres de l'Alhambra plongent leurs pieds dans une végétation paradisiaque. De l'autre côté de la vallée, cette végétation se change en une montagne hérissée de cactus, d'aloës, de plantes sauvages qui rappellent le désert, la demeure stérile du noir Yblis, le démon, l'impur. Que Dieu le déracine et ne le laisse pas s'étendre jusqu'à la riche Véga où est le séjour des bons! Mille ruisseaux la baignent; mais surtout le sang des croyants l'a fertilisée. Il n'est pas un cep de vigne, pas un tronc de figuier qui n'ait été engraisé par un combat. Aussi, quelle terre sourit comme elle? ne lui comparez que l'Éden.¹⁵³

¹⁵¹ Merson, pp. 73-74. This extract is also discussed in Cabete, p. 285.

¹⁵² Quinet, p. 260.

¹⁵³ Quinet, p. 261.

Quinet attempts here to interpret the landscape through the lens of a world view which sees all of its elements starkly divided into good and evil, pure and impure. The vegetation is lauded as 'paradisique' but does so in contrast to the surrounding 'desert'. As we have seen elsewhere, the writer continually repositions his perspective from self to other – from the perspective of the Iman to the writer's own cultural tradition and his identification of the landscape he sees with Eden.

Thompson considers Gautier to be the best of the French Romantic travel writers who write on Spain on 'floral and aquatic themes'.¹⁵⁴ Gautier describes the overgrown path leading from the Alhambra to the Generalife gardens as being akin to one traced 'à travers une forêt vierge d'Amérique' where '[t]out fleurit, tout s'épanouit'.¹⁵⁵ Arriving at the Generalife, and observing an oleander, he describes it as having 'une fraîcheur splendide et vigoureuse presque bruyante'.¹⁵⁶ However, Gautier's appreciation of the vegetation of the Generalife is not concerned merely with its vitality and its suggestion of a triumph over degeneration and death. Gautier also links the appearance of the vegetation with Islamic decorative styles. As Thompson identifies, Gautier 'explicitly connects the vegetal energy and profusion there with that style of surface decoration exemplified for him by plateresque, rococo, and above all Islamic art, which breaks with the aesthetic of straight lines and balanced geometry, in favour of indefinite expansion through the capricious intertwining of repetitions and metamorphoses'.¹⁵⁷ We can see this for example in Gautier's description of a vine that he sees as he walks along the overgrown path to the Alhambra: 'La vigne jaillit par les fentes des murs lézardés et suspend à toutes les branches ses vrilles fantastiques et ses pampres découpés comme

¹⁵⁴ C.W. Thompson, p. 195.

¹⁵⁵ Gautier, p. 290.

¹⁵⁶ Gautier, p. 292.

¹⁵⁷ C.W. Thompson, p. 189.

un ornement arabe.’¹⁵⁸ Gautier’s description offers a further example of life (nature in particular) imitating art, or a particular style of art. This freedom of association, in defiance of traditional logic, is one of the achievements of Romantic travel writing.

Customs, Echoes and Traces

As we have seen, travel writers on Portugal do not on the whole tend to identify with or imagine the perspective of a medieval Muslim when they visit Moorish castles or other Islamic architectural traces. However, these writers are sometimes alert to the echoes and traces of Islamic or Moorish culture that can be found in the customs and other material aspects of Portuguese daily life. One aspect which particularly strikes travellers is when they come across the *bioco*, a long veil worn by women in parts of the Algarve until the 1890s, and in the town of Olhão until the mid-1930s.¹⁵⁹ When Robert Southey is travelling through the Algarve in 1801, near Tavira, he writes in his journal: ‘The female dress is more Moorish – a large cloth sheath half way down, that hoods or hides the head – you sometimes meet them so completely veiled [veiled] that the opening excludes your seeing and barely suffices for their own.’¹⁶⁰ We sense mild disapproval here at the ‘Moorish’ dress preventing the traveller from seeing the Portuguese woman, and, he imagines, preventing her from seeing properly either. When Gabriel de Saint-Victor visits Faro nearly a hundred years later (his account is published in 1891) he makes similar comments when he witnesses women in Faro dressed in this way:

¹⁵⁸ Gautier, p. 290.

¹⁵⁹ Idílio Revez, ‘A *burqa* também existiu no Algarve: era o *bioco* e dava liberdade à mulher’, *Público*, 14 June 2015 <<https://www.publico.pt/2015/06/14/local/noticia/a-burka-tambem-existiu-no-algarve--era-o-bioco-e-dava-liberdade-a-mulher-1698729>> [accessed 30 August 2019].

¹⁶⁰ Southey, *Journals of Residence in Portugal 1800-1801*, p. 49.

Quelques femmes entrèrent après nous. Leur costume est bizarre; encapuchonnées dans une vaste mantille noire, elles la tordent sur la tête de manière à en faire une sorte d'entonnoir assez profond par lequel elles peuvent voir à se conduire mais sous lequel il est impossible de les reconnaître. Cette costume remonte certainement au temps des Maures, mais on assure qu'à Faro elle n'est pas exempte de grands inconvénients.¹⁶¹

In both accounts, the emphasis is on difference, strangeness and impracticality, as well as the link to Moorish culture. The traveller here focuses on the survival of the custom and its impact on the daily lives of those it touches rather than reflecting on the culture that this garment originates from.

Robert Southey refers, in a letter to Grosvenor Charles Bedford written from Sintra, to the survival of witchcraft practices that he sees as being inherited from the Moors:

From the Moors this people have also caught much – a spell called a figa is common to both. 'Tis a clenched hand with the thumb between two fingers, excellent against witchcraft – our proverb a fig for him is probably hence derived. Like the Mohammedans they do not fly from an infectious disease. Is the small-pox next door?¹⁶²

The association between the Moors and magic is one that is also found both in local popular legends in Portugal (which will be discussed further in Chapter 3), and, in the case of writing on Spain, in Washington Irving's *Tales of the Alhambra*.

Travellers also often interpreted aspects of the Portuguese language as echoing Moorish cultural influences. Writing in the 1870s, Marie Rattazzi notes that the King is addressed as 'el rey' rather than 'o rey'. Rattazzi asks:

Pourquoi cette coutume qui rappelle la domination des Maures et quelque peu aussi la domination espagnole? Orgueil d'un côté, humilité de l'autre!

On trouve encore d'autres traces de l'occupation des Arabes: d'abord le fatalisme, puis la puissance de la tradition.¹⁶³

Whereas Southey had associated superstition on the Iberian peninsula with the institution of the Catholic Church,¹⁶⁴ Rattazzi chooses to associate the fatalistic attitude

¹⁶¹ Saint-Victor, p. 227.

¹⁶² Southey, *Journals of Residence in Portugal 1800-1801*, p. 114. (See also p. 11, where Southey describes the same spell, and adds: 'The asses and mules here wear it.'

¹⁶³ Rattazzi, p. 75.

¹⁶⁴ See Southey, *Letters Written during a Short Residence in Spain and Portugal*, p. 81.

of some of the Portuguese she encounters, as well as the power of tradition, with an Arab cultural heritage. Remarks such as these make an implicit comparison with Northern Europe and its associated modernity, the implication being that modernity rejects superstition, fatalism and tradition, which are associated with the South.

Finally, in her walks and drives around Lisbon, Catherine Jackson is attentive to the traces of Moorish culture that linger in distinct parts of the city. During her initial stay in Lisbon she mentions 'the *Alfama*, or *Mouraria* – the old Moorish quarter of Lisbon that escaped destruction by the earthquake, and which is a most interesting part of the city'.¹⁶⁵ Later on in her account she mentions the 'the *Alfama* and *Mouraria* [...] where many traces of the Moors yet linger'.¹⁶⁶ She then includes a section on the Alfama, where she describes the 'mineral springs, Moorish baths, and fine fountains', the 'many winding mysterious passages', 'narrow crooked streets that you might literally and with perfect ease shake hands across' and the '*saloias* or launderesses' who wear 'a kind of Moorish earrings, called *brincas das saloias*'.¹⁶⁷ Still later in her account, whilst in Porto, she describes the following district:

Every morning we have passed an hour or two in *flânerie* between the Rua das Flores and dos Clerigos. On the left are the goldsmiths, this street answering to the 'Gold-street' of Lisbon; but here we have a far more profuse display of the gold filigree work by the country-people. There are ear-rings of immense size, lockets and large crosses to match, with massive chains and rings, various in pattern but all of Moorish design.¹⁶⁸

Jackson shows an evident interest in the surviving Moorish traces in 1870s Portugal, from the architecture of the streets to the Moorish style of artisan jewellery found there (none of the male writers notice the latter). However, by not delving deeper into this past in her writing, such traces only have limited power as isolated descriptions in a four-

¹⁶⁵ Jackson, p. 78.

¹⁶⁶ Jackson, p. 238.

¹⁶⁷ Jackson, p. 241.

¹⁶⁸ Jackson, p. 322.

hundred-page account. Although she does not explicitly refer, as Merson does, to the presence of an 'Orient' in Lisbon, she does recount that whilst on the ship prior to landing in Lisbon: 'I could not go to my berth without looking at the "Sultana of cities," as the Portuguese sometimes call Lisbon, as she lay before us in the dreamy light of the moon.'¹⁶⁹ Sultana here of course refers to a female Sultan (cities are always feminine). The expression stays with Jackson, as she cites it again when she is in the city witnessing the celebrations for the anniversary of the Duque de Terceira's Liberal forces arriving to capture Lisbon on 24 July 1833. Her party decide that the city is best viewed from the river, and Jackson writes: 'On the river, then, we went, and nothing more beautiful can well be imagined than the "Sultana City," on her throne of many hills, thus brilliantly illuminated.'¹⁷⁰ Though the phrase is a local one, according to Jackson, I would argue that her interest in it reflects an eagerness, even implicit, to see Lisbon in Oriental terms.¹⁷¹

Conclusion

As we have seen in this chapter, late eighteenth and nineteenth-century travel writing on Portugal shows both continuities with and differences in relation to Romantic and post-Romantic travel writing on Spain. Though travel writing on Portugal does engage with the country's (late) medieval history, it is more impressed with the country's Christian Gothic architecture than with its Moorish castles, which are mentioned briefly

¹⁶⁹ Jackson, p. 16.

¹⁷⁰ Jackson, p. 158.

¹⁷¹ Although the term is apparently no longer in use, Camilo's translation does not provide any note here to say that Lady Jackson was incorrect in her use of this term.

but without significant imaginative investment. In the case of Sintra's National Palace, which mostly dates from the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries and features a blend of Moorish, Manueline and Gothic styles, travellers note its confused architectural appearance, with Catherine Jackson describing it as a 'Portuguese Alhambra'. There is a sense, though, that some writers were aware of their short-sightedness. Jackson and Dora Wordsworth, both describe Portugal as having 'the most romantic of histories', whilst acknowledging that its early medieval history is hazy to them. Most writers are more taken with Sintra's Orientalist pleasure palaces built in the eighteenth to nineteenth centuries, than with the traces of a medieval Islamic presence. Travellers to Silves and the Algarve in general are rare during this period, and Silves' symbolic status in the memory of Gharb Al-Andalus is only rarely acknowledged.

In this chapter's corpus, Olivier Merson stands out for transposing a Romantic vision of an Oriental Spain onto Portugal, but for most writers, such a widespread transposition does not occur. One point of convergence, however, is the need to emphasise the difference and non-Europeanness of the landscapes of Andalusia, the Alentejo and the Algarve. Whereas travellers in the corpus who visited Cordoba, Granada and Seville were often able to relate their appreciation of Moorish decorative architecture to important moments in Spanish medieval history, travellers to Portugal did not have access to comparable narratives relating to Moorish architecture in Portugal. Though some travellers were able to discover other traces of Islamic culture such as the *bioco* in the Algarve and the character of the Alfama and Mouraria in Lisbon, such traces did not prompt extended imaginative reflections of the kind that can be found in Romantic travel writing on Spain. References to Islamic culture and legacy in Portugal were scattered throughout a corpus of travel accounts which also touched on a large variety of other topics. As such, travel writing on Portugal in the late eighteenth

and early nineteenth centuries was not able to establish a significant association between Portugal and the Orient.

Chapter 2: From Travel Writing to Historical Fiction. António Maria de Oliveira Parreira's *Os Luso-Árabes* (1898)

This second chapter opens up my investigation of nineteenth-century representations of Al-Andalus to include historical fiction. Whilst the object of study remains representations of Gharb Al-Andalus, the analysis will also examine historical fiction's relationship to travel writing in this context. The first portion of the chapter will discuss the case of Anna Eliza Bray's novel *The Talba, or Moor of Portugal* (1830), a historical novel set in fourteenth-century Portugal and featuring Muslim characters.¹ However, the majority of the analysis will relate to António Maria de Oliveira Parreira's 1898 novel *Os Luso-Árabes*, a work virtually unknown outside the field of Portuguese Arab-Islamic studies.² This two-volume historical novel, set in eleventh-century Iberia, fictionalises the story of Al-Mutamid Ibn Abbad (1040-1095), the poet-King and last ruler of the *taifa* (independent principality) of Seville who was born in Beja (modern-day Alentejo), and that of his ambitious advisor Ibn Ammar (1031-1086). *Os Luso-Árabes* is unique in being the most detailed representation of Gharb Al-Andalus written in the nineteenth century. As my research has also uncovered, the author also produced travel writing a few years before writing the novel, including passages which he reworked in *Os Luso-Árabes*, exemplifying the link between the practice of travel writing and that of historical fiction writing.

When examining nineteenth-century historical fiction it is important to highlight that authors are likely to be influenced by Walter Scott's successful model for the historical novel. In particular, Scott's *Ivanhoe* (1820) provided a model for a historical

¹ Anna Eliza Bray, *The Talba, or Moor of Portugal. A Romance*, 3 vols (London: Longman, Rees, Orme, Brown, and Green, 1830).

² António Maria de Oliveira Parreira, *Os Luso-Árabes (Scenas da vida mussulmana no nosso pais)*, 2 vols (Lisbon: Typographia e Stereotypia Moderna, 1898).

novel set in the medieval period, in which history and legend were blended with nationalist or regionalist concerns. It was a model that writers beyond the British Isles, such as Alexandre Dumas (*père*) in France, would use as a point of reference when portraying their own country's history – in Dumas' case using dramatic historical events as the setting for adventure stories. The Marxist literary historian György Lukács famously discusses Walter Scott in his critical work *The Historical Novel* (first published in Russian in 1937, and in English translation in 1962). Lukács draws a distinction between 'the so-called historical novel before Sir Walter Scott' and Scott's own works, arguing that the former were not able to derive 'the individuality of characters from the historical peculiarity of their age'. He gives the example of Walpole's *Castle of Otranto* (1764), in which, 'history is [...] treated as mere costumery: it is only the curiosity and oddities of the *milieu* that matter, not an artistically faithful image of a concrete historical epoch'.³ Although it must surely be impossible to represent a historical period with characters that are entirely historically accurate and without influence from the writers' own period and society, there is a shift towards a more serious attempt to do so from Scott's novels onwards.

It is also important to highlight that Lukács refutes any notion of Scott being a Romantic writer. Whilst he acknowledges that 'the historical subject-matter of his novels is very close to that of the Romantics proper', Lukács argues that 'Scott's interpretation of this subject-matter is entirely opposed to that of the Romantics, as is his manner of portrayal'. Lukács focuses on contrasting the figure of the eccentric Romantic hero (as found in the work of Byron) with the Scottian 'mediocre, prosaic hero', in whom Lukács sees a 'renunciation of Romanticism, [...] a higher development

³ György Lukács, *The Historical Novel*, trans. from the German by Hannah and Stanley Mitchell (London: Merlin Press, 1989), p. 19.

of the realist literary traditions of the Enlightenment'.⁴ Lukács' argument seems overly polarised in the light of more recent scholarship. For example, C.W. Thompson, as discussed in Chapter 1, has sought to give a more balanced view of the relative merits and shortcomings of Romantic writing. Nonetheless, the distinction Lukács makes will be useful as it explains why writers who are strongly influenced by the Romantic aesthetic, such as Oliveira Parreira, might therefore draw only certain aspects from the Scottian model, leaving others, such as the use of a 'mediocre, prosaic hero', behind.

Although a more specific theoretical examination of the links between the travel writing and historical novel genres is still lacking, a number of scholars have acknowledged the reciprocal relationship between travel writing and fiction. Álvaro Manuel Machado and Daniel-Henri Pageaux, have emphasised that from a literary perspective, literary fiction and travel writing genres mutually enrich each other.⁵ This has been the case, they argue, throughout literary history, giving Homer's *Odyssey* and the picaresque novel as examples of literature in which travel becomes synonymous with adventure, and with the hero's moral development.⁶ Machado and Pageaux argue that the traveller, or hero-traveller ('herói-viajante'), is the driving force in literary fiction, and that he is: 'ao mesmo tempo dinâmica e significado da narrativa romanesca [...] Ele imprime, pelos seus encontros com o estrangeiro, pelas suas reacções, pelas suas descobertas mais ou menos emocionais, o ritmo geral ao romance.'⁷

⁴ Lukács, pp. 33-34.

⁵ Álvaro Manuel Machado and Daniel-Henri Pageaux, *Da Literatura Comparada à Teoria da Literatura*, 2nd edn. revised and enlarged (Lisbon: Ed. Presença, 2001), p. 45.

⁶ Similarly, Georges Van Den Abbeele also argues that the metaphor of the voyage can be traced back to such writers as Homer, Virgil, Dante, Cervantes, Defoe, Goethe, Melville and Conrad, as well as being used by a whole host of later writers. Georges Van Den Abbeele, *Travel as Metaphor: From Montaigne to Rousseau* (Minneapolis and Oxford: University of Minnesota Press, 1992), p. xiii.

⁷ Machado and Pageaux, p. 45.

Travel writing is of course primarily an account of a physical displacement in space, which later came to include metaphorical journeys in the sense of a traveller's personal development. Historical fiction, on the other hand, requires the author and the reader to enact an imaginary displacement in time, one which is frequently compared, again metaphorically, to a physical displacement in space. However, the process of moving between different geographical spaces, as we do in a historical novel, also constitutes in itself a third type of metaphorical voyage, with the narrator becoming the one who leads the reader through these spaces. And since the reader is often not located where the story is set, historical fiction often requires metaphorical travel in space as well as in time. Acknowledging this allows us to see that the historical novel shows a certain convergence with the genre of travel writing, despite some obvious differences. Indeed, both genres are perceived to provide the reader with 'pleasurable instruction', a concept explored by Charles L. Batten in relation to the eighteenth-century travel writing genre.⁸

It is well known that 'Romantic writers used travel narratives as models, as well as sources, for their own work' meaning that the link between the genres was 'not just metaphorical but also stylistic in nature'.⁹ Diego Saglia remarks that 'literary works [in the Romantic period] drew heavily on travel accounts and often included scholarly observations in their notes', citing William Beckford's *Vathek* (1786) and Robert Southey's Oriental narrative poems – *Thalaba the Destroyer* (1801) and *The Curse of Kehama* (1810) as examples.¹⁰ Where this analysis considers links between the two genres, it is concerned with how an author's own travel writing and associated travel

⁸ Batten, *Pleasurable Instruction*.

⁹ Carmen Casaliggi and Porscha Fermanis, *Romanticism: A Literary and Cultural History* (London: Routledge, 2016), p. 63.

¹⁰ Saglia, 'Orientalism', p. 475.

experiences, or the travel writing of another influential writer, can influence the conception and writing of a historical novel. This could, for example, be through the presence of the figure of a traveller in the historical novel. However, it is not always necessary for the historical novel to describe a journey for influence to be identified: travel writing can also inform and influence the description of places in historical fiction.

In the context of representations of Gharb Al-Andalus, I am therefore particularly interested in cases where an author's travel and travel writing preceded his or her writing of a historical novel or related literary production concerning Gharb Al-Andalus. As such, William Beckford's Oriental tale *Vathek* (originally composed in French, first published [in English] in 1786), would not qualify, as it was written prior to Beckford's stay in Portugal, which began in 1787, and also does not contain references to the Portuguese context.

Neither will I be analysing in detail Robert Southey's epic poem *Roderick Last of the Goths* (1814), despite it being written after his travels to Portugal (in 1795-6 and 1800). The poem does reflect Southey's interest in Portugal and its shared history of medieval Islamic presence with Spain, but only insofar as it contains a handful of references to Portuguese places and historical figures.¹¹ The poem is often understood as reflecting Southey's horror at the French invasion of Portugal and Spain in the Peninsular War (1807-1814).¹² As discussed in Chapter 1, the representation of Muslims in the poem relies on caricatured images which animalise Muslims and portray them as morally inferior to Christians. As such, though the poem is of interest in its own right, it is not the most obvious choice for this study, as other fictional works represent Gharb

¹¹ We hear that 'many a weary age | Must Coimbra wear the misbeliever's yoke' and there is mention of the 'Lusitanian capital' and the historical figure of Mumadona Dias. Southey, *Roderick last of the Goths*, pp. 13; 31-33.

¹² The period 1808-1814 is known as the *Guerra de la Independencia española* in the Spanish-speaking world.

Al-Andalus and Western Iberian Muslims in a more detailed (and incidentally more sympathetic) manner.

The Talba, or Moor of Portugal (1830)

Of more importance for the purposes of this study is Anna Eliza Bray's historical novel *The Talba, or Moor of Portugal* (1830), set in fourteenth-century Portugal. Aside from Diane Duffy's doctoral thesis from 2011, Bray's novels have received little detailed critical attention, despite their popular appeal in the nineteenth century.¹⁵ Many of Bray's works were reprinted, some twice, even before the first full collection of her works was published in 1846, with their last republication being in 1884.¹⁶ Duffy's thesis does not discuss *The Talba, or Moor of Portugal*, except to note that this novel was published both in the US and in Germany (the latter in translation).¹⁷ However, Duffy does explore questions of historiography, gender and identity in both Bray's early travel writing on France and in her fourteenth-century romances set in France and Flanders.¹⁸ There has, however, been one significant study of *The Talba*: in 1992, Maria Luísa Fernandez Alves published an article dealing exclusively with this novel, including an examination of its historical inaccuracies and its contribution to representations of Portugueseness.¹⁹

¹⁵ Diane Elizabeth Duffy, *Historiography, Gender and Identity in the Works of Anna Eliza Bray* (unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Manchester, 2011).

¹⁶ Duffy, p. 9; 136.

¹⁷ Duffy, p. 10; *The Talba* (New York: J and J Harper, 1831); *Der Talba von Portugal* (Kiel: Universitäts-Buchhandlung, 1835).

¹⁸ Mrs. Charles Stothard, (Anna Eliza Bray), *Letters Written During a Tour Through Normandy, Brittany and Other Parts of France in 1818: Including Local and Historical Descriptions: with Remarks on the Character and Manners of the People* (London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, Orme and Brown, 1820); Bray also published travel writing on Switzerland: *The Mountains and Lakes of Switzerland*, 3 vols (London: Longman, Brown, Green and Longmans, 1841). The mentioned historical romances are *De Foix* (1828) and *White Hoods* (1828), as discussed in Duffy, pp. 122-173.

¹⁹ Maria Luísa Fernandez Alves, 'Hassan, O Talba – O Mouro de Portugal de Anna Eliza Bray', *Revista de Estudos Anglo-Portugueses*, 2 (1992) pp. 105-116.

Bray sets *The Talba* in a newly reconquered Portugal, where Muslims are still present but are heavily taxed and regarded with suspicion. Having examined both the chronicles of the period and the interpretation of the historian José Mattoso, Luísa Alves concludes that although Christian intolerance of Muslims did increase across the Peninsula from the twelfth-century onwards (as did concurrently the intolerance of the Almohad Muslims), '[t]udo indica que D. Afonso IV não tenha sido tão cruel com os mouros quanto a autora defende'. Muslim subjects in Portugal paid similar taxes and enjoyed similar rights and social duties under Alfonso IV, as well as having their own courts, local governors and right to religion. It was not until Pedro I became King that they were forced to live definitively in Moorish quarters, in a frustrated attempt to prevent miscegenation.²⁰ The historical context as depicted by Bray, who was a Protestant, is one which allows her to portray the Portuguese Catholics as particularly intolerant. Of course, as Luísa Alves herself notes, Portuguese Catholicism had been portrayed in striking detail in British travel narratives on Portugal and was frequently the subject of criticism.²¹

The plot of *The Talba* is based on the tragic story of Galician noblewoman Inês de Castro (1325-1355), the lover and posthumously-recognised wife of King Peter I of Portugal. Inês' death was ordered by Peter's father, the then King Afonso IV, who had forbidden their relationship. Although the historical figure of Inês has frequently been represented in art, music and drama, her story is not associated with the legacy of Islamic presence in Portugal. Sintra, where much of the action in *The Talba* is based, had been a Christian territory since the early twelfth century, whereas Bray portrays it as being a relatively recent conquest. Despite the novel's historical inaccuracies and

²⁰ Luísa Alves, p. 108.

²¹ Luísa Alves, pp. 106; 109.

anachronistic elements, it is nonetheless indicative of a Romantic interest in Islamic Portugal, albeit marginal. It also permits us to examine, as an artefact, the literary result of the lack of access to historical information about Gharb Al-Andalus coupled with the absence of an accompanying literary tradition. Having never set foot in Portugal herself, and finding information on the Muslims of medieval Portugal hard to come by, Bray relied on sources which related to Islamic and post-reconquest Granada.²² For example, Luísa Alves believes that Bray may have come up with the idea of a threat of a Moorish rebellion though reading about the Morisco rebellions in reconquered Granada and the surrounding region, which were finally quelled in the sixteenth century. Luísa Alves also notes that the quashing of these rebellions became a form of national vengeance against the Moriscos, which did not occur in Portugal. The use of such material from the Granadan context is therefore one element that contributes to the distortion of Portuguese history in *The Talba*.

Eliza Bray had a longstanding friendship with Robert Southey, which was mainly conducted through the exchange of letters from 1830 onwards.²³ Southey was encouraging of Bray's writing and gave Bray permission to draw on his 1797 travel

²² See Luísa Alves pp. 106-107 for details of how Bray consulted William Guthrie's *A General History of the World* (1765-1767) but was criticised for a lack of historical accuracy in a review in *The Athenaeum* in 1830. In terms of (Christian) sources relating to Islamic Granada used by Bray, Alves cites Ginés Pérez de Hita's *Guerras Civiles de Granada* (1595-1619) whose huge success in France in the seventeenth century, Alves notes, 'fez nascer o "romance granadino" ou "hispano mourisco"'. However, it is likely, as Alves argues citing extracts from Bray's autobiography, that Bray thought that the text was based on authentic Arabic sources (Alves, p. 111).

²³ Some of their correspondence has already been published, for example in Bray's *A Description of the Part of Devonshire Bordering on the Tamar and the Tavy; Its Natural History, Manners, Customs, Superstitions, Scenery, Antiquities, Biography of Eminent Persons, &c. &c. in a Series of Letters to Robert Southey Esq.* (London: John Murray, 1836). She is mentioned on the title page as being the author of *The Talba*. Others appear in John Wood Warter's *Selections from the Letters of Robert Southey* (London: Longman, Brown, Green, and Longmans, 1856) and in Bray's autobiography, which was published after her death as *Autobiography of Anna Eliza Bray* ed. by John A. Kempe (London: Chapman and Hall, 1884). Southey's letters to Bray will also appear in Parts 9-12 of 'The Collected Letters of Robert Southey' ed. by Lynda Pratt, Tim Fulford and Ian Packer, in *Romantic Circles* (2009-) <https://romantic-circles.org/editions/southey_letters> [accessed 10 September 2019].

account to depict Sintra in *The Talba*.²⁴ Luísa Alves also considers that the (anachronistic) description of a bullfight was probably drawn partly from James Murphy.²⁵ Bray's decision to set the opening of the novel and much of the action in Sintra is less to do with historical events and more with a British audience's familiarity with Sintra, through travel and travel writing. The novel opens with a description of the magnificent natural scenery of Sintra, including its lush woods. Of these woods, Bray writes: 'contrasted with the sterile character of the country in the immediate vicinity of Lisbon, [they] "serve to check," in the words of a modern traveller, "any wish to wander from the charming springs and shades of Cintra, or to explore the sad wilderness that insulates them from the chief city of Portugal"''.²⁶ In the 1845 edition, which was revised and corrected, she specifies the origin of the quotation by replacing 'in the words of a modern traveller' with 'in the words of the poet Southey', lending additional authority to the description.²⁷

In the following paragraph of the chapter Bray writes:

The ruins of a Moorish castle may, to this day, be seen on a most commanding station of the rock, not far from the glade of velvet turf we have already noticed in the opening of these pages. The spot was consecrated by long remembered tradition, that gave to it an interest which survives the changes of time and generations. Not even to this hour could it be looked upon by the contemplative eye with indifference.

When Alonso the Fourth, surnamed the Brave, was king of Portugal, this remarkable spot was in its greatest beauty, being then adorned and tended with extreme care.²⁸

Though the novel had opened with a description of Sintra in the present tense, the reader might have assumed that the scene being set was in the historical period in which the action occurs. However, the references first to Southey and then to a present-day Sintra and to a present-day traveller's experience, transform this piece and the

²⁴ Duffy, p. 34. Luísa Alves, p. 109. See description of Sintra in Robert Southey, *Letters written during a short residence in Spain and Portugal* (Bristol, Bulgin & Rosser, 1797) pp. 509-511.

²⁵ Luísa Alves, p. 109. James Cavanagh Murphy, *A General View of the State of Portugal*, London, T. Cadell & W. Davies, 1798, pp. 145-146.

²⁶ Bray, *The Talba*, I, p. 3.

²⁷ Bray, *The Talba: or, Moor of Portugal. A Romance. A new edition, revised and corrected, with notes by the author* (London: Longman, Brown, Green and Longmans, 1845), p. 2.

²⁸ Bray, *The Talba* (1830), I, pp. 4-5.

paragraphs preceding it into a hybrid form, which poses both as fiction and travel writing. Such hybrid form manages to convey both the timelessness of Sintra's beauty and the idea of the passing of time, through the discussion of tradition. It is only when Bray mentions 'Alonso the Fourth' (she is in fact referring to Afonso IV) that we are placed back into the fourteenth century, where her novel is set.²⁹

Bray's allusions to the survival of traditions over generations is also a reminder of her conservatism. Duffy has underlined Bray's orthodoxy, in contrast to 'the more radical women writers such as Mary Wollstonecraft and the youthful Mary Shelley'. Among the features of Bray's conservatism, Duffy identifies the fact that 'Bray wished to conserve the past, to preserve her country's material culture as well as its customs, traditions and landscape, although Bray approaches these national issues through the prism of regionality'.³⁰ Duffy is of course describing Bray's feelings about her native Britain, however, the value Bray places on tradition can also be seen in *The Talba*. The Muslim characters in *The Talba* lend it an exotic appeal, as Luísa Alves identifies, and do not contradict Bray's social conservatism.³¹ And yet this exotic element also makes Bray a pioneer, in that, however clumsily and anachronistically, she does represent medieval Iberian Muslims. Her novel is set at a time when, according to her representation of Portuguese history, a Portugal with Muslim rulers was still within living memory. As such, she has contributed in an original manner to the literary representation and visibility of Portuguese medieval Muslims. Furthermore, it can easily be argued that Bray's inclusion of Muslim characters is not purely for their exotic appeal. Not only do

²⁹ Luísa Alves notes Bray's inability to distinguish between the Spanish and Portuguese language, as seen in the way that many Portuguese characters' names use the Spanish spellings in the novel. While some errors in the names of historical figures are purely linguistic, others reflect 'uma quase total falta de informação histórica' (Alves, p. 110).

³⁰ Duffy, p. 24.

³¹ See Luísa Alves, p. 106.

her Muslim characters transcend the cruder stereotypes that can be found, for example, in Southey's *Roderick*, but Bray is also anxious to convey a point about religious and racial universalism, as can be seen in Hassan's speech to Ines in volume 2:

— you mistrust me because I am a Moor! Hath not He who made thy cheek white as the lily of the field, and cast on mine the darkness of a warmer sun, hath He not given life to us both? Am not I as much his care, and stand in his presence with the same assurance as thyself? I breathe the free air as well as thou: are not heat and cold, the winter's wind, or the light breath of a spring, as obvious to my senses as to thee? These are all outward things; but look on the inward soul; and there read if the Moor, the despised Moor, is below the Christian.³²

Here Bray rewrites, for her Muslim hero Hassan the Talba, Shylock's speech in William Shakespeare's *The Merchant of Venice* (Act 3, Scene 1), in which the character reflects on how as a Jew he has the same human experiences as a Christian, and therefore should not be expected to behave any differently.

Of *The Talba's* Muslim characters, the deceased former Muslim ruler, Alcanzor, is the least developed. Luísa Alves sees a possible literary transposition of king Abou Abdulá (Boabdil) of Granada into Alcanzor, though it must be said that he is not described in detail by Bray.³³ In fact, the last ruler of the Muslim Algarve was Mûsâ Ibn Muhammad Ibn Nassir Ibn Mahfûz, known by the Christians as Aben Mafom. He had already featured in Almeida Garrett's poem *Dona Branca* from 1826 as Aben-Afan, though, as I discuss later in this chapter, this was not by any means a detailed representation. Of more interest here are *The Talba's* living Muslim characters, whose actions are crucial to the development of the plot. Of these, Aza Anzurez, Alcanzor's widow, is strongly developed, as well as Hassan, the Talba. Secondary Muslim characters include Hamet, Alcanzor's son, Ximena, who appears as Ines' maid, and Cassim, Ximena's estranged admirer.

³² Bray, *The Talba*, II, pp. 132-133. Bray frequently uses Shakespeare quotations as epigraphs to her chapters.

³³ Luísa Alves, pp. 109-110.

In relation to Bray's literary output in general, Duffy considers that it is 'significant as it forms the middle ground between the antiquarian and historical specificity of Scott and the focus on female characters in the works of women writers such as Radcliffe, Reeve and Shelley'.³⁴ She sees the strong presence of women in Bray's novels as being compatible with the author's conservative social values, since: 'It is [...] her constant focus on family and personal relationships that makes women central to her narrative, for unlike Scott, Bray's female characters are present throughout the work'.³⁵ Aza Anzurez is presented as a dignified, determined and at times cunning widow, while her qualities of love and self-sacrifice as a mother are also emphasised. She is the first character to be described in the novel, and the description celebrates her exotic appeal in the terms that we are used to reading in travel accounts of the period: 'The face of her we now describe, was rendered expressive by the animation of eyes jet black, and full of that liquid lustre so particularly observable in Moorish beauty'.³⁶ This recalls, for example, Gautier's description of the female gypsies of Sacro Monte: 'Leur teint basané fait ressortir la limpidité de leurs yeux orientaux dont l'ardeur est tempérée par je ne sais quelle tristesse mystérieuse, comme le souvenir d'une patrie absente et d'une grandeur déchue'.³⁷ Such descriptive coherence further underlines the discursive coherence of the two genres.

It is also significant that it is not the beauty of a young virginal woman that is being described, for Aza already has an adult son. Bray describes her as 'the noble Moor', further underlining her status as a dignified and idealised representative of the Moorish race.³⁸ Luísa Alves sees Aza Anzurez, Hamet, Cassim and Ximena as representatives of

³⁴ Duffy, p. 142.

³⁵ Duffy, p. 224.

³⁶ Bray, *The Talba*, I, p.6.

³⁷ Gautier, p. 295.

³⁸ Bray, *The Talba*, I, p.9.

‘os vários estratos sociais dos mouros’, of which Hamet is the intrepid, courageous but immature prince without a throne, Cassim a shepherd and warrior, and Ximena, a loyal Christianised servant to Ines.³⁹ The most significant Muslim character is Hassan, the Talba, from whom the novel takes its title.

Bray describes the profession of a Talba as consisting in:

a knowledge of medicine, and in the study of astronomy, (added to which were the power to foretell what eclipses portended evil, the expounding strange dreams, and predicting events, in a manner considered infallible;) above all, in a deep acquaintance with the arts of astrology and magic; the latter being ever accompanied with a knowledge of poisons, charms, and spells of every description.⁴⁰

Luísa Alves has analysed various aspects of Bray’s portrayal of this revered figure in Islamic society. Firstly, the Talba’s associations with magic and the occult recall how the Moors are frequently associated with magic (sometimes dark), in legend. The author’s use of this enigmatic stereotype therefore allows her to create moments of suspense. At the same time, it is significant that Hassan, as a representative of an ethnic and religious minority, has an important role in the development of a plot which revolves around the Portuguese royal family. In Luísa Alves’ opinion:

[a] escolha de um sábio para herói pode representar o contraste existente entre o progresso do Andaluz na sua idade de ouro e o obscurantismo do resto da Europa na mesma época, um dos factores a que a autora parece querer prestar homenagem na figura do Talba.⁴¹

Despite this positive aspect of the representation, Luísa Alves also highlights a detail from Bray’s autobiography, namely that the Talba’s physiognomy was based on a Turkish diplomat, Sidky Effendi, whom Bray had the opportunity to meet in London.⁴² As such, the portrayal of Muslim characters in the novel is an example of what Luísa Alves terms ‘orientalismo difuso’, the result of the representation in European literature

³⁹ Luísa Alves, p. 114.

⁴⁰ Bray, p. 41.

⁴¹ Luísa Alves, p. 114.

⁴² Bray, *Autobiography* (London: Chapman & Hall, 1884), p. 216, cited in Luísa Alves, p. 112.

of Muslims from different origins: the Arab Empire, Al-Andalus, and from the Ottoman Empire. Luísa Alves argues that by conflating these images of Muslims by representing them as sharing common physical and character traits, British Romanticism has participated in spreading this image of a 'diffuse' orientalism. This conflation in turn assists the portrayal of Islam as the (unified) Other of Western Civilisation.⁴³ The use of such points of reference from the Ottoman Empire in literary works would continue through the nineteenth century and was certainly not limited to British Romanticism, as we shall see when we come to examine Oliveira Parreira's novel.

Luísa Alves' article provides an excellent starting point for the study of *The Talba*, however there are still many directions which further research on this novel could take. Bray's descriptions of architecture, in particular, deserve further attention. Despite Bray's consultation of travel writing on Portugal, her descriptions often reveal a lack of knowledge of the country's historic buildings. An example is when she describes the following chamber located in Sintra in the first volume of the novel:

The chamber in which the members were assembled was situated near the king's own apartment in the palace or castle of Cintra. Like most buildings of importance in Portugal, this was of Moorish origin; for, under the caliphs of the West, and before the Moors were driven from Cordova, they ranked the first in arts, as well as in arms, throughout the world. Their mosques, palaces, and other public edifices, were of a structure so costly and magnificent as to astonish the architects of succeeding ages with the grandeur of their design, and the splendour of their execution.⁴⁴

Bray's statement about mosques and palaces could be applied to Spanish Andalusia, where the Muslims of Al-Andalus built such wonders as the Great Mosque of Cordoba, the Medina Azahara palace complex and the Alhambra Palace (although the latter was mostly built after the Cordoba Caliphate had ended). Even so, the statement 'most buildings of importance' is a little far-fetched, and when applied to Portugal it amounts to a significant distortion. Although many Portuguese churches were originally mosques,

⁴³ Luísa Alves, p. 112.

⁴⁴ Bray, *The Talba*, I, p. 168.

even in the medieval period many buildings of importance such as the Alcobaça and Batalha monasteries were built by Christians (though Manueline architecture was influenced by both Islamic and Indian architecture). In terms of medieval Islamic architecture in Portugal, the smaller scale of buildings such as mosques reflected the fact that the Gharb Al-Andalus was a marginal territory with less concentration of power and wealth. Sharajib, the palace evoked in the Al-Mutamid's poems, had not been discovered at the time Bray was writing, and the remains which have now been excavated under Silves' Moorish castle are significant but again small in scale. As such, the architecture she describes is often imagined: nonetheless, her descriptions can allow us to build up a picture of the author's essentialist beliefs about Islamic culture and how this influenced her representation of the Muslims of medieval Portugal.

In the first volume of *The Talba*, Bray describes an abandoned Moorish palace in Sintra which is far more ornamental than the surviving ruins of the defensive Moorish castle (rebuilt in the 1840s by Ferdinand II). Bray writes: 'The architecture of the pile was the Saracenic, – a style in which richness was combined with strength, whilst eastern lightness displayed itself in the ornamental parts.'⁴⁵ The use of the term 'Saracenic' recalls the language of the Crusades, although this term is used to describe Muslims in many travel accounts on Iberia in English and French from the nineteenth century and early twentieth centuries. Although the building Bray describes is an imagined construction, she may well have had in mind the architecture of the Alhambra palace in Granada, particularly its delicate Nasrid plasterwork, columns and arches dating from the fourteenth century. The author also combines particular concepts: richness, strength and lightness, which refer primarily to aesthetics but whose qualities can easily

⁴⁵ Bray, *The Talba*, I, p. 75.

extend beyond aesthetics to become moral qualities (strength, vitality and grace). In the second volume, a defensive castle is described that is located in: 'a wild sequestered spot in one of those mountainous regions that lie between Cintra [Sintra] and Coimbra'.⁴⁶ Further research is needed to ascertain whether Bray had a particular castle in mind here, or whether it is a completely fictitious structure. Explaining the castle's abandoned state does however give her the opportunity to mention the 'great battle of Santeren', presumably the Christian conquest of Almoravid-ruled Santarém (1147). Bray writes:

In former times, after the great battle of Santeren, where the Christians overcame the Moors, it had been betrayed by secret treachery to the enemy. All the Moors who then guarded it had been put to the sword; not one was spared to tell the tale of treachery, saving him by whose means it had been effected. In memory of this event, the fortress, even amongst Christians, obtained the fearful name of *The Castle of Death*; and tradition, by that appellation, had handed it down to prosperity.⁴⁷

Here the horror and trauma of medieval sieges is presented as affecting the memory not only of the victims (in this case the Moors) but also the perpetrators (in this case the Christians). It is also an example of the presence of gothic elements in Bray's novel, which can often be found combined with oriental themes in works from the Romantic period.

It is easy to criticise certain literary qualities of *The Talba*. The action can sometimes verge on melodrama, the characterisation often lacks subtlety, and character behaviour can become predictable.⁴⁸ Though it is relevant to point out such literary shortcomings, they should not prevent a work from being given due credit for its originality and contribution to the development of representations of Portuguese Al-

⁴⁶ Bray, *The Talba*, II, p. 72.

⁴⁷ Bray, *The Talba*, II, p. 77.

⁴⁸ Duffy also notes a lack of nuance in Bray's characterisation relating to the representation of chivalry, comparing Bray's novels *White Hoods* and *Defroissart* to Walter Scott's *Ivanhoe*, and commenting: 'Bray's work is more stereotyped than Scott's; her knights either follow the codes of chivalry or they do not. Those who do not are presented as villains, violent, dishonourable and abusive to women' (Duffy, p. 144).

Andalus. As Luísa Alves has noted: '*The Talba* será [...] um caso ímpar de romance luso-mourisco na literatura inglesa; mesmo o granadino foi um fenómeno francês por excelência, não tendo tido numerosos seguidores em Inglaterra.' As we have seen, it is not only the setting of the novel but also the fact that Muslim characters enjoy an integral role in the plot and considerable moral authority which makes it unique for the period. Luísa Alves asserts that in this respect Bray's novel surpasses comparable works in Portuguese literature:

Todavia, no que se refere a obras em que as personagens [muçulmanas] tenham capacidade activa de intervenção na acção ou em que se afirmem como protagonistas ou heróis com forte delineação psicológica, também em termos portugueses falham os congéneres de *The Talba*.⁴⁹

As we shall see, however, Oliveira Parreira gives his Muslim protagonists an even more important role in *Os Luso-Árabes*, which was published sixty-eight years after Bray's, and after the high point of Romanticism. Although Bray's decision to set her novel in a newly reconquered Portugal allows her to represent the Catholics as intolerant oppressors of the Portuguese Muslims, from the point of view of visibility of a marginalised cultural heritage, a bolder choice would have been to set it at the time when the Muslims were in the ascendant. Of course, this was not Bray's agenda, but it again provides a very useful point of comparison for the analysis of Oliveira Parreira's *Os Luso-Árabes* that follows, and which features two of the most important figures of Portugal's Arabic literary heritage.

Romanticism in Portugal: Almeida Garrett

Before proceeding with the analysis of *Os Luso-Árabes*, it is useful to consider the context of Portuguese Romanticism by examining one of its key proponents, Almeida

⁴⁹ Luísa Alves, p. 113.

Garrett (1799-1854). As we saw earlier, Garrett produced, amongst other works, an epic poem entitled *Dona Branca* (1826), which is set during the reconquest of the Algarve and fictionalises a love story between Afonso III's daughter and the Algarve's last Moorish ruler, Aben-Afan. The poem was culturally influential, becoming the inspiration for the opera *Donna Bianca*, whose music was composed by Alfredo Keil to an Italian-language libretto by César Féréal. The version of history that Garrett recounts in *Dona Branca* was also used as the basis of José Freire de Serpa Pimentel's historical drama *O Almançor Aben-Afan* (1840). As Oliveira Parreira himself points out in the introduction to *Os Luso-Árabes*, although Garrett's poem is beautifully written and features the Christian reconquest of Silves, it does not in fact offer a detailed picture of Moorish Portugal, nor is it historically accurate:

só tem de mourisco o nome do heroe; pois até mesmo a lenda parece falsa, porque o Abu Afan ou Ibn Maffot, que se diz ter morrido no lodo do pego [de Silves], figura ainda muito depois como rei de Niebla e do Gharb, e é elle que faz cedencia do Algarve a Affonso X depois da rendição de Niebla, muito posterior á epocha a que a tal lenda se refere.⁵⁰

Oliveira Parreira's analysis reveals how Portuguese authors at the time, a little like Robert Southey in *Roderick*, used Moorish settings and characters without a deep engagement with the Muslim cultural presence. The setting would be a mere backdrop, the Muslim characters undeveloped and with only minor representation in the work. This is also the case in Alexandre Herculano's novels *Eurico, o Presbítero* (1844), *El Monge de Cister* (1848) and his collection of tales *Lendas e narrativas* (1851).

Garrett also produced a piece of domestic travel writing, *Viagens na Minha Terra* (1846). Although it does not examine Portuguese Islamic heritage, this work is also relevant to an understanding of the literary context because of its formal experimentation. The title itself contains an inherent irony, since the journey is not to a

⁵⁰ Oliveira Parreira, *Os Luso-Árabes*, I, Introduction, p. x. Further references will be in the body of the text.

distant land but instead features the author's own homeland, which is put under the lens in the work, mainly through the use of conversations between characters, who have been interpreted as being symbolic of different political factions or ideological positions within Portugal at the time Garrett was writing.⁵¹ The playful experimentation of the Romantic writer can also be seen in the way that Garrett inserts a novella, the love story of the green-eyed Joanhina, into the middle of the work. As well as being an important literary model available to the Portuguese nineteenth-century writer, *Viagens na Minha Terra* is also a more obvious point of reference for José Saramago, whose travel writing will be examined in the fourth chapter of this thesis.

***Os Luso-Árabes* (1898)**

Despite offering the most detailed representation of Al-Andalus in nineteenth-century Portuguese literature, António Maria de Oliveira Parreira's 1898 two-volume historical novel *Os Luso-Árabes* has so far received very little critical attention, the writer being virtually unknown outside of the field of Portuguese Arab-Islamic studies. It is, however, briefly discussed by AbdoolKarim Vakil, who, as mentioned in the Introduction to this thesis, identifies *Os Luso-Árabes* as a paradigmatic example of the 'minor boom in mostly Algarve-centred Islamic-themed writings' which we find 'from the 1890s into the early twentieth century'. In saying this, Vakil links Oliveira Parreira's work to other literary manifestations of an Algarvian regionalism which sought to celebrate aspects of the region's history, including the culture of Gharb Al-Andalus.⁵²

⁵¹ John M. Parker, 'Introduction', in Almeida Garrett, *Travels in my Homeland* trans. by John M. Parker (London: Peter Owen, 1987), p. 16.

⁵² Vakil, p. 35. Vakil discusses Oliveira Parreira in conjunction with another key figure from this minor boom, Francisco Xavier d'Athaide Oliveira, who the editor and narrator of a collection of Islamic-themed oral literary traditions, *As Mouras Encantadas e os Encantamentos no Algarve* (Tavira: Typographia

Set in the eleventh century but with frequent references to the present, *Os Luso-Árabes* embarks on a celebration of Portugal's Arabic literary heritage, but in doing so also lays out an opulent vision of Portugal's internal (historic) Orient. Though influenced by the Romantic tradition, as I shall explore below, *Os Luso-Árabes* is above all an example of late nineteenth-century Portuguese Orientalism. Oliveira Parreira's writing reveals a colourful, often sympathetic but nonetheless essentialising vision of the Orient applied to the author's own homeland, in which it is also possible to identify the influence of representations of other Islamic contexts. Amounting to an impressive seven hundred pages, *Os Luso-Árabes* has only ever appeared in one edition, but can be accessed as a reprinted facsimile, with nineteenth-century orthography.⁵³ The novel is in many ways hybrid in terms of genre, combining long sections of dense historical detail including historiographical debates and extensive footnotes and endnotes, with poetic, descriptive and oniric sequences. It can also be described as a fictionalised biography, since the intense and at times volatile relationship between Al-Mutamid and his advisor Ibn Ammar forms the narrative backbone of the novel.⁵⁴

In comparison to Al-Mutamid's status as heir of the Abbadid dynasty, Ibn Ammar was a poet of far more humble origins, but with grand political ambitions. They first met when Al-Mutamid was still a child and Ibn Ammar a young adolescent, and enjoyed an intense friendship based on their mutual love of poetic improvisation. When Al-

Burocrática, 1898). Athaide Oliveira was also the founder of a weekly newspaper based in Loulé, *O Algarvio* (1889-1893), which I discuss in Chapter 3.

⁵³ Various printing houses offer facsimile reprints of the novel, for example Kessinger Publishing, USA, which published facsimiles of both volumes in 2010. This reprint does not include the front covers which are still present on some original copies, and which may (or may not) have been added later, since they bear the year 1899 and the name of publisher, António Maria Pereira.

⁵⁴ In this sense the novel does not comply with Lukács's third major defining characteristic of the historical novel, which is its relegation of historical personages to secondary roles, although Linda Hutcheon observes that in practice: 'In many historical novels, the real figures of the past are deployed to validate or authenticate the fictional world by their presence'. *A Poetics of Postmodernism: History, Theory Fiction* (Routledge: London, 2004), p. 114.

Mutamid was given the title of Emir of Silves at the age of thirteen, Ibn Ammar was appointed as his vizier. The two lived together in Qasr Al-Sharajib (Palace of the Balconies), prompting Al-Mutamid to later write verses dedicated to Silves, in celebration of that happy period of his life. Although Oliveira Parreira does not suggest so in his novel, they may also have had a sexual relationship. One famous episode that Oliveira Parreira does include is the night that, after drinking wine together, Al-Mutamid asked Ibn Ammar to sleep beside him, sharing the same pillow. That night Ibn Ammar had a dream that Al-Mutamid would one day kill him and was found wandering the palace at night in a disturbed psychological state.

Ibn Ammar went on to become Al-Mutamid's diplomat and close advisor, and to rule parts of Al-Mutamid's territory as his vizier. However, his unbridled ambition to rule his own territory as a King, as well as his satirical verses mocking Al-Mutamid's sultana, Itimad, led ultimately to him falling out of favour with Al-Mutamid and he was eventually captured and killed at the hands of his old friend, despite pleading for clemency. After Ibn Ammar's death, Al-Mutamid lost Seville to the Almoravids and was exiled to Aghmat in Morocco, where he continued to write poetry from a prison cell until his death. The novel shows how these two men, both born in the Gharb, were both instrumental figures in the history of Al-Andalus as a whole. I shall refer to Al-Mutamid as 'Motamid' when referring to the character as dramatised by Oliveira Parreira, following the author's spelling.

António Maria de Oliveira Parreira (1836-1918) was born in Azeitão, near Setúbal, but moved to Évora in the early 1890s to work as a schoolteacher following the loss of his vineyards to a phylloxera blight which afflicted many vineyards in France, Spain and Portugal at the time. The early 1890s was a period which also saw him publish journalism, including travel writing. The introduction to *Os Luso-Árabes*, from 1896, was

written back in his native Azeitão, suggesting that he maintained strong links with the area even after moving away for work.⁵⁵ Part of Oliveira Parreira's preparation for *Os Luso-Árabes* involved a detailed and at times critical reading of the work of nineteenth-century Arabists, such as the Dutch scholar Reinhart Dozy and the Chair of Arabic Studies in Granada, Francisco Javier Simonet.

Despite Oliveira Parreira's current obscurity, many Portuguese are familiar with their country's Arabic poetic heritage thanks to the work of poet and Arabist Adalberto Alves (1939-), who in 1987 published a collection of his Portuguese translations of medieval Arabic poetry from the Gharb Al-Andalus entitled *O Meu Coração é Árabe*.⁵⁶ In fact, though publishing roughly a century apart, the two men share similar aims, with Adalberto Alves seeking to bring medieval Arabic poetry into the Portuguese literary canon, and more generally urging the Portuguese to embrace their country's Islamic cultural legacy.⁵⁷ Similarly, Oliveira Parreira sees the Muslim presence in Portugal as a period of Portuguese (and particularly Algarvian and Alentejan) history which has been wilfully obscured. He therefore makes the following direct appeal to the reader in the closing paragraphs of the *Os Luso-Árabes*: 'Desenterrae de debaixo d'esse negro pingó de tinta que encobre a historia de nosso solo, os factos de cinco seculos, estas paginas brilhantes, estes nomes gloriosos que poucos de vós conhecieis' (II: 228).⁵⁸ Using the

⁵⁵ According to the writer Alberto Pimentel, Oliveira Parreira also at one point worked as a teacher in Lisbon. This information appears in Pimentel's volume *Poemas Herói-Cómicas Portugueses*, in which he lists a poem entitled *Cartíada*, which he affirms that he saw a copy of in Sesimbra. Although the poem employs a pseudonym, Pimentel identifies it as having been written by Oliveira Parreira, whom he describes as the 'erudito autor dos *Luso-arabes* e professor do Liceu Camões em Lisboa'. Alberto Pimentel, *Poemas Herói-Cómicas Portugueses (Verbêtes e Apostilas)* (Porto: Renascença Portuguesa, 1922), pp. 27-28.

⁵⁶ Adalberto Alves, *O Meu Coração é Árabe (A Poesia Luso-Árabe)* (Lisbon: Assírio & Alvim, 1987). Alves briefly mentions *Os Luso-Árabes* as a 'crónica romanceada' in his introduction to the figure of Al-Mutamid (p. 61).

⁵⁷ *Os Luso-Árabes* also features Portuguese translations of Arabic poetry. Vakil discusses the similarities in content and approach of both authors (Vakil, pp. 36-7).

⁵⁸ As Vakil also notes (Vakil, p. 35), Oliveira Parreira is also here echoing the sentiments of Athaide Oliveira, who in his introduction to *As Mouras Encantadas* argues that the influence of the Arab presence on the civilisation of the Peninsula is still not fully understood (*As Mouras Encantadas*, p. xiv).

image of the black ink blob, Oliveira Parreira here advocates uncovering and celebrating the important historical events and figures of Portuguese Al-Andalus, figures whom he sees as a source of national and regional pride. This celebration is put forward as the necessary antidote to the ignorance resulting from centuries of racial and religious intolerance (I: viii).

Using a theme which would be picked up by Adalberto Alves some hundred years later, Oliveira Parreira's introduction opens with a lyrical evocation of the presence of enchanted Moorish maidens in his childhood imaginary: 'Emballados com lendas de mouras encantadas, os nossos espiritos infantis, logo que começam a saber dirigir o pensamento, phantasiam horizontes irissados e maravilhosos' (I: v).⁵⁹ Using phantasmagoric language, the author suggests that oral storytelling, with its tales of magic and the supernatural, exposes the Portuguese to this distant Islamic presence in their past. Oliveira Parreira goes on to explain that he wants to: 'ardentemente devassar os segredos do viver d'esse povo, de quem provavelmente descendemos' (vi).⁶⁰ Adalberto Alves, writing in the late twentieth century, goes as far as to make a more intimate statement, imagining the Muslim ancestors who might be hiding behind his 'pele morena', reflecting a greater ability to link the Muslim subject with the self in Portuguese writing of the later twentieth-century century.⁶¹

In *Os Luso-Árabes*, the whole final chapter is set in the Anah region of the Arabian desert, along the Euphrates river, in what is modern-day Iraq. Forming a kind of epilogue to the novel, the chapter retells an anecdote borrowed from Reinhart Dozy, in which a twelfth-century Muslim traveller comes across a Bedouin tribe, the Bani Lakhm, and

⁵⁹ Adalberto Alves begins his own introduction by reminiscing about his childhood experiences in Beja in the Alentejo, hearing local legends (*O meu coração é árabe*, p. 12).

⁶⁰ As noted by Vakil (p. 35).

⁶¹ Adalberto Alves, *O meu coração é árabe*, p. 12.

reads out the (by then deceased) Al-Mutamid's poems to them, before discovering that they are the tribe from whom the poet-king claimed to be descended. The author then uses the Bedouin's spontaneous appreciation of the poems, and their recognition of Al-Mutamid as one of their own, as an example to the Portuguese reader of how they too should recognise Al-Mutamid as part of their proud literary heritage.⁶² Adalberto Alves also goes on to borrow Dozy's episode for the introduction to a volume of translations of Al Mutamid's poetry.⁶³ The subject of poetic improvisation is also strongly developed in *Os Luso-Árabes*: near the beginning the narrator mentions the testimony of Arab scholars who claimed that country people from around Silves were able to improvise poetry (I: 5), and fictionalises this in the character of Mozarab country girl Mariam, who not only improvises but claims that: 'Todos nós, neste abençoado paiz de Shilb, somos poetas e sabemos improvisar' (I: 25).⁶⁴ Oliveira Parreira's portrayal of this phenomenon constitutes an idealised democratisation or popularisation of a high art form, that of highly stylised classical Arabic poetry.

Though Oliveira Parreira shares many of the same concerns as Adalberto Alves, his work differs in scope: as well as examples of Luso-Arab poetry, he wishes to share a large amount of historical detail with his audience, using the momentum of a sweeping historical drama. He chooses the historical novel because '[o] teatro e o romance foram sempre, a meu ver, o melhor meio de vulgarisar a historia'. To avoid distorting '[a] verdadeira historia', as he sees it, he follows Scott's compromise of using endnotes,

⁶² Reinhart Dozy, *Histoire des Musulmans d'Espagne, jusqu'à la conquête de l'Andalousie par les Almoravides, 711-1110* (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1861).

⁶³ Adalberto Alves, *Al-Mu'tamid, poeta do destino* (Lisbon, Assírio & Alvim, 1996), pp. 26-29. Cited in Vakil, p. 36.

⁶⁴ Adalberto Alves also mentions the special literary status of Silves during the time of the taifa kingdoms, where residents were known for being adept at poetic improvisation (*O meu coração é árabe*, p. 22).

‘destrinçando o que era historico do que o não era’ (I: xii).⁶⁵ Clearly the concept of a ‘verdadeira historia’ is problematic for post-Foucaultian scholars. However, it is worth noting that Oliveira Parreira goes to considerable lengths to compare the different historical sources that he uses, and often supplies conflicting information from different historical accounts in footnotes, making them easily accessible to the reader.⁶⁶ Though he does believe in a certain truth provided by ‘true history’, therefore, he is also acutely aware that the chronicles he draws on are untrustworthy and incomplete.

Although both the footnotes and the endnotes in *Os Luso-Árabes* provide additional historical material, it is not particularly easy for the reader to discern which plot elements are the author’s invention. Oliveira Parreira does provide information on this, but the reader must have the perseverance to read through the detailed section of biographical notes (‘Noticia Biographica’) on ‘Arab’ poets and warriors born in the regions now belonging to Portugal (II: 231-282). In the section relating to *Os Abbadidas* (II: 252-253), for example, the author lists certain characters and episodes that he invented or changed in order to give shape to the plot, whilst insisting that, with regards to the rest, ‘Tudo o mais, repetimos, é rigorosamente historico’ (II: 253). This information could have been placed in the introduction, and the choice to place it in a rather obscure section at the end of Volume II suggests a desire to appeal to different kinds of readers, some of whom would be looking above all for entertainment and would not wish to break the spell of the narrative.

⁶⁵ In this context ‘vulgarisar’ means to ‘popularise’, as opposed to the contemporary usage of ‘vulgarisar’ in Portugal, meaning ‘to make vulgar’.

⁶⁶ Oliveira Parreira uses José António Conde, Al-Idrisi and Al-Maqqari as sources – the latter two are likely to be in translation, although Oliveira Parreira does not give details of the editions used. Conde had published an edition of Al-Idrisi: *Descripcion de España de Xerif Aledris conocido por el Nubiense* (Madrid: Imprenta Real, 1799) and a French translation of Al-Maqqari was published as *Analectes sur l'histoire et la littérature des Arabes d'Espagne* edited by Reinhart Dozy, William Wright, Christoph Krehl and Gustave Dugat (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1855-61).

The author's choice of the historical novel genre, as broadly conceived by the Romantic movement, was not particularly timely. As Maria de Fátima Marinho recounts, Manuel Pinheiro Chagas, one of the most popular writers of fiction of the day who was also a historian, wrote in the introduction to *A Joia do Vice Rei*, published in 1890, that '[o] romance histórico, tal como o concebeu Walter Scott ou Alexandre Dumas, está um pouco passado de moda', citing the public's preoccupation with 'exactidão' as being the cause of this decline. The historical novel was seen as deceptive in that it combined 'a mentira com a verdade'.⁶⁷ Only two years after the publication of *Os Luso-Árabes*, in 1900, Eça de Queirós' *A Ilustre Casa de Ramires* appeared, which, as Marinho describes, 'mima satiricamente um processo típico do primeiro Romantismo e o seu ingénuo entusiasmo pela reconstituição histórica'.⁶⁸ We should of course remember, though, that Eça was ahead of his time. And, as José Augusto França notes: 'A partir de 1886, o teatro histórico começou a glorificar o passado, com grande gasto de alexandrino, e uma pintura histórica lhe respondia, na qual o academismo inspirado no Salon de Paris substituíu o ímpeto romântico que a arte portuguesa jamais conhecera'.⁶⁹ As such, Oliveira Parreira's choice of the historical novel, though not characteristic of the development of the Portuguese novel at the time, nonetheless reflects contemporary late-Romantic trends in Portuguese theatre and painting. As we shall see in due course, *Os Luso-Árabes* also reflects post-Romantic changes to both style and aesthetics in the late nineteenth century, notably with the use of impressionistic descriptions.

⁶⁷ Manuel Pinheiro Chagas, *A Joia do Vice-Rei* (Lisboa, Livr. De Antonio Maria Pereira, s/d, p. 5), cited in Maria de Fátima Marinho, *O Romance Histórico em Portugal* (Porto: Campo das Letras, 1999), p. 89.

⁶⁸ Marinho, p. 114.

⁶⁹ José Augusto França, *O romantismo em Portugal: estudo de factos socioculturais. Vol III: Os anos de contestação; Os anos de sobrevivência; Conclusão*, trans. by Francisco Bronze (Lisbon: Livros Horizonte, 1977), p. 1273.

‘O Phantasista’

The inheritance of Romanticism can be seen in the way that the narrator of *Os Luso-Árabes* is presented to the reader as a ‘phantasista’ with the power to conjure up a series of scenes or spaces and before permitting the reader to enter into them. The Romantic notion of fantasy developed as novelists drew on the Gothic tradition, with its ‘medieval settings and supernatural atmospheres’. Drawing on this older tradition, novelists ‘reopened the gates of fancy and imagination, which had been closed by Augustan rationalism, thus channelling unconscious or semi-conscious visions, dreams and terrors into fiction’.⁷⁰ This, combined with a fascination for the Orient, led to a proliferation of phantasmagorical visions, as can be seen for example in Honoré de Balzac’s novel *La Peau de chagrin* (1831), in which a young man finds a magic piece of shagreen (rawhide) in a shop full of curiosities in Paris. Inscribed in imprecise Arabic, the skin promises to fulfil the owner’s wish, shrinking slightly when each wish is granted and consuming a portion of the owner’s physical energy. In novels such as these we find a dreamed or conjured Orient, not necessarily based on travel or other research. Although Oliveira Parreira’s approach does rely on extensive research, he nonetheless retains this influence of early nineteenth-century Romanticism through his vision of the narrator as a ‘phantasista’, or mage.

One of the first instances of a reference to a ‘phantasista’ is in Part I just prior to the description of the palace in Beja inhabited by Motadhid (Motamid’s ruthless father): ‘Usando do nosso direito de phantasista, precederemos Ayub no harem do terrível Abbadida. Penetremos no alcazar’ (I: 164). Similar turns of phrase such as ‘Penetramos

⁷⁰ Casaliggi and Fermanis, p. 57.

com a phantasia' (I: 262) and 'reassumindo o nosso papel de phantasia, vamos agora transportar o leitor' (I: 279) are used later in Part I, prior to descriptions of the interior and gardens of Sharajib (Palace of the Balconies, located in Silves). In Part II, the term 'phantasia' is dropped in favour of simpler turns of phrase, such as 'Entramos em imaginação' (II: 33), 'vamos conduzir o leitor' (II: 75) and 'Entremos' (II: 104; 183), since the reader is now familiar with the style of narration.

Interestingly, the figure of the *phantasia* created by Oliveira Parreira acknowledges the limits of his abilities, as we see when Ibn Salam, a friend of both the young poet Ibn Ammar and the young prince Motamid, asks Ibn Ammar to give him the poem he has written so that he can show it to the prince. Here, the narrator intervenes as follows: 'O interior desse papel não o podemos nós devassar, ainda mesmo com o nosso privilegio de phantasia' (I: 190). The poem itself has not survived, and so Oliveira Parreira relies on the account of historians such as Dozy, who could read the Arabic historical accounts of the period which refer to the poem's artistic merit. The checks that Oliveira Parreira places on the *phantasia*'s reach make the reader's experience more tantalising, as we are reminded of the distance between the reader and the historical subject – the very distance which, if the role and limits of the 'phantasia' are not acknowledged, might collapse with the illusion of vivid sensorial description.

The Author as Traveller

In his introduction to *Os Luso-Árabes*, Oliveira Parreira mentions that he has himself journeyed to the Algarve prior to writing the novel, writing: 'Tendo feito uma viagem ao Algarve, e publicado no *Jornal do Commercio* algumas das nossas impressões nessa

viagem' (I: xiii). The following analysis will examine this travel writing, published in the *Jornal do Commercio* as a sixteen-part series of articles between November 1892 and September 1893.⁷¹ The loss of Oliveira Parreira's vineyards in the early 1890s had left him financially insecure, with a wife and four children to support in his mid-fifties, a time in his life when he had expected to be able to rest.⁷² He started working as a schoolteacher in Évora, and concurrently began publishing journalistic material, including a series of articles in the *Revista Illustrada* entitled *Quadros da minha terra* (1891-1892), five of which explore the effect of changes in the system of government and the loss of the religious orders in the author's native Arrabida.⁷³ These were followed by the sixteen-part series mentioned by the author in the introduction to *Os Luso-Árabes*, entitled 'De Arrabida a Monchique'. The journey undertaken by Oliveira Parreira begins in the hills of Arrabida and continues southwards into the Alentejo and Algarve, and is conducted by donkey, carriage and train. He was following a doctor's advice to treat a persistent (unnamed) illness by bathing in the sea, but was also delighted to have an opportunity to visit the Southern regions of Portugal, regions which were finally becoming more accessible to visitors, as the author notes, with new railway lines and passenger trains.⁷⁴

⁷¹ The *Jornal do Commercio* was a daily newspaper printed in Lisbon, which published its first edition in 1853.

⁷² As recounted by Oliveira Parreira in 'De Arrabida a Monchique: 2ª parte, VII Horas de Dor', *Jornal do Commercio*, 2 September 1893, p. 12.

⁷³ The *Revista Illustrada* was an illustrated magazine published every two weeks. It was owned by Mariano Level and António Maria Pereira (1856-1898). The latter's name also appears on the painted front covers of *Os Luso-Árabes*, dated 1899, although his name does not appear as the publisher inside the novel, suggesting that the publishing house may have decided to market the novel with a new front cover. We can assume that the author's previous working relationship with the publisher would have facilitated this.

⁷⁴ A railway from Lisbon was first established in 1889, but fully completed only in 1906 (Agarez, p. 23). Oliveira Parreira writes: 'É de esperar que o caminho de ferro recentemente aberto ao publico e as estradas modernas que communicam as povoações deem áquella região a riqueza e prosperidade que merece.' 'De Arrabida a Monchique: 2ª parte, I O Shelb', *Jornal do Commercio*, 4 August 1893, p. 7. Such a view was shared by contributors to *O Algarvio* (1889-1893), a regional newspaper based in Loulé, which expresses similar hopes during this period.

As he remarks in the introduction to *Os Luso-Árabes*, the 'De Arrabida a Monchique' series allows Oliveira Parreira to discuss four historical figures from the Algarve/Alentejo, the first being Remechido, a guerrilla leader from the 1830s who supported King Miguel and who Oliveira Parreira saw as a hero belonging in a Walter Scott novel. The other three figures are Muslim political leaders from the twelfth century, Ben Cosai (Ibn Kasi), a Sufi political leader, and his followers Al-Mondhir and Sid Ray, who all resisted the Berber Almoravids under Yussuf.⁷⁵ In Oliveira Parreira's opinion, the reason why these men have not been recognised as local heroes is that they are Muslim:

Os historiadores christãos apenas exaltavam as proezas dos seus, considerando como estrangeiros os filhos da mesma terra, porque tinham modo differente de adorar o Creador.

Para quem encara factores uma [*sic.*] com a imparcialidade da historia, affiguram-se estas luctas guerras civis, e vejo me inclinado a considerar Al-mondhir e Ben Cosai nascidos em Silves; de paes silvenses; mais compatriotas meus do que o conde Henrique nascido em França, do tronco borgonhez, isto sem offensa das crenças religiosas.⁷⁶

Oliveira Parreira's insistence on the overarching importance of one's place of birth (over religious identity) is a feature that recurs in *Os Luso-Árabes* and is fundamental to his argument that modern-day Algarvians and Alentejans should identify with and reclaim the heritage of the (Arab) Muslims of Gharb Al-Andalus. He dedicates a biographical section to the same men in *Os Luso-Árabes*, in which he presents these rebel leaders as the inheritors (culturally and through lineage) of the Arab nobility of Al-Andalus, and especially of Al-Mutamid (II: 266).

Oliveira Parreira's travel writing also anticipates the style of *Os Luso-Árabes* in its rich indebtedness to Romantic themes, including the delirium of illness, visions and

⁷⁵ Ibn Kasi was born and died in Silves, governed the taifa of Seville, and was acquainted with Affonso Henriques. Citing Spanish Arabist José Antonio Conde (1766-1820), Oliveira Parreira gives Al-Mondhir's full name as Mohammed Ben Omar Ben Al-Mondhir Abul Wali (II: 264).

⁷⁶ Oliveira Parreira, 'De Arrabida a Monchique: 2ª parte III Ben Cosai e Al-mondhir', *Jornal do Commercio*, 9 August 1893, p. 12.

moments of epiphany brought about by contact with nature. It also anticipates an impressionistic descriptive style found in the novel at particular moments, which in itself reveals a post-Romantic aesthetic. In one article from the series Oliveira Parreira relates a particular visual experience that he had whilst travelling by carriage towards Silves:

E o carro que me transportava corria veloz atravez d'aquelles lindos campos, levantando sob as rodas nuvens de pó rubro, que atraz de nós se erguiam como flocos de gaze vermelha, subindo lentamente a pouca altura, para mais lentamente ainda descerem sobre o seu leito de pedra, e se esvairam como nevoas tenuissimas no puro azul da atmosphaera.⁷⁷

The close attention paid by the author to the shape and colour of the clouds of red dust (the soil around Silves is particularly red in colour) here recalls the Impressionists' emphasis on fleeting visual effects. The author then recycles and embellishes this description for the opening sequence of *Os Luso-Árabes*, in the following paragraphs:

Nuvens de pó rubro, dançando na atmosphaera esbraseada, ou pairando indolentemente nos ares, marcavam n'elles, como no mar a esteira dos navios, a direcção seguida pelos viandantes. Levantando-se rapidamente n'uns pontos, baixando mollemente n'outros, essas nuvens indicavam de longe os logares onde um pesado carros de bois, ou o passo vagaroso d'uma recua de azemolas ia transportando os productos da lavoura á caria ou á cidade.

A's vezes, o galopar dos cavalleiros levantava mais alto esses frocos de gaze rubra, que se ennovellavam sobre o leito da estrada, semelhando ondas inflammadas de fumo avermelhado d'ume descarga de fusilaria e correndo rapidas e successivas como as notas de escala chromatica vibradas por mão perita no teclado d'um piano. (l: 2, my emphasis).

The year is mentioned a couple of pages later as being 1051. In the passage above Oliveira Parreira adds not only period details but also three additional (modern) similes: a ship's wake, a rifle burst and a piano scale. These three similes add an even closer focus on the particular shape and changing movement of the dust clouds as they shift and alter according to the particular traveller or animal that is passing through, rendering the image even more vivid for the reader, and giving the description a decidedly cinematic feel.

⁷⁷ Oliveira Parreira, 'De Arrabida a Monchique: 2ª parte, l O Shelb', *Jornal do Commercio*, 4 August 1893, p. 6.

It should be noted that the second volume of *Os Luso-Árabes* contains fewer of these impressionistic descriptions, and it is surely not coincidental that a larger proportion of the action in the second volume takes place in Islamic Spain, especially Seville and Murcia, places that the author probably had not visited (I have not found any indication that Oliveira Parreira travelled outside of Portugal). Thus, in the sections where the author was able to draw on his experiences of travel and occasionally to rework his earlier travel writing, the resulting descriptions benefit from the vividness of a traveller's gaze.

Reveries

Before pursuing our analysis of *Os Luso-Árabes*, we should first examine the Romantic notion of reverie, as developed in Jean-Jacques Rousseau's unfinished *Revêries du promeneur solitaire*, written between 1776 and 1778. As Georges Van Den Abbeele explains, the state of reverie is brought about by walking, and is 'a moment of plenitude, of self-possession, of the abolition of all differences in the self or between the self and itself, and it comes therefore to be associated with being in the state of nature'.⁷⁸ Such a concept led to a new interpretation of the figure of the traveller, with an emphasis on subjectivity and introspection. Ibn Ammar, the most reflective character in *Os Luso-Árabes*, is in many ways an embodiment of the Romantic traveller, frequently entering into reveries and reacting to the landscape around him. An example is Chapter XII of the first volume, which narrates the journey that Ibn Ammar makes with Ibn Salam in the Monchique Range (*Serra de Monchique*). Their walk takes them to a spot where they are able to catch a glimpse of the Atlantic coast and ocean (I: 112). Following the Romantic

⁷⁸ Van Den Abbeele, p. 119.

tradition, Oliveira Parreira describes how the dramatic natural setting stimulates the travellers' minds, and, for Ibn Ammar, brings many emotions to the fore:

Ao principio caminhavam silenciosos, como possuidos da importancia dos pensamentos que se lhes revolviam no espirito; porém, depois, á medida que se afastavam da cidade, a linda paizagem que se desenrolava ante seus olhos influia-lhes insensivelmente nos animos tornando-os mais expansivos.

Mórmente Ibn Ammar, cuja alma verdadeiramente poetica não podia resistir ao influxo das bellezas naturaes, sentia em si uma commoção extraordinaria, que tinha necessariamente de expandir-se em palavras. (I: 109-110)

The repeated emphasis on the notion of expansion ('expansivos', 'expandir-se') in the context of this natural setting, recalls the Romantic veneration of the positive effects on human health and creativity that being in nature would entail, with the implication that crowded urban spaces, though stimulating in their own way, stifled such creativity. The young men's musings relate to the sea that they glimpse on the horizon, a 'vastidão infinita' (I: 112), a sea that links them to the lands of their ancestors in Arabia (and specifically Yemen). However, following a prediction from Ibn Salam, as they gaze at the faraway ocean, that Ibn Ammar could one day be Mutamid's First Vizier, the two men part.

The second part of the chapter involves Ibn Ammar journeying alone by mule. One of the novel's many oniric sequences, in this section Ibn Ammar daydreams about meeting the powerful Motamid, with what are described as 'sonhos aureos' (I:115). The process of daydreaming is described in similar terms to an illness or intoxication: 'Ardia-lhe o cerebro, em confusão estonteadora'. Oliveira Parreira here evokes the quasi-surreal images of a wandering mind: 'afiguravam-se-lhe castellos a escalar, os enormes castanheiros isolados, gigantes que combatia em duello mortal e prostrava no campo da victoria'. Ibn Ammar's mind is described as a: 'voragem de pensamentos ambiciosos', a 'labirinto de idéas indefinidas, confusas, baralhadas' (I: 116). Not all of the novel's oniric sequences occur when the character is travelling: they also occur as night dreams,

for example the sequence of Ibn Ammar's nightmare and sleepwalking in the palace of Sharadjib (I: 209-309). However, it is noteworthy that Ibn Ammar's earlier daydream does occur during a travel sequence. The vastness of the natural setting seems to reflect the vastness of Ibn Ammar's personal ambition, and the rhythm of the mule encourages the traveller's trance-like state: 'Não enxergava o caminho; não distinguia os objectos. Sentia se como envolvido numa nuvem de purpura azul e ouro, que mudava successivamente de tons, estonteando o, arrebatando o, enlouquecendo o' (I: 117). In this passage it is important to note the author's attention to the rhythm of the sentence and to the use of alliteration such as 'numa nuvem', as well as the repetition of the sound 'ton'.

In addition to developing Ibn Ammar's characterisation, I would argue that this chapter draws on Oliveira Parreira's own experience of a life-changing epiphany also experienced whilst appreciating a dramatic and beautiful natural setting. When the author made his own trip to the Alentejo and Algarve in 1892-1893 he was suffering from an (unspecified) illness, and his article entitled 'Horas de dor' describes his fears about his family's future should he die prematurely.⁷⁹ In the final instalment of his travel writing series, entitled 'Monchique', he reflects on the overall effect that the trip had on him, including the impact of repeated moments in which his experience of the landscape was almost mystical, such as in the following extract:

Esse espectáculo paradisiaco prendia-me os sentidos, arrebatava-me de admiração, enfeitiçava-me! e a impressão recebida pelos objectos exteriores, causando-me sensações dulcissimas na alma, actuava indirectamente no corpo, e parecia por instantes restituir-me a alegria e a saude.

⁷⁹ Oliveira Parreira, 'Da Arrabida a Monchique 2a parte, VII Horas de dor', *Jornal do Commercio*, 2 Sep 1893, p. 12.

Describing his return to health, both physically and mentally, as a ‘resurreição’, Oliveira Parreira then describes how this ‘resurrection’ inspired him to write about both his personal experiences and the subjects about which he felt passionately:

Ao ver-me arrancado do sepulchro, senti-me violentemente propellido a comunicar pela palavra o que enchia o coração.

Apezar dos curtos limites da minha viagem, os logares que visitei despertaraem em mim sensações variadas.

A imaginação enferma doidejava-me num labyrintho de idéas e de sentimentos, e o pensamento, esse viajante caprichoso, mais veloz que a electricidade e que os astros, arrastava-me numa carreira vertiginosa, de uma impressão physica a uma sensação psychica, das memorias do passado á apreciação do presente, do respeito devido á intrepidez dos guerreiros á consideração pelo homem pacifico que arroteia os campos – de uma pintura a uma narrativa, da esperança e o azul da felicidade, ora o vermelho do desespero, ou o negro sombrio da desgraça.

O amalgama de idéas heterogeneas, desconnexas, confusas d’este trabalho, são o irromper de um turbilhão atravez de um cerebro enfermo.

A forma foi a do delirio cobrindo com as dobras do seu pallio a ignorancia e decadencia do autor.

Perdoe-se-me.

Eu devia uma manifestação de reconhecimento aos dois lugares pittorescos que me revocaram á vida.

Ao reconhecimento juntou-se a admiração, porque, com effeito, Arrabida e Monchique são dois fragmentos do Eden, lançados pela mão do Eterno no abençoado solo do nosso paiz.⁸⁰

In this final section of his travel writing, Oliveira Parreira paints himself as a Romantic figure, who, coming out of the delirium of illness and inspired by places and by the natural setting, experiences a creative rebirth where he is compelled towards personal expression. The reference to an appreciation both of warriors and peaceful rural inhabitants anticipates the spread of characters found in *Os Luso-Árabes*, which glorifies both the bellic and the simple rural life. In addition, the reference to ‘[um] labyrintho de idéas e de sentimentos’ is one that he would later echo in *Os Luso-Árabes* to describe Ibn Ammar’s own experience of being lost in a morass of intense thoughts about his trajectory in life, from which a similar moment of epiphany emerges. Both epiphanies have long-lasting effects: Oliveira Parreira goes on to write an ambitious historical novel about a historical subject that he is passionate about, and the fictionalised Ibn Ammar

⁸⁰ Oliveira Parreira, ‘Da Arrabida a Monchique 2a parte, (Conclusão) VIII Monchique’, *Jornal do Commercio*, 6 Sep 1893, pp. 14-15.

in Oliveira Parreira's literary creation, retains a powerful sense of personal and political ambition for the rest of his life. Though Ibn Ammar's ruthless and ambitious nature is recorded by many historical chroniclers, Oliveira Parreira humanises him in his novel by channelling through him his own personal experience as a traveller. By fictionalising Ibn Ammar's experience as a re-writing of his own experience, the author achieves a closeness with the Muslim subject that is unique for a narrative of this period which represents Gharb Al-Andalus.

The Traveller's Eye

Beyond the examples discussed so far, the traveller's eye can also be detected more subtly in a number of descriptions which foreground the movement of others in the first eighty pages of Part I of *Os Luso-Árabes*. The opening description of the clouds of dust we have already examined, in which the narrator conveys the presence of other travellers on the roads (I: 2). The contrast between nineteenth- and eleventh-century Silves is also highlighted in Chapter II through a comparison of travel experiences, such as in the following extract:

quem atravessasse aquelles campos feracissimos, betados de bonitas e sumptuosas casas de campo [...] acharia a estrada a que nos referimos muito mais movimentada e cheia de vida do que actualmente.

E se estivesse proximo d'ella veria passar lentamente, indifferente á multidão dos viandantes de todas as classes e trajos. (I: 13)

It is the act, either real or imagined, of travelling through the countryside that is the basis for understanding the difference between the 'pequena e pobre Silves de hoje' (I: 13) and the lively and bustling roads of the eleventh century. It is following this description that we are introduced to the young Ibn Ammar, himself a traveller on his way home to visit his mother, but also making a living by selling poems along the way.

In the sixth chapter Ibn Ammar reaches the end of the road, and the reader is provided with a description of Silves. We hear that: 'Onde hoje correm renques de figueiras, corriam então ruas tortuosas, povoadas de gente, formigueiros humanos, em quem a inquietação se manifestava extraordinariamente n'essa ocasião' (I: 55). The movement of people through the narrow streets is compared to the relentless activity of ants in an anthill, an activity that the author refers to repeatedly in Part I.⁸¹ Though the reader is accompanying Ibn Ammar, the perspective is overtly that of the nineteenth-century narrator, as we can see in the reference to the Silves of his day. As Ibn Ammar has just returned from studying in busy Cordoba, he is less likely to be surprised by the activity than the time-traveller. The time-travelling reader on the other hand, if familiar with Silves, is used to a small and sleepy modern-day version of the town, and now finds themselves in unfamiliar surroundings.

The modern-day traveller's perspective can also be seen a little later in Part I when Ibn Ammar decides to climb up a hill at dawn in order to look over the town of Silves: 'Porêm, attrahido pelos encantos que a aurora desenrolava, saiu da circumvallação, e subiu a uma eminencia, d'onde melhor podia contemplar o esplendido quadro do acordar da natureza' (I: 76). By describing the view as a painting of nature waking up, Oliveira Parreira evokes the Romantic desire to feel at one with nature, but also reminds us of his own painterly approach to description, as well as the text's status as representation. His emphasis on the effect of the light on the chain of small peaks surrounding Silves: 'o clarão da aurora, leite entre ouro, azul e purpura, ostentava as suas tintas mimosas' (I: 77), is also reminiscent of Impressionist painters' intense interest in the effects of the light, including shades of purple, with 'tintas' also recalling

⁸¹ See also Oliviera Parreira, I, p. 79.

the painting process. As such the author's descriptions here reflect both a Romantic inheritance and a more contemporary aesthetic.

We do not know whether Oliveira Parreira read such Orientalist works of travel writing as Nerval's *Voyage en Orient* (1851), but it is possible that he may have taken inspiration from descriptions of the busy markets of the Arab world found in nineteenth-century travel writing. It is also possible to connect this historical novel with Oriental themes to the feelings of belatedness experienced by writers such as Nerval and Flaubert, and which, as mentioned previously, have been explored by Ali Behdad in his volume *Belated Travelers*.⁸² According to Behdad, the belatedness experienced by writers travelling to colonised countries such as Egypt arose because they did not find there the imagined authentic Orient that they had conjured up through their reading of *The Thousand and One Nights* and works of European Romanticism. A reference that Oliveira Parreira makes in the introduction to hearing 'o conto de Aladino' as a child suggests that the author shared this European experience of the Orient (I: p. xiv). Thus, it is possible to see *Os Luso-Árabes* as a response to such feelings of belatedness, since it represents a version of an idealised 'authentic' Orient, now undiscoverable in the present, but still possible to recreate in the past.

Oriental Themes

As we saw in the introduction to this thesis, Portuguese Orientalism is generally associated with literature relating to other parts of the world which had a Portuguese presence, or with an external view of the Orient, as can be seen in Eça de Queirós' *O*

⁸² Behdad, 1994.

Egipto, notas de viagem (published posthumously in 1926).⁸³ Though he did not live long enough to read Eça's travelogue, as an educated man Oliveira Parreira was doubtless exposed to Portuguese as well as British and French external Orientalism. Describing an Orient in one's own homeland is, of course, a different enterprise, and it is important to highlight Lisa Lowe's argument that 'orientalism is not a single developmental tradition but is profoundly heterogeneous'.⁸⁴ This section will consider the varied treatment of Oriental themes by Oliveira Parreira.

In *Os Luso-Árabes*, Oliveira Parreira emphasises the fact that his Muslim characters feel very Iberian, having been born in the Gharb Al-Andalus. An Arab-Islamic cultural identity specific to the period is communicated, above all, in the way that the two main characters, Al-Mutamid and Ibn Ammar, are able to excel at both warfare and poetry composition. Oliveira Parreira also particularises the Muslims of Gharb Al-Andalus by emphasising the Yemeni element in particular. Silves was known for having a strong Yemeni presence in this period, and both Motamid and Ibn Ammar claim Yemeni origins, although Ibn Ammar was in fact a Portuguese muladi (of mixed Arab, Berber and West-Iberian origins).⁸⁵ In the first chapter the narrator invites the reader to consider that to the Yemeni Arabs the countryside around Silves must have seemed like paradise: 'O aroma do jasmin, da rosa, do rosmaninho, da alfazema e do alecrim florido, formavam um balsamo perfumado semelhante ao do arrayan do Yemen' (I: 10). Here the use of alliteration of 'r's and assonance of 'a's, the latter thanks to the presence of words of Arabic-origin in the Portuguese language, also has an incantatory effect, in order to reinforce the association between nature and sensorial pleasure.

⁸³ Catroga, p. 223.

⁸⁴ Lowe, p. ix.

⁸⁵ Adalberto Alves, p. 22.

The presence of camels also constitutes a signifier of the Orient in *Os Luso-Árabes*. As Oliveira Parreira remarks in the biographical notes at the end of Part II: ‘Como estranhariamos hoje, se encontrássemos numa estrada de Évora o cortejo dum homem illustre, como uma caravana do deserto, em camelos e cavallos, viajando á oriental’ (II: 244). In this instance he addresses the reader and asking them to imagine the strangeness of seeing a desert caravan, complete with camels, in Évora, Alentejo. Such a remark highlights cultural difference but also appears to also illustrate his argument about the centuries of erasure of Islamic culture: what should be familiar appears exotic and foreign.

It is also curious to see Oliveira Parreira suggest that the Iberian ‘Orient’ even surpasses the Orient that gave birth to it, as in this passage again taken from the first pages of the novel:

E essas estradas [...] trilhadas de camellos, cruzadas por cavalleiros de cimitarra e turbante, e essas campinas resplandecentes de flores e fructos, sob um sol tão puro e menos ardente que o da Arabia, davam ao conjuncto o aspecto de um paizagem oriental, excedendo pela brandura do clima as formosas veigas de Damasco e de Aleppo, e os bosques aromaticos do Yemen. (I: 4)

The passage describes how the soft climate of Silves, a near paradise on Earth, is preferable to the burning sun of Arabia, its fields lush and more abundant than those of Syria and Yemen. Interestingly though, Oliveira Parreira always tempers his identifications of Iberia with the Orient by using comparative constructions. The Silves countryside is described as having ‘o aspecto de um paizagem oriental’ (I: 4, my emphasis) and we later hear that Murcia is ‘essa perola do Mediterraneo, engastada entre palmares, como uma cidade oriental’ (II: 92, my emphasis). With the appearance of the Orient, and sometimes surpassing its best qualities, but never in fact becoming part of the Orient, Al-Andalus itself has the quality of a mirage or a painting in Oliveira Parreira’s work.

There is no doubt that *Os Luso-Árabes* abounds with exoticist descriptions. Oliveira Parreira's Orientalist view of the Algarve can in fact already be seen in his travel writing from the early 1890s, where, in the section following his description of the clouds of red dust on the road to Silves, he describes the Algarve in the following terms:

O Algarve! o Algarve! o Alfaghar sarraceno, terra europea na situação, quasi africana no clima e nas culturas, e asiatica nos costumes e na linguagem! terra de turbantes, de burnoses e de cimettarras, de paixões fogosas e amores ardentes, de odaliscas de dentes eburneos e olhos de azeviche, de fadas e encantamentos.⁸⁶

The reference to an African climate here will remind readers of such comparisons found in the late eighteenth and nineteenth-century travel writing discussed in Chapter 1. The choice of the word 'sarraceno' also conjures up an image of the Saracen armies, a bellic image that is emphasised by the reference to scimitars, rather than the word 'mouro' which would connote the idea of settlers. The word 'odaliscas' is also suggestive of the influence of Western representations of the Ottoman harem on the author, since this term, meaning 'chambermaid' in Turkish, was co-opted by Western writers to refer to women in idealised representations of Ottoman harems.⁸⁷

In Chapter XVI of *Os Luso-Árabes* there is a sumptuous description of the palace of Beja, including a long description of the women of Motadhid's harem who, covered in jewels and precious stones, recline partially unveiled on cushions: 'Aqui a bella Ommalisan [...] reclinava-se indolentemente sobre um coxim, descobrindo o pé elegante que agitava sobre alcatifas do paiz de Fars, numa cadencia scismadora'. The author adds a footnote to the preceding paragraph, which described the gold jewelry and precious stones worn by the women, as follows: 'Talvez esta magnificencia pareça

⁸⁶ Oliveira Parreira, 'De Arrabida a Monchique: 2ª parte, I O Shelb', *Jornal do Commercio*, 4 August 1893, p. 6.

⁸⁷ For more on the representation of the harem in Western literature, see Ruth Bernard Yeazell, *Harems of the Mind: Passages of Western Art and Literature* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2000) and Mary Roberts, *Intimate Outsiders: The Harem in Ottoman and Orientalist Art and Travel Literature* (Durham, N.C.: Duke University Press, 2007).

exagerada, mas a julgar pelas esplendorosas descrições da vida dos arabes da Hespanha pode ser que ainda fique áquem da realidade' (I: 167-168). From these examples we can see that the author's representation of the harem and of the palace can therefore be seen as a rather complex combination of projections of the chronicled wealth of Spanish Al-Andalus (Seville, Granada, and Cordoba) as well as of projections of the perceived culture of the Ottoman Empire, a late nineteenth-century reference for Islamic culture. It is clear that though Oliveira Parreira attempts to particularise Portuguese medieval Muslims, he still often falls into the trap of producing a generalised (as well as exoticised) depiction of a Muslim 'Other' because of his borrowings from European internal and external experiences of Islamic cultures.

Conclusion

As we have seen in this chapter, though scholarship has examined the relationship between travel writing and literary fiction, the link between the practice of travel writing and that of writing historical novels more specifically deserves greater attention. Notably, travel writing on Portugal has influenced the representation of Gharb Al-Andalus in two historical novels: Eliza Bray's *The Talba* (1830) and António Maria de Oliveira Parreira's *Os Luso-Árabes* (1898). Despite its historical inaccuracies, and certain shortcomings in its portrayal of the action and in characterisation, *The Talba, or Moor of Portugal* deserves recognition for its originality and its contribution to representations of medieval Portuguese Muslims, revealing a Romantic interest in Gharb Al-Andalus, albeit marginal. It also reveals how the lack of access to both historical information and to a literary tradition impacts on the representation of the period and its people. The term 'orientalismo difuso' as employed by Luísa Alves is useful

in describing how a writer such as Bray uses a conflated image of Muslims in her writing, including Ottoman references.⁸⁸ Broadly speaking the Muslim characters in *The Talba* lend it an exotic appeal, but are also well developed, particularly the female character Aza Anzurez. Bray's descriptions of architecture in the novel also deserve further attention by scholarship, as these may hold further insights into Bray's writing practice and reliance on references to Islamic Spain.

Oliveira Parreira's *Os Luso-Árabes*, published nearly sixty years later, was written with the benefit of detailed historical research and personal acquaintance with the modern-day locations of the settings in the novel (those in Gharb Al-Andalus, at least). Whereas Bray had examined the Portuguese Muslims as an oppressed minority post-reconquest, Oliveira Parreira sets his novel in the eleventh century, during the time of the *taifa* kingdoms, when Islamic culture was in the ascendant. Oliveira Parreira's fictionalised biography of Al-Mutamid the poet-king and his advisor Ibn Ammar offers the most detailed representation of Al-Andalus in nineteenth-century Portuguese literature and deserves not only greater scholarly recognition but also, ideally, a new edition with updated spellings. As we have seen, the novel, which celebrates Portugal's Arabic literary heritage and explores the main characters' intense and volatile relationship, draws on the author's own experiences as a traveller and on his previously published travel writing, adding a particular vividness to Part 1 in particular. Drawing on many aspects of the Romantic tradition, including the use of reveries, the work's descriptions are also reminiscent of Impressionist approaches to painting. The vision of the Orient offered is both colourful and exoticised, sympathetic and yet often essentialist. Despite the author's best efforts to particularise the Iberian Muslims he

⁸⁸ Luísa Alves, p. 112.

represents, the influence of European external orientalism can still be traced in his writing, as well as projections of the wealth of Spanish Al-Andalus onto Portugal. Arguably his greatest achievement is in the convincing portrayal of both Ibn Ammar and Motamid, with Ibn Ammar in particular being humanised through the author's re-writing of his own moment of personal epiphany. As such, Oliveira Parreira achieves a closeness with the Muslim subject that is impressive for this period and context.

Chapter 3: Representing Gharb Al-Andalus in the Early Twentieth Century: Portuguese Journalism and British Travel Writing

The first half of the twentieth century in Portugal was marked by a shifting political landscape featuring a succession of different regimes with contrasting ideologies. Portugal had entered the twentieth century with a constitutional monarchy, which was abolished when the First Portuguese Republic was established after the revolution of 5 October 1910. The First Republic was secularist in its ideals and sought to limit the influence of the Catholic Church on Portuguese society. It was also during this period that the Chair of Arabic was reinstated at the Universidade de Lisboa in 1914, after a 45-year hiatus, and given to the renowned Arabist David Lopes (1867-1942).¹ Though progressive, the First Republic, lasting sixteen years, was an unstable period, with frequent changes of leadership, monarchist rebellions and a brief civil war during the winter of 1918-19. A military coup d'état on 28 May 1926 led to the establishment of the *Ditadura Nacional*, with António de Oliveira Salazar appointed as Finance Minister in 1928. He became Prime Minister in July 1932, and, after the adoption of a new Constitution, the regime was renamed the *Estado Novo* in March 1933.

Under the *Estado Novo* the history of the reconquest was used to strengthen a nationalist discourse in which Catholicism played a pivotal role. In a speech at Batalha in 1936, Salazar painted the Battle of Ourique as being the result of divine providence. As Patricia Hertel analyses: 'By making divine providence responsible for the course of Portuguese history, Salazar aimed to legitimize the *Estado Novo*'.² Though the *Estado Novo* downplayed the Islamic influence on Portuguese history and culture, Hertel notes that 'there were a few instances of positive appraisal', such as the acknowledgment by

¹ Von Kemnitz, p. 505.

² Hertel, p. 117.

official historical scholarship that '[t]he greatness of the Portuguese nation was seen to be not only the result of the victory over Islam but also of the selective incorporation of elements of Islamic culture'.³ In the commemorations for the conquest of Lisbon in 1947, for example, Arabists were allowed a minor role in 'outlining the history of Lisbon', but in general the Moors were only represented decoratively with the emphasis placed on the Christian heroes. The approach involved Islam being 'alternately forgotten and repressed'.⁴

In Chapter 2 I examined not only published historical fiction but also journalistic material in the form of Oliveira Parreira's travel writing published in the *Jornal do Commercio* in the early 1890s. In Chapter 3 I will again expand the primary material discussed, to incorporate not only published travel accounts written in English from the late 1920s onwards, but also pre-1930s journalistic material in Portuguese from Lisbon and the Algarve discussing Al-Andalus and how it should be remembered. There are two reasons for this choice of primary material: firstly, the fact that relatively few travel accounts on Portugal were published in the 1900s, 1910s and early 1920s, partly due to the disruptive events of the First World War. Secondly, because such material reveals a progressive, predominantly left-wing discourse in the 1910s and 1920s which celebrated the contribution of Islamic culture in Portugal. Variants of this discourse existed both in Andalusia, with Blas Infante's *andalucismo histórico*, and in the Algarve, in pro-Republican regional newspapers such as *Alma Algarvia*. In the case of the Algarvian newspapers, those contributing were very conscious that they were continuing a tradition of Arab-Islamic writings that had begun in the Algarve in the 1890s and were particularly keen to continue the legacy of Oliveira Parreira, whom we examined in the

³ Hertel, p. 116.

⁴ Hertel, p. 121.

previous chapter. Their contributions are worthy of detailed analysis, as is the backlash from reactionary voices in Portugal in the years after the coup d'état in 1926. In an age of politicisation it became ever more important for those in power to manage the narrative on Al-Andalus in the public sphere. However, even whilst medieval Muslims were being erased from public discourse under the Estado Novo, Algarvian intellectuals managed to influence travel writers through the publication of local guidebooks and articles. Anglophone travel writing on Portugal intensified in the 1930s, and whilst not all writers were interested in the traces of Islamic culture in Portugal, an array of British writers were able to find, in Sintra but above all in the Algarve that existed before mass-tourism, a Portuguese Orient, something that only Olivier Merson had managed in the nineteenth century.

Part 1: Memory and the Internal Orient in *Alma Algarvia*

In investigating regional newspapers from the Algarve, scholarship has highlighted the importance of *Alma Nova*, an illustrated magazine first published in Faro in 1914 before moving to Lisbon, and edited by Mateus Martins Moreno, who was also the organiser of the first Congresso Nacional do Algarve in 1915. The magazine published five series between 1914 and 1930, of which the second series (1915-1918) was a regionalist project which aimed to attract the attention of the centralised government, for which Moreno appealed for collaboration from erudite Algarvians. One of the contributors was Julião Quintinha (1886-1968), who was born in Silves and would later go on to develop a career as successful journalist and travel writer. Acquiring the subtitle *Revista Mensal Ilustrada pelo Ressurgimento das Artes, Letras, Ciências e da Pátria* during this period, *Alma Nova* also boasted famous collaborators such as Aquilino

Ribeiro, Francisco Xavier Cândido Guerreiro and the painter Carlos Augusto Lister Franco.⁵ *Alma Nova* did on occasion include material relating to the memory of Gharb Al-Andalus, for example in March 1916, to commemorate the work of the famous writer and folklorist Athaide Oliveira who had died a few months previously, a popular oral legend relating to a *moura encantada* of Silves collected by him was published for the first time by the magazine.⁶ Nonetheless, for the purposes of this study, it is more fruitful to examine another regional publication, *Alma Algarvia*, which was based in Silves itself.

Alma Algarvia was a pro-Republican newspaper (subtitled *Semanário Republicano*) for whom Julião Quintinha, now based in Portimão, was originally sub-editor and later became a director and chief editor. The newspaper ran from 12 March 1911 to 1/15 April 1917, with the format changing to a fortnightly issue from 1 November 1915.⁷ The frequent references in *Alma Algarvia* to Moorish Algarve show that it was also part of what AbdoolKarim Vakil calls the 'minor boom in mostly Algarve-centred Islamic-themed writings' that had begun in the 1890s.⁸ Oliveira Parreira was still alive when the newspaper started up, passing away in April 1914. His novel, *Os Luso-Árabes*, is quoted by the contributor Pedro M. Judice (1875-1944) in *Alma Algarvia* in May 1911, indicating its importance in a tradition to which *Alma Algarvia* also belonged.⁹ *Alma Algarvia* was not the first regional newspaper to explore Arab-Islamic themes. In

⁵ See Rita Correia, *Alma Nova. Revista Ilustrada (II Série)*, 2011 <<http://hemerotecadigital.cm-lisboa.pt/FichasHistoricas/AlmaNovaIIserie.pdf>> [accessed 29 July 2019]. For details of the later series of *Alma Nova* see Helena Bruto da Costa, *Alma Nova – Revista Do Ressurgimento Nacional*, 2006 <<http://hemerotecadigital.cm-lisboa.pt/FichasHistoricas/AlmaNova.pdf>> [accessed 29 July 2019].

⁶ Athaide Oliveira, 'As Mouras Encantadas. I – A Moura Encantada de Silves', *Alma Nova*, 15 (3), March 1916, pp. 41-42, <http://hemerotecadigital.cm-lisboa.pt/Periodicos/AlmaNova/IIserie/N03/N03_master/AlmaNovaISerieN03.pdf> [accessed 29 July 2019].

⁷ A further series of *Alma Algarvia* was published in Loulé between 7 November 1926 and 11 December 1927. Subtitled 'Semanário Republicano Independente', its owner and chief editor was José Maria Ramos, but the director was Mauricio Monteiro, who as we shall see was also a contributor to the earlier Silves-based *Alma Algarvia*. This series did not discuss the region's Moorish history or heritage. My references to *Alma Algarvia* here refer to the earlier Silves-based series.

⁸ Vakil, p. 35.

⁹ Pedro Paulo Mascarenhas Judice, 'O Castello de Silves', *Alma Algarvia*, 28 May 1911, p. 2.

fact, a weekly newspaper based in Loulé entitled *O Algarvio*, which ran from 1889-1893 (and which was founded by Athaide Oliveira himself), had already discussed the Algarve's Moorish history and heritage in a number of articles.¹⁰ These were an eclectic combination of historical pieces, retellings of local legends as well as the writers' own imaginings of encounters with enchanted Moorish maidens, alongside regular features bemoaning the slow progress of the railroad to the Algarve. It would ultimately be the arrival of rail transport, in the 1890s, which would slowly begin to make the Algarve more accessible to visitors, both domestic and foreign.¹¹ In *O Algarvio*, socially conservative regionalist writers attempted to forge a positive identity for the Algarve in which its Islamic history and heritage played an important role. In so doing, they not only showed recognition of but also made creative use of this history's living presence in local folklore.

To a certain extent *Alma Algarvia* shared the ethos of *O Algarvio*, including a socially conservative outlook. *Alma Algarvia* continued with the practice of retelling local legends and conveyed the idea that the Moorish maidens of those legends were still part of lived experience for the people of the Algarve. Being based in Silves, however, the contributors focused more narrowly on the history of Islamic presence in Silves itself, rather than other parts of the Algarve. Secondly, the fact that *Alma Algarvia* was published fifteen to twenty years after *O Algarvio*, and under the Portuguese Republic, meant that different topics were discussed. Whereas the contributors to *O Algarvio* called for more industry in the Algarve as a way of releasing the region's potential, *Alma Algarvia* adds to this a focus on the idea of developing tourism as a way

¹⁰ *O Algarvio* also defended and promoted the political ideas of the Partido Regenerador, the conservative party of its day in Portugal, of which Athaide Oliveira was a member.

¹¹ As Ricardo Agarez notes, '[a] railway from Lisbon was first established in 1889, but fully completed only in 1906' (Agarez, p. 23).

of generating wealth for the area. Whereas *O Algarvio* had discussed the British Ultimatum to Portugal of 1890, an opinion piece in *Alma Algarvia* reveals fears of a future Iberian Union, if Portugal did not participate in the First World War in return for the promise of British protection from a Spanish invasion.¹² In coverage of Morocco, an exoticised depiction of a Moorish horseman in *O Algarvio* contrasts with a more sober coverage of the conflict between Spanish forces and the local Moroccan people in 1914 from *Alma Algarvia*'s correspondent in Tangiers.¹³ There is, in general, a more profound sense of hope for the region's future in *Alma Algarvia*. Contributors to *O Algarvio* were intensely frustrated by the slow progress to improvements to rail links and complained bitterly at how the region had been ignored (particularly financially) by Lisbon. On the other hand, contributors to *Alma Algarvia* welcomed the Republican government's interest in promoting tourism in the region as a sign that economic progress was imminent.

In this first section I will analyse articles in *Alma Algarvia* relating to representations of Gharb al-Andalus, and the discourse generated. The number of authors involved, some of whom are anonymous, implies a variety of representations and viewpoints expressed, however this heterogeneity does not preclude the presence of common threads which cohere within the overall ethos of the newspaper. I shall first discuss the representation of Moorish and modern-day Silves in articles relating to its history and monuments and continue by briefly discussing the representation of the figure of the tourist that contributors wished to attract to the Algarve. I will then examine the representation of the Algarvian woman, and finally look at the representation of legends, voices and ghosts. Such an approach will allow me to show

¹² 'A União Iberica', *Alma Algarvia*, 10 January 1915, p. 1.

¹³ 'O exercito marroquino', *O Algarvio*, 27 October 1889, p. 1. Silva, 'Cartas de Marrocos: Colaboração especial para "Alma Algarvia"', *Alma Algarvia*, 27 September 1914, p. 3; 4 October 1914, p. 2.

how *Alma Algarvia* continues, in its own particular way, the tendency found in both in *Os Luso-Árabes* and in *O Algarvio* to Orientalise the historic internal Other that is the Moor or Arab, whilst also drawing on the Algarve's Islamic cultural heritage to construct the narrative of a region empowering itself for the future.

The contributors to *Alma Algarvia* portray Silves as an enigmatic town whose identity is primarily defined by its former importance within Gharb Al-Andalus. This can be seen in the use of its transliterated Arabic name in an article from 1913, in which the author, Julião Quintinha, describes the nostalgia he feels for 'os campos da velha e mourisca Chelbe'.¹⁴ Elsewhere, in two (anonymous) articles, Silves is described as '[a] velha cidade mourisca'¹⁵ and '[a] antiga *Chelbe*'. The second example is taken from an article entitled 'A Cidade de Silves: Propaganda do Algarve', in which the author lays bare the way that Silves' fortunes and status have changed:

Falemos hoje de Silves cidade de lendas cujo passado atestam ainda as suas muralhas esvaindo-se em pó –terra infortunada que na sua historia ganhou, n'um passado guerreiro, as maiores culminancias, vindo depois a sofrer tristes revezes até á decadencia que, em relação ao desenvolvimento progressivo de outros centros, se acentua na hora presente.

Silves, segundo os velhos alfarrabios, era terra de vastissima importancia exercendo decisiva influencia na politica musulmana.

Though described in the above passage as the 'cidade de lendas', Silves is portrayed as being fragile, with its walls evaporating into dust even while they continue to attest to its past glory. Silves' past and continuing decline is then accentuated by its comparison to 'outros centros' which have concurrently developed and flourished. There remains an echo of the bitter tone of some articles in *O Algarvio* in the early 1890s, which despaired at how the Algarve had been ignored, forgotten and underinvested in by Lisbon. It is not by chance, therefore, that the author chooses to emphasise that Silves

¹⁴ Julião Quintinha, 'Paizagem Algarvia: O Valle de Silves', *Alma Algarvia*, 20 July 1913, p. 1.

¹⁵ 'Silves em foco', *Alma Algarvia*, 1 October 1911, p. 3.

had a population of 15,800 when the Moors abandoned it, ‘sendo a cidade muito mais forte do que Lisboa, e dez vezes mais rica e com edificios de mais valor’.¹⁶

The article appeals to the imagination of the reader to visualise the Moorish presence in Silves through the use of striking visual images, for example when we hear that the last period of Islamic rule was short-lived: ‘poucos tempos brilharam nas ameias de Silves os turbantes alvos dos filhos de Alhan’. In introducing monuments of interest in Silves to the local readership, the author includes the ‘postigo da traição’, a false door in the castle walls which: ‘reza a historia e exagera a lenda, foi onde morreu afogado o ultimo rei mouro – Aben-afan – quando da reconquista de Silves’.¹⁷ The reader is thus encouraged to reimagine the drama of the final loss of Moorish Silves to the Christians, and the death of its last Moorish King, as they pass by this door.¹⁸

Though many articles in *Alma Algarvia* attempt to educate the reader on the history of Silves, they vary in tone between the more poetic and the more informative. Contributors are sometimes based outside of the Algarve, such as Sebastião Joaquim Baçam, who is based in Lisbon. Baçam opens his article in the following manner: ‘A cidade de Silves, florescente côrte no predomínio mourisco, está situada em anfiteatro, numa colina, desde a ponte de pedra ao arruinado castelo, na margem esquerda do rio Arade.’ Though the rest of the article uses a more informative style, this opening description not only pinpoints Silves’ moment of splendour in the medieval era, but also, by comparing its appearance surrounded by hills to an amphitheatre, evokes its status as a theatre for struggles for domination.¹⁹

¹⁶ ‘A Cidade de Silves: Propaganda do Algarve’, *Alma Algarvia*, 12 July 1914, (pp. 1-2) p. 1.

¹⁷ ‘A Cidade de Silves: Propaganda do Algarve’, pp. 1-2. The door is also mentioned in Judice’s article ‘O Castello de Silves’, p. 2.

¹⁸ Aben-Afan of course also featured in Almeida Garrett’s *Dona Branca*. As discussed in Chapter 2, Oliveira Parreira argues that the legend and Garrett’s version are historically inaccurate.

¹⁹ Sebastião Joaquim Baçam, ‘A cidade de Silves’, *Alma Algarvia*, 11 Oct 1914, p. 2.

In certain articles, the poetic evocation of an exotic Silves is enhanced by the writer's distance and nostalgia (as we saw with Quintinha) or mediated through the eyes of a traveller or visitor. Pedro Judice, despite being a native of Silves, writes in his article 'O Castello de Silves': 'Era então bem agradável e indefinível a sensação do viandante que á hora do sol posto se dirigia para a cidade' and also later refers to 'o visitante'.²⁰ Judice writes that a visitor to Silves would never imagine that 37 ships of crusaders had sailed up the river Arade to assist with the Christian siege of Silves in 1189, before proceeding to cite Al-Mutamid's evocation of Silves, using the version from *Os Luso-Árabes*.²¹ Judice therefore projects an image of Silves as being not only beautiful but also having a past that is almost unimaginable to a modern-day visitor. The city's enigma is therefore built on the contrast between its past as the site of wealth and power in the time of Al-Andalus, a time of emblematic clashes between two faiths and cultures, and its humbler modern appearance – with the implied potential for a return to greatness.

Oliveira Parreira had been critical of the fact that Algarvians did not even know the names of important medieval Muslim figures from their region.²² In what could be interpreted as a response to his criticism, two articles from 1914 entitled 'O Algarve no passado' provide details of a series of illustrious men ('homens illustres') from the Algarve, including detailed sections on ten men who lived '[n]o tempo dos arabes', including poets, orators, scholars, and a rebel leader (Ahmad Athassain Ben Casa Abulcassemus), who was defeated by the Almoravids in 1151.²³ The article's stated aim

²⁰ Judice, 'O Castello de Silves', p. 2. Judice would go on to write a book entitled *A Sé e o Castelo de Silves* (Gaia: Edições Pátria, 1934).

²¹ The poem begins: 'Saúda em Silves os sitios queridos que tu sabes, ó Abu Becr, e pergunta-lhes se guardaram a minha lembrança. Saúda sobretudo o Sharadjib, esse soberbo palacio, cujas salas estão cheias de leões e de brancas beldades'. 'Poesia do Motamid a Silves' in *Os Luso-Árabes*, II, pp. 286-287.

²² 'Desenterrae de debaixo d'esse negro pingo de tinta que encobre a historia de nosso solo, os factos de cinco seculos, estas paginas brilhantes, estes nomes gloriosos que poucos de vós conhecieis' (*Os Luso-Árabes*, II, p. 228).

²³ 'O Algarve no passado', *Alma Algarvia*, 26 July 1914, p. 2; 1 August 1914, p. 2.

is to bring: 'os nomes e feitos de todos os algarvios que se distinguiram nas guerras, nas artes, sciencias e letras, para que toda a alma patricia revigore os seus proprios merecimentos no orgullo legitimo de tradições de gloria'.²⁴ From the biographical details provided, the reader is made aware that although some of the men studied in Seville and Granada and were often well-travelled, many also studied in Silves, which was an important enough centre at the time to also be a place of learning.

It should be noted that this veneration of the Arabs in *Alma Algarvia* comes at the expense, in another article by contributor Fazenda Junior, of the Mozarabs. Giving an account of aspects of the history of the 'Imperio Arabe', he mentions 'o califa Al-Muhdin', but then comments: 'de que os nossos corrutores portugueses fizeram Al-Mumedin (até maravilha tão pittorescas deturpações de nomes arabes, o que prova a brutesa e profunda ignorancia dos mosarabes [...])'. Such judgment of the Mozarabs is of course in complete contrast both to Catholic scholars such as Simonet, and Portuguese writers such as Teófilo Braga, who in 1870 had argued that the Mozarabs, or Arabised Christians, were the essence of the Portuguese nation, in order to reinforce Christian superiority.²⁵ In terms of the representation of conduct during battles and sieges, there is also evidence of an attempt at balance in 'A Cidade de Silves: Propaganda do Algarve', where the author takes pains to give a balanced account of the behaviour of both Muslims and Christians, referring both to the 'herocidade sarracena' and to the 'audacia e valentia' of the Christian conqueror (D. Paio Peres Correia) in the second siege of 1242, and to the fact that during the first siege the two sides were 'praticando-se mutuamente crueldades'.²⁶

²⁴ 'O Algarve no passado', 26 July 1914, p. 2.

²⁵ Teófilo Braga, 'Introdução' in *História da Literatura Portuguesa*, p. 2.

²⁶ 'A Cidade de Silves: Propaganda do Algarve', p. 1.

It is fruitful to juxtapose the exposés on Silves' history, monuments, and illustrious figures from the past, which very much privilege the idea of local knowledge of, and pride in, Silves' importance within Gharb Al-Andalus, with other articles which appear on the subject of tourism. At the time, the Algarve did not have sufficient infrastructure or services to attract a large volume of tourists, but a number of contributors to *Alma Algarvia* could see its potential and had specific ideas about the kind of tourist they could attract, and who would benefit from increased tourism. In an article from June 1914 entitled 'Turismo no Algarve: A Cidade de Faro' we read:

E' preciso que as classes pobres reconheçam que o «Turismo» não é só uma industria para ricos – composta de luxuosos hoteis e grandiosos parques, com casino para jogos e automoveis para passeios, – nada disso, o «Turismo» é um agrupamento de interesses e de medidas de civilização e progresso que a todos relativamente aproveitam e em que todos devem cooperar.²⁷

Now, of course, we view such statements with the benefit of hindsight after many parts of the coastal Algarve have come to be dominated (and in many ways spoilt) by mass tourism, a process which was consolidated with the opening of Faro airport in 1965. For this author, the development of tourism in the Algarve is instead seen idealistically as a collective project to elevate all Algarvians, although there is also a rather domineering tone to the last statement suggesting that the author might have little sympathy for those who might oppose the project.

An article from the following year, entitled 'O Turismo no Algarve' and authored by a contributor signing off simply as 'Xara', is written in the context of the upcoming Exposição e Congresso Regional Algarvio which was due to take place the following month (in September 1915). From Xara's article we learn that the idea of developing tourism in the Algarve was a hot topic for discussion at the Congress, and, in light of this, the contributor gives a profile of what he perceives the typical tourist to be. The tourist,

²⁷ 'Turismo no Algarve: A Cidade de Faro', *Alma Algarvia*, 13 June 1914, p. 1.

he believes, is 'uma creatura [...] muito exigente: que quer ter alem das distracções que a Natureza lhe deparou, outras que sejam inventadas pelos homens.' The author considers that the Algarve's natural beauty and beaches are not in themselves sufficient, and advocates the development of sporting facilities (presumably such as tennis courts):

O turista, em geral, gosta do desporto, gosta do jogo, onde pensa encontrar uma fonte de receita para a ajuda do custeio da despesa ou onde se desinvenilha, mais rapidamente, do dinheiro que lhe sobeja e lhe enche demasiado e incomodativamente a carteira.²⁸

In this rather patronising description of a rich but foolish tourist eager to part with their money is an image which the intellectual can look down on. In this way, the newspaper sees the question of the dissemination of its local history, particularly its importance at the time of Al-Andalus, as entirely separate from its promotion as a tourist destination, since tourists are only expected to come to the region for the purposes of bathing and doing sports.

'A Mulher Algarvia', an article authored by Mauricio Monteiro, deserves detailed analysis due to the wealth of ideas expressed in this piece that relate to how the Algarvian intellectuals contributing to *Alma Algarvia* perceived their inheritance from the period of Al-Andalus. Like several contributors, Monteiro describes the Muslims who come to Silves as 'Arabs', to emphasise their perceived superiority in terms of learning and progressive values, as opposed to the North African Berbers. Monteiro describes the Arabs who came as '[t]olerantes e progressivos', the evidence being the 'enorme quantidade de mosárabes que permaneceram em territorio portugues'. He also notes that: 'Já muito de traz, [...] se havia completado a fusão de sangue entre as duas raças, fusão que de facto ha muito existia e que, pode dizer-se, apenas a barreira da lei detinha'.²⁹ This recognition of the mixing of bloodlines is important to note since, as we

²⁸ Xara, 'O Turismo no Algarve. Qual a maneira de atrahir e reter o turista. O jogo e os desportos', *Alma Algarvia*, 8 August 2015, p. 1.

²⁹ Mauricio Monteiro, 'A Mulher Algarvia', *Alma Algarvia*, 15 February 1916, pp. 56-57.

shall see, it is often not acknowledged by the foreign travel writers who arrived in the 1930s.

Despite such recognition, however, Monteiro uses a variety of Orientalist tropes. He perceives a series of noble characteristics that Algarvians inherited from the various 'races' that either settled in the west of the Peninsula or are seen to have had a cultural influence:

Dos gregos, dos fenícios e dos cartagineses, o Algarve herdou o espírito de aventura e comercial que caracterizava aqueles povos. Dos árabes herdou o sentimento, e a idealização poética, pulverização de sonho.³⁰

Whereas the Greeks, Phoenicians and Carthaginians are here associated with perceived masculine qualities (spirit of adventure, desire to trade), the Arabs are associated with perceived feminine or effeminate qualities such as emotional sensitivity and poetic idealisation. Such thinking is necessarily essentialist, since the Arabs were both adventurous travellers and traders.

It is also important to examine the representation of the Algarvian woman in this article. In it we find that certain attractive features of the Orient, such as beauty and sensuality, are feminised in the form of the figure of the Algarvian woman. In this way, the inheritance of the Orient is seen as being palatable and attractive (at least to these male writers) when it is embodied or passed down through the Algarvian female. The author first describes how Christian Algarvian women were exposed to ballads when they were courted by Muslim men in the time of Al-Andalus:

As mais belas trovas de amor, tecidas com o oiro da fantasia oriental, ouviram-as a cristã-algarvia, nessas noites em que a calidez morna da natureza se banha em luar. Dos lábios do sarraceno apaixonado saíram endeiças sentidas, embaladas por sonhos alácres, volateis como o sono do opio, cavalgando no infinito das ilusões...³¹

³⁰ Monteiro, p. 56.

³¹ Monteiro, p. 56.

These poetically idealised romantic encounters, the author argues, permitted not only the mixing of bloodlines but also a passing on of an affective and poetic sensibility to the women of the Algarve.

Monteiro proceeds by suggesting that it was Algarvian woman who passed on this sensibility to their descendants:

E a mulher, conservadora por condição, foi mantendo, através os seculos, essa tradição afetiva e sonhadora, perpetuando-se, de geração em geração, ao som dos cantos regionaes, e das lendas á lareira, adormecendo as creanças num mar de deliciosas fantasias.

This essentialist portrayal of the Algarvian women, who is described as conservative by nature, projects a male desire to give a conservative and traditional role to women, who are then described as if inherently possessing this quality. Though Algarvian women, the author claims, had continued not only to look Moorish but to carry out ‘inovações artísticas’, they nevertheless retained their traditional role of homemakers. The author here adheres to *Alma Algarvia*’s socially conservative ethos, and in fact notes the Algarvian woman contrast with those from other provinces of Portugal, where ‘a mulher se masculinisa, fazendo concorrência ao trabalho do homem’. Clearly, though the perceived role of women can include artistic expression, it must do so within a clearly defined role of homemaker. In addition, Monteiro adds that the Algarvian woman’s role is to help shape the qualities of her sons. She possesses: ‘a gracilidade, o doce afeto, o encanto artístico e suave que modéla no filho’.³² Such Oriental feminine qualities are also therefore deemed acceptable when passed onto sons through a mother’s influence.

The final part of the article describes the Algarvian woman’s ability to captivate visiting foreign men: ‘a algarvia tem uma arte especial para captar o forasteiro [...] É este fundo de sonho, fantasia e aventura, que o viajante ou forasteiro divisa no olhar

³² Monteiro, pp. 56-57.

aveludado e negro [...] das algarvias'.³³ Here there is a certain mirroring of the discourse of nineteenth-century travellers to the Iberian Peninsula, who, particularly in Andalusia, fixated on the dark eyes of the women they saw there, associating them with an Oriental exoticism.³⁴ Monteiro appears to reinforce this tradition by describing the appeal of the Algarvian woman to the male traveller.³⁵

As mentioned previously, the contributors to *Alma Algarvia* favoured emphasising the presence of Arabs in Gharb Al-Andalus rather than the Berber Almoravids and Almohads, though the terms 'mouro' and 'mourisco' are still widely used. This privileging of the contribution of the Arabs in particular, rather than the Berbers, coheres with a negative attitude towards Moroccans displayed in Silva's coverage from Tangiers of the conflict between Spanish forces and local 'mouros' in 1914.³⁶ The Moroccans of Tangiers are represented as being desperate and volatile in Silva's first article, using language such as '[as] furias marroquinas'.³⁷ In the second article, the tone becomes even more damning of the Moroccans as the situation worsens, with Silva writing that the 'instintos retrogrados' of the 'mouros' means that they are unlikely to progress with agricultural production as a means to alleviate the food crisis.³⁸ His negative representation of the Moroccans in a colonial context, often using the term 'mouros', forms a striking contrast to the generally positive and celebratory representation of the Moorishness of the Algarve in *Alma Algarvia*, and

³³ Monteiro, p. 57.

³⁴ Charnon-Deutsch, p. 85.

³⁵ The idea of a female Algarvian muse, emphasising the newspaper's male-centred gaze, is also present elsewhere in *Alma Algarvia*, notably in the 'Muza Algarvia' feature. This would be a poem on the theme of the Algarvian woman by a local poet. These did not, however, necessarily highlight any Moorish elements (see João de Deus, [untitled poem], *Alma Algarvia*, 20 June 1914, p. 1.; J. Reis Varela, 'Quadro vivo', *Alma Algarvia*, 27 June 1914, p. 1).

³⁶ Morocco had become a French protectorate in 1912, leading to the Fez Riots. It had also granted Spain granted small areas of influence in the North and South of the country. Tangiers, where Silva was based, was not part of the Spanish protectorate, instead holding an internationally controlled status.

³⁷ Silva, 27 September 1914, p. 3. The author's first name is not specified.

³⁸ Silva, 4 October 1914, p. 2.

especially the pride with which another form of Islamic presence, this time one of Moorish territorial and cultural dominance, is presented to the reader by other contributors. Of course, we must bear in mind that the representations of a medieval Islamic presence here constitute an idealised version of the past, whereas, in contrast, those relating to Morocco in 1914 were instead describing its corrupted present.

Legends, Voices, Ghosts

The contributors to *Alma Algarvia* describe Silves, and the Algarve in general, as being rich in legends and folklore. Curiously, Monteiro claims that the tales of the 1001 Nights influenced Algarvian folklore, describing the *mouras encantadas* legends as being the legacy of this exposure to the Nights.³⁹ Presumably Monteiro is implying that the tales were being told in Arabic in their earlier forms during the time of Al-Andalus, though the author does not provide any scholarly evidence for this proposition. In addition, for other contributors, local folktales are not merely stories which are passed down the generations. Rather, they give us the sense that through these tales, voices, echoes and shapes from the past can still be heard, seen and felt. In this sense they continued the tradition of thought found in Oliveira Parreira and Athaide Oliveira, who had both experienced Portugal's Islamic past as a 'living presence' through 'popular traditions, local histories and legends'.⁴⁰

In an article appearing in *Alma Algarvia* entitled 'O Nosso Algarve' the author describes the Algarve as 'este pedaço uberrimo da terra portuguesa onde [...] a Lenda

³⁹ Monteiro, p. 56. It is important to note that *Mouras encantadas* were originally supernatural beings from Celtic folklore found in both Portugal and Galicia. They later became associated with Moorish princesses in the south of Portugal.

⁴⁰ Vakil, p. 35.

mussulmana nos adoece de sonho'.⁴¹ The Algarve is therefore described as being abundant not only in terms of its natural environment but also in terms of its imaginative richness, thanks to its Muslim legends. Julião Quintinha also evokes a continuing Moorish presence by describing the landscape around Silves as a: 'terra de princezas mouras, cujo encantamento a briza chora!' He writes, in addition, that: 'A paisagem retorna-se de misterioso encanto e a gente julga ver assomar as ameias derruidas do antigo castello os rostos palidos de enamoradas moiras'. This sense of an enchantment and of the presence of ghostly female figures reflects the association, common across the Peninsula, between the Moors and magic. However, it could also be seen as a further symptom of Silves' decline, in that it has been unable to forge a new identity which might have banished those ghosts. Quintinha also later describes further shadowy figures: 'pelos serros prepassam sombras misteriosas – almas perdidas chorando a prescrição mourisca, dando no seu alcorão profecias fataes contra o aventureiro cristão...'.⁴² Here Quintinha paints a different picture, one of the Muslims of medieval Silves as lost souls, drawing on the Koran and cursing Christian adventurers. These crying voices that can still be heard are suggestive of the past trauma of Silves' history of sieges and conquests culminating in the fall of the Moorish city to the Christians.

The contributors to *Alma Algarvia* also mention legends associated with particular places, for example, in Judice's article on Silves' castle he describes its Moorish cistern as 'monumental [...] A sua abobada abaulada é sastentada [sic.] por quatro

⁴¹ 'O Nosso Algarve', *Alma Algarvia*, 1 November 1915, p. 5.

⁴² Quintinha, 'Paizagem Algarvia: O Valle de Silves', p. 1. 'prepassam' is assumed to be a typographical error; 'perpassam' would mean to pass by.

ordens de columnas e compreende cinco naves [...] Ligada a esta cisterna está a celebre lenda do mouro de Silves.⁴³

The most in-depth treatment of a Moorish legend is an article by Fazenda Junior entitled 'A Toca da Galliana: Motivo Arabe', concerning a cave in an area of picturesque rock formations near Pedrogam (assumed to be Pedrógão in the Alentejo, north-east of Beja and near the Guadiana river).⁴⁴ According to Fazenda Junior, the cave is known as the Toca da Galliana because Galliana, the daughter of a Moorish King named Gallafre, used to like spending her summers in the cave. Plates and other stone utensils are said to have been found in the cave, though Fazenda Junior never found any himself. He explains that though the legend is simple enough, the real interest lies in the origin of Gallafre, whose story can be found in the account of an Arab writer, Al-Beckr-el Babr (likely consulted in translation, although a reference is not provided). Fazenda Junior's summary tells the story of Gallafre's life, from being a student of alchemy at the University of Cairo, to being taken prisoner by desert bandits, to studying again in Cordoba after having been liberated by a merchant from Damascus.

In Cordoba, Gallafre was eventually put in charge of guarding the royal palace, and, during a time of political disorder, proclaimed himself caliph of Badajoz in the year 845 AD, a territory that then formed part of Gharb Al-Andalus. The story retold by Fazenda Junior serves partly to illustrate the strong connections that existed between Gharb Al-Andalus and other parts of the Arab world, to show that the region was historically part of a network in which trade and learning encouraged travel and cosmopolitanism. As such, Fazenda Junior is able to show that legends pertaining to

⁴³ Judice, 'O Castello de Silves', p. 2. According to this legend, on the night of *São João* (St John – celebrated on 24 June), at midnight, an enchanted Moorish maiden appears in Silves' castle's large cistern, sailing on a silver boat and singing, waiting for a Muslim prince to say the words that will break her enchantment.

⁴⁴ Fazenda Junior, 'A Toca da Galliana: Motivo Arabe', *Alma Algarvia*, 15 June 1916, pp. 130-131.

particular places can, with the necessary research, provide insights into the historic identity of the region, and thus shape how readers view it today.

It is possible to detect, in *Alma Algarvia*, a current of self-examination and criticism both in relation to the intellectual elite of the Algarve, and to Algarvians more generally. More specifically, both Monteiro and Quintinha refer to the idea of inheriting a fatalistic attitude from the Arabs. Monteiro writes that : ‘Dos arabes herdou [...] [O Algarve] tambem um pouco de fatalismo enervante da raça mussulmana’, here contributing to the conflation of Orientalist stereotypes by applying a religious qualifier to a racial category (‘raça mussulmana’), giving the sense that this ‘fatalismo enervante’ is a debilitating flaw which serves to check the positive contribution of medieval Muslims to the culture of Algarve.⁴⁵

Quintinha’s article, ‘Impressões’, looks ahead to the Congresso Regional Algarvio due to take place the following month (September 1915), concluding that it will hopefully be the first step to elevating the Algarvian ‘race’ to the top. Quintinha complains that despite the Algarve boasting many artists, intellectuals and scholars, it lacks an intellectual milieu, artistic training and ‘a *fé creadora* que somos capazes de sonhar mas que não nos dispomos a sentir’. This self-critical tone was common in writing of the time in Portugal, as it continued the soul-searching that had begun in the nineteenth century, with the country lagging behind in terms of industrialisation, coming to terms with the independence of Brazil, and facing the challenge of replicating a ‘new Brazil’ in Africa. The difficulty that Quintinha identifies here is of a slightly different nature, since he perceives a sort of mental block where Algarvians do not foresee an ambitious future for their region. This he blames on an inherited attitude:

⁴⁵ Monteiro, p. 56.

‘Pois é mudar de rumo, de contrario permaneceremos mergulhados neste fatalismo musulmano persagio de tão mau fim... que nos adocece d’alma’.⁴⁶ Attacks on Portuguese fatalism were common at the time, and not limited to the Algarve, but this example is striking as Quintinha casts a negative value judgment on Muslims which is rooted in Orientalist stereotypes.⁴⁷ Quintinha is not only arguing that a fatalistic attitude can be associated with Islam and Islamic culture, but also that the attitude can be passed on through generations who are not Muslim. In the light of such comments, it is worth considering that if such a fatalistic attitude existed at the time, it might have had more to do with the Algarve having suffered decades of being ignored by Lisbon.

The concern regarding the mindset needed to create a brighter future recurs in *Alma Algarvia*, in the form of a few lines of anonymous text which appear under the heading ‘Monumentos do Algarve’ and a photo of Silves’ castle in the issue from 15 June 1916, immediately preceding Fazenda Junior’s article on ‘A Toca da Galliana’. The mini-article opens with this statement: ‘Só os povos que se alheam do seu futuro e, barbaramente, perdem a noção da sua atualidade, não teem curiosidade pelo passado’.⁴⁸ The text here cleverly reverses reader expectations, as we would expect it to assert that ignoring one’s past would prevent a people from going forward knowledgeably into their future. Instead, the statement turns that idea around, arguing that a people who do not think about their future, who lose the sense of their identity in the present, are a people who are not curious about their past. Such an argument reflects the hopeful mentality of the contributors, who, though they continue to self-examine and to self-criticise, nonetheless look energetically into a future in which they hope the Algarve will prosper economically and culturally.

⁴⁶ Julião Quintinha, ‘Impressões’, *Alma Algarvia*, 1 August 1915, p. 1.

⁴⁷ Salazar would, in the future, criticise Portuguese Fado music for having a fatalistic attitude.

⁴⁸ ‘Monumentos do Algarve’, *Alma Algarvia*, 15 June 1916, p. 129.

The article continues by arguing that ruins, tombs and old books: ‘são as fontes preciosísimas onde as sociedades mataram a sede de saber, apoiaram a sua inteligência e refizeram a sua personalidade.’ If monuments are left abandoned, the text continues, it attests to the ignorance of ‘[uma] geração inferiorizada pelo mercantilismo da época’.⁴⁹ This idealistic text therefore argues the case for the preservation of the past, in an age where change and hope for the future were fundamental priorities. It argues that the knowledge we can gain from the past is not merely a passive knowledge but can be dynamic: it has the power to remake and to reshape the identities and vision of a people.

Part 2: The Silves Controversy

The idealistic stance of *Alma Algarvia*, with its vision of looking into the region’s past to energise its vision for the future, would surface in a different form in the late 1920s. As I shall examine in this section, a project to commemorate Al-Mutamid in Silves, led by the Andalusian Blas Infante Pérez de Vargas (1885-1936), backfired in a protracted controversy which played out over the summer of 1928 in the Lisbon and Algarve newspapers. Now known as the Padre de la Patria Andaluza, Infante headed the movement of historical andalusianism from 1913 until his assassination by Falangist soldiers at his home in Coria del Río (south of Seville) in 1936. A notary rather than an Arabist by trade, he dedicated his evenings and nights to studying the history of the region, wanting to understand what had led Andalusia to move from a period of cultural brilliance, during the time of Al-Andalus, into long-term decline.⁵⁰ His early position was

⁴⁹ ‘Monumentos do Algarve’, p. 129.

⁵⁰ Enrique Iniesta Coullaut-Valera, *Al-Andalus en Blas Infante* (Madrid: Editorial Darek-Nyumba, 1998), p. 14. See Josep Esquerrà i Nonell, ‘Almanzor: drama histórico de Blas Infante’, *Revista de literatura*, 76: 151

not necessarily Islamophilic, for example in *Ideal Andaluz* (1915) Infante describes the ‘raza mixta’ of Berbers and Arabs who settled in the region as being associated with ‘exclusivismo fanático’ and ‘fatalismo’, adding that ‘ni uno ni otro estigma se observan en los árabes andaluces, efecto seguramente, como ya dije, de preponderar el genio de la raza aborígen’.⁵¹ However, his knowledge of Islamic culture increased markedly over the years that followed, and he became intensely interested in the figure of al-Mutamid as an inspirational figure for modern-day Andalusis.

In 1920, Infante published an Orientalist-modernist play about Al-Mutamid’s final days entitled *Motamid, Último Rey de Sevilla*.⁵² Like Oliveira Parreira had before him, Infante used the work of the Arabist Reinhart Dozy as the main historical source for his depiction of the life of Al-Mutamid (or ‘Motamid’, as the character is named in the two works). This he acknowledges in an *Advertencia* at the end of the play, where he also mentions one of Dozy’s sources, the historian Abbas.⁵³ Oliveira Parreira’s novel and Blas Infante’s play feature a number of the same episodes, such as Motamid’s discovery of Itimad when she improvises poetry as a slave-girl, and his planting of almond trees so that Itimad can be reminded of snow by their blossom.⁵⁴ During this period Infante also studied Arabic, acquiring considerable proficiency, in preparation for a pilgrimage to Al-

(2014) 199-220 (202) for a more detailed account of the development of Blas Infante’s thinking from 1918-1919.

⁵¹ Blas Infante Pérez de Vargas, *Ideal Andaluz: Varios estudios acerca del Renacimiento de Andalucía* (Seville: Joaquín L. Arévalo, 1915) pp. 78-79.

⁵² Blas Infante Pérez de Vargas, *Motamid, último rey de Sevilla* (Seville: Editorial Avante, 1920).

⁵³ Abbas, also known as Ibn ‘Idhari, was born and lived in Marrakech, and wrote a text on the history of Iberia and the Maghreb in the year 1312. Reinhart Dozy published an edited French translation of Ibn ‘Idhari’s text, *al-Bayan al-Mughrib fi Akhbar al-Maghrib* entitled *La Chronique d’Afrique et l’Espagne*, 2 vols (Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1848; 1851). Dozy later published *Histoire des Musulmans d’Espagne, jusqu’à la conquête de l’Andalousie par les Almoravides, 711-1110*, 4 vols (Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1861). A Spanish translation of this work appeared in 1877: Reinhart Dozy, *Historia de los musulmanes españoles hasta la conquista de Andalucía por los almorávides: (711-1110)*, trans. by F. de Castro, 4 vols (Madrid: Victoriano Suárez, 1877).

⁵⁴ Infante also produced an unfinished manuscript for a further play, *Almanzor*, in 1921, which was only published in 2012: Blas Infante Pérez de Vargas, *Almanzor*, ed. by Josep Esquerrà i Nonell, 1st edn (Kragujevac: Centar slobodarskih delatnosti, 2012). This play also used Dozy as a source: see Esquerrà i Nonell, ‘Almanzor: drama histórico de Blas Infante’, p. 204.

Mutamid's tomb. In 1924, Infante travelled to Lisbon, on to Rabat, across the French lines and on to Aghmat, Morocco. His journey intentionally followed the route taken by Ibn al-Jatīb, a court official from the Emirate of Granada in the fourteenth century.⁵⁵ Accompanied on the trip by a young Catalan photographer, José Luis García Vidal, Infante visited Al-Mutamid's tomb and also claimed to have met his descendants.⁵⁶

Blas Infante's vision of Al-Mutamid as the ideal representative of Andalusí culture led him to develop a proposal for a homage to the poet-king in Silves, at which a commemorative plaque would be unveiled. Pedro Judice initially acted as an intermediary between Blas Infante and the Câmara Municipal de Silves: documents held by the Arquivo Municipal da Câmara Municipal de Silves show that a letter sent from Judice prompted Infante's idea to be presented at a meeting of the Comissão Administrativa da Câmara Municipal de Silves in November 1926.⁵⁷ The Câmara Municipal was so enthused by the idea of the homage that they gave their go-ahead and accepted Infante's offer to provide the plaque, also concurrently deciding to change the name of the Rua das Muralhas in Silves to 'Al-Motamid'.⁵⁸ Although the plaque was made, and arrangements made to invite intellectuals to represent Andalusia at a special ceremony in the summer of 1928, the project never came to fruition. As Infante himself later recounted:

⁵⁵ Iniesta, *Al-Andalus en Blas Infante*, p. 11.

⁵⁶ Alfredo de Carvalho, 'Motamid, Príncipe de Silves: A Andaluzia e o Algarve vão celebra [sic.] este famoso poeta mosarabe', *Diário de Notícias*, 15 June 1928, pp. 1, 5 (p. 5). Morocco at this point was still largely a French protectorate, with small areas to the North and South under Spanish protection.

⁵⁷ The letter from Pedro Júdice is mentioned in the minutes of the meeting of the Comissão Administrativa da Câmara Municipal de Silves of 18 Novembro 1926 presided by Aníbal Sant'Ana (p. 175v), as well as the Câmara's decision (p. 177v), Silves, Arquivo Municipal de Silves, PT/CMSLV/B/E/001/Lv4 (pp. 175-175v; 177v).

⁵⁸ The decision was communicated to Pedro Judice via official correspondence from the Presidente da Comissão Administrativa dated 19 November 1926, Arquivo Municipal de Silves, PT/CMSLV/B/E/004/LV13. The name of the road was changed again to Rua Dr Sidónio Pais on 21 March 1934 and is now called Rua Pintor Bernardo Marques. The homage to Al-Mutamid did not come to fruition until the twenty-first century, with the city of Silves' new square being named after him in a decision made on 24 November 1999.

Pues los periódicos retrógrados de Lisboa, emprendieron una activa campaña: y, después de haber estado fijada la fecha del homenaje, de manufacturadas las lápidas, cuya colocación, en lugares adecuados, servirían de motivo al acto; y aun de invitadas las representaciones intelectuales andaluzas, que al mismo se disponían a asistir, *dieron a través*, como se decía antes, con la fiesta, y ésta no se llegó a celebrar, porque ‘o senhor Blas Infante era um islamita’ (?) y de lo que se trataba era de plantar la Media Luna rematando la torre de la Catedral de Silves. Y hasta los *cabritenses*, (nombre que tomaron los opositores a la fiesta, del iniciador de la campaña, señor Cabrita en *A Voz*, de Lisboa) arremetieron contra los *motamides* (los portugueses partidarios de su celebración) invocando, con un criterio aljubarrotista, los sospechosos orígenes de la iniciativa, porque, como ‘diz o velho ditado português – De Hespanha nem bom vento nem bom casamento’.⁵⁹

The battle of Aljubarrota of 1385, referred to here, resulted in a victory for the Kingdom of Portugal over the Crown of Castile and had come to stand as a symbol of Portuguese determination to resist Spanish Imperial ambitions. As this account suggests, the debate, though ostensibly about the homage, became a full-scale war of values. As Blas Infante saw it, those hostile to the homage were paranoid that it would represent a symbolic reconquest of the city, either by Islam, or by Spain. By studying various newspaper articles written about the controversy in Portugal in 1928, it is possible to piece together the bitter debate that raged over whether the homage was acceptable or desirable. This will also allow me to draw insights on other factors that shaped opinion at the time on the question of remembering Al-Andalus.

Scholarship on the Silves controversy has so far offered only a brief analysis of the fallout of Blas Infante’s failed proposal. It is mentioned at the end of Josep Esquerrà i Nonell’s article from 2013 on Blas Infante’s play *Motamid, Último Rey de Sevilla*, with Esquerrà citing Infante’s account of events and contrasting this with a quote from Adalberto Alves from 1996 which recognises the more tolerant approach of Motamid’s rule.⁶⁰ Commenting on this, Esquerrà writes: ‘Afortunadamente, los tiempos han

⁵⁹ Blas Infante Pérez de Vargas, *La verdad sobre el complot de Tablada y el Estado Libre de Andalucía* (Granada: Aljibe, 1979), p. 84.

⁶⁰ Adalberto Alves, *Al-Mu’tamid, poeta do destino* (Lisbon, Assírio & Alvim, 1996), cited in Josep Esquerrà i Nonell, ‘Motamid, último rey de Sevilla: Drama histórico de Blas Infante’, *Colindancias*, 4 (2013) 143-162 (160).

cambiado y los portugueses están en condiciones de saber apreciar hoy el legado cultural andaluz del reinado de Motamid'.⁶¹ Unfortunately, this comparison between the attitudes of conservative newspapers in the 1920s and the revisionist celebration of the Islamic legacy in Portugal in the 1990s obscures earlier Portuguese writing praising the legacy of the poet-king. The obvious example is, of course, *Os Luso-Árabes* (1898), which is missing from Esquerrà's discussion: Esquerrà refers to Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz's novel, *Ben Ammar de Sevilla* (1972) as 'la única versión novelada que se le conoce'.⁶² Although the oversight can be justified by the fact that Esquerrà's study is looking at the Spanish literary tradition only, it still remains problematic given the discussion of the Silves controversy at the end of the article. This underlines the need for further scholarship on earlier Portuguese contributions to the history of representations of Al-Mutamid, acknowledging not only Oliveira Parreira's work but also the role of the Algarvian intellectual community in defending the homage project of 1928, which I shall explore below.

A more recent article from Fabrizio Boscaglia has examined the Silves controversy, identifying a further hostile article in relation to the homage by a writer signing as João Blaguez.⁶³ Rather than looking at these hostile responses in detail, Boscaglia is instead interested in drawing connections between Blas Infante's interest in Al-Mutamid and Fernando Pessoa's. Before the homage project collapsed, two articles were published in *O 'Notícias' Ilustrado* which have been attributed to Pessoa. Signed with the initials of Augusto Ferreira Gomes ('A. F. G.'), they were intitled 'O Renascer de

⁶¹ Esquerrà, 'Motamid, último rey de Sevilla' p. 160.

⁶² Claudio Sánchez-Albornoz, *Ben Ammar de Sevilla (Una tragedia en la España e los taifas)* (Madrid: Espasa-Calpe, 1972); Esquerrà, 'Motamid, último rey de Sevilla', p. 147.

⁶³ Fabrizio Boscaglia, 'Fernando Pessoa, Blas Infante e al-Mu'tamid: do al-Andalus ao "dia triunfal"', *Colóquio-Letras*, 191 (2016), 148-160. João Blaguez, 'Uma lápide em Silves', *O Algarve*, 19 August 1928, p. 1.

Um Simbolo: Al-Motamide, o Iniciador’ and ‘As Causas Longinquas da Homenagem a Al-Motamide, o Iniciador’.⁶⁴ Boscaglia believes that these were likely to be the result of Pessoa having read an interview with Infante conducted by Alfredo de Carvalho, which appeared in the Lisbon newspaper *Diário de Notícias*. According to Boscaglia: ‘Nestes textos, a iniciativa de homenagem de al-Mu’tamid é celebrada com solene aprovação e é reconduzida às suas ocultas e remotas causas’.⁶⁵ It seems that for Pessoa, the proposed al-Mutamid plaque in Silves provided an opportunity to engage in a subtle critique of the narrow conservative vision of Portuguese national identity promoted under the *Ditadura Nacional* (the precursor to the *Estado Novo* Regime).

Building on Boscaglia’s findings, the following section will analyse both Carvalho’s interview with Infante, various hostile attacks on the homage and a number of defensive responses from Algarvian intellectuals. Carvalho’s interview was in fact not the first newspaper coverage of the homage. The Faro-based newspaper *Correio do Sul* had, in fact, published an article on the planned homage on 6 May 1928.⁶⁶ In this earlier article, the homage to Al-Mutamid is envisaged to take place at the end of June, to coincide with the city streets being illuminated with electric light for the first time. The article includes extracts of Al-Mutamid’s poetry, and credits Pedro Judice for coming up with the idea for the homage (which Judice later denied, as we shall see). It also reveals that the plans for the event included Blas Infante giving talks on ‘o rei poeta, sobre literatura e turismo’. This first article did not appear to provoke a controversy, partly because of *Correio do Sul*’s smaller readership. However, it is also the case that

⁶⁴ [Fernando Pessoa, Augusto Ferreira Gomes] ‘O Renascer de Um Simbolo: Al-Motamide, o Iniciador’, *O ‘Notícias’ Ilustrado*, 15 July 1928, p. 22 and ‘As Causas Longinquas da Homenagem a Al-Motamide, o Iniciador’, *O ‘Notícias’ Ilustrado*, 22 July 1928, p. 15. These two articles are also included in the following volume: Fernando Pessoa, *Sebastianismo e Quinto Império*, ed. by Jorge Uribe and Pedro Sepúlveda (Lisboa: Ática, 2011) pp. 295-299.

⁶⁵ Boscaglia, p. 149.

⁶⁶ ‘Uma homenagem em Silves a al-Motamid rei-poeta arabe’, *Correio do Sul*, 6 May 1928, p. 1.

Carvalho's interview with Blas Infante published in 15 June constituted more of an affront to reactionary commentators: it appeared on the front page of a Lisbon newspaper and included, as we shall see, an exposition of Blas Infante's ideas, which embraced the legacy of Islamic culture in the south of the Peninsula from a left-wing ideological perspective.

As he mentions at the end of the article, Alfredo de Carvalho was a student of the Arabist David Lopes, who held the Chair of Arabic at the Faculty of Letters of the University of Lisbon. As such, his enthusiasm for Blas Infante's project for the homage is in the context of having learnt about Islamic culture in Portugal from Lopes. The headline of the article proclaims: 'Motamid, Principe de Silves: A Andaluzia e o Algarve vão celebra [sic.] este famoso poeta mosarabe', and an image accompanying the article reveals the design for the plaque, including the following translated and adapted lines of Al-Mutamid's verse:

Viajante, Saúda Silves
E pergunta-lhe se guarda
Lembrança de meu carinho
Em suas amenas moradas.⁶⁷

The lines have been adapted, since in the original version the lines are addressed to Ibn Ammar rather than to a traveller. We hear that the plaque, already made by this point, was of green and gold design and made from Sevillian tiles.⁶⁸

The article opens with an evocation of Silves replete with Oriental motifs:

Silves, a lendária cidade dos mouros, outróra famosa pelos seus sumptuosos palacios, pelos seus tesouros colossais, pelo seu «sharadjib» povoado de estatuas e coroados de mirantes, pelos seus jardins á beira do rio que não admitiam parelhas – Silves a princesa do Chenchir, naqueles tempos longínquos dos turbantes e das cimitarras ardentes de joias, vai agora reparar a injustiça que ha

⁶⁷ The lines are taken from the poem 'Evocação de Silves'. In the original version, the poem is addressed to Abu Bakr (referring to Ibn Ammar) rather than an unspecified 'traveller'. Alfredo de Carvalho, 'Motamid, Principe de Silves: A Andaluzia e o Algarve vão celebra [sic.] este famoso poeta mosarabe', *Diário de Notícias*, 15 June 1928, pp. 1, 5 (p. 1). Further references to the article will be in the body of the text.

⁶⁸ Whereas Infante's later account refers to multiple plaques (Infante, *La verdad sobre el complot de Tablada*, p. 84), in this interview only one is mentioned (Carvalho, p. 1).

cometido contra um dos seus assinalados varões – o poeta que primeiro a celebrou com mais viva e palpitante ternura. (1)

The proliferation of symbols of wealth and luxury here surpasses those in the descriptions of Silves present in *Alma Algarvia* and is in fact more reminiscent of the splendour described in *Os Luso-Árabes*. Silves is feminised in this extract as the ‘princesa do Chenchir’: ‘Chenchir’ (meaning ‘garden’) being a transliteration of an Arabic name for the province that is also used by Oliveira Parreira. The emotive language of the final phrase (‘injustiça’ and ‘viva e palpitante ternura’) invites the reader to see the homage as the righting of a historic wrong against the poet-king, who is here characterised by his intensely emotional attachment to Silves.

The introduction to the interview includes a short account of Carvalho’s visit to Infante’s house, which was arranged by the Portuguese consul in Ayamonte, Luís Consiglieri de Sá Pereira. Carvalho includes a number of details of Infante’s house on Isla Cristina, mentioning that it includes Islamic-style furniture, tapestries, decorative Arabic versicles which ‘dá-nos a sensação duma vivenda islamita, onde apetece queimar perfumes em vasos de bronze e lêr o Alcorão deitado sobre almofadas macias’ and which ‘excita-nos a fantasia até ao ponto de a gente julgar em outro país e noutras idades’ (1). The description, focusing on the exotic furnishings and their effect on the imagination, appears designed not only to introduce the reader to Infante’s love of Islamic culture but also to contribute to a sense of intrigue about Infante. Carvalho also notices a copy of Oliveira Parreira’s *Os Luso-Árabes* on Blas Infante’s desk, which invites the question as to whether Blas Infante could already have been in possession of the book prior to writing *Motamid, Último Rey de Sevilla* (published in 1920), and therefore

whether Oliveira Parreira could have been a further (and unacknowledged) influence on the play.⁶⁹

The descriptions Carvalho provides of Infante cultivate an enigmatic image of the Andalusian. The 42-year old is mentioned as having an ‘olhar penetrante e intenso’ and an ‘espírito moço’. Carvalho is also keen to paint Blas Infante as a great thinker, working for the good of the people of Andalusia, describing him as: ‘um valor intelectual da Espanha dos nossos dias’ and referring to his literary output and his ‘campanhas intelectuais’. Carvalho also extols the virtues of Blas Infante’s mind, describing him as having an ‘argumentar’ which is ‘incisivo como um gume e que até nos paradoxos revela um fundo lógico’. In this way, Carvalho attempts to guide the reader towards being sympathetic towards Infante’s vision of the legacy of Al-Mutamid. As well as emphasising that Infante is ‘um entranhado amigo de Portugal, que ele visita frequentes vezes e onde já realizou algumas conferencias notáveis’, Carvalho also describes Infante as an ‘[a]utentico homem da Andaluzia’. By emphasising these three aspects (Infante’s interest in Islamic culture, his close links with Portugal and his authenticity as an Andalusian), Carvalho by implication rejects narrow conceptions of patriotism as loyalty to one ‘national culture’ alone. This then sets up Carvalho’s assertion that if the most important thing to Blas Infante is Andalusia, then his interest in Islamic culture is entirely logical: ‘porque esta Andaluzia privilegiada se converteu pela invasão islamita em primeiro centro de cultura na Europa, D [sic.] Blaz Infante diz-se um fervoroso muçulmanista’ (1). These unabashed statements about Infante’s apparent fervour, however, would provide fuel for right-wing commentators to brand Infante as an ‘Islamite’.

⁶⁹ A close comparison of the two works with Dozy is needed to ascertain whether this is the case.

Carvalho's article then proceeds with the interview proper, with Blas Infante beginning by providing his own interpretation of the history of Islamic presence in Iberia. Infante specifies that he is describing 'o sul da península (o Andaluz e o Algarve)', grouping the two regions because of their shared medieval history and implying a shared cultural legacy. Infante gives no suggestion here that the Algarve and Andalusia should become a single territory, as his battle was focused on the idea of an autonomous Andalusia. Nonetheless, part of the reason why the project appears to have alarmed its critics is because it raised the spectre of the feared Iberian Union. Infante describes the 'invasores [...] do norte da África' finding a (Visigothic) culture that was 'manifestamente inferior', thus challenging narratives from the late nineteenth century which sought to elevate the Visigothic and Mozarab cultures above the Islamic culture that took root on the Peninsula. He identifies the superiority of that Islamic culture as being 'sua política de assimilação tranquila, evolutiva e tolerante', qualities which he sees as being instrumental in its 'facil implantação' in the South (1).

Infante further claims that: 'Todo o Andaluz e o Algarve se muçulmanizaram sem coacção, antes docemente, pela ansia legítima de viverem melhor' (1). His positive interpretation of the value of Islamic presence on the Peninsula and its ease of assimilation constitutes a progressive discourse which warmly embraces the process of acculturation that occurred during Al-Andalus, and rejects narratives of violent conquest and oppression. It is a discourse which shares common ground, for example, with the discourse in recent decades of Portuguese archaeologist Cláudio Torres. Torres sees the expanded medieval territory under Islamic rule as being: '[o] primeiro grande império mercantil. Mercantil, não militar. [...] ésta é uma civilização do mercado [...] por definição propenso a receber os outros, a aceitar outras ideias [...] Foi esse contacto que

criou a civilização mediterrânea desde sempre'.⁷⁰ Both Infante and Torres therefore agree that Islamic rule was accepted on the peninsula pragmatically and without coercion.

Infante goes on to describe the Christian reconquest as 'a sobreposição violenta da Europa menos culta':

Os homens da reconquista, [...] fanatizados, atacaram a toda a nossa cultura, queimaram os nossos livros, combateram a nossa musica popular. A reconquista [...] fez sucumbir toda a força animadora de cultura, toda a inspiração de trabalho intelectual, toda a alegria vivaz duma civilização criada no país do sul. (1)

Infante asserts here that the Christian reconquest was simultaneously an attack on the culture of learning, on popular music (and therefore on folk culture) and on *joie-de-vivre* in the south of the Peninsula. In the interview Carvalho supports Infante's argument in this regard a little later by mentioning the Spanish Arabist Julián Ribera y Tarragó, who had published the volume *La música árabe y su influencia en la española* in 1927 and whose thesis coheres with Infante's argument (5).⁷¹ Infante himself would go on to publish *Orígenes de lo flamenco y secreto del cante jondo* between 1929 and 1931.⁷² Infante was in this regard also influenced by Manuel de Falla, who had been arguing for some years that the roots of Flamenco music were found in the Islamic music of Al-Andalus.⁷³ At this time the same argument was also being made for the origin of Fado music, though, as Rodney Gallop argued in the 1930s, the fact that Fado does not originate in the Algarve makes this seem less likely.⁷⁴ Though the Cante Alentejano of

⁷⁰ Luís Leiria, *A civilização islâmica: a última grande civilização mediterrânea: Entrevista a Cláudio Torres*, <<http://www.buala.org/pt/cara-a-cara/a-civilizacao-islamica-a-ultima-grande-civilizacao-mediterranea-entrevista-a-claudio-tor>> [accessed 31 August 2019].

⁷¹ Carvalho, p. 5. Julián Ribera y Tarragó, *La música árabe y su influencia en la española* (Madrid: Editorial Voluntad, 1927).

⁷² Blas Infante, *Orígenes de lo flamenco y secreto del cante jondo*, 125th anniversary edn (Seville: Junta de Andalucía, 2010 [1929–33]).

⁷³ Manuel de Falla, 'El "cante jondo" (canto primitivo andaluz)', in *Escritos sobre música y músicos: Debussy, Wagner, el "cante jondo"* (Buenos Aires: Espasa-Calpe Argentina 1950). Falla organised the Concurso de Cante Jonde in Granada in 1922, supported by Federico García Lorca.

⁷⁴ Rodney Alexander Gallop, *Portugal, a book of folk-ways* (Cambridge, W. Lewis at the University Press, 1936), p. 249.

the Alentejo region has possible roots in either Gregorian Chant or the music of Arab cultures, the Algarve itself does not have a popular music tradition. As such, though Infante attempts to draw the Algarve into his discussion of the Islamic cultural heritage of the south of the Peninsula, some of his remarks apply only to Andalusia.

In the quotation cited above, the phrase ‘a força animadora de cultura’ also shows the mythic status that Infante bestows on the Islamic culture of Al-Andalus. This mythic slant would of course reappear in the Portuguese context much later in the century in the work of Adalberto Alves. Mediated by Carvalho, who describes Infante’s voice as being ‘cheio de fé e sinceridade’, Infante uses this vision to mythologise the idea of reinvigorating Andalusia in the future: ‘o que queremos? Queremos ressuscitar o espirito animador da cultura muçulmana peninsular.. O meu regionalismo, como vê, é puramente cultural’. Infante therefore attempts to justify his regionalism by qualifying it as being purely cultural (rather than, say, purely political), though, as we shall see, this was not taken to be wholly convincing. Though Infante does not say so, the shared cultural heritage of the Algarve and Andalusia is in many ways epitomised by the figure of Al-Mutamid himself, having been born in Beja and having gone on to become ‘príncipe de Silves e ultimo rei de Sevilha’ (5).

Infante sees Al-Mutamid as: ‘[a] figura mais representativa da cultura muçulmana peninsular’, particularly emphasising al-Mutamid’s ‘corte intelectualizada’ and his poetic output, particularly his verses on Silves. The centuries of pilgrimages to Al-Mutamid’s tomb are, for Blas Infante, evidence of the affection felt by people towards him, which renders the plan for the homage ‘a reparação duma injustiça’. Reflecting on Blas Infante’s proposal to send an “‘élite” de intelectuais’ from Andalusia for the homage, Carvalho envisages the ceremony as ‘[um] grande facto intelectual’, in which representatives from the Algarve and Government, as well as a historian from the

‘Academia de Sciencias’ such as David Lopes, should be present. Carvalho ends the interview by calling on his country to offer collaboration, writing that: ‘uma voz unanime de aplauso de todo o nosso povo há de ressoar clamorosa dentro das velhas muralhas da cidade’ (5). This reference to popular and official approbation of the event adds a further level of provocation to reactionary readers, since the reference to the ‘povo’ connects with Infante’s vision of Al-Mutamid as a figure loved by the people, and therefore sits uncomfortably with the idea of official approval by a Government which would want to manage popular opinion according to its own agenda.

As mentioned by Infante himself in his later account, the most influential critic of the homage was Carlos Pedro Cabrita, a native of the town of Lagoa in Algarve who was based at the University of Coimbra. On 8 March 1928, Cabrita had given a talk entitled ‘As bases históricas do regionalismo algarvio’ in which he gave an overview of the peoples and cultures who had inhabited the Algarve from the prehistoric to medieval periods. The talk was subsequently published as a pamphlet and promoted by the Faro-based newspaper *O Algarve*.⁷⁵ The pamphlet accuses Algarvian poets of committing the same error as the people, in seeing the Algarve’s remote past solely as Arab, and forgetting the peoples who had come before. Cabrita’s position is to reassert the Algarve’s Christian inheritance. Poets, he writes, should remember that ‘os árabes, que êles cantam, eram inimigos daquelas populações cristãs, donde verdadeiramente decendemos’.⁷⁶ Reminiscent of the position of Catholic Arabist Simonet, whom he uses as an indirect source, Cabrita’s paper describes the arrival of the Muslims in the eighth

⁷⁵ Carlos Pedro Cabrita, *As bases históricas do regionalismo algarvio* (Coimbra: Gráf. Atlantica, 1928). The pamphlet was promoted in an article by Ramos Bandeira (likely to be José Ramos Bandeira, 1906-1991) in *O Algarve* on 8 April 1928, and again on 29 April 1928, the latter article ending with a pro-nationalist and pro-imperialist message.

⁷⁶ Cabrita, *As bases históricas do regionalismo algarvio*, pp. 20-21.

century as ‘hordas invencíveis’.⁷⁷ Not only this, but his paper contains salient contradictions: for example, despite his apparent pro-Christian and Islamophobic position, he emphasises such features as the wealth and importance of Silves ‘no tempo dos árabes’, and quotes Herculano with respect to the purity of the Arabic spoken in the city and surrounding countryside.⁷⁸

Cabrita’s hostile response to Carvalho’s *Diário de Notícias* interview with Infante was published on the front page of the Lisbon newspaper *A Voz* on 12 July 1928, with a shorter follow-up article also published on 21 July.⁷⁹ The first article contains an aggressive title and subtitle, designed for maximum impact on the reader: ‘Fóra! Fóra! Uma marroquice em Silves: Por iniciativa dum andaluz, coloca-se uma lápide muçulmanista!’ As well as using the despective term ‘marroquice’, denoting a Moroccan connection in a derogatory manner, it sought to associate the plaque primarily with Islam, rather than A-Mutamid’s poetry or his relationship with Silves. Seeking to portray the planned homage as an affront to the (Christian) Algarve and Portugal, it describes the plaque as ‘vexatoria para o pensamento português e ofensiva para o brio dos algarvios’.⁸⁰ Using a predominantly sarcastic tone, Cabrita also includes personal attacks on Blas Infante, describing him as an ‘ilustre desconhecido [...] que vive ao modo islamita’. Cabrita asserts, without providing justification, that the poverty of the Algarve region is largely the fault of Andalusia.⁸¹ The proposed homage itself is described as an act of ‘subservencia intelectual, pois a ideia partiu do estrangeiro’ and even the fact that

⁷⁷ Cabrita, *As bases históricas do regionalismo algarvio*, pp. 21, 24.

⁷⁸ Cabrita, *As bases históricas do regionalismo algarvio*, p. 26.

⁷⁹ Cabrita, ‘Uma marroquice em Silves’, *A Voz*, 12 July 1928, p. 1, 6; ‘Uma Marroquice: A Lápide Muçulmanista de Silves’, *A Voz*, 21 July 1928, p. 4.

⁸⁰ Cabrita, ‘Uma marroquice em Silves’, p. 6. References that follow in this section will be in the body of the text.

⁸¹ Cabrita may well have meant ‘Al-Andalus’ rather than ‘Andalusia’ here.

the tiles for the plaque are Sevillian is seen as unsatisfactory: 'una subservencia artistica, pois representa a expansão duma industria tradicional estrangeira' (1).

Cabrita's first article is also an assertion of a narrow conception of Portuguese identity, linking race with religion. Describing the Portuguese as being 'uma raça fundamentalmente cristã', Cabrita associates the Christian reconquest with moral progress (abolishing eunuchs, slavery and improving the position of women). He also fears that the homage would mean that 'o estrangeiro nos tome por beduinos', citing an imaginary label in an international exhibition: '*travaux des savages de l'Algarve*' (1). This reveals an anxiety about Portugal's status in relation to French culture, with the denial of Islamic cultural heritage being seen as necessary in order to be taken seriously by Portugal's Northern neighbours.

Cabrita next turns his attention to Al-Mutamid, attacking both his personality and legacy. It is somewhat ironic that one of his points of attack is that Al-Mutamid is unknown in the Algarve, since Carvalho had used the same point to argue that the homage was needed to put right a historic wrong. Describing Al-Mutamid as 'mosárabe' (in the sense that they believed he would have been of mixed heritage rather than that he was Christian), Cabrita argues that the poet 'consustancia o muçulmanismo, de tal forma ele cantou o amor cortesão, o amor-pôdre, o amor-harem' (1). As such he relies on a moral argument associating Al-Mutamid with the perceived moral degeneration of the harem. As we saw in Chapter 2, the harem had long obsessed Orientalist writers, tending to produce reactions of both attraction and repulsion, and was perceived as a marker of cultural difference between Islamic and Christian cultures. Cabrita completes his personal attack on Al-Mutamid by highlighting an episode discussed by the Spanish Arabist Julian Ribera y Tarragó, in which Al-Mutamid is alleged to have set out with an army to fight a battle, only for the enterprise to be abandoned in favour of drinking with

singers and courtesans.⁸² As such, Cabrita seeks to portray Al-Mutamid as a symbol of lax self-discipline, failing to carry out the duties demanded of his sex.

Cabrita's second article from 21 July continues to attack Al-Mutamid, arguing that he was a violent killer like his father, Al-Motadhid, and also reminding the reader that he killed Ibn Ammar.⁸³ Cabrita's argument is contradictory since he praises Ibn Ammar for being 'o maior poeta árabe "algarvio"' (the quotation marks tellingly indicate a hesitation over qualifying him as an Algarvian), and yet presumably Cabrita would not have been happy to see a homage to Ibn Ammar either, given Ibn Ammar's role as a military leader as well as a poet. This reinforces the impression that Cabrita is criticising Al-Mutamid for the sake of doing so, rather than putting forward a consistent position. Cabrita also critiques the adaptation of the verses to remove the reference to Ibn Ammar, portraying this as an attempt to cover up Al-Mutamid's actions towards his childhood friend.

The article mentioned by Boscaglia as being published under the name of João Blagues appeared a few weeks later, on 19 August, this time in *O Algarve*. In this article, Blagues dramatises an imagined conversation with the ghost of a medieval Christian warrior named Rui Vences, as a way of inviting the Portuguese reader to engage with the perspective of such warriors, whom he argues would have seen Al-Mutamid as nothing more than a deadly enemy. Blagues makes heavy use of sarcasm, for example he describes the experience of reading Carvalho's interview in the following way: 'com taes argumentos daquele distinto literato que, quando chegou ao fim, me parecia ser

⁸² In Carvalho's interview Blas Infante cites the work of the Spanish Arabist Julian Ribera y Tarragó in order to argue that the music of Al-Andalus had influenced European courtly music (Carvalho, p.5). Cabrita refutes this by arguing that these are Galician-Portuguese ballads, therefore revealing the supremacy of the Portuguese language rather than that of Andalusian music (Cabrita, 'Uma marroquice em Silves', p. 1).

⁸³ Cabrita, 'Uma Marroquice: A Lapide Muçulmanista de Silves', p. 4.

mouro tambem, apesar de ter nascido no Porto da Cal'. Blagues glorifies the Christian soldiers, describing them as '[aqueles] velhos guerreiros fortes e rudes como as penedias das serras, que houvesse encontrado morte gloriosa sob as muralhas de Silves, lutando pela fé cristã e pela grandeza da raça'.⁸⁴ He thus projects an idealised conception of medieval chivalry onto ordinary soldiers caught up in sieges and battles. The name Rui Vences is seemingly a play on words since the Portuguese verb 'vencer' means to win or conquer, although Blagues provides him with a backstory, saying he was killed during the taking of Silves by Sancho I.

Though Blagues has Rui Vences describe the 'sarracenos' as brave and pious, they are also portrayed as beasts: 'Mas o que eles eram todos é o que ainda hoje devem ser – feras com figura de gente, feras de instintos mais barbaros que os tigres. Raça maldita!'. This graphic animalisation of the Muslim soldiers, employing the Orientalist stereotype which associated Muslims with excessive cruelty, is made worse by its extension in the first part of the statement to modern-day Muslims, suggesting that such behaviour is racially rather than historically conditioned. Having not known any Moors personally, the figure of Rui Vences questions whether even their names matter: 'Nomes de Mouros? Para quê? Que me importavam os nomes dos serracenos [*sic.*]?' Vences's argument here anticipates the strategy of dehumanisation (rather than outright erasure) of the Moors, which as we saw earlier became the strategy of Estado Novo. Having earlier described Infante as 'o sarraceno Blas Infante', thereby extending the terminology of the Crusades to refer to the present day, the article ends with his 'espírito guia' telling him that there is no point hearing Al-Mutamid's opinion: 'O Motamid já foi ouvido pelo "Diario de Noticias". Reincarnou no Blas Infante'.⁸⁵ Though the statement is

⁸⁴ João Blagues, 'Uma lápide em Silves', *O Algarve*, 19 August 1928, p. 1.

⁸⁵ Blagues, 'Uma lápide em Silves', p. 1.

not necessarily intended to be taken seriously, it is a further attempt to undermine Blas Infante's project, by portraying him merely as a vessel for Al-Mutamid's self-promotion.

It is clear not only from Infante's account but also the responses to Cabrita that more articles critical to the homage were published, not least by Cabrita himself. However, in the context of this study it is also important to now examine articles in defence of the homage project, written by Pedro Judice, Francisco Fernandes Lopes and Consiglieri Sá Pereira. Again, here, the material selected is not exhaustive, but is sufficient to demonstrate the Algarvian intellectuals' capacity for resistance in the face of an assault on their values and on the legacy of Al-Mutamid by the *cabritenses*.

A first response to Cabrita's initial article came from Francisco Fernandes Lopes (1884-1969), a Doctor and amateur historian based in Olhão. He is viewed as a 'prominent local figure' by Ricardo Agarez, who has researched the long-lasting impact on metropolitan scholars of Lopes' writings in the 1940s on the *açoteia*, an architectural feature found in Olhão which was a source of debate over its possible Moorish origins from the 1930s to 1960s.⁸⁶ Fernandes Lopes' response to Cabrita's article took the form of a letter to a friend, Alvaro de Lemos, which was published in *Correio do Sul* on 22 July and also in the Silves-based *Voz do Sul* on 29 July 1928. Here he offers a detailed and scathing response to what he describes as 'o delirante artigo de "A Voz"', attacking Cabrita's integrity as a scholar and denouncing the inaccuracy of his historical analysis. Having noted the contradictions in Cabrita's published pamphlet that I identified earlier, he goes on to counter Cabrita's assertion that Al-Mutamid was only interested in 'o amôr-harem [sic.]', using verses written by Al-Mutamid about his son Abu Haxim and his daughters as evidence that Al-Mutamid also had a deep paternal love for his children.

⁸⁶ Ricardo Agarez, pp. 29, 35, 39-42. See also António Paula Brito, 'Francisco Fernandes Lopes' <http://www.olhaocubista.pt/personalidades/francico_fernandes_lopes.htm> [accessed 12 July 2019].

He also exposes the hypocrisy of Cabrita's complaint about the social mores of medieval Islamic culture, citing the historical use of slaves and eunuchs in Christian cultures.⁸⁷

Furthermore, Fernandes Lopes acknowledges that some readers may disagree with the format of the planned commemoration, or indeed with the 'andaluzismo (puramente espiritual, embora) do sr. Blaz Infante' –the brackets indicating that Fernandes Lopes himself has doubts about Infante's justifications here. Nonetheless, he argues, the 'discordancia' of Cabrita's arguments objecting to the homage to Al-Mutamid is something else entirely. Opposing the use of Sevillian tiles is an untenable position, given that Portuguese palaces are full of Spanish tiles. He also takes issue with the use of the term 'marroquice', not only for being pejorative, but, as he sees it, inaccurate, given that Blas Infante is Andalusian and Al-Mutamid is 'o simbolo do puro *arabismo* andaluz'. And in a postscriptum, Fernandes Lopes criticises *A Voz* for publishing a further article (a 'manifesto cabrítico') on 18 July on its front page, stating that the paper is serving as an 'instrumento á furia anti-muçulmanista do academico Cabrita' and that the article 'falseia a verdade historica'. In order to counter this misleading of the public, Lopes writes that he will ask the daughter of Oliveira Parreira to authorise a new edition of *Os Luso-Árabes*, 'que todo o Algarve lerá com proveito e gôso'.⁸⁸ Particularly, he advocates that the public read the novel in order to learn about Ibn Ammar's treachery towards Al-Mutamid and have more understanding as to why Al-Mutamid was driven to kill him. Whilst it is unclear whether Fernandes Lopes went any further with his efforts to have *Os Luso-Árabes* republished, no new edition of the novel was commissioned.

⁸⁷ Francisco Fernandes Lopes, 'A Lapide de Silves ao rei-poeta arabe Al-Motamid', *Correio do Sul*, 22 July 1928, pp. 1-2 (p. 1); 'A Lapide de Silves ao rei-poeta arabe Al-Motamid', *Voz do Sul*, 29 July 1928, pp. 1, 4. References are to the first version, published in *Correio do Sul*.

⁸⁸ Fernandes Lopes, 'A Lapide de Silves ao rei-poeta arabe Al-Motamid', pp. 1-2.

Fernandes Lopes responded scathingly to Cabrita's second article (of 21 July) with a second letter himself, in which refers to Cabrita as 'dementado' and to his output as 'prosa paranoica'. Here he quotes various extracts on Al-Mutamid's character from *Os Luso-Árabes* (Oliveira Parreira describes Al-Mutamid as being kind and tender in nature, only twice losing his temper) and suggests that two full chapters of *Os Luso-Árabes* should be published in the *Correio do Sul*, since 'Oliveira Parreira *romanceou*, por forma tão interessante e viva, a verdade historica das derradeiras scenas entre Ibn Ammar e Motamid' (Fernandes Lopes' emphasis). He also quotes Athaide Oliveira's damning assessment of Ibn Ammar's treacherous personality from his *Monografia de Estombar*.⁸⁹ Finally, he exposes the hypocrisy of Cabrita's selective moral outrage over Al-Mutamid, reminding the reader that Alfonso VI of León (1040-1109) was already married to Constance of Burgundy when he fathered a child (Sancho Alfónsez) with Zaida (whom Fernandes Lopes describes as Al-Mutamid's daughter, but who is now considered more likely to have been his daughter-in-law).⁹⁰

In the same edition of *Correio do Sul* from 29 July there also appeared a letter from Pedro Judice, who then continued to respond weekly to the *cabritenses* until the end of August 1928. In the 29 July issue, Judice sets the record straight by clarifying that contrary to what has been asserted by Fernandes Lopes and others, the idea for the plaque was not his but Infante's, whom he had not met in person but had been introduced to via correspondence by a certain Miguel Ortigão. Though an enthusiastic collaborator, he had been happy to take a step back once other entities had become involved. He also writes that Carvalho was sent by the *Diario de Noticias* to Silves to

⁸⁹ Oliveira Parreira 1898, I, p. 59; Francisco Xavier de Athaide Oliveira, *Monografia de Estombar: Concelho de Lagoa* (Porto: Typ. Universal, 1911).

⁹⁰ Fernandes Lopes, 'A homenagem de Silves a Motamid, rei-poeta arabe', *Correio do Sul*, 29 July 1928, p. 2.

meet the previous Comissão Administrativa in order to organise the festivities.⁹¹ Seeing Blas Infante's involvement as a positive wind blowing from Spain, he denounces the opposition to the homage as coming from what he calls 'reacionarismo ultramontano' (this refers to a reactionary political form of Catholicism). He also adds that he has read in the Lisbon papers that three beautiful women 'de letras' were currently being driven around the world looking for the origins of the *1001 Nights*, themselves interested in the very Arab civilisation 'em que principalmente nós, algarvios, muito temos que aprender'.⁹² As we can see, Judice considers that the planned homage would allow Silves to be in tune with efforts at the time to trace the origins of the stories, and concurrently to better understand the influence of Arab civilisation on European culture.

Judice's weekly counterattacks continued in *Voz do Sul*, where in an article published on 5 August he asserts that Cabrita's pamphlet on Andalusian regionalism had not sold a single copy in Silves.⁹³ Not considering Cabrita's family funding to be sufficient to cover the costs of such a publication, he suspects Cabrita of having received funding for his publication from the *talassaria* (a group of reactionary monarchists) and the *ultramontanistas* in Coimbra.⁹⁴ Attacking Cabrita's credentials, he claims that despite having access to the best library in Portugal, in Coimbra, and to the academics there, his is still no match for Dr Fernandes Lopes (a medical doctor), himself a walking library. His article is therefore also a defence of the Algarve's intellectuals who were amateur historians, in the face of critical and reactionary voices from the establishment. Claiming

⁹¹ N.B. Pedro Judice refers to Alfredo de Carvalho as 'Nunes de Carvalho'.

⁹² Pedro Judice, 'A homenagem de Silves a Motamid, rei-poeta arabe', *Correio do Sul*, 29 July 1928, p. 2. I have not yet tracked down who the women referred to here were.

⁹³ Judice, 'A lápide de Silves ao rei-poeta arabe Al-Motamid', *Voz do Sul*, 5 August 1928, p. 4.

⁹⁴ Judice also uses the term 'talassaria' to refer to the group of reactionaries who opposed the Portuguese Republic.

that the plaque is ‘sem significado politica nem religiosa’, he frames the homage as a tribute to Algarvian greatness, describing it as an ‘homenagem a esse periodo aureo da civilização algarvia, em que Silves foi a primeira cidade da Espanha muçulmana’. Finally, Judice makes the point that in the Portuguese territories there are ‘não poucos muçulmanos’, Muslims whose ideas, he argues, should be respected by the Portuguese government.

Judice displays his pro-Republican views overtly by ending with the exclamation ‘Alerta, republicanos!’ He is therefore effectively arguing that the homage itself is apolitical, whilst supporting it with a pro-Republican stance, and opposing the narrow, centralised, nationalist view of conservative monarchists. Certainly, Judice’s writing differs from Fernandes Lopes in that it contains a more politicised analysis of Algarvian identity. For example, he cites the fact that the *talassaria* received a very low number of votes in Silves in the last elections and refers to the Algarve as ‘esta terra essencialmente liberal’ and to Silves as ‘[a] liberal cidade the Silves’. In this way, he positions the liberal attitudes (for the time) of Al-Mutamid’s rule as being an important point of reference for an Algarve that he sees as being inherently liberal.

Judice’s article from 12 August picks up the debate by arguing that the polemic over the plaque has done some good, ‘tendo chamado a atenção da imprensa da capital e da provincia para o estudo da civilização muçulmana’, but that it could yield still better fruits ‘se toda a imprensa algarvia compreendesse que está nisto uma boa maneira de fazer regionalismo’.⁹⁵ This statement comes across as forward-thinking today, considering the efforts made by the Algarve tourist industry over recent decades to capitalise on the region’s history of Islamic presence. Judice continues by reminding the

⁹⁵ Judice, ‘Civilização Muçulmana’, *Voz do Sul*, 12 August 1928, p. 4.

reader of Herculano's realisation of the need to study the period before the Kingdom of Portugal came into being. However, he argues, Herculano did have an anti-Muslim bias, citing Oliveira Parreira's introduction to *Os Luso-Árabes* in which Oliveira Parreira complains that such bias: 'leva muitos a considerar como estrangeiros os filhos do nosso solo'.⁹⁶ Judice further emphasises that 'Não só viveram no terreno que hoje pisamos, mas foram naturalmente os nossos ascendentes', emphasising a genetic link that other commentators were not yet willing to acknowledge. He cites Oliveira Parreira's complaint that most Algarvians knew nothing about the important Muslim figures born in the Gharb Al-Andalus, not even their names.⁹⁷ As we have seen, these were, of course, points that had also been addressed in *Alma Algarvia*, with which Judice had been involved as editor and then director. Judice ends by suggesting that since Arab civilisation was superior to the Portuguese civilisation at that time, then the reconquest itself could be 'o motivo da decadencia de Silves desde então'. As such, his final statement challenges Cabrita's earlier assertion that the Algarve's poverty was somehow the fault of Andalusia.⁹⁸ However, by setting up a contrast between Arab and Portuguese civilisations, he inadvertently falls into the linguistic trap of not including the Arab-Islamic culture of Silves within a concept of Portuguese civilisation, despite believing it to be so.

Judice's next instalment, an article published on 19 August, responds to a later article by Cabrita dated 7 August and published in *A Voz*, in particular Cabrita's assessment of Al-Mutamid's legendarily cruel father, Al-Mutadid, arguing that we should not judge the son based on the sins of the father. As a comparable example, he

⁹⁶ Oliveira Parreira 1898, I, p. IX.

⁹⁷ Oliveira Parreira, I, p. X.

⁹⁸ Cabrita, 'Uma marroquice em Silves', p. 1. As mentioned previously, Cabrita may well have meant 'Al-Andalus' rather than 'Andalusia'.

offers that of the conflict between the first King of Portugal, Afonso I and his mother, therefore demonstrating Cabrita's bias. He also makes the following point: 'O facto de se defender a memoria de Motamid, aliás defendido por todos os historiadores, não destroi a hipótese de ele ter defeitos próprios da época, em que viveu'.⁹⁹ In this way he exposes the unrealistic moral standards set by the *cabritenses* for Al-Mutamid, and which his article suggests are set purely for the sake of attacking the homage event to benefit their own self-serving agenda.

The final article by Judice to be discussed here was published on 26 August 1928.¹⁰⁰ Here he provides further details with regard to the superiority of Arab civilisation at this point in medieval history, and continues by asserting that the opposition to the homage is no less than '[uma] explosão de odio religioso, ou para melhor dizermos pseudo-religioso', in other words, a case of Islamophobia. He further denounces 'a sem razão dos que à falta de argumentos pretendem vencer pela gritaria, escondendo no seu intimo o desejo de fazer regressar a sociedade portuguesa aos tempos de D. João III'.¹⁰¹ This amounts to an effective summary of Judice's position – exposing the weakness of the arguments of the *cabritenses* and their hidden political agenda. The reference to João III is also significant here as he was a figurehead for religious obscurantism and centralisation. Judice's article ends with the following suggestive statement in relation to João Blagues' article:

registamos o que lemos no ultimo numero de 'O Algarve' com o pseudonimo João Blagues. Nem carne, nem peixe, antes pelo contrario, ou antes carne, peixe e tudo o mais. Mas nós, que conhecemos os intuitos do *blagueur*, sabemos o que aquilo quere dizer.

Distanced from the event as we are now, it is difficult to grasp all the implications of Judice's statement, for example, whether he is implying that João Blagues is a

⁹⁹ Pedro Judice, 'Ainda Al-Motamid', *Voz do Sul*, 19 August 1928, p. 4.

¹⁰⁰ Pedro Judice, 'A Autópsia Continúa', *Voz do Sul*, 26 August 1928, p. 4.

¹⁰¹ These adherents were also known as *integralistas*, a term that Judice also employs in his articles.

pseudonym for Carlos Pedro Cabrita or for another individual. Judice's play on words implying a link between Blagues' surname and French word *blagueur* meaning 'joker' is clear, but the 'sabemos o que aquilo quere dizer' is rather more cryptic, but perhaps suggestive of a hidden and destructive agenda below the surface of Blagues' imagined conversation with the spirit of a Portuguese Christian warrior.

The articles by Lopes and Judice are characterised by a particular confidence and do not hint at any moment that the homage event might not come to fruition. In contrast, it is worth examining a later article published in *Voz do Sul* in October and authored by Consiglieri de Sá Pereira, who, as mentioned previously, was the Portuguese consul in Ayamonte, and helped to arrange Carvalho's visit to Blas Infante's house on Isla Cristina.¹⁰² Carvalho also describes Sá Pereira in the interview write-up as a 'jornalista original e combativo, cuja obra ficou dispersa no grande jornalismo de Lisboa'.¹⁰³ Sá Pereira mentions that discussion about the homage is still ongoing at this point (October 1928) in the *Diario de Lisboa*. The plan for the homage is attributed to 'um grupo de intelectuais andaluzes' rather than only Blas Infante, perhaps in an attempt to dispel the negative publicity that had arisen from Infante's association with the homage. Sá Pereira recommends that his readers consult the Portuguese translation of Reinhart Dozy's *Histoire des Musulmans d'Espagne*, seeing Dozy's authority as indisputable, and citing his tribute to Al-Mutamid's sensitive and poetic soul. He argues that given Al-Mutamid's evident love for Silves and the Algarve, as seen in the frequency of evocations to them in his poetry, the homage should be seen as an '[a]cto despido de qualquer outra intenção, de essencia puramente espiritual'. Sá Pereira also acknowledges the importance of the official support of the Municipio de Silves, who, in

¹⁰² Luis Consiglieri Sá Pereira, 'A tradição mussulmana portuguesa: Os intelectuais andaluzes ofereceram á cidade de Silves uma lapide que está esquecida ou perdida', *Voz do Sul*, 17 October 1928, p. 4.

¹⁰³ Carvalho, p. 1.

relation to Al-Mutamid, 'entendeu e muito bem, dever dar caracter officioso a essa consagração da memoria'. Mentioning the names of particular Andalusian academics who were designated to act as representatives of their organisations at the homage, Sá Pereira thus asks:

Não será esta demora, este esquecimento, esta indiferença, um pouco – lamentável? A que razões obedece a comissão administrativa do município de Silves, para um procedimento que abrangendo o nome da nossa Patria desagradavelmente impressiona alguns dos melhores valores intelectuais do país visinho?

As a consul, Pereira would have been particularly sensitive to the negative impression that the delay on the Portuguese side was giving to the Spanish entities involved (Spain was at this time under the authoritarian rule of Primo de Rivera), or else he wished to incite such anxiety in order to encourage steps to be taken to finish organising the homage. Acknowledging that the homage has been 'catalogado de ofensivo dos sentimentos catolicos do país', and ironically describing this as a resurrection of the 'luta entre a Cruz e o Crescente', he notes that in Spain there are a number of official institutions, such as the *Centro de Estudios Historicos*, engaged in Islamic Studies, despite Spain having Catholicism as its official religion. These include a number of priests, who are nevertheless engaged in bringing to light 'uma cultura obscurecida e em grande parte destruida por anteriores gerações – que com a ignorancia acumulavam o pecado da intolerancia'.¹⁰⁴ Pereira's final point is that examples such as these should be enough to convince the Catholics of Silves that participating in the homage would not go against any of the canons of their religion.

A number of conclusions emerge from this examination of the Silves controversy. Firstly, the debate became a war of values between reactionaries from the establishment and pro-Republican intellectuals, including amateur historians, from the

¹⁰⁴ Sá Pereira, p. 4.

Algarve. Though it may perhaps be surprising to see such overtly pro-Republican sentiments being voiced in 1928, we must remember that censorship was not yet in place at this point. Though the homage event was ultimately cancelled, the resistance offered by Fernandes Lopes, Judice and Pereira reveals the determination of Algarvian intellectuals to fight for the tradition of celebrating the Algarve's Arab-Islamic heritage, a tradition that had been established over several decades. As we have seen, references to and the promotion of Oliveira Parreira's novel, as a landmark in the history of representations of Gharb Al-Andalus, was a recurrent feature of the discourse defending this tradition and arguing for its continued relevance. As we shall see in the next part, certain Algarvian intellectuals would continue their project by exerting influence over travel writers.

Part 3: The Forgotten 'Orient' in the Writing of Travellers to Portugal in the 1930s

The period 1900-1926 was not a prolific one for travel writing in English (or French) on Portugal. There were restrictions on travel during the period of the First World War (1914-18), which explains the lack of published travelogues in this period, but more research is needed to determine why so few travel accounts were written in the 1900s, for example.¹⁰⁵ In the early twentieth century the Algarve continued to be difficult for most travellers to access by land: as we saw previously, the railway line to Lisbon was not completed until 1906, and, as Agarez notes, '[m]odern roads date to as late as 1932 (the central route from Faro to Beja in Alentejo), 1936 (the western littoral route) and 1947 (the eastern, Guadiana route)'.¹⁰⁶ One of the few British travelogues on

¹⁰⁵ Fussell, p. 19.

¹⁰⁶ Agarez, p. 23. See Mariano Feio, *Le Bas Alentejo et l'Algarve* (Coimbra: Coimbra Editorial, 1949).

Portugal from the 1900s is Gilbert Watson's *Sunshine and Sentiment in Portugal* (1904), which details the author's journey to the Alentejo and Algarve with the palaeontologist Professor Hans Hadow to search for prehistoric remains.¹⁰⁷ It includes a trip to Mértola (Alentejo), rare for the time, but due to the particular interests of the writer it does not reflect on the traces of Islamic heritage in southern Portugal. The coast of the Algarve was not yet popular with travellers, either domestic or foreign, in fact, as Agarez writes: '[I]acking transport infrastructure and facilities, peripheral Algarve missed the turn-of-the century elite travelling vogue and the ensuing popularisation of the sea-side'.¹⁰⁸ It also lacked sophisticated seaside resorts, at least in comparison to other options in the Mediterranean such as the French Riviera.¹⁰⁹

Though the First World War stalled the production of European travel writing, a notable account, Aubrey Bell's *Portugal of the Portuguese*, was published in 1915, offering a view of Portuguese daily life under the First Republic.¹¹⁰ More travelogues started to appear after the Coup d'Etat of 1926, with British travelogues, in particular, proliferating in the 1930s (at least eight accounts were published). The Coup d'Etat led to the so-called *Ditadura Nacional*, the precursor to the *Estado Novo*, a corporatist authoritarian regime ruled by António Oliveira de Salazar, who became Prime Minister in 1932 and remained so until 1968. The largely positive reception of Salazarist Portugal in Britain conferred respectability onto Portugal from the early 1930s, whilst on the

¹⁰⁷ Gilbert Watson, *Sunshine and Sentiment in Portugal* (London: Edward Arnold, 1904). Also published in the 1910s was Martin Andrew Sharp Hume's *Through Portugal* (London: E.G. Richards, 1907). Hume was an English historian who had spent time living in Spain and had Spanish relatives. His account has the particularity of giving a view Portugal as seen through a Castilian lens. It is not discussed in detail here as the author does not dwell on Portugal's history of Islamic presence.

¹⁰⁸ Agarez, p. 45.

¹⁰⁹ Calado, p. 22.

¹¹⁰ Aubrey Bell, *Portugal of the Portuguese* (London: Isaac Pitman & Sons Ltd., 1915).

other, the Spanish Civil War (1936-1939) had the effect of making Portugal post-1936 seem, by comparison, a safer Iberian destination.

Though the *Sociedade de Propaganda de Portugal*, which aimed to promote Portugal as a tourist destination, had been founded in 1906, by the 1930s Portugal was still not seen as somewhere that was on the regular tourist map. It was therefore sought above all by travellers who wanted to spend little money or who wanted to get off the beaten track and go somewhere that wasn't on conventional tourist routes, as Ana Calado notes.¹¹¹ There was a sense at this time that a lot of the world had already been explored, prompting a desire to seek out territories that had been overlooked. Portugal offered travellers the opportunity, as Carl Thompson has written in relation to late-modern travel writing more generally, 'to access the authentically Other and visit places and cultures still untouched by modernity' (2011: 124).

For the first wave of these travellers to Portugal, it was hard to find up-to-date information. Philip Marden, who published an account entitled *A Wayfarer in Portugal* (1927), writes:

so difficult is it to find even a guide-book relating to this country which is not at least a dozen years out of date that I have included what may seem to the casual reader much that savours of undue particularity.¹¹²

Travellers often deliberately sought out parts of Portugal to which previous travel writers had given little attention, including the Algarve and Alentejo regions in the South. In comparison to nineteenth-century travel writing, 1930s writers favoured simpler architectural styles – something that these regions, in particular, offered. Their

¹¹¹ Ana Calado, *O Portugal de Salazar visto de uma varanda transmontana* (Lisbon: Centro de Estudos Anglo-Portugueses, 2005), p. 67. On this idea, Carl Thompson writes: 'some travellers will make a great show of the extent to which they journeyed 'off the beaten track', thereby avoiding tourists and the infrastructure that supports them. It is only by this means, it is frequently suggested, that one can access the authentically Other and visit places and cultures still untouched by modernity'. Carl Thompson, *Travel Writing* (London: Routledge, 2011), p. 124.

¹¹² Philip Marden, *A Wayfarer in Portugal, with twenty-six illustrations and a paper map* (London: Unwin Brothers Ltd., 1927), Preface, p v.

taste can be linked to the contemporary aesthetic shift towards architectural modernism, and meant that such writers would sometimes also express a dislike for the eclecticism of high orientalism. As Jan and Cora Gordon mention in their account of Sintra:

Portugal is filled with such fine domestic architecture. We do not refer to the over-decorated monstrosities of Manueline exuberance like the wedding-cake house at Cintra or the Palace Hotel at Bussaco, but to the little bits of simple, homely building.¹¹³

In terms of appreciating Portugal's Islamic cultural heritage, this was a favourable tendency, because it became less important that Portugal could not boast such architectural wonders as the Alhambra Palace or the Great Mosque of Córdoba, since traces of Islamic culture that were of equal interest could be found on a smaller scale.

When the Gordons enter the Algarve they write:

Here the land became almost wholly Arabic [...] The women's faces are still veiled from the gaze of the inquisitive stranger. All along the road you meet these European bedouin, and the motor-bus at last brings you into their town of Olhão, which might have been plucked from any desert's edge, and for sheer starkness of architecture could give points to many a young architect priding himself on the functional use of materials.¹¹⁴

The Gordons are here of course referring to the use of the *bioco*, the long veil worn by women in parts of the Algarve until the 1890s. Despite being outlawed in the district of Faro in 1892, the *bioco* did not immediately disappear, its usage being entrenched in parts of the population, who managed to circumvent the law. In fact, it was still worn in the town of Olhão until the mid-1930s, as mentioned in Chapter 1.¹¹⁵ In this extract, the Gordons combine an appreciation of Orientalised cultural traces with, as Agarez notes,

¹¹³ Jan and Cora Gordon, *Portuguese Somersault*, Illustrated by the Authors (London: George G. Harrap & Co. Ltd., 1934), p. 224. Ronald Bodley, who visited Sintra in 1940, also describes Pena Palace in the following manner: 'This baroque monstrosity was erected in 1841 by Dom Fernando of Saxe-Coburg-Gotha, on the site of what was, first of all, a Moorish mosque and then a convent [...]. The Portuguese guide book states that the Coburg castle is in a superb Gotho-Arabic style, but it is a pity that the architect did not take his life before ruining what must have been two unique buildings.' In Bodley's case, it may also be that anti-German sentiment contributed to his interpretation here. Ronald Bodley, *Flight into Portugal: The dramatic story of an Englishman's escape from Paris to Lisbon* (Tiptree, Essex: Anchor Press, 1941), p. 82.

¹¹⁴ Jan and Cora Gordon, p. 212.

¹¹⁵ See Revez, 'A *burqa* também existiu no Algarve'.

a projection of their (modernist) references onto what they saw, 'prompted not only by their own impression but also by existing accounts'.¹¹⁶

Agarez's study, *Algarve Building*, includes a detailed and insightful analysis of travel accounts on the Algarve from the 1930s. He notes that: 'from the 1930s on, travel guides were published in English, aimed [...] at the adventurous traveller. This self-sufficient tourist [...] was mirrored in the authors, self-styled as explorers in an exotic land'. The genre here was that of the 'edited travelogue', 'simulating the notebook where the traveller documented his journey', and sometimes accompanied by hand drawings.¹¹⁷ The 1930s has been portrayed by Paul Fussell as a Golden Age of British travel writing, and in such a crowded genre each writer attempted to distinguish their own travel account by adding a particular perspective, whether through the themes discussed, the traveller's itinerary or their approach or mode of travel.¹¹⁸

Although there are some exceptions, many authors of the 1930s travelogues could not speak Portuguese, which may have contributed to the layering effect identified by Agarez, in which writers read other recently written accounts on the same places they were visiting and therefore arrived with particular expectations and a lens informed by prior reading.¹¹⁹ Nonetheless, this layering effect has also been seen by critics as occurring more generally in travel writing, whatever the region. Agarez suggests, furthermore, that: 'the effect of consecutive experience of the same place based on previous readings was that of a magnifying lens that tended to augment and crystallise stereotypes'. He does not, however, wish to suggest that foreign travellers set the tone for the discourse on the Algarve in the 1930s. On the contrary, his research,

¹¹⁶ Agarez, p. 49.

¹¹⁷ Agarez, p. 45.

¹¹⁸ Fussell, p. 247.

¹¹⁹ Agarez, p. 49.

using the town of Olhão as a specific example, demonstrates how key Algarvian intellectuals were able to influence metropolitan discourse, both domestic and foreign, on the Algarve. He points out that three guidebooks were published in advance of the 1929 Iberian-American exhibition in Seville, attempting 'to promote and support touring in nearby Algarve'. As guidebooks, these accounts would have focused on providing information on the region that would be useful to a traveller, whereas the personal experiences of the writer would not be evident as they would be in a travelogue. The works in question were a French-language guidebook published in 1928, followed in 1929 by a Portuguese monograph authored by Mário Lyster Franco (1902-1984), 'a local intellectual, lawyer, journalist, mayor and councillor of Faro', and also an English-language monograph by César Pereira dos Santos, the British vice-consul in Faro and Tavira.¹²⁰

Though Pereira dos Santos' volume was 'a modest endeavour, an assortment of geographic, economic and tourism-related data', Agarez argues that Lyster Franco's text, which was 'part of an official series on the country's provinces, set the tone for many subsequent portraits of the region'. In what amounted to a 'biased view of the region's towns', Lyster Franco promoted some 'while deriding others and established an enduring menu for the picturesque, sellable Algarve'. Those towns derided by Franco included Vila Real de Santo António and Tavira, while Olhão was particularly praised for having an appearance which was both Cubist and Moroccan, simultaneously traditional, original and modern. Franco was to repeat the same formula in later texts from the 1930s and 1940s, thus creating 'a single inextricable discourse to be replicated in

¹²⁰ Agarez p. 45. Sociedade de Propaganda de Portugal, *Algarve* ([Paris] [n. pub.], [1928]); Mario Lyster Franco, *O Algarve* (Lisbon: Imp. Nacional, 1929); César Pereira dos Santos, *Monography of Algarve* (Faro: Tip. União, 1929).

national and foreign accounts'.¹²¹ Agarez's assertion is easily corroborated: John Gibbons mentions Lyster Franco's 'scholarly little treatise' and praises him for being 'the almost permanent Mayor' of Faro, a 'scholar' and one of the city's 'great men' in his 1936 travelogue, whilst the Brazilian anthropologist Gilberto Freyre, visiting the Algarve in the early 1950s, describes Lyster Franco taking on the role of his personal guide to the Algarve's Moorishness: 'Refiro-me ao advogado Mário Lyster Franco, que muito fez para desencantar, diante de nossos olhos de brasileiros, mistérios mouros que o Algarve não costuma abrir aos olhos dos turistas'.¹²²

Finally, Agarez's research is useful in its analysis of the style of the travel accounts from this period. Agarez notes that the 'edited travelogue' was used as an: 'appropriate genre to report an essentially sensorial, impressionistic experience'. In *Travel Writing Studies* the modernist period is associated with experimental British travel writing by writers such as Evelyn Waugh, Graham Greene, W. H. Auden, Rebecca West and others. However, in the context of travel writing on Portugal the picture is slightly different. The style identified by Agarez is a particular form of modernism that takes inspiration from both nineteenth-century Impressionism and Orientalism: 'Built objects, human subjects, costumes and landscapes were included in a painterly portrait that evoked Impressionist art and the Orientalist curiosity feeding artists and travellers in the previous century'.¹²³ The Orientalist slant of some British travel writers should not come totally as a surprise,

¹²¹ Agarez, pp. 45-46.

¹²² John Gibbons, *Playtime in Portugal. An unconventional guide to the Algarves* (London: Methuen & Co., 1936), p. 3, 128. Gilberto Freyre, *Aventura e Rotina: sugestões de uma viagem à procura de constantes portuguesas de carácter e ação*, 3rd edn (Rio de Janeiro: Topbooks, 2001 [1st edn 1953]), p. 122. The case of Gilberto Freyre is interesting because he came to Portugal in order to gain insights into his own country, Brazil –and Portugal's Moorish past is highly relevant to Freyre's theories about the positive effects of miscegenation in Brazil.

¹²³ Agarez, p. 45.

given that we have already seen a different earlier example of Spanish modernist Orientalism, in the shape of Blas Infante's play *Motamid, Último Rey de Sevilla* (1920).

My analysis will examine representations of Gharb Al-Andalus in selected travel accounts which engage specifically with this topic. I shall focus predominantly on John Gibbons' two accounts: *Afoot in Portugal* (1931) and *Playtime in Portugal: An unconventional guide to the Algarves* (1936), the latter being the only account to focus exclusively on the Algarve. So far, scholarship on Gibbons has tended to focus on his writing on the north of Portugal, the most complete study of the author and his work to date being Ana Calado's study from 2005, which focuses on Gibbons' third travelogue on Portugal, *I Gathered no Moss* (1939), an account of rural life in Trás-os-Montes in the early years of the Estado Novo. There have also been subsequent smaller-scale studies, such as Fátima Loureiro Matos' article from 2012.¹²⁴ I shall also examine Rodney Gallop's *Portugal, a book of folk-ways* (1936); American-born Alice Blight Lowther's *Moments in Portugal or the Land of the Laurel* (1939) and Rose Macaulay's later account *Fabled Shore: From the Pyrenees to Portugal* (1949), as well as referring in passing to other accounts from the period.¹²⁵

In terms of the representation of Gharb Al-Andalus, the first point to note is that a number of accounts, such as those of Marion F. Smithes and Douglas Goldring, included a chapter solely on Portuguese history to provide background and context for the reader.¹²⁶ These, rather inevitably, were selective, and often contained either pro-

¹²⁴ Fátima Loureiro Matos, 'A paisagem duriense a partir de uma obra de John Gibbons', *Revista da Faculdade de Letras – Geografia – Universidade do Porto*, 3: 1 (2012), 59-73. His account *Tramping Through Ireland* (London: Methuen, 1930) is briefly discussed in Glenn Hooper, 'The Isles/Ireland: The Wilder Shore', in *The Cambridge Companion to Travel Writing* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), pp. 174-190 (p. 186).

¹²⁵ Rose Macaulay, *Fabled Shore. From the Pyrenees to Portugal* (London: Hamish Hamilton, 1949).

¹²⁶ Marion F. Smithes, *Things Seen in Portugal, The garden of the west, a land of mountains and rivers, of the wine (...) many illustrations and a sketch map* (London: Seeley Service, 1931); Douglas Goldring, *To Portugal* (London: Rich and Corven Ltd., 1934).

Christian or anti-Muslim messages. Smithes writes, of the reconquest, that 'a flood of joyous Christianity followed the removal of the black cloud of Moors', here relying on a simplistic dichotomy (Christians good versus Moors bad).¹²⁷ In attempting to understand the position adopted in these accounts, it is helpful to bear in mind the shifting mood back home in Britain during this period. Though it would be a mistake to draw too sharp a distinction between the moods of the 1920s and 1930s, the 1920s had brought with it a cautious optimism after the end of the First World War. In the 1930s, on the other hand, the threat of world conflict brought with it an uncertainty that intensified as the decade drew on.¹²⁸ These feelings of insecurity led some writers of the period to search for a way of understanding the world that lay outside of conventional politics, either in radical socialism (in the case of George Orwell or Ralph Fox) or, in the case of more conservative writers, in religion, with writers such as Evelyn Waugh and Graham Greene converting to Catholicism. In the Portuguese context, where this more conservative angle prevailed amongst British travel writers, many sought to interpret part of the country's history into an ideological war between Christianity and Islam, strongly identifying with the Christian side. The Anglo-French writer and historian Hillaire Belloc, for example, published a travelogue entitled *Many Cities* in 1928, which covered parts of France, Spain and Greece and the cities of Viseu and Porto in Portugal. A Catholic (and also now widely viewed as being anti-semitic), Belloc included a chapter in the travelogue entitled 'Islam and Christendom' in which he described the medieval Islamic presence in Europe as a 'wound' from which Europe had only slowly recovered, further stating that 'half our civilisation was drowned under a Mohammedan deluge'.¹²⁹

¹²⁷ Smithes, p. 20.

¹²⁸ It is important to remember, nonetheless, that the 1920s was also a difficult decade for Britain, with a general strike being held in 1926 over wages and conditions for coal miners.

¹²⁹ Hillaire Belloc, *Many Cities* (London: Constable and Co., 1928), p. 71.

This phenomenon of interpreting a country's history as a war between Christianity and Islam was not limited to the Iberian context. To understand this, we only have to look at a work such as Rebecca West's *Black Lamb and Grey Falcon* (1941) on the history and culture of Yugoslavia, another territory with a history of Islamic presence, this time that of the Ottoman Empire.¹³⁰ As Bernard Schweizer writes, one of the reasons that West's account has been questioned by historians is its 'wholesale condemnation of Turkish rule', with Schweizer also drawing attention to the analogy she draws 'between England and Kosovo and between Turkish rule and Nazi oppression'.¹³¹

There is no simple rule of association between a writer's ideological position and their sympathy (of lack of) towards Islam. For example, Schweizer classes West as a leftist writer, despite her Islamophobic position. He does, however, see some patterns between writers' choice of destination and their ideological position:

Leftists tended to go to places that were embroiled in class struggles or engaged in antifascist resistance. It was [...] the Spanish trench, or the war-ravaged Balkans that attracted politically engaged leftists [...] Conservative travelers, on the other hand, tended to visit faraway places (mostly British colonies) that still exercised an exotic appeal.¹³²

Though Portugal was of course far closer to home, Schweizer's analysis might suggest that writers who sought the exotic at this time were likely to be conservative-minded rather than leftists. An exception is the communist writer Ralph Fox, whose account *Portugal Now* dates from 1937, though it is not a fruitful one for this study as Fox does not touch on the question of Islamic cultural traces in Portugal.¹³³

Not all British travel accounts on Portugal from the 1930s contain any detailed references to Al-Andalus. What is notable, compared to travel accounts from the

¹³⁰ Rebecca West, *Black Lamb and Grey Falcon*, 2 vols (London: Macmillan, 1941).

¹³¹ Bernard Schweizer, *Radicals on the Road: The Politics of English Travel Writing in the 1930s* (Charlottesville and London: University Press of Virginia, 2001), p. 137.

¹³² Schweizer, p. 174.

¹³³ Ralph Fox, *Portugal Now* (London: Lawrence and Wishart, 1937).

previous century, is that they often mention the fact that English crusaders assisted the Christians in the siege of Muslim-ruled Lisbon in 1147 as was standard in books offering a historical portrait of Portugal in the 1930s.¹³⁴ Calado sees the assistance of the crusaders in the siege of Lisbon as the first of a number of events mentioned in these accounts in which English involvement in Portuguese history is emphasised, serving to demonstrate the longstanding friendship between Britain and Portugal.¹³⁵ In general, in these accounts there is more recognition of the history of Islamic presence and its cultural legacy, suggesting that travel writing on Portugal had, in a sense, caught up with travel writing on Spain. Writers regularly notice and comment on such aspects as Arabic place names and were interested in the history of the Portuguese tiles.

Whilst most travel writers to Portugal in the 1930s tended to be upper class, John Stephen Reynolds Gibbons (1882-1949), the author of *Afoot in Portugal* (1931) and *Playtime in Portugal* (1936), was a middle-class professional travel writer.¹³⁶ Despite this difference in class, which may have implications for the author's worldview and style, Gibbons' discourse on Al-Andalus is mostly representative of other British travellers in the 1930s. As a young man Gibbons worked as a researcher in the British museum library and was unable to carry out his dream of travelling for economic reasons for the first half of his life.¹³⁷ His first paid piece of travel writing was an account of a trip to Lourdes undertaken for a religious magazine, which he later turned into a book.¹³⁸ It was here

¹³⁴ The key historical source for the Siege of Lisbon is the contemporary 'English' eyewitness account 'De Expugnatione Lyxbonensi', first published in Portuguese by Alexandre Herculano in the *Portugaliae Monumenta Historica* (1861) and in English translation in William Stubbs' *Chronicles and Memorials of the Reign of Richard I* (1864), cited in Livermore, 'The "Conquest of Lisbon" and its Author', *Portuguese Studies*, 6 (1990), 1-16 (p.1). For an early twentieth-century reference to the English crusaders' involvement, see George Young's *Portugal Old and Young: An Historical Study* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1917), pp. 62-3.

¹³⁵ Calado, p. 47.

¹³⁶ John Gibbons, *Afoot in Portugal* (London: George Newnes Ltd., 1931).

¹³⁷ Calado, p. 70.

¹³⁸ John Gibbons, *Tramping to Lourdes: being some account of the adventures that befell John Gibbons of Hornsey in Middlesex in a pilgrimage undertaken through Anjou and Anverne, Quercy, Béarn and Bigorre*

that he developed his characteristic simple, non-erudite and self-deprecating style, which he learnt to accompany with a dose of humour.¹³⁹

Gibbons' first trip to Portugal came in 1930, after he had visited and written on Ireland, Italy and central Europe. As was his habit, he avoided the places most commonly visited by tourists, choosing not to stay long in Lisbon.¹⁴⁰ He was in fact most attracted to exploring the area between Lagos, in the Algarve, and Setúbal (two hundred miles to the north and just south of Lisbon) due to the lack of railways and near absence of roads between the two.¹⁴¹ It was on this first trip to Portugal that Gibbons first fell in love with the town of Silves, describing it as follows:

Lying down a branch off the main line to Lisbon, next to nobody ever goes there, which in a way is a pity. It used in the old days to be the capital of the Moorish Kingdom, and right at the top of the hill you can see the old Arab castle. Then when you stand by the remains of its great red walls, you can see how from its position it would absolutely dominate the whole countryside. There are some huge reservoirs here, and the Moors built them so well that they are still partly in use. [...] Then only a little lower down the hill is what used to be a Mosque and when the Domination came to an end it was turned into a Cathedral. Also, the Portuguese to celebrate the freedom erected a great Crucifix. [...] It seems a pity that nobody goes to Silves.¹⁴²

As can be seen here, Gibbons uses loaded language in his narrative, such as the capitalised noun 'Domination', with its connotation of oppressive control, to describe the Islamic presence, combined with a reference to 'freedom' later in the paragraph to describe the reconquest. However, while Gibbons distances himself from Islam as a religion, and by implication as an oppressive political order, he admires Muslim architectural and scientific achievements, such as the building of reservoirs.

Gibbons returned to Portugal four years later, in 1934, at the invitation of the Algarve region's Comissões de Iniciativa de Turismo. He followed a similar route to his

with other foreign parts in the 47th year of his age, and in the year of Grace 1928 (London: Methuen & Co., 1929).

¹³⁹ Calado, pp. 72, 77.

¹⁴⁰ Calado, p. 78.

¹⁴¹ Gibbons, *Afoot in Portugal*, p. 46.

¹⁴² Gibbons, *Afoot in Portugal*, pp. 36-7.

first trip, visiting Faro, Lagos, and adding in Olhão and returning again to Silves, which left an even more lasting impression. In the closing pages of his account of this trip (*Playtime in Portugal*), he chooses to reminisce once more about the town:

There is a scent that if I shut my eyes I can sometimes recapture, and it is the scent of all those almond trees just coming to real life with the cool warmth of the southern evening. [...] I think that I should like to go and live in Silves.¹⁴³

Here, his ambivalence towards Muslim Silves is sublimated into an evocation of place, as an elusive object of sensual desire experienced at a distance.

The sentiments expressed by Gibbons on his first visit are somewhat echoed by Rose Macaulay (1881-1958) in her later travel account, *Fabled Shore* (1949). Macaulay had detailed knowledge of Portugal, having recently published a history of travellers to the country entitled *They went to Portugal* (1946), in which she describes twelfth-century Silves as ‘rich, beautiful and strong’.¹⁴⁴ In *Fabled Shore*, she too expresses pity towards the town’s reversal in fortunes over the years: ‘Poor Silves, once so rich, has been desolated and laid waste ever since it was first attacked by the Christian armies’. She does however note that Silves appears to be thriving again at the time of her visit, due to the presence of cork factories. Though she describes the castle as ‘a ghostly place’, overall, for Macaulay, Silves is a place that invites a longer stay: ‘One might spend a long time in Silves, climbing about its steep, winding Moorish streets among its flat-roofed houses, its gardens, its walls, its little squares’. The attraction of the town seems to lie partly in the quiet reflection it invites on its past status as capital of Gharb Al-Andalus. Macaulay goes further than Gibbons, however, in her detailed imagining of how Moorish Silves would have looked to the crusaders, informed by the reading of medieval chronicles:

¹⁴³ Gibbons, *Playtime in Portugal*, p. 180.

¹⁴⁴ Macaulay, *They went to Portugal* (London: Jonathan Cape, 1946), p. 29.

described by contemporary chroniclers as of shining whiteness, climbing its hill in three tiers of great guarding walls, [...] All about the white city were rich arcaded and terraced houses, arcaded streets of shops and small dwellings, mosques, climbing, twisting, narrow streets, and cool patios with cisterns and wells, and everywhere were gardens, orchards, orange groves, palms.¹⁴⁵

Macaulay's visit to Silves, one of the last destinations on her road trip around the coast of the Iberian Peninsula, is particularly fruitful in the imaginative work that she is able to do. The reader is furnished with two images of Silves, past and present, but though Macaulay mentions a guide who shows her round the castle, what is perhaps lacking in her account is any engagement with individuals, either belonging to Silves' present or its past.¹⁴⁶

Gibbons' *Afoot in Portugal* features a foreword by G. K. Chesterton, in which he himself makes the point that travel books, as he calls them, are all too often 'books about books' rather than books about travel – a comment on the intertextual nature of much travel writing.¹⁴⁷ Chesterton thus implies that in the majority of travel books the reader is unsure whether the writer has really visited the site that is described, although not in Gibbons' case, since he is a master at describing what Chesterton calls 'new or neglected realities'.¹⁴⁸ When it comes to the question of Portugal's Islamic traces, we might therefore expect Gibbons to yield a new perspective rather than reworking previous tropes. This expectation is not always met, however, since Gibbons is inevitably affected by prior knowledge, despite cultivating a non-erudite persona. *Afoot in Portugal* is framed by the author's travels in Spain, journeying to Portugal via Madrid and Seville, and then travelling back via Valencia de Alcántara, Madrid and Zaragoza.

¹⁴⁵ Macaulay, *Fabled Shore*, pp. 190-192.

¹⁴⁶ Macaulay recognises, in *Fabled Shore*, 'my personal limitation of taste, which finds buildings and landscape more aesthetically pleasing than the animal creation' (p. 5).

¹⁴⁷ G. K. Chesterton, 'Foreword' in Gibbons, *Afoot in Portugal*, pp. 1-4 (p. 1).

¹⁴⁸ Chesterton, pp. 2-4.

Such a route had the result of encouraging Gibbons to keep earlier writers' interpretations of Spain in mind when he visited Portugal.

One of the places where this is most evident is in Gibbons' descriptions of people. In contrast to Macaulay, he often preferred to describe people rather than monuments, in order to differentiate himself from previous travel writers, whom he perceived as having filled their accounts with details of architecture and painting.¹⁴⁹ Whilst journeying across remote parts of the Alentejo, Gibbons resorted to travelling on foot, by cart or donkey, sometimes with a guide. He describes one of his guides, an elderly gentleman, in the following manner:

On one ragged slipper he wore a tiny spur, and even with his eyes he was perfectly master of his donkey. [...] he spent the entire day in a sort of endless and tuneless croon. I rather wondered whether it might not have come down through the centuries even from Moorish times. The man himself, with his straggling bit of beard and his handkerchief twisted under his hat and round his head, looked not unlike my conception of an Arab.¹⁵⁰

This is reminiscent of Washington Irving's description of singing Spanish muleteers on his journey to the Alhambra in 1829, to which Irving adds: 'This talent for singing and improvising is frequent in Spain and is said to have been inherited from the Moors'.¹⁵¹

Gibbons' writing is as impressionistic as that of the Romantics; and like them, he creates the effect of tangible truth by featuring a wealth of anecdotes. For example, after explaining to the reader that the speech of the 'Algarves' is likely to be full of 'Moorish oddities', he goes on to say:

I myself in a Faro café have talked in bad French to a Portuguese who looked like an Arab; he was a gentleman and a scholar, but not only did he look like an Arab but he actually boasted that he was an Arab by centuries-old ancestry.¹⁵²

¹⁴⁹ Gibbons discusses this tendency in *Afoot in Italy* (London: George Newnes Ltd.; 1933), p. 50. Cited in Calado, p. 76.

¹⁵⁰ Gibbons, *Afoot in Portugal*, p. 93.

¹⁵¹ Irving, *Tales of the Alhambra*, p. 18.

¹⁵² Gibbons, *Playtime in Portugal*, p. 54.

The scholar boasting of Arab ancestry remains nameless and elusive. This extract also reveals the linguistic difficulties encountered by the writers of the period; because very few could speak Portuguese, nor would they have met many English-speakers, there was the potential for misunderstandings. Gibbon's impression of Algarvians as resembling Arabs also contrasts with travel writing from the previous century and reveals the subjective nature of such impressions.¹⁵³

Clearly fascinated by the Moorish influence in Portugal, Gibbons could be prone to overemphasising this aspect. For example, when describing the area of land between Lagos and Setúbal, he writes: 'the people who live in it are counted as hardly being proper Portuguese, being very largely descendants of the ancient Moors'.¹⁵⁴ Here he conveys not only the snobbery of the Portuguese towards the Alentejans, but also the idea that having Moorish blood is incompatible with being Portuguese. Though, as we have seen, this would have been a commonly held view in Portugal at the time, the tendency towards antithesis found in writing of this period foregrounds such distinctions, rather than seeking an interpretation based on the idea of mixed bloodlines or ancestry.

Ronald Bodley (1892-1970), who visited Sintra in 1940, is another travel writer whose representation of Portugal's Al-Andalus is similarly impressionistic. Seeing Sintra's National Palace, he writes that he experienced 'feelings akin to ecstasy at this old building of obviously Arab origin'. Despite noting its difference in appearance to the Alhambra in Granada, Bodley remarks: 'I put forward a theory to someone well-

¹⁵³ When arriving in the Algarve, Rose Macaulay writes that compared to the Andalusians, the people of the Algarve have 'more of the negro, less of the Moor', but goes on to say that in Olhão '[t]he population looks Moorish' (Macaulay, *Fabled Shore*, pp. 184-5). Douglas Goldring also remarks that 'the Alentejo peasant is a picturesque figure and if he occasionally looks forbidding, his looks, I am assured, belie him. There must be a good deal of North African blood in his make-up' (Goldring, p. 132).

¹⁵⁴ Gibbons, *Afoot in Portugal*, p. 46.

informed on the matter that it might have been founded by the Moors who had come from Andalusia to trade in Lisbon, as a kind of small Alhambra, and I was not contradicted.¹⁵⁵ The reader is encouraged to give Bodley the benefit of the doubt, and assume that the person he consulted was well-informed. However, if they were, they were certainly humouring Bodley, since his analysis is both confusing and historically inaccurate. Sintra's National Palace was originally founded when Lisbon was a Moorish *taifa* Kingdom. However, no surviving parts of the palace date from pre-reconquest Portugal, so everything the visitor sees was built under Christian rule. Aside from Bodley's lack of expertise, his analysis also suggests a desire to associate Sintra's Islamic traces with the cultural prestige and fame of the Alhambra, and of Spanish Al-Andalus.

It would be a mistake to assume that historical inaccuracies always went unchallenged. As Agarez acknowledges, not 'all written discourse [on the Algarve] was unanimous and consistent' in the first half of the twentieth century, and though writers would often rework previous impressions, they also challenged those that they disagreed with.¹⁵⁶ One attempt to redress distortions came in the form of the ethnographer Rodney Gallop's *Portugal, a Book of Folk-ways* from 1936, the first of three works by Gallop on Portuguese folklore.¹⁵⁷ The product of Gallop's time as a diplomat based in Lisbon from 1931, *Portugal, a Book of Folk-ways* does not present itself as a travelogue, but does contain narrated episodes of his personal experiences of witnessing particular traditions in different parts of Portugal.¹⁵⁸ Gallop attempted to counter perceived inaccuracies or misrepresentations in accounts such as Gibbons'

¹⁵⁵ Bodley, pp. 79-80.

¹⁵⁶ Agarez, p. 50.

¹⁵⁷ The other two are *Eight Portuguese Folksongs* (London: Oxford University Press, 1936); and *Cantares do Povo Português* (Lisbon: Instituto para a Alta Cultura, 1937).

¹⁵⁸ See Gallop, *Portugal, a book of folk-ways*, pp. 176-179 for an example. As is discussed below, Gallop narrates his experience of watching a play called *Auto de Floripes*.

Afoot in Portugal and others, which had emphasised the presence of the Orient in the Algarve. Gallop writes:

the impression which the Moors left was not an abiding one, and the Algarve proved far less African in atmosphere than report and expectation would have it. [...] Olhão, the most eastern in appearance, owes its terraces and lattice windows to no Arab heritage (for it was not founded until the sixteenth century) but to its modern commerce with North Africa.¹⁵⁹

Gallop here effectively takes a side in a debate on the origin and specificity of Olhão's *açoteias*. This debate, which remained ongoing from the 1930s to the 1960s, was over whether the *açoteias* were an Algarvian descendant of Moorish dwellings, as the German ethnographer and philologist Wilhelm Giese (1895-1990) had argued in the 1920s, or, as Gallop posits, the result of more recent trade with Morocco.¹⁶⁰ Francisco Fernandes Lopes, who was discussed previously in the Chapter, was to provide a long-lasting influence on the debate with an article from 1945, which asserted the local uniqueness of the *açoteias* and their utilitarian and recreational function.¹⁶¹

It is clear, therefore, that the travelogues of the 1930s disagreed with one another over the extent of the legacy of Al-Andalus in Portugal and specifically the Algarve. As an ethnographer and folklorist, Gallop's opinions were also informed by scholarly debates in his field. For example, he summarises the findings for the reader, including those which were disputed, of the work of Julián de Ribera y Tarragó in the 1920s on the influence of Arabic poetry on European lyric forms.¹⁶² However, after weighing evidence for and against the influence of Moorish sung verse on Portuguese folk songs, he concludes that in Portugal 'the musical influence of the Moors seems to have been surprisingly small'.¹⁶³ Nonetheless, his account is notable in its examination

¹⁵⁹ Gallop, p. 13.

¹⁶⁰ Agarez, pp. 29, 33.

¹⁶¹ Agarez, pp. 35, 39-40.

¹⁶² Gallop, p. 196.

¹⁶³ Gallop, p. 203.

of two folkloric features of Portuguese Islamic heritage: the *mouras encantadas* and the *mouriscas*. Gallop highlights the fact that the *mouras encantadas* or ‘enchanted Moorish princesses’ are a hybrid folklore, combining Celtic traditions with the memory of Al-Andalus and the reconquest. He writes: ‘They are associated not only with natural phenomena such as may have lain behind primitive religions, but also with material vestiges of ancient races. They haunt ruined cities and castles’. Gallop considers such a phenomenon to be partly explained by the idea that ‘the Portuguese preserved a distorted recollection of the last great conquering race which overran their land’.¹⁶⁴ Here, his use of the term ‘distorted’ is used not so much to mean a conscious bias, but rather to describe the result of the workings of imagination over time.

In addition, Gallop provides a detailed discussion of the *mouriscas*, a term used to describe to a variety of traditions, ranging from mock-battles between Christians and Muslims, to traditional open-air plays featuring costumes loosely conceived of as Moorish and ceremonial dances.¹⁶⁵ In the Portuguese context these traditions, found in the north of Portugal (and the Azores) rather than the south, were dying out, although Gallop managed to witness a performance, in ‘Souto das Neves’, a Portuguese village between Barcelos and Viana, of the *Auto de Floripes* ‘which combines a mimic combat between Moslems and Christians with a mediaeval play’. Gallop links particular Portuguese *mourisca* traditions with other related traditions: Soule, in the French Basque country, he explains, has a similar tradition of performing open-air plays which fuse ‘mediaeval theatre’ with ‘ceremonial combats between Christians and Moslems’.¹⁶⁶ Gallop also refers to a *danzas das donzelas* in the village of Arcozelo near Gouveia, where ‘six or eight little girls pretended to be Moorish maidens desirous of embracing the

¹⁶⁴ Gallop, pp. 77-80.

¹⁶⁵ Gallop, p. 163-177.

¹⁶⁶ Gallop, p. 176.

Christian faith', whilst acknowledging a wider medieval tradition of dancing that was 'Moorish only in name' and which still existed at the time of his account, 'from Portugal through Spain, Southern France and Italy to Dalmatia', and 'even in parts of England' given the probable common etymology of Morris dancing and *mourisca* or morisco dancing. Therefore, though he acknowledges that certain traditions can no longer truly be said to represent an encounter between Christians and Muslims, Gallop is nonetheless able to identify enactments that did seem to constitute another form of 'distorted recollection' of the Islamic presence in Portugal that he had found in the *mouras encantadas*.¹⁶⁷ As such, Gallop is able to reflect not only on the contribution of popular cultural practices to the cultural memory of Islam in Portugal, but also on the complexity of the process by which that cultural memory evolved.¹⁶⁸

A Portuguese Orient

In order to examine representations of the Orient I shall now turn again to Gibbons, who was first reminded of Arabian Nights as he journeyed into the south of Spain:

the towns gradually turned white [...] With dome-shaped towers and flat-roofed buildings that reminded you somehow of pictures in the child's book of the 'Arabian Nights.' The station names were beginning to begin with "Al," and it made you think of the Koran and the Moor. Almodovar I remember was one, with a great castle pinnacled up savagely on some towering rocks, [...] And I don't see what on earth else they could have called the place. For somehow no other name would have fitted in half so well.¹⁶⁹

Here, Gibbons' description is particularly revealing, in that he acknowledges that the reality he sees around him reminds him of a representation, a presumably European image of the Orient. The Arabic names of towns seem fitting to him because they reflect

¹⁶⁷ Gallop, pp. 166-7.

¹⁶⁸ For a recent analysis of representations of Islam in popular festivals in Spain and Portugal, see Hertel, pp. 125-138.

¹⁶⁹ Gibbons, *Afoot in Portugal*, pp. 21-22.

what he desires to see: an exotic, oriental Spain. This image of Spain then becomes a point of reference when he journeys into Portugal.

For Gibbons, parts of the Algarve also constituted a Portuguese Orient, as we can see in this memory of the village of São Marcos da Serra in inland Algarve:

I shall not forget that little town and the image it instantly called up to my mind. It is all whitewashed walls with a sort of impression as though there ought to be domes; and my memory was a story-book picture of the *Arabian Nights*.¹⁷⁰

Whereas in Spain, Gibbons had seen ‘dome-shaped towers’, here he feels ‘as though there ought to be domes’. In other words, the village carries some signifiers of the Orient, such as the white-washed walls, and this mere hint is enough for him to construct an imagined Orient there, for, as he acknowledges, his memory of the place was a ‘story-book picture of the *Arabian Nights*’. His remark suggests an awareness of the Orient’s constructedness, and, also, of how personal memories can in turn be influenced by representations of that Orient. The continuity with Spain is also apparent in *Afoot in Portugal* since Gibbons makes a similar comment about the expressiveness of Arabic-Algarvian place names as he had made (above) about Almódovar in Spain: ‘Then came Bordeira and Alfambra and Aljezur, and their very names seem somehow to describe them.’¹⁷¹

Though the references to images from *Arabian Nights* story-books that we have seen so far suggest an attraction to and desire for a beautiful and exotic Orient in Iberia, Gibbons’ accounts also reveal the expectation to find evidence of Oriental cruelty in Portugal – cruelty, of course, having been identified by Edward Said as one of the stereotypical characteristics of the Orient, as constructed by French and British colonial writers and scholars.¹⁷² We saw in Chapter 1 how Olivier Merson described Sintra’s

¹⁷⁰ Gibbons, *Playtime in Portugal*, p. 56.

¹⁷¹ Gibbons, *Afoot in Portugal*, p. 102.

¹⁷² Said, *Orientalism*, p. 4.

castle as 'Le sinistre château des Maures',¹⁷³ and in *Afoot in Portugal* we find a similar description, when Gibbons looks onto the town of Aljezur from a hillside, describing the town's 'whitewashed lanes' but also 'the grim grin of the toothless doors and windows of the old Arab castle'.¹⁷⁴

In Gibbons' case, the castle's sinister appearance paves the way for a revealing discussion of his assumptions about the Moors of Al-Andalus. Still narrating his walk, he describes the day turning to night and how the castle conjured up for him the idea of a ghostly army of 'dusky' faces lurking on the hillside, 'with the gleam of sharp knives held between their grinning teeth as in the shadows the men crept stealthily forward upon the unsuspecting village'. Though he cannot say where the idea came from, he explains the menacing image by adding: 'I do not believe that the old Moorish Domination was distinguished by any particular gentleness towards its Christian subjects.' Moving on to describe a horrific dungeon he saw in a castle near Setúbal, he adds: 'If, then, Christians did this thing to other Christians in, I think, the fifteen hundreds, one imagines that the really rough old days of the Arab times must have been a little on the severe side'.¹⁷⁵ This last statement features a very English use of understatement ('a little on the severe side') to imply that the past was not perhaps as genteel as we would have liked it to be. Though Gibbons' statement is ambiguous, he may be making an assumption that since 'Arab times' were further back in history, that they must have been less civilised than the Christians in the late Middle Ages.¹⁷⁶

A further reference to Moorish cruelty is found in *Playtime in Portugal*, where Gibbons refers to the inhabitants of Silves, writing: 'Their Moorish ancestors must have

¹⁷³ Merson, *Guide du voyageur à Lisbonne*, p. 208.

¹⁷⁴ Gibbons, *Afoot in Portugal*, p. 103.

¹⁷⁵ Gibbons, *Afoot in Portugal*, pp. 104-105.

¹⁷⁶ Muslim rule in the area lasted from the eighth until the late twelfth century, although the rulers in the twelfth century were Berber rather than Arab.

built pretty well, or probably have flogged their Christian slaves into building pretty well for them'.¹⁷⁷ Here Gibbons' suggestion that building in Gharb Al-Andalus was dependent on slave labour reinforces the idea that the Caliphate was powerful during the early centuries of Muslim rule, though the suggestion of cruelty also upholds Orientalist prejudices. When Gibbons finds himself in Tavira, he also notes an instance of Moorish treachery when describing the history of the town:

Its Moorish part dates back to the twelve hundreds and to the Seven Knights of Tavira; there was supposed to be a truce with the Moors and the seven knights were out hunting peacefully when the Moors broke the treaty and attacked them, and in the resultant unpleasantness that part of Portugal arose and took its freedom.

Gibbons does not include a corresponding anecdote about Christians breaking a treaty or chivalric code, unlike Charles Davillier, who, as we saw in Chapter 2, took pains to discuss and indeed emphasise the fact that atrocities were carried out by both Muslims and Christians. Whatever Gibbons's intentions, his inclusion of the episode without a counterexample suggests that the Moors were more prone to such treachery than the Christians. He continues this section by identifying the knights as 'Crusaders' and clarifying that the term did not only apply to those fighting for the Holy Land: 'many an Englishman would drop into Portugal and southern Spain for a little bit of practice fighting against the local Moslems'.¹⁷⁸ Here the informal tone used makes light of the conflict, and Muslims are grouped together as a single group, regardless of their background, place of birth or ethnicity.

Rose Macaulay's account again provides a useful comparison to Gibbons, this time as an example of greater sympathy towards the Moors. In her account of Portimão, she refers to two separate fleets of foreign crusaders arriving in 1189 'to help King Sancho I to take Silves, the capital of the Algarve, from the Moors'. She describes the

¹⁷⁷ Gibbons, *Playtime in Portugal*, p. 93.

¹⁷⁸ Gibbons, *Playtime in Portugal*, p. 142.

first fleet of 'English, French, Norman, German and Danish' crusaders as 'intoxicated, barbarous Christians [...] aflame with anti-Saracen zeal'. They arrived and found Portimão deserted, the Moorish inhabitants for miles around having 'fled to the walled stronghold of Alvor, where the Christians pursued them, destroyed and sacked their castle and town, and massacred six thousand persons before proceeding on their way to the Holy Land'. She returns to the subject of the siege of Silves when she visits the town itself, describing how it had held out throughout the summer but finally surrendered after losing its water supply:

The exhausted Moors, promised their lives, filed out through the town gates, and were massacred and stripped of their clothing as they came. The atrocious deeds committed by our crusading ancestors in Portugal, against both Moors and Portuguese, do not bear thinking of.¹⁷⁹

As can be seen here, Macaulay departs from the discourse of Gibbons and other writers who present the contribution of the English crusaders to the Portuguese reconquest as a source of pride. Instead, Macaulay openly condemns their actions as ruthless massacres, and their motivation as 'anti-Saracen-zeal'. In addition, she hints at the fact that the crusaders also harmed the local Arabised Christians, as they did not recognise them as sharing their own religion. Macaulay was clearly very well researched: as discussed earlier, she had already published *They Went to Portugal* by this point, where she had discussed the role of the crusaders in the siege of Silves in detail.¹⁸⁰ She was also, evidently, someone who was also not afraid to take a critical stance towards her forbears. Her criticism of the crusaders also chimes with what we know about her stance towards the Anglican Church: despite being attracted to Christianity and coming from a devout family, Macaulay was agnostic for long periods of her life, and had a complex

¹⁷⁹ Macaulay, *Fabled Shore*, pp. 188-190.

¹⁸⁰ Macaulay, *They went to Portugal*, pp. 28-32.

relationship with her faith.¹⁸¹ As such, she would have been particularly attentive to the hypocrisy of the Crusades, with their official sanctioning of violence and brutality in the name of Christianity.

Returning now to our examination of the Orient in Gibbons' travelogues, the fact that Gibbons liked to distance himself from the tourist trail has implications for the way in which he treats Sintra. His description of Sintra is, in fact, remarkably short and indicates his dislike of being caught up in 'the tourist parties that wander perpetually through the great empty state-rooms' of Sintra National Palace. His account of the visit is also telling, for example he writes: 'you look with interest at the huge kitchen chimneys and the harem and the place for the Moorish bathing beauties, and all the rest of it'.¹⁸² There is the sense here that all that can be said about the Palace has been said already, and the author is merely ticking off a list which involves the harem (the obsession, of course, of many writers dealing with the Orient).¹⁸³ Here, Gibbons fails to evoke for the reader anything of the specificity of Portuguese Al-Andalus, instead relying on stereotypical and conflated images of an 'Orient' as it had long been imagined by Europeans.

A feature that recurs not only in Gibbons' writing but also in the work of another writer from the period, Lady Alice Lowther (née Blight) (1873-1939), is the desire to convey the idea that in parts of Portugal time has simply stood still. This phenomenon has been identified and theorised by Johannes Fabian in relation to anthropology and

¹⁸¹ For a personal account of Rose Macaulay and her work see Frank Swinnerton, 'Rose Macaulay', *The Kenyon Review*, 29:5 (1967), 591-608. Macaulay's semi-autobiographical novel, *The Towers of Trezibond* (1956), also contains passages which reflect on the dilemma of her 'anglo-agnosticism' (Swinnerton, p. 607).

¹⁸² Gibbons, *Playtime in Portugal*, p. 30.

¹⁸³ For a discussion of representations of the harem in Orientalist discourse, see Ruth Bernard Yeazell, *Harems of the Mind: Passages of Western Art and Literature* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2000) and Mary Roberts, *Intimate Outsiders: The Harem in Ottoman and Orientalist Art and Travel Literature* (Durham, N.C.: Duke University Press, 2007).

can usefully be applied to travel writing.¹⁸⁴ Fabian describes it as ‘a persistent and systematic tendency to place the referent(s) of anthropology in a Time other than the present of the producer of anthropological discourse’. He names this practice a ‘denial of coevalness’ because the anthropologist (or in our case, the travel writer) is seemingly denying that the people he is describing inhabit the same temporal moment that he does, since modernity is being equated with particular forms of perceived progress (such as industrialisation and urbanisation), rather than the simple fact of living in the modern period.¹⁸⁵ Such a point of view can appear, on the surface, to be a way of praising a particular place for not being changed or homogenised by the modern world, however, it also simultaneously asserts the superiority of the travel writer. This is because the traveller’s insights and ability to appreciate the temporal relation between themselves and the Other are dependent on their modern condition, which also enforces a distance between them and the Other.¹⁸⁷

Gibbons’ descriptions of Silves in his two accounts provide examples of this tendency to deny coevalness. In *Afoot in Portugal* he describes the view over Silves from its ‘Mosque-Cathedral’, adding:

and the girls with their water-pitchers crooked into their brown arms are gossiping in the cool of the evening exactly as the Silves girls must have gossiped back in the fourteen hundreds or whenever it was that they put up that *Cruzeiro*.¹⁸⁸

Although Gibbons suggests in this first extract that certain ways of life have stood still in Silves since the time of Christian rule after the reconquest, he slightly alters this in his second travelogue, moving the point of reference to the Moors themselves:

¹⁸⁴ See Carl Thompson, *Travel Writing*, p. 147.

¹⁸⁵ Johannes Fabian, *Time and the Other: How Anthropology Makes its Object* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1983), pp. 17, 31.

¹⁸⁷ As Fabian has argued in relation to anthropology: Fabian, p. 121.

¹⁸⁸ Gibbons, *Afoot in Portugal*, p. 39.

Up those steep little lanes the girls are carrying their earthenware jars of water from the wells, and they carry [them] with the exact crook of the arm that you can see across the seas in Morocco. Half of those people are still ancient Moors grafted on modern-day Portugal.¹⁸⁹

Having spent more time in the Algarve by this point (and met the scholar in the Faro café boasting of his Arab ancestry) Gibbons seems to have become more convinced that the people of Silves remind him not of medieval Christians but of Moroccans. It is telling that he sees Portugal (at the time of writing) as a tree onto which the ‘ancient’ Moors, who have somehow survived unchanged, have been grafted. It implies a somewhat forced and unnatural process, emphasising the Otherness of the Moor who retains that immutable Otherness even as he becomes an extension of the tree of Portugal. A further problematic aspect of Gibbons’ description is that he delights in the fact that Silves has this timeless feel, specifically conveyed through the image of the women carrying water from the wells. Just as he attempts to capture the elusive scent of Silves in bloom, so he creates for the readers from an industrialised Europe, already aware of real and impending conflict, a picturesque scene that helps them imagine older and apparently simpler ways of life. However, he fails to ponder on the plight of these women, and how they might benefit from improvements to the local economy which would take away the need for them to carry out this form of labour.

An additional example of ‘denial of coevalness’ comes from the account of Alice Lowther’s account *Moments in Portugal or Land of the Laurel*, which was published in 1939 in the form of a diary that Lowther had written in 1936.¹⁹⁰ American-born, Lowther had married the British diplomat Sir Gerard Augustus Lowther, who died in 1916. Lowther’s description of Portugal refers almost exclusively to the landscape of Lisbon and surroundings, the history of the country and the legends associated with it.¹⁹¹

¹⁸⁹ Gibbons, *Playtime in Portugal*, p. 94.

¹⁹⁰ Alice Lowther, *Moments in Portugal or Land of the Laurel* (London: Luzac & Co., 1939).

¹⁹¹ Calado, p. 36.

Discussing Portugal's recovery after the Earthquake of 1755, she argues that despite the country's efforts under Pombal to 'throw off its atrophy', it nonetheless failed to prosper, particularly after the loss of Brazil. She then describes different parts of society in turn, starting with the learned, then the peasants, and finally the women:

the women, like goddesses descending from Olympus, sweep by with a grace of pride I have not known elsewhere, and their refined and delicate features shadowed under the knotted kerchief, their glance soft, dark and aloof. Surely Arab blood calmed the fret of the Celtic aborigines, and the serenity of an ancient race lives still among these unspoiled people, worth all the hustling anxiety of modernity.¹⁹²

Here Lowther suggests that the Celts were indigenous to Portugal, reinforcing the sense we get that the 'Arab blood' is by contrast a foreign element, which nonetheless influenced the national character by contributing 'the serenity of an ancient race'. She then sets up a contrast between the Portuguese, who remain 'unspoiled' because they have retained the character of these forebears, and what she calls 'the hustling anxiety of modernity'. On the one hand, her attitude is very much typical of the time: although in this case the writer is an American who married a British man, there is, in 1930s British travel writing, a sense of lost authenticity that accompanies living in a modern world, an 'authenticity' that is projected onto the hybrid Andalusian space.¹⁹³ When Lowther talks of 'the hustling anxiety of modernity' she conveys the idea that being modern necessarily carries with it a certain baggage, an accompanying anxiety, brought about by a sense of rapid change and associated loss of traditions and older ways of life. Writers of this period were therefore keen to find communities whose slower pace of life meant they seemed comparatively untroubled.¹⁹⁴ However, such a perception created a vicious circle, since modernity, as Stacy Burton writes, 'produces the pursuit of representations

¹⁹² Lowther, p. 15.

¹⁹³ See Carl Thompson, *Travel Writing*, p. 124, on the difficulty of accessing the 'authentically Other'.

¹⁹⁴ Gibbons, for example, is drawn to the idea of journeying across remote parts of the Alentejo and writes that 'southern Portugal is like England before the Industrial Revolution' (*Playtime in Portugal*, p. 69). Stacy Burton, *Travel Narrative and the Ends of Modernity* (Cambridge University Press, 2013), p. 163.

and circumstances it romanticizes as authentic even as it makes them scarce'.¹⁹⁵ What we also see here is that the traveller effectively encourages the Other to remain naive and ignorant, in order to remain, as the traveller sees it, 'unspoiled'.

Lowther's account also illustrates how the desire for 'authentic' and 'unspoiled' places demands that they remain largely unknowable and mysterious. She describes visiting Montserrat Palace, and as she returns towards Sintra and looks up towards the Moorish Castle on the hill, offers the following reflection:

A curious fact brings to mind the savagery of some of the ancient battles. Under a stone, bearing the engraved symbols of the Cross and the Crescent, are interred the bodies of Christians and Moslems who perished in the storming of the castle by Affonzo Henriques in the older days, and upon it in Arabic is inscribed : "Whom God has brought together, He will separate." This does not quite agree with another legend which recounts that when Affonzo stormed the mountain-side to attack this Moorish eyrie not a soul was found within the walls. Every Moor had fled – escaping through secret underground passages to the country beyond and across the sea far to the south!

But who can tell the truth among the many truths and fables which have come down to us from both Christian and Moorish sources?¹⁹⁶

Here, different legends conflict and merge with one another. Like the Moors fleeing through secret underground passageways, the 'true' nature of the place will always be beyond the British traveller's grasp, a symbol of an unattainable desire.

As we have seen, British travel writers who visited Portugal in the 1930s acknowledged the deep and varied legacy of Al-Andalus in Portugal. Alice Lowther herself writes, of the period of the reconquest, that: 'Many of the Arab artisans and farmers remained however in the land, and through their art and industry profoundly influenced the manners and architecture of the Portuguese; especially in the Algarve'.¹⁹⁷ Nonetheless, the idea of a period of cultural achievement and relative tolerance is conspicuously absent, and the Moors tend to be described as a homogenous whole rather than as individuals, with travel writers lacking the historical knowledge to talk

¹⁹⁵ Stacy Burton, *Travel Narrative and the Ends of Modernity* (Cambridge University Press, 2013), p. 163.

¹⁹⁶ Lowther, p. 25.

¹⁹⁷ Lowther, p. 132.

about key figures such as Al-Mutamid. In spite of this, the town of Silves gains greater recognition in certain accounts, particularly those of John Gibbons and Rose Macaulay.

The discourse tends, overall, to favour and emphasise dichotomies rather than allowing for the idea of cultural hybridity, which was more a feature of Romantic travel writing. Although the travellers of the 1930s were attracted to what they saw as the authenticity of remoter parts of Portugal, their denial of coevalness implied a perceived superiority and the assumption that only they could perceive the authenticity that they themselves were constructing. Conflated stereotypes of the Orient, such as cruelty, occur frequently, as we have seen in the writing of John Gibbons and Marion Smithes. Writers generally claim the authority to interpret history (precisely because of, rather than in spite of, their often patchy historical knowledge), though some, like Rose Macaulay, were well-researched. As Agarez has shown, local historians, intellectuals and public figures (such as Francisco Fernandes Lopes and Mário Lyster Franco) also managed to influence some travel accounts and establish an itinerary, possibly defining some lines of enquiry.¹⁹⁸ Alice Lowther is a notable exception in acknowledging the inability to form an interpretation of history in some circumstances, anticipating postmodern responses to conflicting historical accounts. Ironically, the discovery of a Portuguese Orient that we see here (often in the image of the Orient that had been found in Spain in the nineteenth century) came at a time when, as AbdoolKarim Vakil and Patricia Hertel have shown, the Portuguese state was itself depersonalising the memory of the Muslims of Al-Andalus.¹⁹⁹

¹⁹⁸ Agarez, pp. 25, 39-40, 45.

¹⁹⁹ Vakil, pp. 29-44, Hertel, pp. 116, 121.

Chapter 4: José Saramago's *Viagem a Portugal* (1981) and *História do Cerco de Lisboa* (1989)

In Chapter 2, the study of representations of Gharb Al-Andalus allowed us to examine the links between António Maria de Oliveira Parreira's travel writing and his hybrid historical novel-fictionalised biography *Os Luso-Árabes* (1898). In this final chapter, a similar opportunity arises with two works by Nobel-prize winning author José Saramago: *Viagem a Portugal* (1981), the account of his journey made (by car) around his native country in 1979-80, and *História do Cerco de Lisboa* (1989), which takes as its subject the 1147 Christian siege of Almoravid-ruled Lisbon.¹ The main storyline of *História do Cerco de Lisboa* is in fact set in 1980s Lisbon, but the work incorporates elements of historiographical metafiction, a term coined by Linda Hutcheon to describe works which combine the features of metafiction and historical fiction.² Though *História* has been the subject of many critical works, given Saramago's fame it is surprising that *Viagem a Portugal*, which was published in English translation in 2000, has not received more critical attention.³

This chapter will therefore consider thematic links between the two works as well as analysing each work in its own right. Though there has not been a specific comparative study of these two works to date, relevant work has been done on thematic links between Saramago's works more generally. Maria Alzira Seixo, for example, has discussed how the notion of travel and being a traveller, both literally and also very

¹ José Saramago, *Viagem a Portugal* (Lisboa: Editorial Caminho, 1990); *História do Cerco de Lisboa* (Lisboa: Editorial Caminho, 1989).

² Hutcheon, p. 114.

³ José Saramago, *Journey to Portugal*, trans. Amanda Hopkinson and Nick Caistor (San Diego: Harcourt, 2000). Paulo de Medeiros notes that *Viagem* stands out among Saramago's non-novelistic output: 'The book has been completely ignored by critics, and yet in it one finds not only a work of literary achievement but also a document that clearly speaks of Portugal in a way that it would be difficult to find duplicated anywhere else'. Paulo de Medeiros, 'Invitation to the Voyage', *Bloom's Modern Critical Views: José Saramago* ed. by Harold Bloom (Philadelphia: Chelsea House Publishers, 2005), pp. 109-120 (p. 111).

frequently allegorically, is a recurrent motif in Saramago's work.⁴ In terms of discussing representations of Gharb Al-Andalus, scholarship on *Viagem* to date has not examined Saramago's reflections within it on Portuguese mudéjar architecture, for example. However, in scholarship on *História*, studies such as Alves de Paula Martins (2006) and Sabine (2016) have considered Saramago's treatment of the Other including some aspects of the representation of the medieval Muslim subject.⁵ This study will build on such work by offering an extensive consideration of Saramago's representation of Gharb Al-Andalus in *História*, as well as the aforementioned comparative perspective with Saramago's travel writing.

The approach in this chapter will differ from Chapter 2, where I was able to identify paragraphs in Oliveira Parreira's historical novel which were reworked passages from his travel writing. The relationship between Saramago's *Viagem* and *História* is unlikely to be so textually close given that the two works were published eight years apart, with the author publishing three novels in the intervening period. The first of these was *Memorial do Convento* (1982), a historical novel and love story set in the eighteenth century against the backdrop of the building of the Convent of Mafra. It was Saramago's first critical success in Portugal (at the age of 60), and the English translation (*Balthazar and Blimunda*, 1988) also earned him international acclaim. *Memorial do Convento* was followed by *O Ano da Morte de Ricardo Reis* (1984) and *A Jangada de Pedra* (1986).⁶ These three works reveal a considerable evolution on the part of the writer in terms of style and approach, however due to the thematic scope of this

⁴ Maria Alzira Seixo, *O essencial sobre José Saramago* (Lisbon: Imprensa Nacional-Casa da Moeda, 1987), p. 31.

⁵ Adriana Alves de Paula Martins, *A construção da memória da nação em José Saramago e Gore Vidal* (Frankfurt: Peter Lang, 2006); Mark Sabine, *José Saramago: History, Utopia, and the Necessity of Error* (Cambridge: Legenda, 2016).

⁶ The plot of *A Jangada de Pedra* is based on a journey undertaken by five people and a dog. For a detailed discussion of *A Jangada de Pedra* see Sabine, *José Saramago*.

doctoral research project I shall not be examining them here. It is worth noting, however, that *A Jangada de Pedra*, as Paulo de Medeiros identifies, 'best exemplifies the importance of travel in Saramago's imagery, as not only are its main characters in constant travel through Spain and Portugal, but the whole of the Iberian peninsula itself is in motion after its separation from the continent'.⁷ As such, it is clear that Saramago continued to use a variety of concepts of travel to structure his writing following the publication of *Viagem a Portugal*.

José Saramago (1922-2010) was born into a farming family in Azinhaga, Ribatejo, north-east of Lisbon. In 1924 his family moved to Lisbon, where his father worked as a policeman. Despite showing an early interest in academic study, Saramago was unable, for economic reasons, to follow a traditional academic pathway, instead attending technical school. After graduating he worked first as a car mechanic, before becoming a translator, journalist and finally a novelist. By the 1980s, Portugal had mass tourism in the Algarve (Faro airport opened in 1965) and was recovering from 40 years of rule by the authoritarian Estado Novo regime. The journey (by car) undertaken by Saramago which is narrated in *Viagem a Portugal* therefore took place a mere five years after the overthrow of the regime in 1974. Under the Estado Novo, Portuguese history had been presented to the nation in a selective and distorted manner, to fit the narrative of a country with a glorious maritime and colonial past and a destiny as a great and powerful colonial nation (failing, of course, to recognise the atrocities connected with Portuguese colonialism). This narrative also emphasised a narrow vision of Portuguese identity, of which a strong component was Catholicism. As such, the regime promoted the idea of a

⁷ Medeiros, p. 111.

Christian identity through revisiting the idea of the reconquest as the period in which such an identity had solidified.

The vision described above is denounced by Saramago using the term 'História Pátria'. In adopting this term, Saramago uses the language of the regime itself to ironic effect, to highlight the regime's manipulation of the concept of 'pátria' for its own ends.⁸ Saramago was aware of how the selective inclusion or exclusion of events, as well as imposition of a particular narrative on the past, could be used to introduce bias: in the author's own words, 'a história é parcial e parcelar'.⁹ The narrativisation of history had, of course, famously been discussed by Hayden White in *Metahistory* (1973).¹⁰ Beyond being critical of *História Pátria* itself, what Saramago objected to even more was the fact that such a vision of history continued to live on, as part of the regime's legacy of the crushing of 'critical enquiry and democratic participation'.¹¹ If we compare Saramago's two works, *Viagem* (1981) and *História* (1989), it is possible to see a change in tone which reflects the author's evolution from initial criticism to deep frustration at the survival of the discourse of *História Pátria* into and through the 1980s, with his characteristic irony descending into trenchant sarcasm at times in the latter text.

In order to better understand Saramago's approach, we should first consider the broad context of postmodernism and its engagement with History. Linda Hutcheon in *A Poetics of Postmodernism* makes the point that in comparison to the 1960s, which was very much 'the age of now, of the present', postmodernism's contribution has been 'a historical consciousness mixed with an ironic sense of critical distance'.¹² This historical

⁸ Reis, p. 81.

⁹ Carlos Reis, *Diálogos com José Saramago* (Porto: Porto Editora, 2015), p. 83.

¹⁰ Hayden White, *Metahistory: The Historical Imagination in Nineteenth-century Europe* (Baltimore, Maryland: Johns Hopkins University Press, [1973] 2014).

¹¹ Sabine, p. 4.

¹² Linda Hutcheon, *A Poetics of Postmodernism: History, Theory, Fiction* (Routledge: New York and London, 2004), p. 201.

consciousness, which is foregrounded in historiographical metafiction, includes an awareness that the accessibility of the past to us now 'is entirely conditioned by textuality'.¹³ Whilst postmodern novelistic forms such as historiographical metafiction have exposed these forms of bias, there is an inherent irony in their doing so in a literary form: while postmodern writers could expose the entrapments of language, they also reproduced them, albeit with greater self-awareness. This led Hutcheon to view postmodern literature as being anti-utopian, as it did not appear to offer a way forward other than this ironic self-awareness. Elisabeth Wesseling, whose study was published in 1991, has, nonetheless, offered a critique of certain arguments made by Hutcheon in her reading of literary postmodernism.¹⁴ Wesseling identified texts within a corpus of both postmodern and modernist texts, proposing a new label of 'uchronian fiction'.¹⁵ She explains that the term 'Uchronie' has sometimes been used in the French and German traditions 'to refer to the type of counterfactual fantasy which devises alternatives within the confines of documented history'.¹⁶ Wesseling employs the term 'uchronian fiction' to show how some postmodern novels which may not appear to be straightforwardly utopian can still contain utopian elements:

Postmodern novelists do not straightforwardly project inspiring alternatives for the status quo into the future. Rather, they turn to the past in order to look for unrealized possibilities that inhered in historical situations, and subsequently imagine what history would have looked like if unrealized sequences of events and courses of action had come about.¹⁷

As Sabine identifies, Wesseling's study 'looks at how literature might articulate an effective challenge to the dominant ideological formations of the present by foregrounding and countering "the ways in which versions of history function as

¹³ Hutcheon, p. 16; 114.

¹⁴ Elisabeth Wesseling, *Writing history as a prophet: postmodernist innovations of the historical novel* (Amsterdam; Philadelphia: J. Benjamins Pub. Co., 1991).

¹⁵ Wesseling, p. 100.

¹⁶ Wesseling, p. 102.

¹⁷ Wesseling, p. 13.

instruments of *power* in the present””.¹⁸ He sees Saramago’s novels as containing elements both of Hutcheon’s concept of historiographical metafiction, with its ironic critical distance, and of Wesseling’s concept of uchronian fiction, implies a more engaged attitude to changing our lives for the better in the present. These concepts are both useful to keep in mind when examining *Viagem a Portugal*, which, as we shall see, already reveals Saramago’s irreverent attitude towards *História Pátria*.

***Viagem a Portugal* (1981)**

In an interview with Carlos Reis (first published in 1998), Saramago explains that he had been asked by the *Círculo de Leitores* (a Book Club) to write a travel guide that would be useful for someone travelling around the country and looking for information about places to visit. Saramago initially declined, and offered a counterproposal: ‘Se vocês quiserem, se estiverem interessados nisso, eu posso fazer uma viagem e depois conto.’¹⁹ Rejecting the idea of writing a travel guide, Saramago instead proposed to write a piece of travel writing, thus giving himself more freedom in terms of both content and style. His proposal was accepted, but the terms of his acceptance did not go unnoticed by critics. Maria Luísa Leal’s study from 1999 discusses how *Viagem a Portugal* differs from a travel guide, emphasising the constraints of the travel guide genre. Her comment that ‘a leitura de um roteiro turístico é monocórdica e insípida’, however, suggests that her study does not account for the rich history of the genre.²⁰ Leal goes on to underscore the literary virtues both of *Viagem* and of the Spanish author Julio Llamazares’ travel account *Trás-os-Montes: (Un viaje portugués)* (1998), with the

¹⁸ Wesseling, p. 118. Cited in Sabine 2016, p. 17.

¹⁹ Reis, *Diálogos com José Saramago*, p. 122.

²⁰ Maria Luísa Leal, ‘Viagem A Portugal: os passos do viajante’, *Colóquio/Letras*, 151-152 (Jan.-Jun. 1999), 191-204 (p. 194).

implicit suggestion that Saramago and Llamazares' travel accounts have more literary value because their authors have also written highly regarded works of literary fiction.²¹ Her analysis therefore leaves the impression that she is promoting a hierarchical view of different genres, with literary fiction sitting above travel writing, which in turn sits above travel guides. This view has been challenged by the discipline of Travel Writing Studies in recent decades, which has argued for a reappraisal of the literary value and research interest of both travel writing and travel guides (indeed, I include a travel guide in my corpus for Chapter 1). More recent studies, such as that of Daniel Henn, from 2003, incorporate insights from Travel Writing Studies, with Henn's study in particular providing a useful overview of *Viagem*.²²

The journey recounted in *Viagem* took place over six months, beginning in October 1979.²³ The *Estado Novo* regime had stifled the possibility of recovering and celebrating Portugal's Islamic heritage in any meaningful way, and although the need to recover such a heritage is not the dominant theme of *Viagem*, it nonetheless constitutes a recurring preoccupation of Saramago the traveller, as we see in his reflections in response to examples of this heritage that he stumbles across in the course of his trip. It is a journey, it should be noted, in which Saramago devotes more time to little-known landmarks than to major monuments. It is the weight given to heritage-related reflections which prompts Maria Luísa Leal to identify *Viagem* as both 'repositório e descoberta de uma memória cultural'.²⁴

²¹ Julio Llamazares, *Trás-os-Montes: (Un viaje portugués)* (Barcelona: Penguin Random House Grupo Editorial, Debolsillo edition, 2016).

²² David Henn, 'Place and People: José Saramago's "Viagem a Portugal"', *Portuguese Studies*, 19 (2003), 175-189.

²³ Henn, p. 175.

²⁴ Leal, p. 198.

The first editions of *Viagem* were both coffee-table sized editions containing photographs. As Henn notes, the first edition published in 1981 contained 250 colour plates, of which 100 were photographs taken by Saramago himself. Subsequent editions published for a wider public replaced three quarters of Saramago's photos with others taken by the photographer Mauricio Abreu.²⁵ There have since been further editions, such as that most recently published in 2014, which are smaller in size and do not contain any photographs. All quotations from this study are from the Editorial Caminho 1990 edition, however I shall not be commenting on the significance of the particular photographs taken or the ways in which text and image interact with each other in this or any other edition of *Viagem a Portugal*, as it is beyond the scope of this study.

The question of style is also one that Leal's study of *Viagem* addresses, in particular the range of erudite and popular references, as well as the presence of 'a oralidade que marca o discurso do narrador saramaguiano', which contributes to the work's irreverent tone.²⁶ The author-traveller in *Viagem* refers to himself in the third person throughout, as 'o viajante'. Henn has discussed how this technique is used by Julio Llamazares in his first two travel books, *El río del olvido: Viaje* (1990) and in the aforementioned *Trás-os-Montes*, in which Llamazares refers to himself as 'el viajero'.²⁷

However, as Henn also notes:

the Spanish novelist and travel writer Camilo José Cela used third-person narration for all six of his accounts of his travels (published between 1948 and 1986) through various regions of his home country, styling himself 'el viajero' in three of these works and 'el vagabundo' in the others.²⁸

²⁵ Henn notes that 'Saramago's photographs tend to show people and architectural or artistic details, while the other plates largely show buildings, monuments and landscapes.' (Henn, p. 175).

²⁶ Leal, pp. 198-200.

²⁷ Julio Llamazares, *El río del olvido* (Barcelona: Editorial Seix Barral, 1990).

²⁸ Henn, p. 179.

Cela refers to this narrative style in an essay published in 1964, writing: ‘El vagabundo – que ahora habla de él como de otro hombre, objetivándose en la distanciadora y persuasiva tercera persona’.²⁹ Henn thinks it likely that Llamazares was influenced by Cela’s approach.³⁰ Saramago, on the other hand, does not justify his own use of the third person, nonetheless, he may also have read Cela and been influenced by his use of ‘el viajero’. Saramago uses the technique to enable the narrator to look at himself almost as a separate character, adding commentaries that use irony and critical distance. The effect can be envisaged usefully in cinematic terms, if we imagine that instead of the camera being located at the traveller’s eye level, it is instead located some distance away, looking onto the traveller and accompanied by a voiceover.

Viagem is of course a domestic travel account, and, as Leal has emphasised, it reveals Saramago’s inheritance from Almeida Garrett (indeed *Viagem* begins with a dedication to Garrett, whom he calls ‘mestre de viajantes’).³¹ As discussed in Chapter 2, Garrett, in his own domestic travel account, *Viagens na Minha Terra* (1846), exploits the genre’s flexibility by producing a work which in fact covers very little geographical distance, incorporates dialogue, and includes a fictional short story, that of Joaninha.³² Medeiros considers that Saramago has ‘invoked and inverted Garrett’s model’ (inverting it by actually writing about travel within Portugal, but invoking it by interweaving different types of stories, including ‘traditional legends’, ‘imagined episodes’ and ‘descriptions of the encounters the author experiences’).³³

²⁹ Camilo José Cela, ‘Con la mochila al hombro y una paz infinita en el corazón’, in *Obra completa*, Tomo IV, *Viajes por España*, I (1948-1952) (Barcelona: Destino, 1965), pp. 9-16 (p. 10).

³⁰ Llamazares was also familiar with Saramago’s travel account, which is mentioned on a number of occasions in *Trás-os-Montes*.

³¹ Leal, p. 191.

³² Despite the title, the account only covers a short journey, from Lisbon to Santarém.

³³ Medeiros, p. 112.

In his introductory remarks, Saramago writes: 'O viajante viajou no seu país. Isto significa que viajou por dentro de si mesmo, pela cultura que o formou e está formando'.³⁴ Saramago therefore frames his journey as being one of self-exploration and discovery. Of course, ever since the Romantic period travel accounts have foregrounded the experience of travel as one that leads to greater self-knowledge. Indeed, travel books typically 'dramatiz[e] an engagement between self and world'.³⁵ For Saramago, this engagement is coloured by his assertion that his country's culture has shaped him and continues to shape him. Understanding that culture better can, therefore, contribute to a richer understanding of the self. Medeiros writes that though Saramago is careful to make explicit the subjectivity of his own experience, and that of his representation of the Portuguese territory, he also at times 'slips into traditional notions of representation as transparency'.³⁶ One example is in the preface when he uses the following series of images to describe (in the third person) his role of traveller during the trip:

foi, por muitas semanas, um espelho reflector das imagens exteriores, uma vidraça transparente que luzes e sombras atravessaram, uma placa sensível que registrou, em trânsito e em processo, as impressões, as vozes, o murmúrio infindável de um povo. (7)

Saramago here uses two traditional metaphors (the first of the mirror was famously used by Stendhal), as well as a third which may allude to the presence of his own photographs in the first edition of *Viagem*.³⁷ Such images would appear to contradict his own emphasis on the subjective filter of the writer. Although this slippage is surprising, it reveals a tension of which the author may have been aware, when he describes

³⁴ José Saramago, *Viagem a Portugal*, (Lisboa: Editorial Caminho, 1990), p. 7. Further references to this edition will be in the body of the text.

³⁵ Casey Blanton, *Travel Writing: Self and World* (New York: Routledge, 2002), p. xi.

³⁶ Medeiros, p. 116.

³⁷ Medeiros, p. 114. In *Le Rouge et le Noir*, Stendhal uses the following image to describe the realist novel: 'un roman, c'est un miroir qui se promène sur une grande route'. Stendhal, *Le Rouge et le Noir* (Paris: Gallimard, 1952), p. 557.

Viagem as the ‘história de viagem e viajante reunidos em uma procurada fusão daquele que vê e daquilo que é visto, encontro *nem sempre pacífico* de subjectividades e objectividades’ (7, my emphasis). However, without wishing to undermine the importance of *Viagem* as a piece of literature in its own right, it is useful to remember that *Viagem* comes early in Saramago’s literary career, and before *Memorial del Convento*. The slippage Medeiros identifies is evidence that this text was partly a place for developing and trying out ideas, ideas which are developed more consistently in later works, including *História*. This further reinforces my argument from Chapter 2 that the relationship between the genres of travel writing and historical fiction deserves further critical attention due to their frequent interconnectedness.

As we saw a moment ago, Saramago describes himself as registering ‘o processo, as impressões, as vozes, o murmúrio infindável de um povo’ (7). The importance of the contribution of ordinary people in shaping both history and culture is a thematic vein running through *Viagem*, and also echoes academic trends of the time in Historiography and New Art History. As Sabine reminds us, ‘Saramago’s literary project emerged [...] out of a culture of resistance writing profoundly influenced by Marxist literary and aesthetic theories’, and Saramago himself stated that Marxism was the only way of seeing the world that consistently made sense to him.³⁸

Broadly speaking, Saramago’s journey through Portugal begins in the north and runs southwards. As Henn notes, Saramago dedicates comparatively little time to exploring the Algarve, and frequently reminds the reader that he cannot stay too long in one place.³⁹ He does however visit Silves and admires the Moorish castle there, writing:

³⁸ Sabine, p. 3. Reis, p. 78.

³⁹ Henn, p. 179.

Este castelo é obra árabe. Está uma ruína, mas formosa. E a pedra vermelha, [...] dá-lhe, contraditoriamente, um ar de construção recente, como se fosse feito de argila ainda húmida, de barro acabado de amassar. [...] O viajante admira a enorme cisterna que está no meio da esplanada, com a sua abóbada sustentada por quatro ordens e colunas, como uma mesquita. E vai ver, surpreendido pelo engenho da invenção, as pequenas construções subterrâneas do [sic.] que os árabes faziam silos. (251)

Aside from the castle's attractiveness, Saramago here focuses on the ingenuity of its design and also on its strange air of newness. It is strange not only because of the distance in time, but also because of the distance Saramago feels from the (Islamic) culture of Gharb al-Andalus, after centuries of erasure by the official discourse which has promoted a Christian Portuguese identity. He writes earlier in the account that: 'Do ponto de vista das tradições populares', 'o tempo dos Mouros' is a period for which there is a lack of 'testemunhos materiais abundantes', a period which is 'fertilíssimo em lendas' (89). The historical traces that Saramago comes across in travels around Portugal do however lead him to reflect on the period immediately after the reconquest, and on the cultural loss that resulted from the expulsion of the Muslims and Jews.

Responses to Mudéjar Architecture

Saramago's fascination with pre-eighteenth-century Portuguese architecture is evident in the work, with one disgruntled reviewer of *Viagem* writing that he should have named the work *A Guide to the Churches of Portugal*.⁴⁰ Amongst this wealth of reflections, Saramago's discussions of mudéjar style are sporadic, nonetheless, they do show a particular evolution in his thinking over the course of the narrative. The first reflection comes when the traveller reaches Aveiro, and spots something unusual about the Christ figure on the altar in the Church:

⁴⁰ Steve Porter, 'Review – José Saramago's Journey to Portugal', *Steve Porter's World of Books*, 18 July 2010 <<https://stevenjporter.wordpress.com/2010/07/18/review-jose-saramagos-journey-to-portugal>> [accessed 17 September 2019].

O viajante apenas falará daquele Cristo crucificado que está, não falhando a memória, no coro alto [...] É uma figura estranha, calva, ou que assim parece. [...] não é o corpo esguio a que estamos acostumados, não tem a esbelteza que o descaimento do tronco e dos membros inferiores acentua; [...] Que Cristo é este, de que ninguém fala? Diz o guia que parece ter sido feito em Burgos, por gente árabe convertida ao cristianismo, assim se explicando a anatomia doutra raça, o rosto exótico. Se o escultor era mudéjar, terá preferido olhar o seu próprio corpo para fazer o Cristo, em vez de ir procurar modelos numa outra cultura, que só dolorosamente iria assimilando. Esta imagem de Cristo, aos olhos do viajante, exprime essa dor. (89)

The Christ figure in question, which dates from the fifteenth century, is in fact gothic rather than mudéjar. It is described in the Portuguese press in 2017 as being an iconic piece, with a face that appears to either smile or look sad depending on the angle of the viewer – something that Saramago had also noticed.⁴¹ Although Saramago does not reflect further on the guide's comment about the figure being made in Burgos, his very inclusion of this point is indicative of his awareness of Spain and Portugal's shared Islamic cultural history, and also of the influence and flow of craftsmanship from Spain (where the mudéjar tradition is far more developed) into Portugal. Of course, it is a reality which also challenges monolithic concepts of Portuguese nationalism. Saramago reads in this representation of the body of Christ the personal pain of a *mourisco* artisan who has been forced to assimilate into Christian culture but is nonetheless able to represent his own experience in this Christ figure. As such, he sees the sculpture as providing a visual counternarrative to the official discourse which has silenced the *mourisco* experience.⁴²

The Aveiro Christ figure has a lasting impact on Saramago, as we can see in the next extract. When Saramago finds himself in Tomar (an inland city south of Coimbra

⁴¹ Maria José Santana, 'Museu de Aveiro dá mais visibilidade ao seu Cristo crucificado do séc. XV', *Público*, 4 April 2017 <<https://www.publico.pt/2017/04/04/local/noticia/museu-de-aveiro-da-mais-visibilidade-ao-seu-cristo-crucificado-do-sec-xv-1767525>> [accessed 16 September 2019].

⁴² See also Marcelo Campos Tiago, *Na estrada com José, no mar com Manoel: a construção das representações espaço-temporais em Viagem a Portugal de José Saramago e em Um filme falado de Manoel de Oliveira* (unpublished doctoral thesis, Universidade Presbiteriana Mackenzie, 2011) <<http://tede.mackenzie.br/jspui/handle/tede/2064>> (pp. 167-168) for an analysis of Saramago's reflections on the Aveiro Christ figure. Marcelo Campos comments that Saramago gives a new meaning to the classic crucifixion image.

and north of Lisbon) he is impressed by the vastness of the Castle, which he says looks as if it had been built by giants. He goes on to comment:

Parece que foram judeus magrebinos os construtores, os mesmos que depois vieram a construir a sinagoga de Tomar e são autores da cripta de D. Afonso, aonde o viajante logo irá. Recordar-se o viajante do Cristo de Aveiro, provavelmente de gente mudéjar, mete na mesma caldeira cristãos-novos e convertidos árabes, espreita para ver como fervem as tradições, as novas crenças, e as contradições de umas e outras, e começa a ver surgirem formas diferentes de arte, súbitas mutações infelizmente integradas antes do seu desenvolvimento pleno. (156)

The work of Arabised Jewish artisans reveals the cultural diversity of Portugal's medieval history, and the experience of seeing their work leads Saramago to begin to reflect on the idea of cultural mixing as a productive experience, one which did not reach its full potential. This idea of an arrested artistic development resurfaces when he later visits Sintra's National Palace, offering his own laudatory impression of the inner patios:

Poucas coisas podem ser mais belas e repousantes que os pátios interiores do Palácio da Vila, poucas de mais serena exaltação que a capela gótica. Quando o espírito cristão se encontrou com o espírito árabe, uma nova arte quis nascer. Cortaram-lhe as asas para que não voasse. Entre os pássaros do paraíso seria esse um dos mais formosos. Não pode voar, não pode viver. (187)

Here Saramago develops his previous reflection, and by adopting a poetic style and the image of a bird, his language becomes more emotive. It also anticipates the mythic tone adopted by Adalberto Alves from the mid-1980s onwards. AbdoolKarim Vakil, who discusses the significance of Alves' writing, is critical of the way that it slips into an 'overcompensating stress on the "mythic"', nostalgic vision of a lost Gharb al-Andalus.⁴³ However, in Saramago's writing, this mythopoetic effect is never sustained, and indeed is often checked by the presence of irony, as we shall see.

Saramago's reflections continue as he moves southwards into Alentejo, and visits the Solar de Sempre Noiva (Sempre Noiva Manor House) on his way to Évora, commenting:

Outra vez o viajante se lamenta de não terem ido por diante os frutos do espírito cristão e do espírito mourisco. Juntar e fazer viver a força e a graça teria sido acto de inteligência e sensibilidade. Foi mais fácil cortar cabeças, uns a gritarem: "Santiago e aos mouros", os outros a

⁴³ Vakil, p. 37.

clamarem: “Em nome de Alá.” Que conversas terão no céu Alá e Jeová, isso é que nós não sabemos. (209)

The reference to ‘Santiago’ here refers to St James the Great, one of Jesus’ disciples, who was also believed to be the protector of the Portuguese Christian army during the reconquest period. Here the mythopoetic tone resurfaces with the phrase ‘os frutos do espírito cristão e do espírito mourisco’, and the two cultures are characterised in essentialist terms as ‘a força e a graça’. However, Saramago then offers a damning verdict: for both sides, ‘[f]oi mais fácil cortar cabeças’. The sarcastic tone deployed here anticipates that used in *História*, where those who use religion to further violent or isolationist agendas are lambasted. Saramago’s thinking also starts to develop a profound sense of loss, when he muses on what might have been if this culturally collaborative artistic project had been allowed to continue.

Saramago’s reflections develop further when he later recounts seeing the abandoned São Sebastião Church on the road out of Serpa towards Beja:

Já na saída para Beja olha a abandonada Ermida de São Sebastião, tão formosa na sua hibridez de manuelino e mudéjar. Hibridez, pensa, porém seria mais correcto dizer simbiose, união não apenas formal, mas vital. Não tão vital assim, repreende o espírito lógico, uma vez que o estilo não ultrapassou os limites do Alentejo nem se prolongou no tempo, transformando-se. Vital, sim, responde o espírito intuitivo, porque a arquitectura civil, a casa, a chaminé, o alpendre aí estão a proclamar donde vêm, que pais estilísticos foram os seus: a construção moura, que perdurou para além da reconquista, a construção gótica, que a ela se juntou em seu devido tempo. (233-236)

This insertion of an inner debate over whether it is more correct to refer to hybridity or symbiosis exemplifies Saramago’s approach as being openly contrary to that of an architectural historian. As a historically-informed traveller, Saramago claims the authority to draw an important message from the hermitage: that of the power of architecture to speak to us about rich cultural origins, in defiance of imposed discourses. However, this authority comes from a mixture of both logic and intuition, implying an emotional facet to his thinking. It is, in fact, the ‘espírito intuitivo’ which reasserts the narrator’s suggestion that the church’s architecture is a symbiosis of Moorish and Gothic

elements. The idea of a symbiosis implies that rather than there simply being a formal amalgamation of styles (architectural hybridity), there is in fact a living (and mutually beneficial) relationship between the Moorish and Gothic styles in the building. This idea of a living relationship or union ('união vital') is reminiscent (though not identical) to the idea of the Islamic legacy having a living presence in Portugal, as was discussed in Chapter 2 in regard to the writing of Athaide Oliveira, Oliveira Parreira and Adalberto Alves.⁴⁴

Finally, when Saramago visits Beja's castle he remarks:

Das suas salas interiores, todas abobadadas, levaria o viajante, se pudesse, a sala central, de abóbada estrelada, muçulmana de inspiração, para prova de que os arquitectos cristãos souberam, ainda por muito tempo, entender a necessidade de um estilo e de uma técnica que tinham, nesta região, raízes culturais profundas. Tolice foi, mais tarde, tê-las arrancado. (236-7)

Whereas scholarship has often emphasised the use of Islamic decorative styles in Christian Iberia as being associated with displays of wealth, refined or fashionable aesthetics or power, here Saramago argues that Portuguese Christian architects could not overlook Islamic architectural designs due to their deep cultural roots in Portugal. Again, Saramago laments the loss of these roots, and the promotion of a more narrowly Christian identity and aesthetic.

Saramago's visit to the Algarve is comparatively short compared to his time spent in the North of the country and does not yield any further discussion on mudéjar architecture. In fact, aside from his comments on the castle of Silves, he is mainly preoccupied with the presence of tourists. However, as we have seen, he is undeniably attuned to the power of mudéjar architecture to offer a visual counter-narrative against any discourse seeking to homogenise Portugal's religious and cultural heritage.

⁴⁴ Vakil uses the phrase 'living presence' in this regard (Vakil, p. 35).

Memory and Historical Bias

Amongst Saramago's reflections in *Viagem* are instances where he recognises distortions in the way that the reconquest and historic Islamic presence are remembered. When travelling towards Sintra, he visits the São Mamede de Janas Chapel, writing: 'Seja como for, o viajante não está longe de acreditar que a Ermida de São Mamede de Janas foi, em tempos, local de outros cultos e diferentes rituais. Não faltam igrejas no lugar de mesquitas' (181). There are a number of churches in Portugal which are believed to stand on the site of former mosques (in the case of Mértola's Church of Nossa Senhora da Anunciação, the original walls of the mosque and the mihrab still remain). Here the phrase 'Não faltam igrejas no lugar de mesquitas' is not meant to apply to the chapel literally, rather it is a concise way of alluding to places of worship being reused by different religions, and therefore having an impure history.

In Évora, Saramago interrogates the labels we assign to buildings when he describes the Church of São Brás, built in the fifteenth century: 'O viajante vê um pouco de largo a Ermida de São Brás, com a sua cor de côdea de pão, fortaleza mourisca de merlões e coruchéus, grossa galilé, ninguém lhe chamaria igreja se não fosse o minúsculo campanário lá atrás' (229). Calling this building a church may reflect its function, but its appearance, Saramago suggests, communicates something different: the historic influence of Islamic culture in Portugal.⁴⁵

Vakil describes the narrator in *Viagem* as an 'irreverent "traveller"', citing the example of Saramago's response to the Castle of Guimarães. Like many medieval castles in Portugal, it was restored so extensively under the orders of the Estado Novo in the 1940s that it is now hard to see where the medieval building blocks lie. Rather than

⁴⁵ The building in fact has a manueline-mudéjar style.

discussing the castle itself, Saramago opts instead to commune with the sky and rocky ground, which Vakil equates to a rejection of 'Salazar's authoritarian nationalist ideology'.⁴⁶ Similarly, the Castle of São Jorge in Lisbon, which features prominently in *História*, is also a target for Saramago in *Viagem*, having also been restored during the Estado Novo (in time for the eighth-centenary commemorations of the Foundation of the Nation in 1940).⁴⁷ Saramago describes the Castle of São Jorge in *Viagem* as follows:

Fortaleza de tantas e tão remotas lutas, desde romanos, visigodos e mouros, hoje mais parece um parque. O viajante duvida se o preferiria assim. [...] aqui, apesar dos restauros, que num princípio reintegrariam a fortaleza nas sua recordação castrense, acaba por ter significado maior o pavão branco que se passeia, o cisne que voga no fosso. (194)

Here he specifically attacks the restoration process itself and the castle, imagined by the Salazarist state as being a grand symbol of the reconquest, is rendered ridiculous through being described as a park devoid of meaning, with nearby peacocks and swans surpassing it in elegance.

Saramago's visit to the parish church (Igreja Matriz) of the town of Pavia, north-east of Lisbon, also yields a striking example of historical partiality in relation to the Portuguese memory of al-Andalus. After noting that the outer wall is 'coroadá por merlões muçulmanos', he finds that the door, unlike the many locked Church doors he has encountered so far on his trip, opens of its own accord. At this point he adds a reference to *The Thousand and One Nights*, perhaps conscious of its status as the key text used by Europeans to imagine the Orient: 'nem precisou de dizer: "Abre-te, Sésamo"'. However, the real revelation comes when he sees the altarpiece:

Tornou o viajante a contemplar o retábulo e nota que na banqueta, além de um bispo e de Santo António, está Santo Iago malhando em mouros como em centeio verde. Veja-se como as coisas são: mouro é a arquitectura desta igreja, a aos mouros dão o pago de mandar avançar Santo Iago. Em luta desleal, porque o santo ganha sempre. (211)

⁴⁶ Vakil, p. 30.

⁴⁷ Vakil, p. 29.

This appears to be a case of history being written by the victors, in the sense that the image of Santo Iago (Saint James the Great) tussling with Moors is a heroic depiction. However, Saramago analyses the irony of the context of representation: the image appears in a Church whose architecture is Moorish. This juxtaposition offers multiple possibilities for interpretation, for which the building's history would need to be taken into account. This is not straightforward given the lack of historical records relating to the Church, but if we assume that the building was not formerly a mosque and was built after the Christian conquest of Évora, it would mean that the Moorish architectural style was being put at the service of a church which reinforced a Christian or victor-focused narrative about the reconquest.

Elsewhere, Saramago exposes the ruthlessness of medieval figures that are held up as heroes for assisting with the reconquest. In Évora he visits the Praça do Giraldo, named after Giraldo Sem Pavor (Gerald the Fearless) who helped Alfonso Henriques to expel the Moors from the Alentejo using stealth and surprise attacks. Saramago writes:

O viajante está em Évora. Esta é a praça famosa do Giraldo, aquele cavaleiro salteador ou salteador cavaleiro que, para lhe perdoar Afonso Henriques os demandos e crimes, se determinou a conquistar Évora. Por manha o conseguiu a inocência dos mouros, que tinham a velar numa torre um homem apenas e sua filha, cujos não velavam nada, antes a sono solto dormiam quando o Sem Pavor sem piedade lhes cortou a cabeça. Coitada da menina. No alvoroço do engano, supondo-se atacados noutro lado da cidade, deixaram os mouros abertas as portas da fortaleza, por onde entraram os mais soldados cristãos, com ajuda de mouriscos e moçárabes, que a seu bel-prazer mataram e aprisionaram. Foi isto em 1165. (224)

Saramago immediately exposes Giraldo as a 'salteador' [brigand], who doesn't hesitate in cutting off the head of a young girl, and juxtaposes Giraldo's former 'crimes' with 'a inocência dos mouros'. As the reader is familiar with Saramago's sceptical position, we know that he is not suggesting a straightforward moral dichotomy (Muslims innocent, Christians bad). Rather, he is criticising the discourse that glosses over acts of cruelty in the course of elevating certain figures to the level of heroes. Of course, this empathetical position towards the Moors is one that we have seen in previous travel writing (in

Davillier, for example), but Saramago implies here that the official Portuguese discourse has continued to glorify figures such as Sem Pavor unquestioningly. Saramago goes on to add: 'Que Évora fosse a que Giraldo conquistou, não é o viajante capaz de imaginar. Quantos mouros havia para conquistar a cidade, não sabe'(224), therefore stating categorically that he is not able to imagine twelfth-century Moorish Évora, since some historical information, such as the number of Moors that were present, is now unknowable. This position is one that Saramago went on to develop further in *História*, as we shall see. Unlike Oliveira Parreira, who sought to make Islamic Portugal immediately vivid to the reader, Saramago therefore prefers to expose certain aspects of it that are inaccessible or unknowable, and to mostly withhold that vivid experience, or suggest that it must be earned.

Saramago's approach is also characterised by the multiplicity of perspectives offered, indeed Medeiros emphasises Saramago's 'desire not to construct a controlling, totalizing narrative' in *Viagem*.⁴⁸ One of the ways in which this is achieved is through having a narrator whose stance is constantly shifting. Not long after the previous extract, Saramago states:

O viajante acha que tem muita sorte: alguém lhe conquistou um bom sítio para construir esta Évora, alguém a levantou, alguém a defendeu, alguém lutou para que as coisas fossem assim e não doutra maneira, tudo para que pudesse aqui regalar-se de artes e ofícios. Agradece em pensamento ao Sem Pavor, apesar de não lhe perdoar a rapariga degolada, agradece ao povo revoltoso de 1383, sem nada ter que lhe perdoar, e mete-se aos caminhos do Alentejo que o esperam, entre restolhos ardentes e ardentes palavras, trabalho, terra, revolução também. (229)

The reference to 'regalar-se de artes e ofícios' shows Saramago's awareness of his position of modern-day privilege, which allows him to enjoy medieval crafts and workmanship. In this section, Saramago thanks Sem Pavor (whilst still condemning his decapitation of the Moorish girl), and in the same sentence, with the mention of the

⁴⁸ Medeiros, p. 112.

‘povo revoltoso e 1383’, evokes the resistance movement of the Portuguese interregnum (countering Castilian intervention). By placing these events side by side, the Castilian crown and the Moors are therefore both represented as threats to local governance. This is a useful reminder of Saramago’s belief that power structures should be local (he famously opposed Portugal joining the EU), and in the need for a revolution led by those who work the land. The phrase ‘entre restolhos ardentes e ardentes palavras’ also recalls his previous use of a similar poetic mirroring effect (‘aquele cavaleiro salteador ou salteador cavaleiro’) as a tool for expressing irony, indeed, *Viagem* frequently makes use of such poetic use of language for literary effect and to draw attention to particular ironies.

Indirect References to the Memory of Al-Andalus and the Reconquest

It is curious that most of Saramago’s discussions in *Viagem* concerning the memory of Portugal’s historic Islamic presence occur when he is outside of Lisbon, especially given that he later chooses to write a novel centred around the siege of Lisbon in 1147. There are a few exceptions, such as Saramago’s visit to the Church and Monastery of São Vicente de Fora where he sees eighteenth-century tiles representing the reconquest of Lisbon and Santarém that are ‘cheios de movimento’. He also observes that São Vicente de Fora was built (outside the old city walls) ‘em terras onde acamparam os cruzados alemães e flamengos que deram a D. Afonso Henriques a mão necessária para conquistar Lisboa’ (194). Since the conquest of Santarém (March 1147) and to an even greater extent the role of the crusaders in the siege of Lisbon are of central importance to *História*, the experience described by Saramago in *Viagem* anticipates this choice of focus for *História* and gives some indication of this novel’s long

gestation period. Overall though, in *Viagem* Saramago's focus in Lisbon tends to be on other histories and heritages, including the impact of the Lisbon earthquake on the city's appearance and identity. We should not, however, overlook certain more indirect discussions of the heritage of al-Andalus which take place, such as his account of his visit to the Alfama district.

Saramago first creates a feeling of anticipation by writing: 'O viajante ainda não descerá a Alfama' (p. 194). After visiting the aforementioned Church and Monastery of São Vicente de Fora, he then proceeds to announce conversationally: 'Agora é que o viajante vai a Alfama', and proceeds to use an extended metaphor to describe the Alfama district:

Alfama é um animal mitológico. Pretexto para sentimentalismos de várias cores, sardinha que muitos têm querido puxar à sua brasa, não barra caminhos a quem lá entra, mas *o viajante sente que o acompanham irónicos olhares*. [...] O viajante tem visto muito de mundo e vida, e nunca gostou de achar-se na pele do turista que vai, olha, faz que entende, tira fotografias e regressa à sua terra a dizer que conhece Alfama. Este viajante deve ser honesto. *Foi a Alfama, mas não sabe o que Alfama é*. [...] vem-lhe a vontade de penetrar outra vez nas sombrias travessas, nos becos inquietantes, nas escadas de quebra-costas, e ficar por lá enquanto não aprender ao menos as primeiras palavras deste discurso imenso de casas, de pessoas, de histórias, de risos e inevitáveis choros. Animal mitológico por conta alheia, Alfama vive à sua própria e difícil conta. Tem horas de bicho saudável, tem outras em que se deita a um canto para lambar as feridas que séculos de pobreza lhe abriram na carne e esta não encontra maneira de curar. (194, my emphasis)

In this passage, Saramago explores the mythical status of the Alfama, portraying it as an animal that cannot be understood easily, one that can appear both untamed and wounded. The district's history is important here: the Estado Novo regime had been happy to promote Fado music, which is associated with the Alfama, as being quintessentially Portuguese, but had not tackled the area's poverty. By the time of Saramago's visit, after the return of democracy, the area still had roofless buildings. In *Viagem*, the Alfama's status as inspiration for sentimentalist impressions of Lisbon is not lost on its residents, who we hear offer 'irónicos olhares' to passing tourists.⁴⁹ This

⁴⁹ Although Saramago does refer to tourists elsewhere in this passage, his visit came before the main tourist boom in Lisbon.

passage, and particularly the phrase: 'Foi a Alfama, mas não sabe o que Alfama é', is an example of another recurring theme in *Viagem*, that is the acknowledgement by the travel writer of failure, of the impossibility of knowing a place from a short visit. Whilst Saramago does note the Alfama's twisting narrow alleys (194), in line with his resistance in *História* to evoking either the picturesque or the exotic, he chooses not to evoke Alfama's Moorish origins, preferring instead to sympathise with its current residents.

Viagem resists focusing heavily on Portugal's most popular tourist attractions, instead encouraging detours and finding historical traces which may have been overlooked. Nonetheless, Saramago does visit and describe Sintra – the obsession of British travel writers – acknowledging its attractiveness to travellers by adding: 'Todos os caminhos vão dar a Sintra. O viajante já escolheu o seu' (182). Rather like the nineteenth-century travel writers we saw in Chapter 1, he chooses not to dwell on the Moorish castle, giving the following justification: 'Tendo avistado destes passos o Castelo dos Mouros, o viajante deu-se por satisfeito. Aliás, no geral, castelos é vê-los de fora, e este, tão maneirinho à distância, é assim que quer ser visto: emblematicamente' (186). This reminder that Castles are above all emblems of hierarchical power allows Saramago to instead focus (critically) on a Sintra which, though it is a paradise for the visitor (181), he sees as the product of 'delírios românticos' (186). Saramago's harshest commentary is reserved for Montserrat Palace:

Ao perto, o viajante entristece: este capricho inglês, alimentado com o dinheiro do comércio de panos, e de inspiração vitoriana, mostra a fugacidade dos revivalismos. [...] Estas arquitecturas oitocentistas são geralmente de importação, ecléticas até ao desvario. A grande penetração económica dos impérios tomava para seu divertimento as alheias culturas. E isto sempre foi, também, o primeiro sinal das decadências. (182)

The mention of 'comércio de panos' is a reference to Francis Cook, who bought Montserrat Palace in 1855 and restored it. Cook worked for and eventually ran his father's business, Cook, Son & Co., which traded wool, cotton, linen and silk. With a

sober Marxist gaze, Saramago denounces Montserrate as capricious, and nineteenth-century Orientalism as fleeting and superficial. He exposes the fact that this Orientalism, which is 'de inspiração victoriana' (that of Cook's Victorian Britain), was imported and funded by industries propped up by the British Empire. Empire, he argues, appropriates other cultures and reduces them to pure entertainment for the rich.

Saramago's vigorously critical assessment of Montserrate contrasts with his more nuanced reaction to Pena Palace. He begins by being sarcastically dismissive of the building's mix of styles, using an informal style and colloquial turns of phrase: 'Já não é pequeno trabalho vê-lo, aguentar o choque desta confusão de estilos, passar em dez passos do gótico para o manuelino, do mudéjar para o neoclássico, e de tudo isto para invenções com poucos pés e nenhuma cabeça'. Nonetheless, seeing the building from afar produces a different reaction:

Mas o que não se pode negar é que, visto de longe, o palácio apresenta uma aparência de unidade arquitectónica invulgar, que provavelmente lhe virá muito mais da sua perfeita integração na paisagem do que da relação das suas próprias massas entre si. (186)

Pena Palace thus becomes an illustration of the subjectivity of perspective, as Saramago has to admit that from afar Pena is perfectly integrated into its landscape.

Finally, it is worth noting the authority that Saramago bestows on the traveller when, later, he is considering which route to take and decides to end one of his itineraries in Alcázar do Sal in Alentejo, south-east of Lisbon.⁵⁰ He writes: 'Todo o viajante tem o direito de inventar as suas próprias geografias' (205). This assertion also implies that the traveller can create their own perspective on the land they visit (in this case, Saramago's own homeland). This possibility for reorientation within space arms the traveller with further possibilities for critical engagement with national narratives.

⁵⁰ The town became an important outpost during the time of Al-Andalus, though Saramago does not allude to this.

História do Cerco de Lisboa (1989)

I shall now move on to consider Saramago's work of historiographical metafiction, *História do Cerco de Lisboa*, where appropriate highlighting the links between this text and *Viagem*. First published in 1989, with the English translation appearing in 1996, *História* is a novel that engages critically with history books, historical novels and with the question of historical memory. As the title suggests, it takes the 1147 Christian siege of Moorish Lisbon (and modern representations of the same) as its point of focus. However, for reasons which will become clear, we should also keep in mind the wider European context of the Crusades. The Crusades were religious wars sanctioned by the Latin Church, with the term most commonly referring to the campaigns aimed at recovering access to the Holy Land, which at the time was under Muslim rule. However, Pope Eugenius III also authorised a crusade in the Iberian Peninsula in the spring of 1147 and gave Alfonso VII of Leon and Castile permission to include his campaigns against the Moors with the rest of the Second Crusade.

The Second Crusade as a whole (1147-49) had been sanctioned in response to the fall of the County of Edessa (located in present-day Turkey) in 1144. It was led by Louis VII of France and Conrad III of Germany, who marched their armies separately across Europe and into Anatolia but were each defeated separately by the Seljuk Turks, eventually participating in an ill-advised attack on Damascus in 1148.⁵¹ The fall of Lisbon was in fact the only significant Christian success of the Second Crusade. 13,000 Flemish, Frisian, Norman, English, Scottish, and German crusaders had sailed by ship from Portsmouth in 1147, and though intending to sail directly to the Holy Land, bad weather

⁵¹ 'Germany' here refers to the German kingdom within the Holy Roman Empire. 'The Second Crusade' in *A History of the Crusades* ed. by Marshall W. Baldwin, 6 vols (Madison, Wisconsin: University of Wisconsin Press, 1969), I, pp. 463-512.

forced them to stop at Oporto. After meeting Afonso I of Portugal, the crusaders agreed to help his army of 7,000 to attack Lisbon, in exchange for the right to pillage and obtain ransom money from any prisoners taken.⁵² The siege was successful, although the terms of surrender were not kept to by the Christians, who had promised the Muslims that the occupants would be able to hold onto their lives and property. In fact, they were stripped of their valuable possessions and forced to leave the city. Most of the crusaders then settled in Lisbon, whilst some sailed on to the Holy Land.

The context of the Crusades has particular significance for the novel's plot, which is constructed around the decision by Raimundo, a proofreader living in 1980s Lisbon, to alter a sentence in the proofs of a history book with the same title as Saramago's novel. Raimundo inserts the word 'não' into the sentence stating that the foreign crusaders did assist Afonso Henriques in besieging Moorish Lisbon, so that it instead states that they did *not* offer assistance. After his act of playful sabotage is discovered, Raimundo, with encouragement from his new boss and love interest Maria Sara, determines to write an alternative history of the siege in which this assistance was not offered to the Christian forces. We might wonder why Saramago chose this particular historical event as the one to manipulate. Certainly, the relative importance of the roles played by the foreign crusaders and the Portuguese soldiers has historically been contested: as Sabine notes, Herculano 'denounces foreign historians' failure to acknowledge the Portuguese contribution'.⁵³

⁵² Afonso Henriques had been named King of the Portuguese by Pope Innocent II in 1143, after being proclaimed King by his soldiers following his victory at the Battle of Ourique in 1139. However, Saramago deliberately does not refer to him as 'Rei' in *História do Cerco de Lisboa*, instead referring to him as 'Afonso Henriques' or 'D. [Dom] Afonso Henriques', thus undermining the narrative that the Portuguese nation was born in 1139.

⁵³ Sabine, p. 240.

The alternative history that Raimundo is writing also seems to have much in common with Wesseling's subsequent description of uchronian fiction, in which:

Changes are wrought upon canonized history by effecting shifts among the various factors that played a role in a given historical situation or series of events. These shifts produce a counterfactual course of events which can either be more or less desirable than the way in which things actually turned out. [...] world-historical figures may be made to set out upon an alternative course of action, causal weight may be shifted from one historical factor to another, etc.⁵⁴

David Frier highlights that 'Raimundo's rewritten version of history forces the King into making egalitarian concessions to the ordinary people which would have been unthinkable in the twelfth century'.⁵⁵ As such, Frier sees Raimundo learning not to value or be overly reverent towards 'mere historical accuracy for its own sake', instead privileging the 'building [of] a better future which views people as an end in themselves'.⁵⁶ Whilst not seeking to deny the novel's utopian undercurrent, I would argue that through the character of Raimundo, Saramago does advocate a critical engagement with historical sources in the novel, including detail-oriented work. Indeed, Saramago shows that such work can complement purposefully directed imaginative and creative processes.

Much has been made by critics, and rightly so, of the parallelism between Raimundo and Maria Sara's relationship and the siege itself.⁵⁷ Sabine notes that '[b]esiegement serves as a multiple metaphor that is crucial to the development of both of *História's* plot arcs'.⁵⁸ However, I wish to divert my analysis more closely onto Saramago's representation of Islamic Lisbon. My analysis will begin by looking at the itineraries used in *História* to examine how the figure of Raimundo draws on Saramago's

⁵⁴ Wesseling, p. 100. An example from contemporary popular fiction would be Robert Harris' *Fatherland* (New York: Random House, 1992).

⁵⁵ David Frier, *The Novels of José Saramago: Echoes from the Past, Pathways into the Future* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2007), p. 118.

⁵⁶ Frier, p. 132.

⁵⁷ See Frier, p. 121; Sabine p. 235; Alves de Paula Martins, p. 338 and pp. 350-1.

⁵⁸ Sabine, p. 207.

experiences as a traveller. I will also later address the criticisms *História* makes of the traditional historical novel, the author's use of irony and comedy, and his representation of the medieval Christians and Muslims.

Itineraries

Over the course of *História do Cerco de Lisboa*, Raimundo embarks on a series of reflective walks around parts of historic Lisbon. He examines parts of the city he calls home with fresh eyes, looking for the traces of an older Lisbon that he is still trying to grasp with his imagination. I will argue that the particular way that Raimundo engages with architectural traces recalls the figure of the traveller in *Viagem*. When making this comparison it is important to note that Raimundo has certain advantages that the traveller in *Viagem* does not. In *Viagem*, the author-traveller acknowledges his failure to really know and understand certain places on route. As David Henn highlights, 'the author gives frequent reminders that he does not have an unlimited amount of time to spend examining the places he visits and has quite a busy schedule to keep to'.⁵⁹ On the other hand, in *História*, Raimundo, as an inhabitant of Lisbon, has more time in which to follow a number of itineraries, with the first following the outline of the old city walls, followed later by two separate trips to Castle of São Jorge.

Of these three itineraries, the first has been discussed in detail by Sabine as revealing to Raimundo such aspects as the 'complexity of the past' and 'the propensity of its traces to furnish multiple narratives of origin, allegiance and identity'.⁶⁰ The walk begins when Raimundo has made the decision to insert the word 'não' into the book

⁵⁹ Henn, p. 179.

⁶⁰ Sabine, p. 211-213 (p. 212).

proof, a decision that cannot be reversed as the proof has already been collected. Feeling on edge, he leaves his apartment and heads towards the Leitaria A Graciosa (a café). The narrator remarks that: 'Raimundo Silva, que justamente se encontra nos lugares da antiga cidade moura, tem, desta coincidência histórica e topográfica, uma consciência múltipla, caleidoscópica, sem dúvida graças à decisão que formalmente tomou de haverem os cruzados resolvido não auxiliar os portugueses'.⁶¹ The image of the kaleidoscope is very apt, since the image seen by the user constantly shifts as the object is rotated, and in a similar way, Raimundo's perception of the city continually changes as the different landmarks that he sees trigger sudden realisations, insights and visions in relation to Moorish Lisbon.⁶² Sabine has also linked the idea of kaleidoscopic vision to Saramago's evocation, in his interviews with Carlos Reis, of a vision of the past as an 'arrumação caótica'.⁶³

Raimundo's objective for the walk to Leitaria A Graciosa is described as follows: 'A sua ideia [...] é acompanhar o traçado da cerca moura, segundo as informações do historiador, poucas, dubitáveis, como tem a honradez de reconhecer' (68). David Frier has noted that the first itinerary is a possible echo of the poem 'Caminos' by Antonio Machado – the poet was admired by Saramago.⁶⁴ From here Raimundo walks to one of the entrances to the Alfama district, via the Arco do Chafariz d'El-Rei.⁶⁵ Saramago emphasises Raimundo's slow and methodical manner: 'Raimundo Silva não tem pressa. Consulta gravemente o itinerário, por sua satisfação vai tomando minuciosas notas

⁶¹ José Saramago, *História do Cerco de Lisboa* (Lisboa: Editorial Caminho, 1989), p. 60. Further references will be in the body of the text.

⁶² See for example Alves de Paula Martins (pp. 323-357) on multiplicity in *História do Cerco de Lisboa*.

⁶³ Sabine has also linked the idea of kaleidoscopic vision to Saramago's evocation, in his interviews with Carlos Reis, of a vision of the past as an 'arrumação caótica' (Sabine, p. 214).

⁶⁴ Frier, p. 121. Machado's poem 'Caminos' opens with the lines: 'De la ciudad moruna | tras las murallas viejas, | yo contemplo la tarde silenciosa, | a solas con mi sombra y con mi pena.' See Antonio Machado, *Poesías Completas* (Madrid: Editorial Espasa Calpe, 2003), p. 211.

⁶⁵ Saramago does not specifically comment on the origin of 'chafariz' which comes from the Arabic and means 'fountain'.

mentais' (72-3). This attention to detail, however, is accompanied by imaginative work. When he finds himself just outside the old city walls, where the besieging army would have been located, he starts to imagine that at any moment a young Moorish woman might appear at the window and begin to sing: 'não faltaria mais que abrir-se agora um daqueles janelões e aparecer uma rapariga moura a cantar, Esta é Lisboa prezada, Resguardada, Aqui terá perdição, O cristão' (68-9). Raimundo then imagines a hint of playfulness in the woman's attitude, which dispels the idea that her words are purely disdainful. Drawing on old-age poetic tropes, this meditation leads him to muse on the idea that Lisbon is a woman: 'bem poderia ser que Lisboa, ao contrário do que parecia, não fosse cidade mas mulher, e a perdição somente amorosa' (69). As well as contributing to setting up the much-discussed parallels between the siege and Raimundo's relationship with Maria Sara, this sequence moves freely between the analysis of material historical remains, imagined dramatic sequences and abstract or lateral thinking.

Still following this first itinerary, Raimundo has lunch at a restaurant in the Alfama on the Rua de S. João da Praça, and there has a mute encounter with a young gypsy girl:

À porta do restaurante estava uma rapariguinha cigana, de uns doze anos, estendia a mão, à espera, sem pronunciar palavra, apenas olhando fito o revisor, que, indo atrás dos pensamentos que o ocupam, não viu cigana, mas moura, na hora da primeira necessidade, quando ainda havia a quem pedir e os cães, os gatos e os ratos julgavam ter vida assegurada até à sua natural morte, por doença ou guerra das espécies, afinal, o progresso é uma realidade, hoje ninguém, em Lisboa, anda à caça de animais para comer, Mas o cerco não acabou, avisam os olhos da cigana. (73)

For Sabine, the final statement above shows Raimundo's recognition of 'the persistence of ethnic prejudice and marginalisation'.⁶⁶ However, there is another significance to Raimundo's seeing a young Moorish girl in place of a gypsy girl. The confusion between

⁶⁶ Sabine, p. 213.

Moors and gypsies is one that is frequently described by French nineteenth-century writers. As Lou Charnon-Deutsch has investigated, certain French travel writers in the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries did not merely mistake the Gypsies for Moors but in fact believed they were their descendants.⁶⁷ Even for historically-informed writers, the association persisted. Prosper Mérimée's narrator in *Carmen* at first assumes Carmen is 'Mauresque' and when Charles Davillier and Gustave Doré visit Granada, Davillier writes that seeing groups of gypsies makes it easy for them to imagine themselves transported six or seven centuries back into a medieval past, describing a twenty-year old Gypsy woman as being 'brune comme une moresque'.⁶⁸ Writing in a Portuguese context, these references may appear dislocated or irrelevant, though they are also likely to reflect Saramago's wide reading of non-Portuguese literatures. Nonetheless, Saramago is here inscribing Raimundo into a rather problematic tradition of making such connections. Whereas for Saramago the purpose of the association is to rightly emphasise common feelings of ethnic marginalisation or persecution experienced across hundreds of years, for many nineteenth-century writers it was an association that added a further dimension to their romanticising and exoticising of the Gypsies.⁶⁹

After following the remainder of the wall, Raimundo heads towards home, but when he is fifty metres away comes to a sudden realisation:

[ele] mora no preciso lugar onde antigamente se abria a Porta de Alfofa, se da parte de dentro ou da parte de fora eis o que hoje não se pode averiguar e impede que saibamos, desde já, se Raimundo Silva é um sitiado ou um sitiante, vencedor futuro ou perdedor sem remédio. (75)

⁶⁷ See Lou Charnon-Deutsch, *The Spanish Gypsy: The History of a European Obsession* (Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2004), p. 47; 53.

⁶⁸ Prosper Mérimée, *Carmen et autres nouvelles*, 2 vols (Paris: Librairie Générale Française, 1983), II, p. 196. Gustave Doré and Charles Davillier, 'Voyage en Espagne' in *Le Tour du monde: nouveau journal des voyages* (Paris: Hachette, 1864), p. 23 and p. 27.

⁶⁹ It is worth noting that *Viagem a Portugal* also features a very brief encounter with a: 'rapariga morena, de olhos pretos e brilhantes, tipo evidente de cigana, bonita e de sorriso claro' (p. 218).

Here Saramago plays with the visual and auditory proximity of the words 'sitiado' and 'sitiante' ('besieged' and 'assailant' in English). The effect is to suggest that though Christians and Muslims are painted in Portuguese nationalist historical narratives as being diametrically opposed, there is in fact little to separate them, and that to belong to one side or the other is in fact random and arbitrary. This idea is developed later in the novel, when Raimundo and Maria Sara discuss the fact that his apartment lies where one of the towers defending the gate would have stood. Maria Sara asks: 'Então, aqui, na torre, que somos nós, mouros ou cristãos, Por enquanto, mouros, estamos cá justamente para impedir que os cristãos entrem, Não o conseguiremos' (267). Though Saramago drops this discussion into the dialogue very casually, it is a significant statement to say 'we are the Moors', even in a late twentieth century text. Even if the identification with the Moors here is a temporary one ('por enquanto'), it is nonetheless shown to be possible. This willingness to identify more directly with the Moors is also an important part of the way that texts in the second half of the twentieth century present a departure from previous representations. This can also be seen for example in Adalberto Alves' referral, in *O meu coração é árabe*, to 'antepassados que foram proscritos mas se esconderam na minha pele morena' as well as in the title of a collection of graphic short stories published in 2003, *Nós somos os mouros*.⁷⁰

Raimundo's itineraries are ones in which he gains particular insights which are not available him purely through reading and study: they are accessible only by walking through the city and engaging in a particular way with its historical traces. As I argued in my analysis of the narrator in *Viagem*, it is also a process by which the traveller/walker listens to their intuition, a trait which is replicated in Raimundo's engagement with

⁷⁰ Adalberto Alves, *O meu coração é árabe* (Lisbon: Assírio & Alvim, 1987), p. 12. Laura, Filipe Abranches and others; prefs. by Felipe Hernández Cava and João Paulo Cotrim, *Nós somos os mouros* (Lisbon: Assírio & Alvim, 2003).

Lisbon while he is in the process of gradually bringing his idea of an alternative account of the siege to fruition. In *História*, the idea of intuition is evoked when Raimundo is on the way to the Castle of São Jorge on his second itinerary, and we read that: ‘Raimundo quer ver a cidade, ainda não sabe para quê’ (133). This partially echoes the narrator’s description of the traveller’s visit to the Alfama in *Viagem*: ‘Foi a Alfama, mas não sabe o que Alfama é’ (195). Whereas the first quotation refers to a lack of prior understanding, which will be followed by enlightenment, and the second refers to an inability to understand or to know which remains with the traveller after having visited a place. However, these short statements are similar in style due to their succinctness and the way that they both engage with the idea of *not* knowing.

Raimundo’s second and third itineraries both involve visiting the Castle of São Jorge. As Vakil notes: ‘It was no doubt with a sense of irony that José Saramago’s publisher opted for Lisbon’s Castle of St George as the venue for the launch of his novel *History of the Siege of Lisbon*’. This, he argues, is because Saramago, was acutely aware of how the Estado Novo had used castles as ‘symbolic markers in the nationalist narrative of a nation forged in war’.⁷¹ As we saw previously, in *Viagem* Saramago disparagingly referred to the Castle of São Jorge in Lisbon as a ‘parque’ (194), and this sense that the castle is far from awe-inspiring is carried over into *História*. When on his second itinerary Raimundo heads to the castle, we hear: ‘Entrou no castelo, de cada vez surpreende-o que seja tão pequeno, uma coisa que parece de brincar, um outro legos ou meccano’ (134). In belittling the castle for looking like a small toy, Saramago undermines the Castle’s symbolic association with the legacy of the regime’s historical discourse.

⁷¹ Vakil, p. 29. This castle was extensively renovated by the *Estado Novo* in the 1940s.

Whilst at the Castle, Raimundo heads for the ramparts on the São Vicente side in order to look out over the Campo de Santa Clara, where Dom Afonso Henriques encamped his soldiers. Here the narrator comments on Raimundo's aim: 'o que Raimundo Silva procura, [...] é uma impressão de tangibilidade visual, algo que não saberia definir, que, por exemplo, podia ter feito dele agora mesmo um soldado mouro a olhar os vultos dos inimigos e o rebrilhar das espadas' (134-135). This statement underlines the fact that there is something uniquely inspiring about being in the physical place where a historical event occurred, which cannot be substituted by study, however extensive. Raimundo's desire to be transformed temporarily into a Moorish soldier in order to gain greater historical insight is also important, and part of his intellectual progression throughout the novel in which he learns to identify with the Other.

The question of perspective is highlighted again in Raimundo's third itinerary, in which he returns to the castle in order to help him imagine how the loss of the support (and manpower) of the crusaders would have altered the strategy of the Christian attackers:

Torna-se portanto necessário reconsiderar toda a estratégia, e é para examinar in loco o teatro das operações que Raimundo Silva volta a subir ao castelo, de cujas levantadas torres podem os olhos abarcar a extensão, como um tabuleiro de xadrez aonde virão pelear, objectivamente falando, os peões e os cavaleiros, sob as vistas do rei e dos bispos. (217)

Here Raimundo reduces the men to pawns and knights on a chessboard, thus evoking the way that soldiers are dehumanised by military commanders when planning attacks, as well as the relative safety enjoyed by some privileged onlookers in positions of power. However, he soon moves into an extended imagined debate, in which the voices of the Christians intervene to discuss tactics. After spending all afternoon at the castle, immersed in this imagined debate, Raimundo returns home as evening approaches (222).

Overall, these three itineraries allow Raimundo to gain insights from the particular imaginary work that interaction with a real physical place and its visual perspective allow. These moments both break his writer's block and give him the confidence to write an alternative history which goes against existing historical narratives such as the History that he is proofreading – a work which, as he himself assesses, merely repeats previous work and its associated narratives. The dynamic trajectory of Raimundo's physical displacements is therefore associated with a sense of intellectual progression, whilst the ability to return multiple times to a historical site provides him with a deeper understanding than that of the time-pressed traveller in *Viagem*.

While Saramago is keen to emphasise Raimundo's disciplined work ethic as a proofreader and researcher, he also explores how the topic of the siege invades Raimundo's less structured thoughts, including daydreams and the subconscious. In the third chapter, after a morning spent doing research, Raimundo looks out of his apartment window on a misty day, and daydreams about there being a mosque there in place of a cathedral: 'decerto não a poderia ver, por tão delgada que era, aérea, imponderável quase, e então, se esse fosse a hora, a voz do almuadem desceria do céu branco, directamente de Alá'. The minaret is described as being airy and graceful, beautiful rather than threatening, but its intangibility and the presence of a mist also appear to reflect the difficulty of grasping the idea itself. The centrality of the Christian cathedral and its architecture as markers of Christian identity clearly still held a certain power in the Portugal of the 1980s. It is not clear in this passage whether Raimundo is imagining twelfth-century Lisbon, or a modern-day Portugal that has remained Islamic. Certainly, the second idea is one that Saramago was already prepared to explore, if comically, in *Viagem*. In his account of his visit to Silves he writes:

Tem aí Silves, a alta colina, o alto castelo, lembre-se de que, se os mouros ainda por cá estivessem, ficaria muito contente, sendo horas de almoço, se lhe apresentassem uma lista onde pudesse ler: sardinhas assadas, em vez de um arabesco, belíssimo de ver, mas intraduzível. (251)

What is conveyed in this extract from *Viagem*, in which he shows some sympathy for the experience of the tourists visiting the Algarve, is also his openness to the idea of an Islamic cultural presence: we sense here that the idea of a modern-day Moorish Silves is not something that he finds threatening, in fact it is so wholly undisconcerting that he is able to focus on the question of menus and the beauty of Arabic calligraphy. Interestingly, though, he remarks that if the grilled sardines appeared on the menu solely in Arabic, then it would be beautiful but indecipherable for him. He therefore recognises that it is not enough to admire the aesthetic of Islamic culture, acts of translation are also needed to allow transcultural understanding.

In *História* the siege becomes an obsession for Raimundo the researcher that spills over into his subconscious: once he has finished his first itinerary (following the castle walls) and discovered that his apartment is on part of the old city wall, this realisation is reimagined in a dream:

De tão cansado dos exercícios do dia, dormiu pesadamente, mas algumas vezes acordou, sempre quando sonhava e voltava a sonhar com uma muralha sem nada dentro e que era como um saco de boca estreita alargando o bojo até à margem do rio. (75)

In this extract, the process of dreaming in which Raimundo sees an abstract image of the rampart as a sack suggests that he has begun to engage more deeply with reimagining the space that he inhabits, thanks partly to the considerable time he has spent following the old city walls. On another occasion, a little later in the novel, his conscious thoughts lead to a quasi-spiritual experience. This occurs the same day that the idea of writing an alternative history is first suggested to him, when Raimundo is at home, later, listening to the April rain:

Num movimento rápido, inesperado em pessoa habitualmente tão sóbria de gestos, Raimundo Silva abriu de par em par a janela, alguns borrifos salpicaram-lhe a cara, [...] e a mesma impressão

de força plena e desbordante lhe tomou o espírito e o corpo, esta é a cidade que foi cercada, as muralhas descem por ali até ao mar [...] esta é a moura Lisboa. (116)

It is important here to note the affirmative statements ('esta é a cidade que foi cercada' and 'esta é a moura Lisboa'), because they imply a greater confidence and are far more categorical than his earlier musings – his attempts to reimagine the Cathedral as a mosque, for example. Through the perspective of the view from his window, he is able to trace the contours of Moorish Lisbon and see it in its totality, offering yet another perspective which is different from his ambulatory work on the ground.⁷² Later, once Raimundo has started fleshing out the characters of his alternative history, Saramago presents another scene where Raimundo is again sitting by the window, and we hear that:

de certo modo Raimundo Silva anda a viver em dois tempos e em duas estações, o julho ardentíssimo que refulge e inflama as armas que cercam Lisboa, este abril húmido, gris, com um sol às vezes dardejante que torna a luz dura, como um diamante liso e fechado. (242)

In some ways the experience Saramago is conveying is common to all researchers, the sense of becoming so mentally involved in a project that it gives the impression of living in two places and two times. Here the different weathers serve to mark a separation between his lived experience and his imagined experience, but their proximity in his mind is hinted at because these two moments seem almost equally vivid to him. In a sense, then, he has conquered the problem of the temporal distance, if not that of cultural difference. Crucially, Saramago only permits Raimundo to indulge in this sensorial imagined experience when he has first engaged critically with historical accounts, and secondly challenged the official discourse on how the reconquest should be remembered.

⁷² For a discussion of the significance of windows in *História* see Frier, p. 117.

Criticism of the Traditional Historical Novel

Whereas Orientalist descriptions are scarce in *História*, criticism of the traditional historical novel is present from early on in the novel. In the second chapter we are presented with a description of a muezzin waking up just before dawn, climbing up a minaret overlooking Moorish Lisbon, and reciting the call to prayer. The description draws attention to the changing colour of the light and to the restless sleep of the city:

Quando chegou acima sentiu na cara a frescura da manhã e a vibração da luz alvorecente, ainda cor nenhuma, que a não pode ter aquela pura claridade que antecede o dia e vem tanger na pele um arrepio subtil, como de uns invisíveis dedos [....] Aos pés do almuadem há uma cidade, mais abaixo um rio, tudo dorme ainda, mas inquietamente. A manhã começa a mover-se sobre as casas, a pele da água torna-se espelho do céu, e então o almuadem inspira fundo e grita, agudíssimo, Allahu akbar, apregoando aos ares a sobre todas grandezas de Deus. (18-19)

This sequence recalls other texts in the corpus: both Edgar Quinet's description in which he imagines a Moorish King looking out over Toledo, and Oliveira Parreira's description of Ibn Ammar looking out over an Islamic Silves in Volume I of *Os Luso-Árabes*.⁷³ However, whereas in these two examples the character's gaze over the space is important, Saramago's description ends with the revelation that the muezzin is blind, adding an element of delayed dramatic irony. There is also an implied tension in the description of the inhabitants as sleeping 'inquietamente' ('restlessly'). After setting up this long description, Saramago pulls the rug out from under it a few pages later, when we are told:

A resposta, surpreendente, é que ninguém escreveu, que, embora pareça que sim, não está escrito, tudo aquilo não foi mais que pensamentos vagos da cabeça do revisor enquanto ia lendo e emendando o que escondidamente passara em falso nas primeiras e segundas provas. (22)

There is of course a deliberate irony in the way that the narrator asks us to take the words as not having been written, when we have just read them on the page ourselves,

⁷³ Quinet, Edgar, *Mes vacances en Espagne* (Paris: Comptoir des imprimeurs-unis, 1846) pp. 212-213. I discuss this passage in Chapter 1. Oliveira Parreira, I: 76. I discuss this passage in Chapter 2.

and in this way Saramago uses metafictional techniques to draw attention to the novel's constructedness. The narrator then proceeds to critique Raimundo's imagined representation of the scene, questioning small details such as the existence of markings on the parapets of the verandahs pointing in the direction of Mecca (23), in so doing revealing a variety of anachronisms and errors. Finally, he criticises 'aquele discurso falso, embora coerente, e esse é o perigo maior, não saiu nunca da cabeça do revisor, antes não passou de seu devaneio fabulante e irrisório' (25). Here the idea of a discourse which is both false and coherent recalls the dangers inherent in emplotment. The narrator therefore oscillates between exposing the proofreader's errors in a fairly neutral way and undermining or offering undue criticism of him. The critical statements here parody a viewpoint which rejects all historical fiction as make-believe. In this way, Saramago is able to put across his own views about some of the pitfalls of immersive historical novels, whilst at the same time parodying those who take this point of view too far and denigrate all historical fiction.

To put this into context, it is worth reiterating that the novel as a whole condemns the uncritical valorisation of historical accounts as being equally likely to contain biases. Saramago is also careful to expose the literariness of the historical account, for example when, in the same chapter, we hear the proofreader's reaction to the historian's brief mention of the muezzin and minaret in the proofs of the *History of the Siege of Lisbon* that he has read:

Lá lhe pareceu que era informar pouco limitar-se o historiador a falar de muezim e minarete, unicamente para introduzir, se são permitidos juízos temerários, um pouco de cor local e tinta histórica no arraial inimigo. (22)

This idea of inserting a 'local colour and historical atmosphere' into the text for the purposes of entertaining the reader is precisely the sort of criticism that Marxist literary critics have levelled at historical fiction, and something which Saramago mostly avoids

himself in *História*. Interestingly, though, here it is presented as criticism of the historian by the proofreader, the very proofreader who was described as ‘fanciful’ (‘fabulante’) only a few pages later. It is also this same proofreader who redresses one of the inaccuracies of the historical account, using the fact that he has a better knowledge of the Muslim calendar than the historian (23). By way of these contradictions, Saramago undermines any binary opposition between the historian and fiction writer, and between the historical text and the fictional text.

Lastly, it is worth noting that Saramago engages critically with modern representations of the medieval period found in a variety of different genres, highlighting the way in which this period has been reimagined through various forms of medieval revival. For example, the narrator describes the Christian and Muslim envoys meeting each other as follows:

Portanto, indo contra o costume e convenção, e com uma infinita pena de ter de desmentir aplaudidíssimas tradições de espectáculo e de históricas cenografias, somos obrigados, por amor à simples verdade, a declarar que os emissários de um lado e do outro se encontraram a poucos passos de distância, [...] ao contrário do que imaginávamos por ingénua confiança nas exagerações dos épicos. (199-200)

The narrator here emphasises that the two parties would only have been able to hear each other by being in close physical proximity, whereas representations in epics, history plays and in cinema give the impression of a meeting on a huge scale, with the parties standing very far apart from one another. The tone Saramago employs here is playful: he makes ironic use of high register and serious language, such the phrase ‘infinita pena’, and creates a mock-heroic idea of a moral duty to expose the falsehoods created by ‘ingénua confiança’. It is not only epics and history plays whose illusions are mercilessly exposed by the author: cinema receives similar treatment when Raimundo makes a visit to the Castle of São Jorge. Looking out over Lisbon, he tries to gain an insight into why,

according to his new version of events, the crusaders would have refused to help the Christians to besiege and capture the city. We hear that:

O vento puxa e repuxa Raimundo Silva, obriga-o a segurar-se aos merlões para manter o equilíbrio. Num momento, o revisor experimenta uma sensação forte de ridículo, tem a consciência da sua postura cénica, melhor dizendo, cinematográfica, a gabardina e manto medieval, os cabelos soltos plumas, e o vento não é vento, mas sim corrente de ar produzida por uma máquina. (135)

Yet despite the sense of ridicule that Raimundo feels as the wind tugs at his hair, recalling the shots of medieval heroes or kings gazing out over their territories or the territories they wish to conquer, it is immediately after this moment that Raimundo gains the insight that he is looking for. Saramago appears to highlight that we run the risk of looking foolish when trying to represent or engage with the medieval period, which is the fault of the plethora of existing representations which take themselves too seriously. However, for Raimundo, this awareness of the nature of some of those past representations, in which the period was reduced to a dressed-up spectacle, permits a more sensitive and insightful engagement with that past.

Irony and Comedy

As historiographical metafiction, *História* engages with the question of how to represent the different sides involved in the siege, and how to do so fairly. These reflections tend to be in free indirect speech (a technique of presenting a character's voice partly mediated by the voice of the narrator) and relate to Raimundo's writing of his alternative history of the siege. We should proceed with caution when reading a character's stance as a clue to the author's own position, however the following extract describing Raimundo's thoughts is helpful in providing an understanding of how Saramago's novel *História* engages with the memory of the siege. In particular, it highlights the position of a writer attempting to represent the siege in a way that breaks with existing narrative,

a writer who is the product of a country which has for centuries identified mainly with the Christian side. Therefore, in certain ways it is a statement which applies both to Raimundo and to Saramago himself:

Raimundo encontra-se numa interessante situação, a de quem, jogando o xadrez consigo mesmo e conhecendo de antemão o resultado final da partida, se empenha em jogar como se o não soubesse e, mais ainda, em não favorecer conscientemente nenhuma das partes em litígio, [...] neste caso os mouros ou os cristãos, [...] E muito abertamente o tem vindo a demonstrar, haja vista a simpatia, diríamos mesmo o apreço, com que tem tratado os infiéis, [...] aquele tom, aquela nobreza, em contraste com uma certa secura, uma impaciência, uma ironia, até, que sempre vêm à tona do discurso quando se trata dos cristãos. Não se infira daqui, porém, que as inclinações de Raimundo Silva vão todas para o lado dos mouros, entendamo-las antes como um movimento de espontânea caridade, [...] sobretudo porque sendo ele também cristão, ainda que não praticante, o indignam certas hipocrisias, certas invejas, certas infâmias que no seu próprio campo têm carta branca. (233)

Although Raimundo has much in common with Saramago, for example both worked as proofreaders in Lisbon, there are clearly differences between Saramago and his literary creation. Whereas Raimundo is described here as being a non-practising Christian, Saramago was known to be an atheist. However, when the narrator refers to the Muslims as 'infiéis', using the fifteenth-century term in a tongue-in-cheek manner, it appears that Raimundo shares the joke. The passage emphasises not only Raimundo's sympathy and respect towards the Muslim side, but also his awareness that he identifies culturally with the Christians, and therefore cannot be impartial. In one sense Saramago and Raimundo are closely aligned, in that both oppose a vision of the medieval Christian fighters as being beyond reproach simply for being Christian, despite committing acts of hypocrisy and cruelty. Rather than taking sides and trying to argue that one side has behaved better than the other, Saramago is therefore advocating behaving with respect and humanity towards the Other, the Muslim, and criticising the culture that he comes from for its lazy and unquestioning representation of the Christians as heroes and the Muslims as villains or enemies.

Irony is the dominant mode in *História*, however the service to which this irony is put does vary: often, as described in the quotation above, it is designed to expose hypocrisy on the Christian side – although Islam is not exempt from mockery either, reflecting Saramago's distrust of organised religion. However, the use of irony in the novel can and often does produce a comic effect. Harold Bloom, who reads Saramago's works in translation, writes that he likes *The History of the Siege of Lisbon* 'best among his books because it is the most light-hearted [...] For me the heart of Saramago is *THSL* [*The History of the Siege of Lisbon*], possibly because it communicates so freely Saramago's own pleasure in his own work'.⁷⁴

An example of this irony producing a light-hearted comic effect is the sequence in which Saramago describes Afonso Henriques giving a speech to the leaders of the crusaders to enlist their support to besiege Lisbon:

Nós cá, apesar das dificuldades, que tanto nos vêm do ingrato solo como das várias imprevidências de que padece o espírito português em formação, vamos fazendo o possível, nem sempre sardinha nem sempre galinha, ainda por cima tivemos a pouca sorte de nos terem cabido estes mouros, gente de escassa riqueza, se vamos a comparar com Granada e Sevilha, por isso mais vale tirá-los daqui duma vez para sempre. (139)

In the above extract, Saramago combines colloquial language such as the popular proverb 'nem sempre sardinha nem sempre galinha' with the loftier notion of the 'espírito português em formação'. The latter is a comically anachronistic reference to nationalistic discourses from the nineteenth century, which argued that Portugal and Portugueseness were crystallised during the process of reconquest. In addition to the comic effect, the phrase 'espírito português em formação' also exposes the artificiality of these later constructs. Having established this ironic tone, Saramago continues to use variances in register, such as the casual phrase 'mais vale tirá-los daqui duma vez para

⁷⁴ Harold Bloom, 'Introduction' in Harold Bloom ed., *Bloom's Modern Critical Views: José Saramago* (Philadelphia: Chelsea House Publishers, 2005), p. xiv.

sempre', to create humour. Offering a tongue-in-cheek comparison between Portugal and Spain, he has Afonso argue that the Moors who are in Portugal are 'gente de escassa riqueza' compared to the Moors of Seville and Granada, and as such they may as well be thrown out for good. Here Saramago also dismisses the discourse that portrays the reconquest as a moral struggle, suggesting instead that it was a far more straightforward fight for political dominance.

In *História* the author uses irony to confront many of the myths of the reconquest, including the legend of the Battle of Ourique (discussed in Chapter 1 of this thesis). In the second chapter of *História*, when Ourique is mentioned, we hear that: 'mas Cristo não quis aparecer aos mouros, e foi pena', undermining the logic of the legend since, the narrator argues, such an appearance could have meant a conversion to Christianity of 150,000 souls (20). Elsewhere, Saramago shows how the Portuguese language continually reveals traces of Islamic culture, due to the presence of Arabic words and ways of thinking from Moorish or Arab culture. For example, we hear that: 'Acertara D. Afonso Henriques em cheio quando prognosticou que o exame da sua proposta acabaria em algazarra'. The narrator goes on to note that the word 'algazarra' (meaning 'uproar' or 'racket') is a word of Arabic origin, though in this case it applies to the crusaders rather than the Moors (47). Later, when Raimundo is thinking through his alternative history of the siege, (the version with the crusaders not helping the Portuguese), he tries to imagine how the Portuguese soldiers would distribute themselves in this new scenario:

Está pois claro que os doze mil soldados do rei Afonso vão ter de ser divididos em cinco grupos para cobrirem as portas igualmente, e quem diz cinco deveria dizer seis, porque não nos podemos esquecer do mar, que verdadeiramente mar não é, mas rio, porém o uso faz lei, chamaram-lhe os mouros mar, e nós até hoje, ora, sendo assim, dos grupos falamos, que é que temos, a ridicularia de dois mil homens para cada frente de batalha. (218)

The Tagus river estuary is even today thought of as the sea, because the Moors thought of it as such. As such, traces of the Islamic cultural presence inevitably creep into any account of the process of defeating and expelling the Moors, showing ironically that that expulsion was only partial, and that linguistic and cultural traces remain deeply embedded.

That an affective link to the past remains in popular memory is also shown comically, through the use of the Portuguese phrase ‘Há mouro[s] na costa’ in amorous contexts.⁷⁵ When Raimundo’s cleaning lady (‘a senhora Maria’) sees a white rose in a vase in his apartment then she immediately suspects that he has a lover, and we hear that:

é possível que a senhora Maria tenha dito, Há mouro na costa, expressão histórica e popular duma substancial desconfiança originada nos tempos em que os mouros, já então varridos da terra portuguesa, vinham assolar as nossas costas e vilas marinheiras, e hoje reduzida a mera reminiscência retórica, porém de alguma utilidade, como acaba de ver-se. (217)

Saramago also continues the joke a little later by alluding back to this episode: ‘A primeira desconfiança dela, de haver mouros na costa, manifestada quando viu a rosa no solitário, e que se tornara em quase certeza, [...] quando as rosas passaram a ser duas, volvia-se agora em convicção firme’ (257). In the first quotation the narrator explains that the expression reflects a historical anxiety about the danger presented by Moorish ships appearing on the horizon. This historic anxiety is today no more than a recollection that expresses itself through a popular saying, but it still transmits an association between the Moor and something dangerous or untrustworthy in the Portuguese psyche – though again, there is a double irony in the fact that the expression only tends to be used when referring to romantic relationships. Here the humour arises firstly from Raimundo’s apparent emotional transparency in the sense that ‘a senhora

⁷⁵ The same expression exists in Spanish: ‘(no) hay moros en la costa’.

Maria' is able to guess almost immediately that he has a lover, and secondly from the irony of the phrase's appropriateness given that Raimundo, probably unbeknownst to Maria, is at that time increasingly obsessed with writing a version of the reconquest of Lisbon.

Destabilising the Christian Hero

As we saw earlier when looking at *Viagem*, Saramago was haunted during his stay in Évora by the story of Giraldo Sem Pavor decapitating a young girl during the reconquest of the city. In a similar fashion, in *História* he turns his attention to a crusader named Osberne (Osberno in the Portuguese), who is in fact Osbern de Bawdsley, to whom the eyewitness account 'De Expugnatione Lyxbonensi' was historically attributed, but who in fact never existed.⁷⁶ Osbern is described as engaging in a similar act of merciless killing: '[Osberno] viu à frente da sua espada um mouro velho que nem para fugir tinha já forças, ali espojado no chão, agitando as pernas e os braços como se intentasse afundar-se pela terra dentro' (40). Saramago later produces another version of this image and highlights its importance by using it to close the penultimate paragraph of the novel:

Porém, quando o sol, descendo para o mar, tocou o nítido horizonte, ouviu-se a voz do almuadem da mesquita maior clamando pela última vez lá do alto, onde se refugiara, Allahu akbar. Arrepiaram-se as carnes dos mouros à chamada de Alá, mas o apelo não chegou ao fim porque um soldado cristão, de mais zelosa fé, ou achando que ainda lhe faltava um morto para dar a guerra por terminada, subiu correndo à almádena e de um só golpe de espada degolou o velho, em cujos olhos cegos uma luz relampejou no momento de apagar-se-lhe a vida. (347-348)

⁷⁶ See Sabine, p. 207. Earl A. Anderson explains that in the salutation at the beginning of the memoir, the abbreviation 'baldr' was presumed to refer to 'Bawdsey' (a village in Suffolk). He explains that 'the now standard view [is] that Osbert was the recipient of the letter, which was composed by R—'. Thus, according to Anderson, Saramago's suggests that 'the book that Raimundo is proofing is outdated in its scholarship'. Earl A. Anderson, *Postmodern Artistry in Medievalist Fiction: An International Study* (Jefferson, North Carolina: McFarland, 2018), p. 128.

Here a contrast is established between the spiritual power that the call to prayer has on the Moorish listener, prompting goose pimples, and the brute, senseless violence of the killing of an old blind man, who has the power to create something of beauty in that very same call to prayer. With regard to the image of a final light appearing in the dying blind man's eyes, critics such as Sabine have pointed out that literal and metaphorical blindness is already a recurrent theme in *História*, one that he goes on to explore in even greater depth in *Ensaio sobre a Cegueira* [*Blindness*] (1995).⁷⁷ This last image of a vulnerable man being mercilessly killed is also more archetypal than in the previous example, since the Christian soldier here remains unnamed. The muezzin's cry is evoked not only at this point but also on numerous occasions earlier in the novel and is heard by the Christian side as they camp outside Lisbon (152 and 227). When in this penultimate paragraph the cry is cut short, it therefore also symbolises the loss of the Muslim voice in Portugal, or indeed, as Sabine puts it: 'the effacement of the ethnic Other's historical perspective'.⁷⁸

Evocations of indiscriminate killing appear earlier in the novel, in relation to the retaking of Santarém in March 1147 by a surprise night-time assault. In a retelling of a speech given by Afonso Henriques in the account of the siege that Raimundo is proofreading, Afonso argues that even without the help of the crusaders he and his men would still be able to take Lisbon:

como ainda há três meses tomámos Santarém com uma escada de mão e meia dúzia de homens, que tendo entrado depois o exército foi toda a população passada à espada, homens, mulheres e meninos, sem diferença de idades e terem ou não terem armas na mão, só escaparam os que conseguiram fugir e foram poucos, ora, se isto fizemos, também cercaríamos Lisboa. (140)

The allusion to the ruthless killing of defenceless (Moorish) men, women and children in Santarém here highlights Afonso's casual disregard for human life, rather than

⁷⁷ See Sabine, pp. 219; 238.

⁷⁸ Sabine, p. 238.

constituting a convincing negotiating tactic, and his heroic status is undermined by his assertion that such carnage is a matter of pride.

Later in the novel, when Raimundo Silva is thinking through the events of his alternative history of the siege, we read that in his version the military leaders order that: 'no dia seguinte, à hora do meio-dia, quando os mouros estivessem em oração, seria o ataque desencadeado ao mesmo tempo nas cinco frentes, que Deus nos proteja a todos, que em seu serviço vamos' (235). Raimundo's retelling of the events suggests here that the Christian forces use dirty tactics by choosing to attack at a time of day when they know the Moors will be praying. Saramago juxtaposes this decision (to disregard the enemy's religious devotion) with the Christian leaders' appeal to God to protect them. To add further insult to injury, we later hear the following in relation to the pain and hunger experienced by the Moors at the end of the siege: 'Lisboa gemia de miséria, e era uma ironia grotesca e terrível deverem os mouros celebrar o seu ramadão quando a fome tornara o jejum impossível' (345). Here Ramadan, the Muslim month of fasting, becomes impossible to adhere to because it requires a discipline that depends on having access to food at specific times (i.e. after sunset and before sunrise). The harsh realities of a siege, where food becomes scarce and finding it is a matter of survival, therefore render adherence to Ramadan impossible. Ironically, here it is the very lack of food that makes it harder to enact fasting.

As we have seen, the novel works to undermine the narrative of heroic Christian warriors defeating the Moors to install a morally superior society in Portugal by representing the Christian warriors and leaders as opportunistic and amoral. So far, the representations of the Moors that I have examined have tended to cast them as victims of Christian brutality, however I shall now examine other types of representations, whilst also examining their limitations.

Representation of the Moors: Partiality and Intrusion

Raimundo acknowledges his difficulties in creating Muslim characters for his alternative History of the Siege, in the following extract:

Do lado dos mouros, o mais que até agora conseguiu foi um almuadem que aparece de vez em quando e que se encontra na menos satisfatória situação possível, pois sendo algo mais que um figurante, não o é bastante para tornar-se em personagem. (183)

On the other hand, Raimundo takes a minor historical figure who was involved in the siege of Santarém on the Christian side, the foot soldier Mogueime, and transforms him into a developed character. We are reminded right near the end of the novel that: 'Este soldado Mogueime, que não sabe ler nem escrever, que não se lembra da terra em que nasceu nem por que lhe foi dado um nome que finalmente parece ser mais de mouro que de cristão' (325). Saramago therefore hints that this soldier was likely to have had Mozarab or Muslim ancestry.⁷⁹ As such, he implies that despite the historical narratives of two opposing camps engaged in bloody warfare, there was in fact a certain continuity, through bloodlines, of people inhabiting the West of the peninsula, and that many ended up fighting one another simply because they had become caught up in the power struggles of their leaders.

The narrator chooses to emphasise on a number of occasions the fact that the Muslim voice is left out of (Christian) historical accounts. For example, we are presented with an account of a meeting between two of the King's men, Dom João Peculiar and Dom Pedro Pitões, and the Moorish governor of the city of Lisbon (196). The chapter in

⁷⁹ There is also mention in the novel of another historical figure with possible Mozarab ancestry, Mem Ramires. Raimundo compares conflicting accounts relating to whether it was Mem Ramires or Mogueime who stood on the other's back or shoulders in order to be the first to attack the walls of Santarém (191-192). The event also is seized on by Saramago as providing the perfect metaphor for the exploitation of the ordinary man. Mem Ramires is also described as being sometimes consulted for the purposes of translating from Latin into Arabic (198).

fact combines a description of the events themselves with Raimundo's reaction, in such a way that the reader is told about events that are missed out from the historical account Raimundo is reading. This prompts the reader to question where the additional material supplied from the narrator comes from, and to realise that this is a necessary fictionalisation, one that adds truth (by supplying a lost voice) in a way that is arguably more useful than sticking to the very partial historical accounts which we have been left with. The issue of partiality is highlighted, for example, by the reader being supplied with the names of two key Christian figures, whilst the narrator is unsure of the Moorish governor's name or title:

saíram por ela [a porta] uns quantos mouros em passo lento, um deles, passado da idade, poderá ser o governador, título este que dá para tudo e que no caso é usado à falta de certezas quanto ao próprio, [...] além de não ser de excluir a probabilidade de lá de dentro terem mandado a negociar, por exemplo, um alfaqui, um cádi, um amir, ou mesmo um mufti. (199)

The enumeration of Arabic-language titles at the end of this extract only serves to highlight further the Christian chronicler's hazy understanding of the Islamic structures of power, using one term 'o governador' as a catch-all ('dá para tudo'). We also see that it takes the Christians a while to understand why the Moors have taken so long to appear, though in the end it becomes clear that this is due to careful diplomatic efforts to match the Christian delegation (199). The difficulty the Christians have in decoding the Moors' political and diplomatic behaviour is apparent but also suggests a laziness that springs from an assumption of moral superiority, and in this way Saramago exposes this flaw in the Christian discourse through satire.

Later in the chapter, the narrator reflects on aspects of the Archbishop's speech, and, as if he had really been present at the event, comments that through letting his mind wander he has missed the beginning of the Moorish governor's speech. Ironically, the content that was missed happens to be relevant to the dismantling of some of the certainties of the Christian side, as we hear through the medium of the Christian herald

that the governor had, in the missed part of the speech, been casting doubt on the geographical relevance of the allusion to the kingdom of Lusitania (203).⁸⁰ The Moorish governor goes on to criticise the ruthlessness of the Christian forces at Santarém, adding sternly, in a comment that could be addressed to a contemporary audience: ‘ora não me digais que se vos apagaram da memória os tristes sucessos’ (204). Not only this, but when the Moorish governor later adds an ominous final threat, which we the reader are privy to, we then hear that this is not recorded by the scribe: ‘No silêncio ouviu-se a voz do arcebispo de Braga, uma ordem dada ao escrivão, Frei Rogeiro, não fareis constância do que disse esse mouro, foram palavras lançadas ao vento e nós já não estávamos aqui’ (207). We therefore witness the rewriting of history in action. Raimundo had earlier offered begrudging admiration for the Moor, in a sequence which also reveals his own prejudices:

Confrontando as duas falas, pesou ao revisor ver como um simples mouro a quem faltavam as luzes da verdadeira fé, se bem que com patente de governador, soube, em prudência e eloquência, librar mais alto seu voo que um arcebispo de Braga. (205)

We as the reader are thus under no illusions that Raimundo is far from an impartial observer. Overall, the chapter functions on multiple levels, leaving the reader uncertain as to where to situate the narrator, or where exactly the material being supplied comes from. This unsettles the reader, exposing the problem with putting full trust of historical accounts, including eyewitness accounts.⁸¹ It also exposes the multiple ways in which the voice of the Muslim Other can be distorted, selectively censored or removed.

⁸⁰ Lusitania was an Iberian Roman province encompassing modern Portugal south of the Douro river and parts of western Spain (Extremadura and part of the province of Salamanca). The Latin term *lusitani*, referring to the tribes who lived in this area, was used by certain writers from the late fifteenth-century onwards to refer to the Portuguese. The evocative use of ‘Lusitania’ to refer to Portugal increased in the nineteenth century due to the influence of Romanticism and its concepts of nationhood. The *Estado Novo* also perpetuated the idea of the Portuguese being descended from a ‘race’ of Lusitanians.

⁸¹ Vakil notes how Raimundo ‘calls into question the historian’s reliance on the eye-witness account of the event’ (p. 32).

Additionally, the loss of knowledge of some of the key markers of Islamic Lisbon is highlighted when Raimundo and Maria Sara are walking near Lisbon Cathedral, and Raimundo realises that they are next to the old site of the Porta de Ferro, a gate to the city of Lisbon inserted into the old Moorish walls after the reconquest. He remarks: 'aqui era a Porta de Ferro, deitaram-na abaixo há uns duzentos anos, o que dela restava, claro está, quanto à dos mouros ninguém sabe como era' (301). Raimundo inserts this comment as a distraction, whilst Maria Sara is trying to encourage him to consider that being an author might be his destiny. Though Maria Sara playfully chastises him for changing the topic (and perhaps for being overly detail-focused) the inclusion of the comment shows Raimundo's growing awareness of the shape (and gaps in our knowledge) of Moorish Lisbon, and how its coordinates correspond to the city today.

Earlier in the novel, when Raimundo is in the *Leitaria A Graciosa*, he hears the voices of nervous Moors living in the Lisbon of 1147 intervene in the narrative, as if they were themselves present in the café. Afonso Henriques is referred to using the Arabised form, 'Ibn Arrinque', and as 'o Galego' (a mischievous addition by Saramago given that, even today, Portuguese northerners refer to Lisbon's inhabitants as 'mouros').⁸² The city is full of people fleeing Afonso Henriques' attacks on other cities, and when one man suggests attacking the crusader ships anchored on the river, a lady comments: 'Que justa obra seria esse [...] em pago das misérias dos nossos'. As Sabine writes in his analysis of this section, the exercise:

compels Raimundo – and the novel's reader – to recognize the common humanity and unjust suffering of their historical 'enemy'. [...] It also, however, suggests the difficulties of recovering – and truly comprehending – anything of the historical Other's world-view, beyond their basic instincts towards compassion, community, and self-preservation.⁸³

⁸² Afonso himself was not Galician, and in fact he ousted his mother Teresa due to her relationship with the Galician nobleman Fernando Pérez de Traba. There is scholarly disagreement over his place of birth.

⁸³ Sabine, p. 214.

Saramago's decision to insert these Muslim voices into the narrative in a fragmentary way, rather than as fully fleshed-out characters, suggests that he is equally concerned with underlining the difficulty of representation of the Muslim perspective here. The question that remains, however, is whether his caution and reluctance to represent the medieval Muslim of Gharb al-Andalus in a more developed and detailed way constitutes a progression or a retreat in terms of our modern engagement with the Muslims of Gharb al-Andalus.

In *História* Saramago highlights many positive aspects that the Islamic presence brought to Gharb al-Andalus, for example we hear that along the banks of the Tagus there is: 'um vergel de regalar-se qualquer alma de bem, [...] manifestação perfeita de que para as hortaliças em geral não há melhores mãos do que as dos mouros' (127). The Moors of al-Andalus are of course commonly recognised as having improved use of the land for horticulture through irrigation practices. In general, Saramago attempts to avoid Orientalised descriptions of Islamic Lisbon, except on a few occasions when they are inserted in order to satirise discourses within literature which portray the Moors as sinister and threatening (such as Southey's *Roderick*, as discussed in Chapter 2). An example is in the first part of the following extract from *História*:

Eirados, ameias e caminhos de rolda do alcáçar estão apinhados de escuros e barbados mouros que fazem gestos de ameaça, porém calados, poupando as palavras, que talvez os cristãos acabem por retirar-se como fizeram há cinco anos, e sendo assim seriam ofensas perdidas. (198-199)

Although the Moors are described as 'dark, bearded Moors making threatening gestures', this image of the Other is undermined by the second half of the sentence, which interprets their silence as them saving their breath because the Christian attack might end in retreat. We also get an underlying sense of their weariness at being continually under attack.

A further example of Saramago's deliberate use of Oriental discourse comes in the following passage, which is narrated from the point of view of Mogueime, the young Portuguese Christian soldier, and in which Lisbon is described in terms which recall nineteenth-century descriptions of Oriental women:

Grandes são as diferenças entre a paz e a guerra. Quando as tropas aqui estiveram acampadas, [...] Lisboa aparecia como uma jóia por assim dizer reclinada na encosta, oferecida às volúpias do sol, toda coberta de cintilações, rematada lá no alto pela mesquita do castelo, rebrilhante de mosaicos verdes e azuis. (288-289)

The phrase 'reclinada na encosta, oferecida às volúpias do sol' feminises the city and recalls descriptions of Oriental woman reclining on couches.⁸⁴ For example, in Oliveira Parreira's *Os Luso-Árabes*, the singer Daïssé is described as follows:

Em contravenção das leis do koran, o collo alto e esbelto como o do hairão, apresentava a alvura nitida do jaspe, realçada por um rico collar de pedrarias, e fazia adivinhar as magnificencias de um seio de fada, arquejante de amor e volupia.⁸⁵

Of course, Saramago's description also picks up on the tropes of medieval Iberian poetry in which besieged cities were compared to women and the attacking forces to a desiring male. Saramago goes on to compare this peacetime scene with the scene that foot soldier Mogueime observes, in which houses outside the walls are burnt down and the Portuguese army is compared to a swarm of destructive ants (289). The Orientalist description therefore serves to underscore a sense of the loss of beauty and human cultural flourishing.

⁸⁴ For an analysis of Flaubert's famous Orientalist description of Salammbô, see Lisa Lowe, *Critical Terrains: French and British Orientalisms*, (Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press, 1991), p. 82.

⁸⁵ Oliveira Parreira, I, p. 292. N.B. Oliveira Parreira specifies that Daïssé is a Circassian whom Motamid had asked to be brought over from Cairo in order to perform in *Silves* (I, p. 281).

Conclusion

This chapter takes up the objective of Chapter 2, which was to examine both the nature of representations of Gharb Al-Andalus in a key author's work, and, simultaneously, to look at the links between travel writing and historical fiction produced by that author. The contexts are of course different, António Maria de Oliveira Parreira being a now virtually unknown author producing Romantic-Orientalist writing at the end of the nineteenth century, whilst José Saramago is a Nobel-prize winning author producing historiographical metafiction ninety years later, however, the contrast provides many fruitful areas for discussion. We have seen that though the need to recover Portugal's Islamic heritage is not the dominant theme of Saramago's *Viagem a Portugal* (1981), it nonetheless constitutes a recurring preoccupation. Amongst other things, this travel account is place for trying out ideas, some of which are developed further in *História do Cerco de Lisboa* (1989). In *Viagem a Portugal*, Saramago is struck by the ability of mudéjar architecture and sculpture to provide a visual counternarrative to the official discourse which has silenced this legacy and the *mourisco* experience and homogenised Portugal's religious and cultural heritage. Mudéjar architecture also provides him with the opportunity to see Moorish and Gothic styles in a symbiotic relationship, as opposed to conceptualising Christianity and Islam as being in conflict. Elsewhere, he is struck by the irony of Moorish architectural styles being sometimes present alongside Christian or victor-focused narratives about the reconquest. Unlike the travellers we have seen in previous chapters, he avoids focusing on exoticising Portugal's Islamic past, but is equally critical of Sintra's modern Orientalist architecture as the British travellers of the 1930s had been, associating it negatively with Empire. The trip also encourages him to

begin thinking about the events of the siege of Lisbon, which would become the focus of *História do Cerco de Lisboa*.

Through the character of Raimundo in *História*, Saramago advocates both a critical engagement with historical sources, as well as imaginative work, in order to gain an understanding of medieval history which will necessarily have gaps, since there are many details which will ultimately be unknowable. As I have shown, the imaginative work undertaken by Raimundo is often in the context of an engagement with place, and given the similarities between Raimundo and Saramago itself, it is likely that such engagement draws on the figure of the author-traveller who narrates *Viagem a Portugal*. Saramago also uses *História do Cerco de Lisboa* as an opportunity to expose some of the pitfalls of both historical accounts, with their various forms of bias, and historical novels, whose vivid plots can prevent the reader from adopting a critically engaged position. His objective is very different to Oliveira Parreira's: though Muslim voices do appear in the novel, and one character, Mogueime, has possible Muslim ancestry, his primary aim is not to represent the Muslim perspective; rather he advocates respect and humanity towards the Other, and criticises the official discourse of his country for its unquestioning representation of medieval Christian warriors as heroes and Muslims as enemies. He also reveals, more subtly, the embeddedness of traces of the medieval experience of Al-Andalus in the Portuguese language. Orientalist discourse is present only selectively in *História do Cerco de Lisboa* and is used self-consciously as a form of criticism of both mainstream historical narratives and literary techniques. As such, Saramago contrasts with a figure like Adalberto Alves who, also writing in the late twentieth century, promotes Portugal's Islamic past in a more nostalgic, mythologised form. Nonetheless, we should question to what extent Saramago's reluctance to represent the Muslim experience presents a retreat, or

whether it can be justified on the grounds that his novel is a critique of Portuguese official discourse rather than an exploration of the Muslim culture of Gharb Al-Andalus.

Conclusion

The selected travel writing, historical fiction and journalism examined in this thesis has provided a rich series of insights into the history of representations of Gharb Al-Andalus, both bringing to light new material and offering a new perspective on works which have previously benefited from scholarly attention. The study has demonstrated that travel writing on Portugal from the late eighteenth and nineteenth centuries did indeed differ in its points of focus from travel writing on Spain, most notably in its differing responses to traces of Islamic culture in the two countries. Whereas, in Spain, travellers were inspired by the cultural energies apparent in its medieval Islamic architecture, in Portugal the smaller scale of the architectural remains and the lack of detailed historical information about Muslim figures or Islamic culture there, meant that the response was more muted. There is no shortage of enthusiasm, in travel accounts on Portugal, for Christian Gothic architecture and modern Orientalist architecture, but Moorish castles tend to be mentioned briefly, with little imaginative investment, and Sintra's National Palace was seen as a confused construction, provoking debate over whether it could really be considered a 'Portuguese Alhambra'. Nevertheless, there are exceptions, such as the French writer Olivier Merson, who writes engagingly on the persistence of traces of the Orient in the behaviour of the Portuguese. Accounts of Silves, and the Algarve more generally, are rare until the mid-nineteenth century, Robert Southey being an exception, and although the Moorish traces there are acknowledged, accessibility remained an issue and succeeded in deterring many travellers. Although some travellers had the tantalising sense that Portuguese history must surely hold fascinating secrets, they generally did not produce the extended imaginative pieces on Al-Andalus that filled the pages of French Romantic travel accounts on Toledo, Seville, Granada and Cordoba.

In contrast, Chapter 3 shows that British travel writing on Portugal from the 1930s appears, in a certain sense, to have 'caught up' with travel writing on Spain, with extensive acknowledgment of the Islamic cultural legacy in Portugal in its various forms. Responses are sometimes reminiscent of nineteenth-century travel writing on Spain, revealing the difficulty of avoiding such influence. The need to produce an original account and to locate the authentically Other encouraged travellers to explore rural Portugal, including more of the Algarve and Alentejo regions, where different aesthetic values and notions of authenticity encouraged them to prize the smaller-scale traces of Muslim culture apparent there. Though some writers were enthusiastic in their discovery of a Portuguese Orient, their historical knowledge was patchy, resulting in some misrepresentations of Gharb Al-Andalus by authors drawing on Orientalist stereotypes. However, there were also instances of insightful historical and cultural analysis by writers who combined historical research with an intense engagement with place. This study also supports Agarez's hypothesis that there is evidence of the influence of local figures in the Algarve on the discourse and itineraries of these travellers.¹

Bearing in mind that the texts in the corpus do not include a number of accounts which ignore the question of Portugal's Islamic legacy entirely, we can draw certain conclusions from the analysis of foreign travel writing undertaken in Chapters 1 and 3. Whereas nineteenth-century travel writing on Spain was culturally influential and contributed to the construction of a Spanish Orient in the European consciousness, the same did not occur with travel writing on Portugal, either in the late eighteenth and nineteenth century, or in the prolific period of the 1930s. In the case of the late

¹ Agarez, pp. 25, 39-40, 45.

eighteenth and nineteenth century, a Portuguese Orient was only fleetingly perceived, and in the case of 1930s travel writing, we can hypothesise that the writing itself did not have sufficient cultural influence to change perceptions beyond its immediate readership. This state of affairs was one factor contributing to the fact that Al-Andalus remained (and still remains) overwhelmingly associated with Spain, a fact which underlines the value of transnational tourist routes, as discussed in the Introductory chapter.²

This thesis has also opened up other areas of investigation in relation to the study of representations of Gharb Al-Andalus, by looking at both historical fiction and journalism. Turning first to historical fiction, in Chapter 2 we saw how the writer Eliza Bray was inspired to write a historical novel (*The Talba, or Moor of Portugal*, 1830) set in fourteenth-century Portugal and featuring prominent Muslim characters. Despite some flaws, the novel is a fascinating literary artefact, revealing a Romantic interest in Gharb Al-Andalus, albeit marginal, but also exposing, through its inaccuracies and anachronisms, a lack of easily available historical knowledge or of an existing literary tradition on the subject. As Luísa Alves has shown, Bray's work also demonstrates the possibilities for reworking travel writing into historical fiction within the context of representations of Gharb Al-Andalus.³

The example of Bray therefore helps to contextualise my analysis of António Maria de Oliveira Parreira, who produced both travel writing and a two-volume historical novel, *Os Luso-Árabes* (1898). Now virtually unknown outside Portuguese

² See 'La Ruta de al-Mutamid, de Sevilla a Lisboa', *El legado andalusí: Revista digital de la Fundación Pública Andaluza* <http://revista.legadoandalusi.es/n47_revista_el_legado_andalusi/las_artes_y_los_dias/la_ruta_de_al_mutamid_de_sevilla_a_lisboa> and *Umayyad Route* <<http://umayyad.eu/?q=umayyad-route>> [both accessed 26 August 2019].

³ Luísa Alves, p. 109.

Arab-Islamic studies, in *Os Luso-Árabes* Oliveira Parreira produced the most detailed representation of Gharb Al-Andalus in nineteenth-century literature, a work that deserves far greater scholarly attention. A fictionalised biography of Al-Mutamid and Ibn Ammar, *Os Luso-Árabes* is an ambitious, meticulously researched work which attempts to uncover, for its readers, the story of the Arab cultural presence in the Algarve and its culture of poet-warriors, and to reveal how the figures of Al-Mutamid and Ibn Ammar were instrumental figures in the history of Al-Andalus as a whole. Drawing heavily on the Romantic tradition, as I have shown in my analysis, the novel features rich descriptions and passages which draw directly or indirectly on the author's travel writing, giving, particularly in the material set in the Gharb, the sense of a traveller's eye. As I have demonstrated, despite the author's best attempts to particularise the Muslims of Gharb Al-Andalus, he nonetheless has recourse to Orientalist stereotypes, showing not only the influence of external representations of other Orients but also a tendency to project the wealth of centres of power within Islamic Spain onto Islamic Portugal. Overall, the novel is particularly successful in its in-depth exploration of the intense relationship between these two men and of the significance of the fall of the taifa of Seville to the Almoravids. In highlighting the novel's interest for scholars, it is also clear that a new critical edition with updated spellings is required.

The legacy of Oliveira Parreira was kept alive in the Algarve's intellectual community, with regionalist writers attempting to forge a positive identity for the Algarve in which its Islamic history and heritage played an important role, as can be seen in my study of articles from the Silves-based newspaper *Alma Algarvia* (1911-1917), in Part 1 of Chapter 3. In so doing, the contributors not only showed recognition but also made creative use of this history's living presence in local folklore. As I have demonstrated, the discourse in *Alma Algarvia* portrays Silves as an enigmatic 'cidade de

lendas', full of traces of its past glory, but also full of hope for a brighter future of economic and cultural prosperity. Though happy to educate its readership about the history of Gharb Al-Andalus, the contributors do not envisage it being of interest to the tourists they hoped to attract to the coasts to play sports. *Alma Algarvia* also has a decidedly male-centred perspective, frequently musing on the idea of the Algarvian woman, and envisaging her, in one article, as the inheritor of positive traits from the Arabs, such as emotional sensitivity and poetic idealisation. On the other hand, the newspaper also associates the region's medieval Muslims with a fatalism that it considers to have been passed down to today's inhabitants, stalling their drive to improve their situation. As such, *Alma Algarvia* reveals the persistence of Orientalist stereotypes in this period, even in writing that overtly celebrates a direct Islamic cultural heritage.

The determination to keep Oliveira Parreira's legacy alive (and to promote his work) is also evident in the Algarvian responses to the Silves controversy, concerning Blas Infante's failed attempt to hold a homage event for Al-Mutamid in Silves in 1928. As I showed in the second part of Chapter 3, Blas Infante's account that those hostile to the event were paranoid that it would represent a symbolic reconquest of Silves, either by Islam, or by Spain, tells us part but not all of the story. A press interview with Infante had exposed his views on the shared heritage of Andalusia and the Algarve, as well as his view of Al-Mutamid's rule as being one that valued learning and had an authentic popular culture, and being thus where the 'Andalusian spirit' was born. An analysis of key articles opposing the homage reveals them to be aggressive in their tone and use of terms, using personal attacks on both Al-Mutamid and Infante as well as assumptions about the perspective of medieval Christians to build an argument against the planned event. On the other hand, the resistance to this attack, by Francisco Fernandes Lopes,

Pedro Judice and others in Algarvian newspapers, reveals considerable confidence and the determination to unpick their opponents' arguments with the help of historical evidence. It constitutes a reassertion of the value and significance of the Algarve's Islamic heritage and the need to fight for their tradition of celebrating that heritage. Although research has already been carried out on other Algarvian journals such as *Alma Nova*, as well as on the discourse around Algarvian architecture (in Ricardo Agarez's study), a more comprehensive study on the Algarvian intellectual community in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries would provide further insights into this intellectual tradition and their achievements and influence.

Finally, in Chapter 4, we saw how the approach of analysing links between travel writing and historical fiction can be applied fruitfully to José Saramago's *Viagem a Portugal* (1981) and to *História do Cerco de Lisboa* (1989), a piece of historiographical metafiction. The context of these two works was of course very different, with Saramago providing criticism of the Estado Novo's narrow conception of Portuguese identity, and of the survival of its associated discourse in Portugal after the return to democracy. Saramago's travels around Portugal, as narrated in *Viagem a Portugal*, allowed him to gain a new perspective on his own country, finding insights into its history which contradicted the official narrative. As my analysis has shown, Saramago's reflections on mudéjar architecture reveal their rich potential as visual counternarratives or ironic counterpoints to Christian-focused narratives about the reconquest. *Viagem a Portugal* also provides him with an opportunity to begin to reflect on the siege of Lisbon, the future subject of *História do Cerco de Lisboa*. I have also argued here that in *História*, Raimundo's imaginative engagement with place has echoes of that experienced by the author-traveller in *Viagem*. Such strategies complement Saramago's use of irony, satire and parody in *História*, resulting in a work that is rich in its reflections on how we should,

or can, represent the reconquest. *História* shows particularly that Saramago is less interested in an Orientalist recognition of the importance of Islamic legacy, instead using it as a form of criticism of both historical mainstream narratives and literary techniques. A further point highlighted by Saramago is the extent to which historical truth can be inaccessible to even the most meticulous researcher.

The comparative approach adopted by this study invites further reflection on what the main differences were in the images of Gharb Al-Andalus promoted by foreign and Portuguese writers. Though this varies depending on the period, broadly speaking foreign travel writers would be more likely to confuse Portugal with Spain and to frame their responses accordingly, either using tropes from travel writing on Spain or by comparing or contrasting monuments, such as Sintra's National Palace with the Alhambra. On this note, there is no obvious Portuguese equivalent for the Romantics' rediscovery of the Alhambra Palace and its subsequent re-evaluation by the Spanish. Whereas in Sintra, British and German influence and wealth transformed the town and led to the creation of a host of Romanticist and Orientalist palaces which impressed many nineteenth-century visitors more than its sixteenth-century mudéjar National Palace, in the Algarve, the smaller scale of the Moorish remains (in comparison to Andalusia) meant that foreign travellers, when they arrived, needed the expertise of local guides to appreciate the significance of such traces. In comparison to nineteenth-century foreign travellers, some of those in the early twentieth century showed more awareness of local and international debates about local heritage.

Portuguese writers, on the other hand, might be grappling with the question of whether or not to consider the Muslims of Gharb Al-Andalus to be their forebears (both genetically and culturally), and what implications this would have for national and regional identities. If Portugal's Islamic cultural legacy remained largely

unacknowledged it was because of the symbolic geography that gradually solidified in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries according to which the West and the North were seen as hierarchically superior to the East and the South.⁴ Though, as we have seen, there are important exceptions, the majority of Portuguese writers viewed the legacy of the pre-Celtic tribes (such as the Lusitanians), Celtic tribes, the Roman Empire and Germanic invasions in a different light to the legacy of the Arabs and Berbers of Gharb Al-Andalus. In the the desire to be taken seriously by their Northern European neighbours, many Portuguese preferred to associate their genetic and cultural identity with Northern Europe rather than Africa. Thus the Islamic presence was framed as an occupation by a foreigners which did not leave a lasting impression on the national psyche (or only in the Southern regions).⁵ As we saw in Chapters 3 and 4, medieval Christian warriors were seen by conservative commentators in the twentieth century as being more worthy of public memory than Muslim warriors, even those who had fought heroically against oppressors.

A further question that arises from this study is whether Portugal actively promoted a distinctive identity to that of Spain. It is worth remembering that Portugal has long pursued diplomatic ties (for strategic reasons) with Britain (rather than France or Spain) resulting in a close relationship between the two countries. It is due to this history that British travellers often visited Porto (due to the Port Wine connection), Lisbon (as the capital) and Sintra. The promotion of a separate identity took on a new importance when Portugal began to compete seriously with Spain for tourism in the 1950s and 1960s. Even so, it is mainly only in the last few decades that the Algarve has

⁴ Said, *Orientalism*. Moreira, p. 99.

⁵ Moreira, p. 105.

sought to capitalise on its Islamic heritage as part of its tourism offering, and it still remains a rather elusive part of the region's tourism offering.

This study also demonstrates the usefulness of the study of travel writing in examining the representation of historical contexts, as well as the need for more research on the links between the practices of travel writing and historical fiction writing. It is pertinent for scholars considering how to define what Europe is and what its borders and margins are, in an age where the concept of 'Fortress Europe' is promoted by a number of European member states, as well as how to consider Christian and Islamic legacies. It adds to the study of European Orientalisms, in parallel with recent scholarship on the representation of Ottoman, Islamic Europe.⁶ In relation to Portugal specifically, it is pertinent to note that Portuguese scholars have tended to look for Portuguese Orientalism in representations of places outside of Portugal itself, whereas this study's outsider's perspective has made it possible to identify and understand Portuguese internal Orientalism both in literature and journalism. As such, the study calls for a broadening of the understanding of Portuguese Orientalism to include such domestic examples. This study also invites further research on the topic of representations of Gharb Al-Andalus in other languages, genres and contexts.

⁶ See Derek Bryce, 'The Absence of Ottoman, Islamic Europe in Edward W. Said's *Orientalism*', *Theory, Culture & Society*, 30:1 (2013) 99-121.

Bibliography

Primary Texts: Travel Writing, Fiction, Histories

- Alves, Adalberto, *Al-Mutamid de Beja* (Beja: Câmara Municipal de Beja, 1985)
 ——— *Al-Mu'tamid, poeta do destino* (Lisbon, Assírio & Alvim, 1996)
 ——— *O meu coração é árabe* (Lisbon: Assírio & Alvim, 1987)
- Beckford, William, *Italy; with Sketches of Spain and Portugal*, 2 vols (London: Richard Bentley, 1834)
 ——— *Recollections of an Excursion to the Monasteries of Alcobaça and Batalha* (London: Richard Bentley, 1835)
- Bell, Aubrey, *Portugal of the Portuguese* (London: Isaac Pitman & Sons Ltd., 1915)
- Belloc, Hillaire, *Many Cities* (London: Constable and Co., 1928)
- Bodley, Ronald, *Flight into Portugal: The dramatic story of an Englishman's escape from Paris to Lisbon* (Triptee, Essex: Anchor Press, 1941)
- Braga, Teófilo, *História da Literatura Portuguesa. Introdução* (Porto: Nova Livraria Internacional, 1870)
- Bray, Anna Eliza, *The Talba, or Moor of Portugal. A Romance*, 3 vols (London: Longman, Rees, Orme, Brown, and Green, 1830)
- Byron, George Gordon, 'Childe Harold's Pilgrimage', in *The Works of Lord Byron*, 13 vols, ed. by E. Coleridge & R. Protero (London: John Murray, 1898-1904), II
- Davillier, Charles and Gustave Doré, *L'Espagne* (Paris: Hachette, 1874)
 ——— 'Voyage en Espagne' in *Le Tour du monde: nouveau journal des voyages* (Paris: Hachette, 1864), pp. 1-32; 353-416
- Dozy, Reinhart, *Histoire des Musulmans d'Espagne, jusqu'à la conquête de l'Andalousie par les Almoravides, 711-1110*, 4 vols (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1861)
- Flaubert, Gustave, 'Correspondance' ed. by Yvan Leclerc and Danielle Girard
 <<https://flaubert.univ-rouen.fr/correspondance/edition/>> [accessed 24 August 2019]
 ——— *Voyage en Orient* (Paris: Gallimard, 2006)
- Fox, Ralph, *Portugal Now* (London: Lawrence and Wishart, 1937)
- Freyre, Gilberto, *Aventura e Rotina, sugestões de uma viagem à procura de constantes portuguesas de caráter e ação*, 3rd edn (Rio de Janeiro: Topbooks, 2001 [1st edn 1953])
- Fullerton, Alice, *To Portugal for Pleasure* (London: Grafton, 1945)
- Gallop, Rodney Alexander, *Portugal, a Book of Folk-ways* (Cambridge, W. Lewis at the University Press, 1936)

- Garrett, Almeida, *Camões e Dona Branca* (Lisbon: Livraria Clássica Editora, 1943)
 — *Viagens na Minha Terra* (Lisbon: Livraria Sá da Costa Editora, 1974)
- Gautier, Théophile, *Voyage en Espagne, suivi de España*, 2nd edn (Paris: Gallimard, 1981)
- Gibbons, John, *Afoot in Portugal*, with foreword by G.K. Chesterton (London: George Newnes Ltd., 1931)
 — *Playtime in Portugal: An unconventional guide to the Algarves* (London: Methuen & Co., 1936)
- Goldring, Douglas, *To Portugal* (London: Rich and Corven Ltd., 1934)
- Gordon, Jan and Cora, *Portuguese Somersault*, Illustrated by the Authors (London: George G. Harrap & Co. Ltd., 1934)
- Herculano, Alexandre, *História de Portugal*, 4 vols (Lisbon: Viúva Bertrand e Filhos, 1846-1853)
- Hugo, Victor, *Les Orientales* (Paris: J. Hetzel, 1829)
- Hume, Martin, *Through Portugal* (London: E.G. Richards, 1907)
- Infante Pérez de Vargas, Blas, *Ideal Andaluz: Varios estudios acerca del Renacimiento de Andalucía* (Seville: Joaquín L. Arévalo, 1915)
 — *La verdad sobre el complot de Tablada y el Estado Libre de Andalucía* (Granada: Aljibe, 1979)
 — *Motamid, último rey de Sevilla* (Seville: Editorial Avante, 1920)
- Irving, Washington, *Chronicle of the Conquest of Granada* (UK: Leonaur, 2011)
 — *Tales of the Alhambra* (Granada: Ediciones Miguel Sánchez, 2002)
- Jackson, Catherine Charlotte, *Fair Lusitania*, (London: Bentley & Son, 1874)
 <<https://archive.org/details/fairlusitania00jackrich>> [accessed 30 August 2019]
- Llamazares, Julio, *El río del olvido* (Barcelona: Editorial Seix Barral, 1990)
 — *Trás-os-Montes: (Un viaje português)* (Barcelona: Penguin Random House Grupo Editorial, Debolsillo edition, 2016)
- Lowther, Alice (née Blight) *Moments in Portugal or the Land of the Laurel* (London: Luzac & Co., 1939)
- Macaulay, Rose, *Fabled Shore. From the Pyrenees to Portugal by Road* (London: Hamish Hamilton, 1949)
 — *They went to Portugal* (London: Jonathan Cape, 1946)
- Marden, Philip, *A Wayfarer in Portugal, with twenty-six illustrations and a paper map* (London, Unwin Brothers Ltd., 1927)
- Machado, Antonio, *Poesías Completas* (Madrid: Editorial Espasa Calpe, 2003)
- Mérimée, Prosper, *Carmen et autres nouvelles*, 2 vols (Paris: Librairie Générale Française, 1983)

— ‘Lettres sur l’Espagne’ in *Mosaïque* (Paris: Librairie Gründ, 193-)

Merson, Olivier, *Guide du voyageur à Lisbonne – histoire – monuments – mœurs* (Paris: Imprimeur du Sénat et de la Cour de Cassation, 1857)

— ‘Voyage dans les provinces du nord du Portugal’ in *Le Tour du Monde : Nouveau Journal des Voyages*, ed. by M. Édouard Charton (Paris: Hachette, 1861), pp. 273-320

Murphy, James Cavanagh, *Travels in Portugal; through the provinces of Entre Douro e Minho, Estremadura and Alem-Tejo, in the years 1789 and 1790. Consisting of Observations on the Manners, Customs, Trade, Public Buildings, Arts, Antiquities, &c. of that Kingdom* (London: Printed for A. Strahan and T. Cadell Jun and W. Davies, 1795)

Neale, John Mason, *Murray’s Handbook for Travellers in Portugal. With a Travelling Map*, 2nd edn, (London: John Murray, 1856)

Oliveira, Francisco Xavier de Athaide, *As Mouras Encantadas e os Encantamentos no Algarve* (Tavira: Typographia Burocratica, 1898)

Parreira, António Maria de Oliveira, *Os Luso-Árabes (Scenas da vida mussulmana no nosso pais)*, 2 vols (Lisbon: Typographia e Stereotypia Moderna, 1898)

Pessoa, Fernando, *Sebastianismo e Quinto Império*, ed. by Jorge Uribe and Pedro Sepúlveda (Lisboa: Ática, 2011)

Pimentel, Alberto, *Poemas Herói-Cómicas Portugueses (Verbêtes e Apostilas)* (Porto: Renascença Portuguesa, Rio de Janeiro: Anuario do Brasil, 1922)

Pimentel, José Freire de Serpa, *O Almançor Aben-Afan* (Coimbra: Imprensa da Universidade, 1840)

Queirós, José Maria de Eça de, *O Egipto, notas de viagem* (Porto: Livr. Chardron, 1926)

Quinet, Edgar, ‘De la renaissance orientale’, *Revue des Deux Mondes*, 28 (1841) 112-130
— *Mes vacances en Espagne* (Paris: Comptoir des imprimeurs-unis, 1846)

Rattazzi, Marie, *Le Portugal à vol d’oiseau* (Paris, A. Degorce-Cadot, 1879)
— *Portugal de relance* (Lisbon: Henrique Zeferino, 1882)

Reis, Carlos, *Diálogos com José Saramago* (Porto: Porto Editora, 2015)

de Saint Victor, Gabriel, *Portugal: Souvenirs et Impressions de Voyage* (Paris: Henri Gautier, 1891)

Sánchez-Albornoz, Claudio, *Ben Ammar de Sevilla (Una tragedia en la España e los taifas)* (Madrid: Espasa-Calpe, 1972)

Saramago, José, *Journey to Portugal* trans. by Amanda Hopkinson & Nick Caistor (London: Harvill, 2002)

— *História do Cerco de Lisboa* (Lisboa: Editorial Caminho, 1989)

— *The History of the Siege of Lisbon* trans. by Giovanni Pontiero (London: Harvill, 1996)

— *Viagem a Portugal* (Lisboa: Editorial Caminho, 1990)

Simonet, F. J., *Memoria presentada al IX Congreso de Orientalistas* (Granada: Don José López Guevara, 1891)

— *L'influence de l'élément indigène dans la civilisation des Maures de Grenade* (Brussels: Polleunis & Ceuterick, 1895)

Sismondi, J.C.L. Simonde de, *De la littérature du midi de l'Europe* (4 vols.) (Paris: Treuttel et Würtz, 1829)

Smithes, Marion F., *Things Seen in Portugal, The garden of the west, a land of mountains and rivers, of the wine (...) many illustrations and a sketch map* (London: Seeley Service, 1931)

Southey, Robert, *Letters Written during a Short Residence in Spain and Portugal, with Some Account of Spanish and Portuguese Poetry* (London: Bulgin and Rosser, 1797)

— *Journals of Residence in Portugal 1800-1801*, ed. by Adolfo Cabral (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1960)

— *Roderick last of the Goths*, 4th edn (London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, Orme and Brown, 1816)

Vasconcelos, António Augusto Teixeira de, *Les Contemporains Portugais, Espagnols et Brésiliens. Le Portugal et La Maison de Bragança* (Paris: Typ. Guirard, 1859)

Watson, Gilbert, *Sunshine and Sentiment in Portugal* (London: Edward Arnold, 1904)

Wordsworth (Quillinan), Dorothy, *Journey of a Few Months' Residence in Portugal and Glimpses of the South of Spain* (London and New York: Longmans, Green & Co, 1895)

Primary texts: Newspapers, Magazines and Miscellaneous Archival Documents

'A Cidade de Silves: Propaganda do Algarve', *Alma Algarvia*, 12 July 1914, pp. 1-2

'Acta da Comissão Administrativa', 18 November 1926, Arquivo Municipal de Silves, PT/CMSLV/B/E/001/Lv4 (pp. 175-175v; 177v)

'A União Iberica', *Alma Algarvia*, 10 January 1915, p. 1

Baçam, Sebastião Joaquim, 'A cidade de Silves', *Alma Algarvia*, 11 Oct 1914, p. 2

Blagues, João, 'Uma lápide em Silves', *O Algarve*, 19 August 1928, p. 1

Cabrita, Carlos Pedro, *As bases históricas do regionalismo algarvio* (Coimbra: Gráf. Atlantica, 1928)

— 'Uma marroquice em Silves', *A Voz*, 12 July 1928, pp. 1, 6

— 'Uma Marroquice: A Lápide Muçulmanista de Silves' *A Voz*, 21 July 1928, p. 4

de Carvalho, Alfredo, 'Motamid, Príncipe de Silves: A Andaluzia e o Algarve vão celebra [sic.] este famoso poeta mosarabe', *Diário de Notícias*, 15 June 1928, pp. 1, 5.

de Deus, João [untitled poem], *Alma Algarvia*, 20 June 1914, p. 1

Fazenda Junior, 'A Toca da Galliana: Motivo Arabe', *Alma Algarvia*, 15 June 1916, pp. 130-131

Judice, Pedro Paulo Mascarenhas; 'O Castello de Silves', *Alma Algarvia*, 28 May 1911, p. 2

— 'A homenagem de Silves a Motamid, rei-poeta arabe', *Correio do Sul*, 29 July 1928, p. 2

— 'A lápide de Silves ao rei-poeta arabe Al-Motamid', *Voz do Sul*, 5 August 1928, p. 4

— 'Civilização Muçulmana', *Voz do Sul*, 12 August 1928, p. 4

— 'Ainda Al-Motamid', *Voz do Sul*, 19 August 1928, p. 4

— 'A Autópsia Continúa', *Voz do Sul*, 26 August 1928, p. 4

Lopes, Francisco Fernandes, 'A Lapide de Silves ao rei-poeta arabe Al-Motamid', *Correio do Sul*, 22 July 1928, pp. 1-2

— 'A Lapide de Silves ao rei-poeta arabe Al-Motamid', *Voz do Sul*, 29 July 1928, pp. 1, 4

— 'A homenagem de Silves a Motamid, rei-poeta arabe', *Correio do Sul*, 29 July 1928, p. 2

Monteiro, Mauricio, 'A Mulher Algarvia', *Alma Algarvia*, 15 February 1916, pp. 56-57

'Monumentos do Algarve', *Alma Algarvia*, 15 June 1916, p. 129

'O Algarve no passado', *Alma Algarvia*, 26 July 1914, p. 2; 1 August 1914, p. 2

'O exercito marroquino', *O Algarvio*, 27 October 1889, p. 1

Oliveira, Francisco Xavier de Athaide, 'As Mouras Encantadas. I – A Moura Encantada de Silves', *Alma Nova*, 15 (3), March 1916, 41-42

'O Nosso Algarve', *Alma Algarvia*, 1 November 1915, p. 5

Presidente da Comissão Administrativa de Silves, official correspondence to Pedro Judice dated 19 November 1926, Arquivo Municipal de Silves, PT/CMSLV/B/E/004/LV13

Quintinha, Julião, 'Paizagem Algarvia: O Valle de Silves', *Alma Algarvia*, 20 July 1913, p. 1

— 'Impressões', *Alma Algarvia*, 1 August 1915, p. 1.

Reis Varella, J., 'Quadro vivo', *Alma Algarvia*, 27 June 1914, p. 1

'Silves em foco', *Alma Algarvia*, 1 October 1911, p. 3

Silva, 'Cartas de Marrocos: Colaboração especial para "Alma Algarvia"', *Alma Algarvia*, 27 September 1914, p. 3; 4 October 1914, p. 2

'Turismo no Algarve: A Cidade de Faro', *Alma Algarvia*, 13 June 1914, p. 1

'Uma homenagem em Silves a al-Motamid rei-poeta arabe', *Correio do Sul*, 6 May 1928, p. 1

Xara, 'O Turismo no Algarve. Qual a maneira de atrahir e reter o turista. O jogo e os desportos', *Alma Algarvia*, 8 August 2015, p. 1

Secondary Literature

'XVI Feira Medieval de Silves', *Câmara Municipal Silves* <<https://www.cm-silves.pt/pt/menu/1080/xvi-feira-medieval-de-silves.aspx>> [accessed 26 August 2019]

Agarez, Ricardo, *Algarve Building: Modernism, Regionalism and Architecture in the South of Portugal, 1925-65* (London: Routledge, 2016)

Al-Gharb-Al-Andaluz: Celebrating 1300 years of Islamic Heritage in Portugal <<http://algharb-andaluz.blogspot.com>> [accessed 26 August 2019]

Alves, Maria Luísa Fernandez, 'Hassan, O Talba – O Mouro de Portugal de Anna Eliza Bray', *Revista de Estudos Anglo-Portugueses*, 2 (1992) 105-116

Anderson, Earl A., *Postmodern Artistry in Medievalist Fiction: An International Study* (Jefferson, North Carolina: McFarland, 2018)

Araújo, Nuno Borges de, 'Portugal', in *Encyclopedia of Nineteenth-Century Photography* ed. by John Hannavy (New York: Routledge Reference, 2008) pp. 1151-1154

Arnaut, Ana Paula, 'Viagem ao centro da escrita. Da subversão à irreverência da(s) história(s)' in *Colóquio/Letras*, 151-152 (Jan 1999) 325-340

Batten, Charles L., *Pleasurable Instruction: Form and Convention in Eighteenth-Century Travel Literature* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1978)

Behdad, Ali, *Belated Travelers: Orientalism in the Age of Colonial Dissolution* (Durham and London: Duke University Press, 1994)

'Biografia do Autor: Cláudio Torres, Diretor do Campo Arqueológico de Mértola', *Campo Arqueológico de Mértola* <<http://www.camertola.pt/author/cl%C3%A1udio-torres-0>> [accessed 26 August 2019]

Blanton, Casey, *Travel Writing: Self and World* (New York: Routledge, 2002)

Bloom, Harold, 'Introduction' in *Bloom's Modern Critical Views: José Saramago* ed. by Harold Bloom (Philadelphia: Chelsea House Publishers, 2005)

Boscaglia, Fabrizio, 'Fernando Pessoa, Blas Infante e al-Mu'tamid: do ao "dia triunfal"', *Colóquio-Letras*, 191 (2016), 148-160

Braga, Teófilo, *História do Romantismo em Portugal - II* (Minho: Edições Vercial, 2014)
— 'Introdução' in *História da Literatura Portuguesa* (Porto: Nova Livraria Internacional, 1870)

Brito, António Paula, 'Francisco Fernandes Lopes', *Olhão Cubista*, 2007
<http://www.olhaocubista.pt/personalidades/francico_fernandes_lopes.htm> [accessed 12 July 2019]

Bryce, Derek, 'The Absence of Ottoman, Islamic Europe in Edward W. Said's *Orientalism*', *Theory, Culture & Society*, 30:1 (2013) 99-121

Buescu, Ana Isabel Carvalhão, *O Milagre de Ourique e a História de Portugal de Alexandre Herculano: Uma polémica Oitocentista* (Lisbon: INIC (Instituto Nacional de Investigação Científica), 1987)

Burton, Stacey, *Travel Narrative and the Ends of Modernity* (Cambridge University Press, 2013)

Cabete, Susana Margarida Carvalheiro, *A narrativa de viagem em Portugal no século XIX: alteridade e identidade nacional* (unpublished doctoral thesis, Université de la Sorbonne nouvelle - Paris III, 2010) <<https://tel.archives-ouvertes.fr/tel-00868637>> [accessed 1 September 2019]

Calado, Ana, *O Portugal de Salazar visto de uma varanda transmontana* (Lisbon: Centro de Estudos Anglo-Portugueses, 2005)

Campos Tiago, Marcelo, *Na estrada com José, no mar com Manoel: a construção das representações espaço-temporais em Viagem a Portugal de José Saramago e em Um filme falado de Manoel de Oliveira* (unpublished doctoral thesis, Universidade Presbiteriana Mackenzie, 2011) <<http://tede.mackenzie.br/jspui/handle/tede/2064>> [accessed 1 September 2019]

Carvalho Alves, Carla, *Figurações do mouro na Literatura Portuguesa: o lado errado do marenostro?* (unpublished doctoral thesis, Universidade de São Paulo, 2010)

Casaliggi, Carmen and Porscha Fermanis, *Romanticism: A Literary and Cultural History* (London: Routledge, 2016)

Castanheira, Maria Zulmira, 'O "aborrecido lavor de traduzir": Camilo Castelo Branco, tradutor de Lady Jackson', *Revista de Estudos Anglo-Portugueses*, 16 (2007) 119-134

— 'Robert Southey, o primeiro lusófilo inglês', *Revista de Estudos Anglo-Portugueses*, 5 (1996) 59-120

— 'Portugal: uma barbárie de pitorescas paisagens (Joseph Oldknow e John Mason Neale, dois ingleses entre nós em meados do século XIX)', *Revista de Estudos Anglo-Portugueses*, 3 (1994) 31-73

Castelo Branco, Camilo, *A Senhora Rattazzi* (Porto: Livraria Internacional de Ernesto Chardron, 1880)

Catroga, Fernando, 'A história começou a oriente', in *O orientalismo em Portugal: séculos XVI-XX*, (Lisbon: Comissão Nacional para as Comemorações dos Descobrimentos Portugueses, 1999), pp. 197-239

Channon-Deutsch, Lou, *The Spanish Gypsy: The History of a European Obsession* (Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2004)

Colmeiro, José F., 'Exorcising Exoticism: "Carmen" and the Construction of Oriental Spain', *Comparative Literature*, 54: 2 (Spring 2002), 127-144

Correia, Rita, *Alma Nova. Revista Ilustrada (II Série)*, 2011 <<http://hemerotecadigital.cm-lisboa.pt/FichasHistoricas/AlmaNovallserie.pdf>> [accessed 29 July 2019]

da Costa, Helena Bruto, *Alma Nova – Revista Do Ressurgimento Nacional*, 2006 <<http://hemerotecadigital.cm-lisboa.pt/FichasHistoricas/AlmaNova.pdf>> [accessed 29 July 2019]

Deandrea, Pietro, 'The hegemonic outsider: William Beckford's Lisbon journal', *Studies in Travel Writing*, 14:3 (2010), 225-239,

<<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/13645145.2010.500098>> [accessed 29 July 2019]

Dias, Carlos, 'Papa Francisco premeia 40 anos de trabalho do Campo Arqueológico de Mértola', *Público*, 13 November 2015 <<https://www.publico.pt/local/noticia/papa-francisco-enalteceu-e-premiou-40-anos-de-trabalho-do-campo-arqueologico-de-mertola-1714232>> [accessed 21 August 2019]

Duffy, Diane Elizabeth, *Historiography, Gender and Identity in the Works of Anna Eliza Bray* (unpublished doctoral thesis, University of Manchester, 2011)

Elmarsafy, Ziad, Anna Bernard and David Attwell eds, *Debating Orientalism* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013)

ENI CBCMED (2018) <<http://www.enicbcmmed.eu/home>> [accessed 26 August 2019]

Erll, Astrid, 'Travelling Memory' in *Parallax*, 17:4 (October 2011), 4-18
<<http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/13534645.2011.605570>> [accessed 14 August 2019]

Esquerrà i Nonell, Josep, 'Almanzor: drama histórico de Blas Infante', *Revista de literatura*, 76: 151 (2014) 199-220

— 'Motamid, último rey de Sevilla: Drama histórico de Blas Infante', *Colindancias*, 4 (2013) 143-162

Fabian, Johannes, *Time and the Other: How Anthropology Makes its Object* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1983)

Fairchild Ruggles, D., *Gardens, Landscape & Vision in the Palaces of Islamic Spain* (University Park, Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania University Press, 2000)

Falla, Manuel de, 'El "cante jondo" (canto primitivo andaluz)', in *Escritos sobre música y músicos: Debussy, Wagner, el "cante jondo"* (Buenos Aires: Espasa-Calpe Argentina, 1950)

Festival Islâmico de Mértola <<https://www.festivalislamicodemertola.com>> [accessed 26 August 2019]

Fisk, Robert, 'There's a good reason why anti-Muslim ideology hasn't found a home in Portugal', *The Independent*, 23 February 2018
<<https://edition.independent.co.uk/editions/uk.co.independent.issue.230218/data/8223506/index.html>> [accessed 22 August 2019]

Forty, Adrian, 'Foreword', in Ricardo Agarez, *Algarve Building: Modernism, Regionalism and Architecture in the South of Portugal, 1925-65* (London: Routledge, 2016), pp. xxv-xxviii

Foucault, Michel, *Surveiller et punir* (Paris: Gallimard, 1975)
— *Histoire de la sexualité*, 3 vols (Paris: Gallimard, 1976-84)

França, José Augusto, *O romantismo em Portugal: estudo de factos socioculturais. Vol III: Os anos de contestação; Os anos de sobrevivência; Conclusão*, trans. by Francisco Bronze (Lisbon: Livros Horizonte, 1977)

- Freeland, Alan, 'The People and the Poet: Portuguese National Identity and the Camões Tercentenary (1880)' in *Nationalism and the Nation in the Iberian Peninsula, Competing and Conflicting Identities*, ed. by Clare Mar-Molinero and Angel Smith (Oxford: Berg, 1996) pp. 53-67
- Frier, David, *The Novels of José Saramago: Echoes from the Past, Pathways into the Future* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2007)
- Fussell, Paul, *Abroad: British Literary Travel Writing between the Wars* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1980)
- Global Platform for Syrian Students* <<http://www.globalplatformforsyrianstudents.org>> [accessed 2 September 2019]
- Gonçalves, Mariana de Matos, 'José Saramago: da viagem ao viajante' (unpublished master's thesis, Universidade de Lisboa, 2013)
- Henn, David, 'Places and People: José Saramago's *Viagem a Portugal*' in *Portuguese Studies*, 19 (2003), 175-189
- Hertel, Patricia, *The Crescent Remembered: Islam and Nationalism on the Iberian Peninsula* trans. by Ellen Yutzy Glebe (Brighton: Sussex Academic Press, 2015)
- Hiddleston, Jane, 'Foucault and Said: Colonial discourse and Orientalism' In *Understanding Postcolonialism* (Stocksfield: Acumen Publishing, 2009) pp. 76-97
- História de Portugal*, ed. by José Mattoso and others, 6 vols (Lisbon: Estampa, D.L., 1993-4)
- Hoffmeister, Gerhart, 'Exoticism: Granada's Alhambra in European Romanticism', in *European Romanticism: Literary Cross-currents, Modes and Models* ed. by G. Hoffmeister (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 1990)
- Hooper, Glenn, 'The Isles/Ireland: The Wilder Shore', in *The Cambridge Companion to Travel Writing* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), pp. 174-190
- Hutcheon, Linda, *A Poetics of Postmodernism: History, Theory Fiction* (Routledge: London, 2004)
- Iniesta Coullaut-Valera, Enrique, *Al-Andalus en Blas Infante* (Madrid: Editorial Darek-Nyumba, 1998)
- Irwin, Robert, 'Flaubert's Camel: Said's Animus' in *Debating Orientalism*, ed. by Ziad Elmarsafy, Anna Bernard and David Attwell (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013), pp. 38-54
- Kemnitz, Eva Maria von, *Portugal e o Magrebe (séculos XVIII/XIX): Pragmatismo, inovação e conhecimento nas relações diplomáticas* (Lisbon: MNE e Instituto Diplomático, 2010)
- Laouyene, Atef, 'Pathologies of Moorishness: Al-Andalus, Narrative, and 'Worldly Humanism' in *Journal of East-West Thought*, 3:1 (2013) pp. 31-44
<<http://www.cpp.edu/~jet/Documents/JET/Jet6/Louayene31-44.pdf>> [accessed 21 September 2019]

'La Ruta de al-Mutamid, de Sevilla a Lisboa', *El legado andalusí: Revista digital de la Fundación Pública Andaluza*
 <http://revista.legadoandalusi.es/n47_revista_el_legado_andalusi/las_artes_y_los_dias/la_ruta_de_al_mutamid_de_sevilla_a_lisboa> [accessed 26 August 2019]

Laura, Filipe Abranches and others; prefs. by Felipe Hernández Cava and João Paulo Cotrim,
Nós somos os mouros (Lisbon: Assírio & Alvim, 2003)

Leal, Maria Luísa, 'Viagem A Portugal: os passos do viajante', *Colóquio/Letras*, 151-152 (Jan.-Jun. 1999), 191-204

Ledford-Miller, Linda, 'Voyage to the Land of the Novel: Narrative Voices in *Viagens na Minha Terra*', *Luso-Brazilian Review*, 21:2 (1984), 1-8

Leiria, Luís, *A civilização islâmica: a última grande civilização mediterrânea: Entrevista a Cláudio Torres*, <<http://www.buala.org/pt/cara-a-cara/a-civilizacao-islamica-a-ultima-grande-civilizacao-mediterranea-entrevista-a-claudio-tor>> [accessed 31 August 2019]

Livermore, H.V., *Portugal: A Short History* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1973)
 — 'The "Conquest of Lisbon" and its Author', *Portuguese Studies*, 6 (1990), 1-16

Lowe, Lisa, *Critical Terrains: French and British Orientalisms*, (Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press, 1991)

Lukács, György, *The Historical Novel*, trans. from the German by Hannah and Stanley Mitchell (London: Merlin Press, 1989)

Machado, Álvaro Manuel and Daniel-Henri Pageaux, *Da Literatura Comparada à Teoria da Literatura*, 2nd edn (Lisbon: Presença, 2001)

Marinho, Maria de Fátima, *O Romance Histórico em Portugal* (Porto: Campo das Letras, 1999)

Marques, Amália, *Mouras, Mouros e Mourinhos Encantados em Lendas do Norte e Sul de Portugal*, (unpublished master's thesis, Universidade Aberta, 2013)

Martins, Adriana Alves de Paula, *A construção da memória da nação em José Saramago e Gore Vidal* (Frankfurt: Peter Lang, 2006)

Matos, Fátima Loureiro, 'A paisagem duriense a partir de uma obra de John Gibbons', *Revista da Faculdade de Letras – Geografia – Universidade do Porto*, 3: 1 (2012), 59-73

Matos, Sérgio Campos, 'Portugal: The nineteenth century debate on the formation of the nation', *Portuguese Studies* 13 (1997), 66-94

Medeiros, Paulo de, 'Invitation to the Voyage', *Bloom's Modern Critical Views: José Saramago* ed. by Harold Bloom (Philadelphia: Chelsea House Publishers, 2005), pp. 109-120

Menocal, María Rosa, *The Ornament of the World: How Muslims, Jews and Christians Created a Culture of Tolerance in Medieval Spain* (New York: Little, Brown, 2002).

— 'Why Iberia?', *diacritics* 36:3-4 (Fall-Winter 2006) 7-11

Moreira, Ana Rita, 'Árabes e Nação na periferia da Europa', *Intersecções Ibéricas: Margens, Passagens, Fronteiras*, IV Encontro Ibérico de Antropólogos, Ponte de Lima, 4-8 September 2007, pp. 97-112

Nora, Pierre, 'Between Memory and History: Les Lieux de Mémoire' in *Representations. Special Issue: Memory and Counter-Memory*, 26 (1989) 7-24

O'Callaghan, Joseph F., *A History of Medieval Spain* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press 1983)

Padeira, Ana Rita Soveral, 'Uma visão artística de Portugal – James Murphy e a sua obra', *Revista de Estudos Anglo-Portugueses*, 16 (2007) 23-83

Parker, John M., 'Introduction', in Almeida Garrett, *Travels in my Homeland* trans. by John M. Parker (London: Peter Owen, 1987)

Pires, Maria Laura, 'Portugal', in *Literature of Travel and Exploration: An Encyclopedia*, vol. 2, ed. by Jennifer Speake (New York: Fitzroy Dearborn Publishers, 2003)

Porter, Steve, 'Review — José Saramago's Journey to Portugal', *Steve Porter's World of Books*, 18 July 2010 <<https://stevenjporter.wordpress.com/2010/07/18/review-jose-saramagos-journey-to-portugal>> [accessed 17 September 2019]

Puga, Rogério Miguel, 'Through the Stained Glass Window: O Imaginário Medieval(izante) na obra lusitanista de William Beckford', *Revista de Estudos Anglo-Portugueses*, 12 (2003) 61-84

Reis, Carlos, 'Eça de Queirós e o Oriente', in *Portugal-China: 500 anos* (Lisbon: BNP/Babel, 2014), pp. 221-225

Revez, Idílio, 'A *burqa* também existiu no Algarve: era o bioco e dava liberdade à mulher', *Público*, 14 June 2015 <<https://www.publico.pt/2015/06/14/local/noticia/a-burka-tambem-existiu-no-algarve--era-o-bioco-e-dava-liberdade-a-mulher-1698729>> [accessed 30 August 2019]

Roberts, Mary, *Intimate Outsiders: The Harem in Ottoman and Orientalist Art and Travel Literature* (Durham, N.C.: Duke University Press, 2007)

Sabine, Mark, *José Saramago: History, Utopia, and the Necessity of Error* (Cambridge: MHRA/Legenda, 2016)

Saglia, Diego, 'Orientalism', in *A companion to European romanticism* ed. by Michael Ferber (Oxford: Blackwell, 2005), pp. 467-485

— '“The true essence of romanticism”: Romantic theories of Spain and the question of Spanish romanticism', *Journal of Iberian and Latin American Studies*, 3:2 (1997), 127-145 <<https://doi.org/10.1080/13507499708569457>>

Said, Edward, 'Andalusia's Journey', *Travel and Leisure* (December 2002), pp. 178-94 <<http://www.travelandleisure.com/articles/andalusias-journey/1>> [accessed 30 August 2019]

— *Orientalism* (London: Penguin Books, 2003)

— — *Orientalismo*, trans. by María Luisa Fuentes (Madrid: Debate, 2002)

Santana, Maria José, 'Museu de Aveiro dá mais visibilidade ao seu Cristo crucificado do séc. XV', *Público*, 4 April 2017 <<https://www.publico.pt/2017/04/04/local/noticia/museu-de-aveiro-da-mais-visibilidade-ao-seu-cristo-crucificado-do-sec-xv-1767525>> [accessed 16 September 2019]

Santos, Boaventura de Sousa, 'Between Prospero and Caliban: Colonialism, Postcolonialism, and Inter-identity', *Luso-Brazilian Review*, 39: 2 (Winter, 2002), 9-43

Sasot, Mario, 'Un concejal de Vox retira un busto de Abderramán III en un pueblo de Zaragoza', *La Vanguardia*, 19 June 2019
<<https://www.lavanguardia.com/politica/20190619/462969369062/busto-abderraman-iii-zaragoza-retirado-cadrete-vox.html>> [accessed 21 August 2019]

Schweizer, Bernard, *Radicals on the Road: The Politics of English Travel Writing in the 1930s* (Charlottesville and London: University Press of Virginia, 2001)

Seixo, Maria Alvira, *Lugares da ficção em José Saramago : o essencial e outros ensaios* (Lisbon: Imprensa Nacional-Casa da Moeda, 1999)

— — *O essencial sobre José Saramago* (Lisbon: Imprensa Nacional-Casa da Moeda, 1987)

'Sintra Myths and Legends', *Sintra Capital do Romantismo*
<<http://www.sintraromantica.net/en/museums/623-sintra-myths-and-legends>> [accessed 26 August 2019]

Sousa, Ronald W., 'José Saramago "Revises," Or Out of Africa and Into Cyber-History' in *Bloom's Modern Critical Views: José Saramago* ed. by Harold Bloom (Philadelphia: Chelsea House Publishers, 2005) pp. 95-108

Swinnerton, Frank, 'Rose Macaulay', *The Kenyon Review*, 29:5 (1967), pp. 591–608.

Taibo, Carlos, *Comprender Portugal* (Madrid: Los libros de la Catarata, 2015)

'The Second Crusade' in *A History of the Crusades* ed. by Marshall W. Baldwin, 6 vols (Madison, Wisconsin: University of Wisconsin Press, 1969), I, pp. 463-512

Thompson, Carl, *Travel Writing* (London: Routledge, 2011)

Thompson, C.W., *French Romantic Travel Writing, Chateaubriand to Nerval* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012)

— — 'The Romantic Literary Travel Book', in *The Routledge Companion to Travel Writing* ed. by Carl Thompson, 1st edn (Abingdon: Routledge, 2016), pp. 269-277

Torres, Cláudio, Santiago Macias and Susana Gómez, *In the Lands of the Enchanted Moorish Maiden*, ed. by Cláudio Torres ([n.p.]: Museum With No Frontiers, 2010)

Umayyad Route <<http://umayyad.eu/?q=umayyad-route>> [accessed 26 August 2019]

Vakil, AbdoolKarim, 'The Crusader Heritage: Portugal and Islam from Colonial to Postcolonial Identities' in *Rethinking Heritage: Cultures and Politics in Europe* ed. by R. Peckham (London: I.B. Tauris, 2003) pp. 29-44

Van Den Abbeele, Georges, *Travel as Metaphor: From Montaigne to Rousseau* (Minneapolis and Oxford: University of Minnesota Press, 1992)

Varisco, Daniel *Reading Orientalism: Said and the Unsaid* (Seattle and London: University of Washington Press, 2017)

Vasco, Célio, 'A *burqa* também existiu no Algarve: era o bioco e dava liberdade à mulher', *Público*, 14 June 2015 <<https://www.publico.pt/2015/06/14/local/noticia/a-burka-tambem-existiu-no-algarve--era-o-bioco-e-dava-liberdade-a-mulher-1698729>> [accessed 30 August 2019]

Vazquez, Oscar E., 'Vision, Lamentation and Nineteenth-century Representations of the End of al-Andalus', *Art in Translation*, 9:1 (2017), 71-91
<<https://doi.org/10.1080/17561310.2017.1303994>>

Ventura, António, *O Algarve visto pelos estrangeiros: séculos XII a XIX* (Faro: Lex, 2005)

Viswanathan, Gauri ed., *Power, Politics and Culture: Interviews with Edward W. Said* (New York: Vintage Books, 2002)

Waldegrave, Katie, *The Poets' Daughters: Dora Wordsworth and Sara Coleridge* (London: Windmill Books, 2014)

Weiss, Julian, 'El postcolonialismo medieval: líneas y pautas en la investigación de un problema histórico', in Natalia Fernández Rodríguez and María Fernández Ferreiro eds, *Literatura Medieval y Renacentista en España: Líneas y Pautas* (Salamanca: Universidad de Salamanca, Sociedad de Estudios Medievales y Renacentistas (SEMYR), 2012), pp. 177-200

Wesseling, Elisabeth, *Writing history as a prophet: postmodernist innovations of the historical novel* (Amsterdam; Philadelphia: J. Benjamins Pub. Co., 1991)

White, Hayden, *Metahistory : The Historical Imagination in Nineteenth-century Europe* (Baltimore, Maryland: Johns Hopkins University Press, [1973] 2014)

Yeazell, Ruth Bernard, *Harems of the Mind: Passages of Western Art and Literature* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2000)

Young, George, *Portugal Old and Young: An Historical Study* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1917)